

# **CITY OF BOROONDARA**

## **Review of B-graded buildings in Kew, Camberwell and Hawthorn**

Prepared for  
City of Boroondara

January 2007  
Revised June 2007  
Revised November 2009

### **VOLUME 3 DATA SHEETS FOR CAMBERWELL AND HAWTHORN**

**LOVELL CHEN**

ARCHITECTS & HERITAGE CONSULTANTS

35 LITTLE DOURKE STREET, MELBOURNE 3000, AUSTRALIA  
TEL: +61 (0)3 9667 0800 FAX: +61 (0)3 9662 1037 enquiry@lovellicher.com.au



## TABLE OF CONTENTS

VOLUME 1	Main Report
VOLUME 2	Individual Building Data Sheets – Kew
VOLUME 3	Individual Building Data Sheets – Camberwell and Hawthorn
VOLUME 4	Individual Building Data Sheets for buildings not recommended for the Heritage Overlay

## Introduction to the Data Sheets

The following data sheets have been designed to incorporate relevant factual information relating to the history and physical fabric of each place, as well as the analysis and assessment supporting the recommendation for the application of the overlay.

The following table contains explanatory notes on the various sections of the data sheets

Section on data sheet	Explanatory Note
Name	Original and later names have been included where known.  In the event no name is known, the work House appears on the data sheet
Reference No.	For administrative use by Council.
Building type	Usually Residence, unless otherwise stated.
Address	Address as advised by Council and checked on site.
Survey Date	Date when site visited. Noted here if access was requested but not provided.
Grading	Grading following review (A or B). While the reviewed gradings are broadly in line with the general approach of the earlier studies, they do not always reflect the detail of the definitions in the earlier studies. In general, a B grading reflects a local level of significance, while an A grading reflects a higher level of significance (either state or municipal, refer to the statement of significance for clarification). It is noted that the City of Boroondara is currently working on a review of its local heritage policy framework which would seek to develop categories of 'Significant' and 'Contributory' buildings (these categories to be defined with reference to the grading systems used in the earlier municipal studies).
Date	Date of construction.
Previous Grading	Grading in earlier study.
Photograph	Photographs were taken by the consultants in 2005-6.
Extent of overlay	As recommended in this Review. Most commonly the recommendation is to title boundaries as this is accepted practice in the application of planning scheme overlays. In a small number of cases this recommendation varies.
Intactness	Where possible, an assessment of intactness has been made. This assessment (Good, Fair or Poor) is intended to refer only to visible external fabric and is not intended in most cases to

	consider rear or otherwise non-visible fabric or interiors.
Heritage Status	Indicates any listing on the Victorian Heritage Register, the Register of the National Estate or the National Trust Register. The recommendation for inclusion in the Boroondara Planning Scheme is noted here.
History	The history section incorporates in most cases material prepared by other consultants in the earlier municipal heritage studies. This material has been revised and in many cases expanded (though in others material considered to be of limited significance equally has been deleted). Footnotes from the original studies have been included (though these have not been verified). The authors of the earlier studies have been acknowledged by the note at the end of the history section.
Description & Integrity	This section is based on the site inspection, in most cases combined with other documentation such as drawings and planning and building file information. The objective in this section is to describe the fabric and identify alterations and additions. Refer to Section 2.4 in Volume 1.
Historical Context	This brief note is intended to help to place the building in its historical context. In some cases it includes information on the historical development of the surrounding area; in others it is simply a note about the building stock existing in the area.
Comparative Analysis	This section helps to place the building in its architectural and typological contexts, making reference to stylistic sources in some cases, and to other comparable buildings. Refer to section 2.6 in Volume 1 for further discussion.
Assessment Against Criteria	For a discussion of the criteria and their application in this Review, refer to section 2.7 in Volume 1 of the report.
Statement of Significance	<p>The statement of significance summarises the results of the assessment against criteria. It is a concise and brief statement noting the level of significance (local, municipal or state/national) and the nature of the significance. It does not repeat historical or descriptive material or list all significant fabric.</p> <p>Note that in all cases, buildings have been noted as being of historical significance even where not assessed against the relevant criteria (A or G). This is in recognition of the fact that all the buildings contribute in a general sense and at a local level to the historical framework of the area. Refer to discussion at section 2.7 of Volume 1.</p>
Grading Review	Comments on the revised grading.

Recommendations	Recommendations for the inclusion in the overlay.  In some cases, additional recommendations are made.
Identified By	Reference to the earlier municipal study in which the building was identified.
References	General and specific references. Refer also to the Select Bibliography in Volume 1 (4.0)

This volume of the report includes data sheets for the following buildings:

#### Camberwell and surrounding suburbs

24	Albion Street, Surrey Hills
15	Alma Road, Camberwell
25	Alma Road, Camberwell
33	Alma Road, Camberwell
36	Alma Road, Camberwell
78	Athelstan Road, Camberwell
2	Beatrice Street, Burwood
87-87A	Bowen Street, Camberwell
930	Burke Road, Balwyn
458	Camberwell Road, Camberwell
29	Canterbury Road, Camberwell
136	Canterbury Road, Canterbury
138	Canterbury Road, Canterbury
169	Canterbury Road, Canterbury
24	Chaucer Crescent, Canterbury
44	Currajong Avenue, Camberwell
33	Deepdene Road, Balwyn
119	Doncaster Road, North Balwyn
10	Fitzgerald Street, Balwyn
177	Glen Iris Road, Glen Iris
32	Hortense Street, Burwood
30	Howard Street, Glen Iris
27	Inglesby Road, Camberwell
6	Kitchener Street, Balwyn (provisional)

11	Luena Road, North Balwyn
7-9	Mangarra Road, Canterbury
91	Maud Street, North Balwyn
51	Mont Albert Road, Canterbury
65	Mont Albert Road, Canterbury
137	Mont Albert Road, Canterbury
158	Mont Albert Road, Canterbury
1	Montana Street, Glen Iris
7	Muriel Street, Glen Iris
622	Riversdale Road, Camberwell
626-8	Riversdale Road, Camberwell (provisional)
660	Riversdale Road, Camberwell
11	The Avenue, Surrey Hills (provisional)
899	Toorak Road, Camberwell (provisional)
931	Toorak Road, Camberwell
1292	Toorak Road, Glen Iris
1293	Toorak Road, Burwood
1297	Toorak Road, Burwood
89	Union Road, Surrey Hills
7	Victoria Avenue, Canterbury
13	Victoria Avenue, Canterbury
12	Vincent Street, Surrey Hills
26A	Wandsworth Road, Surrey Hills
50	Wandsworth Road, Surrey Hills
294	Warrigal Road, Burwood
452	Warrigal Road, Ashburton
125	Wattle Valley Road, Camberwell
136	Whitehorse Road, Balwyn
199	Whitehorse Road, Balwyn
127	Winmalee Road, Balwyn
150	Winmalee Road, Balwyn
41-45	Yarrbat Avenue, Balwyn

## Hawthorn

173	Auburn Road, Hawthorn
7	Elphin Grove, Hawthorn
26	Lisson Grove, Hawthorn (provisional)
1	Neave Street, Hawthorn
61	Wattle Road, Hawthorn
149	Victoria Road, Hawthorn



<b>Name</b>	<i>Thule Croft</i>	<b>Reference No</b>	
<b>Address</b>	24 Albion Street, Surrey Hills	<b>Survey Date</b>	20 September 2005
<b>Building Type</b>	Residence	<b>Grading</b>	B
<b>Date</b>	1911	<b>Previous Grading</b>	B



#### Extent of Overlay

Refer Recommendations

**Intactness** ☒ Good ☐ Fair ☐ Poor

**Heritage Status** ☐ HV ☐ AHC ☐ NT ☐ Rec. BPS Heritage Overlay

#### History

Harrison Rotherham acted as builder and C M Rotherham as owner to construct this nine-room, two-storied concrete dwelling in 1911.<sup>1</sup> To date, no architect has been associated with the project. Curiously, an image of this house or an identical house is reproduced in the Camberwell Conservation Study 1991 (vol. 2, p. 55), where it is described as being the home of SH Wilson, Albion Road, Canterbury. No date is given but the source of the image is identified as the *Real Property Annual*.<sup>2</sup>

Harrison Rotherham and his family lived there until c.1925. Rotherham resided in Leopold Crescent, Surrey Hills, at the turn of the century and later at 435 Kent Street, Surrey Hills.<sup>3</sup> His business lay with Rotherham Wood & Co., manufacturers agents, Elizabeth Street, Melbourne.<sup>4</sup> Within a generation he had reputedly shifted his interests to the Dominion Brace and Garter Co. Pty Ltd, Hawthorn. Rotherham, Wood & Co. represented among others: Josiah Parkers, makers of locks; Geo Salter & Co., spring balance (scales) and iron manufacturers; Summerscales Mangles; Newman door springs; the Wyoming Shovel Co.; and Adshead and Smellie, art-metal makers. They were wholesale only but displayed all of the makers' samples and could be contacted by telegraph from any government or Reuter office. Rotherham attended the Philadelphia Commercial Congress, as Melbourne's delegate, in 1899.<sup>5</sup>

*Thule Croft* had minor (and unspecified) additions in 1935 and 1947, and was converted into flats and had a carport constructed in 1960.<sup>6</sup> More recently it was returned to use as a single dwelling, and alterations were undertaken to the front fence and the rear of the house (at ground and first floor levels) in 1999-2002.<sup>7</sup>

(G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, additional research by Lovell Chen, 2005)

## Description & Integrity

*Thule Croft*, at 24 Albion Street, Surrey Hills, is a two-storey attic-roofed house evidently with stone footings,<sup>8</sup> and concrete masonry ground floor walls and chimneys, a return verandah facing north and east, and a shingle covered upper storey, formed from several attic wings. The shingles at the upper level appear possibly to have been replaced more recently in an atypical pattern of 30 cm squares. The attic wings and dormers are original other than for the small dormer in the main roof form, which has been added. The v-pattern half-timbering at the upper gable was covered in shingles sometime after 1991.<sup>9</sup>

The original roof, probably of slate, has been resurfaced in powder-coated galvanized steel. Several front windows have been altered or given new frames, though the arched stained glass window bearing the name *Thule Croft* in milky coloured glass may be original or early. The western quarter of the front yard has been paved over to form a court in front of a new garage building with automatic door, and the original concrete fence has been removed at that point. The remaining garden, to the north and east of the house, appears largely mature.

The front fence planking and gate have been replaced more recently in works applied for in 2001,<sup>10</sup> though the posts and base are in the original vesticulated concrete masonry seen on the ground floor walls and chimneys of the house itself (note that the blockwork was proposed to be rebuilt).

## Historical Context

Albion Street had been laid out by the turn of the century, but was little developed until the 1910s and later. The new tram service from Hawthorn along Riversdale Road to Wattle Park opened in c.1916<sup>11</sup> and this further encouraged new development in the Surrey Hills area.

## Comparative Analysis

While it has been suggested that an architect was involved in the design of *Thule Croft*, this has not been confirmed and it is possible that the house was builder-designed.<sup>12</sup> The house has a neighbour of very similar design to its west: 22 Albion Road, probably by the same builder and/or architect. This has identical concrete masonry in the walling and its main ground floor windows are in their original frames. Number 22 also has a roof in original slate, and a more recent picket fence.

Graeme Butler has noted the following in relation to *Thule Croft*;

Machines to produce plain and vesticulated concrete masonry wall blocks were available from both America and Britain in this period and were advertised in the early 1900s.<sup>13</sup> Williamstown builder, John Garnsworthy, constructed similar concrete masonry structures in Nelson Place (Modern Buildings) during 1909. Garnsworthy's own in-situ concrete home, the White House in The Strand, was built two years earlier of reinforced concrete. The engineer and concrete builder, H R Crawford, built in-situ concrete homes in Canterbury, one in Mont Albert Road. With a render coat, the house no longer expressed its special construction type.<sup>14</sup>

(G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991)

As Butler notes, 22 and 24 Albion Road are linked chronologically with examples of concrete masonry houses in the Williamstown area, and with in situ concrete houses by H R Crawford at Mont Albert Road and elsewhere in the Camberwell-Canterbury region.<sup>15</sup> Concrete masonry was later abundant on the Mornington Peninsula and Phillip Island, often manufactured on site or nearby as it was difficult to transport heavy materials there. It occasionally reappeared in post-war vernacular housing elsewhere, particularly in Melbourne's southern suburbs. No. 24's use of concrete masonry is very early here, and its detailing is very early in the development both of the bungalow and gabled attic house styles in the early twentieth century.

Compositionally the house is poised between Federation villa of the 1900s and gabled attic bungalow modes of the later 1910s and 1920s. The projecting rafters are early by Melbourne bungalow standards, and the Chinese horn-brackets supporting the verandah<sup>16</sup> were not common in Melbourne in 1911.

## Assessment Against Criteria

*Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria*

*CRITERION D: The importance of a place or object in exhibiting the principal characteristics or the representative nature of a place or object as a part of a class or type of places or objects.*

*Thule Croft* is an early and clear example of an early twentieth century attic form house, influenced in varying degrees by the arts and crafts movement.

*CRITERION E: The importance of the place or object in exhibiting good design or aesthetic characteristics and/or in exhibiting a richness, diversity or unusual integration of features.*

*Thule Croft* is well-composed, boldly massed and unusual in its integration of vassicated concrete masonry. It is an early and characteristic fusion of the Federation villa with its return verandah, and the gabled attic house more typical of the 1920s.

*CRITERION F: The importance of the place or object in demonstrating or being associated with scientific or technical innovations or achievements.*

*Thule Croft's* use of concrete masonry is unusual at this time, particularly in this middle-suburban setting. It does, however, share these characteristics with a neighbour, 22 Albion Road, which in its basic house form appears to be as, if not more, intact.

### Statement of Significance

*Thule Croft* at 24 Albion Street, Surrey Hills, is of local historical and architectural significance. Externally relatively intact, it is an early and clear example of an early twentieth century attic form house, influenced by the arts and crafts movement. Along with its neighbour, 22 Albion Street, *Thule Croft* is a relatively early example of this form, and demonstrates the transition from the Federation villa, with its return verandah, toward a gabled attic form more typical of the 1920s. Both 22 and 24 are distinguished by their bold massing and are unusual for this period in their incorporation of vassicated concrete masonry.

### Grading Review

Unchanged.

### Recommendations

While 24 Albion Street is considered to be of sufficient significance to warrant its inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme, it is recommended that the overlay also include the more intact but ungraded building at 22 Albion Street. A new citation addressing both buildings should be prepared.

### Identified By

G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

### References

*General:* G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

*Specific:*

<sup>1</sup> City of Camberwell Building Applications 1899-1918, 1466.

<sup>2</sup> Which ran in Melbourne from 1912.

<sup>3</sup> WD Wise, *Victorian Post Office Directory*, 1899-1900.

<sup>4</sup> WD Wise, *Victorian Post Office Directory*, 1899-1900.

<sup>5</sup> WD Wise, *Victorian Post Office Directory*, 1899-1900.

<sup>6</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Permits Index, Nos. 5184, dated 17 June 1935; a study added, 1026, dated 18 December 1947; other unspecified additions, 17835, dated 15 February 1956; a garden shed (not visible from the street), 19304, dated 2 October 1956, convert to apartment house, 28298, dated 9 December 1960.

<sup>7</sup> City of Boroondara Building Permit No. 1130/990013/0, alterations to front fence, 4 March 1999, see also Proposed Alterations (drawing by Alexander Metherall, August 2001) approved by the Hendry Group, # 2001/641.

<sup>8</sup> Personal communication from a neighbour who worked on repairs to the roof, 20 September 2005.

<sup>9</sup> Compare Butler's photograph: Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, vol. 4 p. 4.

<sup>10</sup> Proposed Alterations (drawing by Alexander Metherall, August 2001) approved by the Hendry Group, # 2001/641.

<sup>11</sup> Allom Lovell & Associates. Wattle Park Heritage Conservation Plan, p. 15.

<sup>12</sup> G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, vol. 3, p.4.

<sup>13</sup> M Lewis, *200 Years of Concrete in Australia*, [Melbourne]: Concrete Institute of Australia, [1988?], p. 26.

<sup>14</sup> M Lewis, *200 Years of Concrete in Australia*, [Melbourne]: Concrete Institute of Australia, [1988?], p. 26.

<sup>15</sup> G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, vol. 4. p. 4.

<sup>16</sup> G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, vol. 4, p. 5.

Name	<i>Doneraile</i>	Reference No	
Address	15 Alma Road, Camberwell	Survey Date	September 2005
Building Type	Residence	Grading	A
Date	1890-91	Previous Grading	B



Extent of Overlay  
To title boundaries.

Intactness ☒ Good ☐ Fair ☐ Poor  
Heritage Status ☐ HV ☐ AHC ☐ NT ☒ Rec. BPS Heritage Overlay

### History

The house, *Doneraile*<sup>1</sup>, is thought to have been constructed in 1890-91 for Joseph Blair, previously a resident of Coburg.<sup>2</sup> In September 1890, the architect Evander McIver accepted tenders for the 'erection of a brick villa for J Blair, Esq., in Camberwell'.<sup>3</sup> Joseph Blair was listed in Alma Road, Camberwell in the *Sands & McDougall Melbourne Directories* from 1891, with the house being identified as 'Elderslie' in 1904.<sup>4</sup>

The house was owned by retired opera singer, Miss Amy Castles in the 1940s.<sup>5</sup> Amy Castles was born in 1880 at Carlton, Melbourne, eventually training in opera under Allan Bindley and, in Paris, under Madame Marchesi and Jaques Bouhy. After winning prizes in Australia, she performed in London with Ada Crossley and Clara Butt, at the Queens Hall in 1901 and made her European debut in grand opera at Cologne in 1907. Many overseas tours followed, including a post with the Viennese Imperial Opera company just before the war and New York during, where she opened up her home for visiting Australians and gave benefit concerts to aid the wounded. In 1930-1 she took part in a sound motion picture but appears to have retired soon afterwards. She was the first Australian prima donna to make her debut in grand opera in Australia.<sup>6</sup> Castles died in 1951 and is buried in Box Hill Cemetery.

Amy Castle's two sisters, Eileen and Esther (Dolly) were also prominent singers. Esther was well-known in Gilbert and Sullivan opera, while Eileen sang in opera and concert engagements, sometimes with Amy and their brother George, and later took up broadcasting.<sup>7</sup> At least one of the two sisters also lived at 15 Alma Road from the 1940s (Amy was said to have been living with her sister Esther at Camberwell at the time of her death in 1951) to the early 1960s.<sup>8</sup>

George E Castles occupied the property during the mid-1960s, before the property was purchased by Dr and Mrs Shumack in 1968.<sup>9</sup>

(G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, additional research by Lovell Chen, 2005)

### Description & Integrity

Designed by Evander McIver, *Doneraile*, at 15 Alma Road, Camberwell, is a double fronted house built in 1890-1 with return verandah to the north and east, and an east elevation marked by two substantial round arches in cream brick over the front door approach. The house has plain walling in red brick, mildly weathered in places. Aside from the entry arches, cream brick is confined to the chimney caps and their flanking vertical straps. The bracketed gable barge boarding projects clear of the brick gable surface behind it. Its pattern is Japanese, echoed more tentatively in the glazing bars on the upper sashes of the verandah windows. The concave verandah canopy was in cast iron with cast iron lace and a corrugated galvanised steel roof, replaced in recent years with the addition of two transparent acrylic corrugated sheets. The slate main roof is original, though with more recent ridge capping in powder-coated steel. A bulged acrylic skylight has been added on the main roof's west side. The verandah roof has also been replaced in recent years, and has two large sections of corrugated clear plastic to allow light through. The timber front fence is not original. There was an earlier fence replacement in 1943, and two sets of interior alterations, one including a laundry in 1968, and additions, not visible from the street, in 1971.<sup>10</sup>

The garden, to a generally circular plan in its front arm, was reworked, probably in the 1970s, with native plantings. Some of the older trees may possibly date from the early twentieth century. Flowering wisteria, a motif in this street and probably a more recent planting, covers the verandah frame.

### Historical Context

Conveniently located between Camberwell Road and Burke Road, this pocket of the Camberwell area underwent significant development in the late Victorian period. *Doneraile* was one of a number of villa residences which had been constructed in Alma Road by the early 1890s. Later development in this part of the street consisted largely of bungalows and attic-bungalows from the 1920s.

### Comparative Analysis

Graeme Butler has observed that *Doneraile* was 'perhaps a prototype for the later Queen Anne villa style,' adding that it was 'a successful and early prototype of a common early 20<sup>th</sup> century villa style.'<sup>11</sup> In fact, it ranks with only six or seven prototypes for the Federation villa that appeared in Melbourne in the period 1889-92, and is potentially of significance in a wider context. The most direct formal parallel is A B Rieusset's villa in Caulfield, which was published around the same time.<sup>12</sup> Evander McIver, as with A B Rieusset, Alfred Dunn, Christopher Cowper and others active in the Camberwell-Surrey Hills area, was prominent in moving in this direction and the house sets out much of the Federation form that would spread around Australia in the next ten years.<sup>13</sup>

There are many Camberwell houses that parallel *Doneraile's* general composition and materials, but few which match its lightness in detail and its early engagement with Japanese line and pattern. The chimney treatment, derived from the strapwork on British and American urban Free Style houses of the 1870s and 1880s, was relatively new at the time. So too was the pyramidal main roof, the use of an unstriped plain red brick over all the wall surfaces (instead of stucco as at 23 Alma Road or dichrome brick, as at 25 or 36 Alma Road). The gable timbering, suggesting half-timber but with the frame lifted off the brick gable face, was seen on a few houses in Melbourne suburbs of this period, as in Berkeley Street, Hawthorn or Railway Parade, Murrumbeena. The interest here is in the plain Japanese patterning of the timber gable frame, an early announcement of the Federation period usage of Japanese patterns that extended to verandah valances, door screens and balustrading. In *Doneraile* the Japanese motif extends to the elegantly thin window framing in the upper sashes. The concomitant in progressive architecture of this period-Richardson's free style American Romanesque-appears in the round arches at the east return of the verandah, at the entry. It is of interest to note that McIver, *Doneraile's* architect, was designing churches in a free, quite progressive manner at this time.<sup>14</sup>

The general layout of the house shows the continuing debt to Victorian Italianate in early Federation design. The verandah was still separate from the main roof eave and was fitted with a cast iron lacework valance, as in many houses on the Tara Estate nearby. This is framed in several timber bays, in a manner seen also on 25 and 36 Alma Road (q.v.). The verandah is graceful and shallow, and, accompanying the main roof form, its lightness hints at 'Old Colonial' homestead forms then

fascinating an increasing number of Australian architects. The pyramidal main roof, in slate, is early Federation in character, being flared elegantly near the lower edges. The rafters protrude below, in what would have read at the time as a distinct shift from 1880s eave bracketing.

### Assessment Against Criteria

#### *Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria*

*CRITERION E: The importance of the place or object in exhibiting good design or aesthetic characteristics and/or in exhibiting a richness, diversity or unusual integration of features.*

*Doneraile* is a prototype for the emerging Federation villa. Its asymmetrical planning, strapwork chimneys, plain brick walling, pyramidal slate roof and Japanese turned timber detailing are all Federation characteristics, but were seen in combination in only a few houses prior to 1890. It is one of a limited number of prototypes that appeared in Melbourne during the period 1889-1892.

*Doneraile* is a virtual compendium of very early Federation forms and detail; these components are combined with elegance and directness, and with a particular scale that was to recur throughout the Federation period.

*Doneraile* is one of the key examples in Boroondara which demonstrate the shift toward Federation architecture, along with houses by Alfred Dunn and others in Oxley Road, Hawthorn, by Ussher and Kemp in Camberwell, Canterbury and Balwyn, and Christopher Cowper in Hawthorn. It is part of Boroondara's contribution to the development of Federation architecture in Australia.

### Statement of Significance

*Doneraile* is of local historical and state architectural significance. Designed by architect Evander McIver and constructed in 1890-91, *Doneraile* is a prototype for the emerging Federation villa. Its asymmetrical planning, strapwork chimneys, plain brick walling, pyramidal slate roof and Japanese turned timber detailing are all Federation characteristics, but were seen in combination in only a few houses prior to 1890. It is one of a limited number of prototypes that appeared in Melbourne during the period 1889-1892. *Doneraile* is a virtual compendium of very early Federation forms and detail; these components are combined with elegance and directness, and with a particular scale that was to recur throughout the Federation period.

*Doneraile* is one of the key examples in Boroondara which demonstrate the shift toward Federation architecture, along with houses by Alfred Dunn and others in Oxley Road, Hawthorn, by Ussher and Kemp in Camberwell, Canterbury and Balwyn, and Christopher Cowper in Hawthorn. It is part of Boroondara's contribution to the development of Federation architecture in Australia.

The association in the 1940s with the prominent opera singer, Miss Amy Castles, is of local historical interest.

### Grading Review

Revised to A grading.

### Recommendations

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme.

### Identified By

G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

### References

*General:* G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

*Specific:*

<sup>1</sup> Information supplied by Dr and Mrs Shumack, 5 July 2007.

<sup>2</sup> *Sands & McDougall Melbourne Directory* 1892.

<sup>3</sup> *Building Engineering and Mining Journal*, 6 September 1890, supplement, p. 5, cited in the Miles Lewis Index of Australian Architecture.

<sup>4</sup> The house was identified in the 1991 Camberwell Conservation Study as having been constructed for Robert and/or Elizabeth Burroughs, however the Burroughs' residence was further west along Alma

Road. The subject property was two houses to the east of Thomas Gagin's residence at 25 Alma Road (q.v.); Sands and McDougall Melbourne Directories, various dates.

<sup>5</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, # 15947, dated 15 November 1943.

<sup>6</sup> *Who's Who in Australia*, 1935; Maureen T Radic, 'Amy Eliza Castles', in *Australian Dictionary of Biography*, Vol. 7, pp. 588-89.

<sup>7</sup> *Who's Who in Australia*, 1962.

<sup>8</sup> Maureen T Radic, 'Amy Eliza Castles', in *Australian Dictionary of Biography*, Vol. 7, p. 589; Sands and McDougall Victoria Directories, various dates.

<sup>9</sup> Information supplied by Dr and Mrs Shumack, 5 July 2007.

<sup>10</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index: fence, #15947, 15 November 1943; laundry and interiors, #43825, 3 September 1968; additions, #49276, 10 June 1971.

<sup>11</sup> G Butler, City of Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, v. 4, p. 8.

<sup>12</sup> Conrad Hamann, 'Nationalism and Reform in Australian Architecture, 1880-1920', *Historical Studies*, 18, 72, April 1979, pp. 393-411.

<sup>13</sup> Compare with other seminal Federation houses of the period, such as Alfred Dunn's double and single storied houses on the Irving Road Estate in Windsor, of 1889, see *Australasian Builder and Contractor's News* from that year, or indeed Dunn's 'Residence at Camberwell', I of 1892, which Butler reproduces in his Camberwell Conservation Study, v. 3: Restoration Guide, p. 7. Cowper's major shift in design, seen in the Hawthorne house at Kerang, appeared pre *Doneraile*. Beverly Ussher's seminal *Cottage by the Sea* orphanage at Queenscliff (now demolished), which set out the mature Federation villa form, appeared a short time later: see *The Building and Engineering Journal*, 8, 184, 9 January 1892, p. 14, cited in Tibbits, below. It is well before Ussher's forays into the Boroondara region: see George Tibbits, Ch. 4 in Trevor Howells, ed., contrib., *Towards the Dawn: Federation architecture in Australia 1890-1915*, Sydney: Hale and Iremonger, 1989, pp. 59-60.

<sup>14</sup> As with McIver's St Andrew's Presbyterian Church, Kerang, 1892, completed two years after *Doneraile*. See Miles Lewis, *Victorian Churches*, Melbourne, National Trust, 1991, p. 128. St Andrew's' timber belfry and porch show McIver's developing interest in conspicuous timber usage and his parallels with contemporary Australian practitioners of Richardson Romanesque. The broad Gothic arch is almost round, and compositionally the church moves closer to Free Romanesque experimentation elsewhere in Australia, as with George Temple Poole's Highway Church in Claremont, WA, of 1895. See Richard Apperly et al., *Identifying Australian Architecture*, Sydney: Angus and Robertson, 1989, p. 117; Myra Orth, 'The influence of the "American Romanesque" in Australia,' *Journal of the Society of Architectural Historians*, 34, 1, March 1975, pp. 2-11. McIver's other well-known churches preceded *Doneraile*: The Brunswick Presbyterian Church, 212 Sydney Road, 1884, is discussed by Lewis, *Victorian Churches*, p. 61 n. 56; he also worked on the formally similar Kew Presbyterian Church of 1887 for Nathaniel Billing, Highbury Grove, Kew, of 1887, where the leading Federation architect Henry Kemp was married. See Tibbits, *Towards the Dawn*, p 64; Lewis, *Victorian Churches*, p. 75, n. 105. McIver also trained Christopher Cowper, another of the key figures in Melbourne Federation architecture. See Tibbits, *Towards the Dawn*, p. 64.



<b>Name</b>	<i>Thomas Gaggin House</i>	<b>Reference No</b>	
<b>Address</b>	25 Alma Road, Camberwell	<b>Survey Date</b>	September 2005; 31 January 2006
<b>Building Type</b>	Residence	<b>Grading</b>	B
<b>Date</b>	1889	<b>Previous Grading</b>	B



#### Extent of Overlay

To title boundaries.

**Intactness** ☒ Good ☐ Fair ☐ Poor

**Heritage Status** ☐ HV ☐ AHC ☐ NT ☐ Rec. ☐ BPS Heritage Overlay

#### History

Accountant, Thomas W. Gaggin, purchased two allotments from John Kelly in Alma Street during the late 1880s, adding a house in 1889.<sup>1</sup> His architects, Oakden Addison & Kemp, called tenders for the house in 1888.<sup>2</sup>

Later owners included O.A. Mevendorf and R. Morgan.<sup>3</sup>

Gaggin held the post of 'accountant to the Treasurer'<sup>4</sup> the second most senior position in the treasury, during the late 1800s and early 1900s, serving through the period of the country's major economic recession. He served under such ministers as Sir George Turner, succeeding G.T. Allen in this role.

(G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991)

#### Description & Integrity

As constructed, the *Thomas Gaggin House*, at 25 Alma Road Camberwell, is an asymmetrically-planned Italianate Victorian villa. Other than for the alteration of one bay, it is largely intact on the north side of the property and to the extent that it can be viewed from the north-west and north-east sides. Originally the house had its verandah on three sides, uninterrupted, with the original north and east bays kept hidden under the verandah roof.<sup>5</sup> The front northern bay has been altered with a later window detailed by the architect OH Jorgenson added in 1937; this replaced the original canted bay in this location and appears to have been altered again since that date.<sup>6</sup> The hipped roof is in patterned slate with galvanized iron ridge capping with eave brackets to the front wing. It has tuckpointed dichrome umber and cream brick walling. The cream brick is patterned in two-course bands and in groups of stepped horizontal patterns approximating quoins. These appear around the doors, windows and chimney corners. The chimneys are corbelled with battered cement-rendering tops and

dichrome brick in miniature quoin patterns and horizontal strapping. The door and window joinery all looks original, though screen doors have been added. The verandah, constructed round the house on its west, north and eastern sides, is separate from the main roof above it. Council's Building File lists a 'new verandah' in 1989, and on this basis, it would appear that the verandah was either reconstructed or substantially repaired at this date.<sup>7</sup> The verandah posts are in turned wood, supporting rectangular timber frieze frames enclosing panels of metal lacework. The columns are evenly spaced with a pairing at the north east corner and two pairings either side of the front door steps. This entry is marked by a small pediment.

Numerous alterations and additions have been made to the house. In the late 1930s, Jorgenson completed drawings for an addition extending along the south fence from the original stables. This added a sitting room, two more bedrooms and a concrete floored verandah,<sup>8</sup> and is next to the current swimming pool, added in 1967. A kitchen and laundry, were added in 1980.<sup>9</sup> More recently, a conservatory with canted bay was added, projecting south east from a refurbished and deepened family room. This is flanked on its south side by a recent courtyard paved in a set of concrete plates laid diagonally. This diagonal patterning is now repeated through all the garden paths to the north and east of the house. The south courtyard is flanked on its west and south sides by an extension in cement rendered brick, painted pale grey, which links the original house with the stables and extension group completed in Jorgenson's 1937 additions. The stable wing has now been altered to include a new garage, and a plant room for the swimming pool was added at the eastern end of this extension.

Apart from the garage none of this is clearly visible from the street, and from the east garden the extension, mostly separated from the original house by the courtyard and surfaced in painted cement rendering, reads as a separate building. The original house has always had a deep plan with a centrally placed lantern over its bathroom and a large vestibule to the rear, now a family room.<sup>10</sup>

The swimming pool area has had some refurbishment since, particularly in its integration with the family room, the south extension and the courtyard, and with later glass fencing.<sup>11</sup> This, and the main garden area, are hidden from the footpath gate by a recent concrete screen (c. 1989)<sup>12</sup> juxtaposed with the cypress hedge opening. That screen also blocks views of the main garden space. Most planting in the east side garden is more recent, though well-established. A number of the trees appear quite old, and the agapanthus lining the drive could have been there for decades.

### Historical Context

Conveniently located between Camberwell Road and Burke Road, this pocket of Camberwell area underwent significant development in the late Victorian period. This was one of a number of villa residences which had been constructed in Alma Road by the end of the 1880s.

### Comparative Analysis

Given its size and cost, the *Thomas Gaggin House* was a clearly restrained, visibly disciplined design by late 1880s Italianate standards. Its verandah lacework was enclosed (and compositionally restrained in turn) by oblong timber frames, as in 15 and 36 Alma Road nearby. The rear vestibule, like an enclosed kitchen court, was unusual, the most obvious Boroondara counterpart being *Montserrat* at 26A Wandsworth Road, Surrey Hills (q.v., B-graded).

At the time of this commission, Oakden, Addison and Kemp were reaching their peak as an 1880s architectural partnership; this house was designed shortly after Kemp's 'skyscraper' Australia Building in central Melbourne and just before Addison's proto-Federation houses and Queensland Exhibition Building.<sup>13</sup> Henry Kemp was working on a series of Melbourne houses in 1889; however, this is a conservative design by Kemp's standards and may be attributable to Percy Oakden, the older partner in the practice.<sup>14</sup> The verandah, originally circling the house on three sides and punctuated by a pediment over the front door steps, hints at Queensland stump house influence, not surprising given GHM Addison's prominence as an architect in Queensland.<sup>15</sup> The palette of materials, slate roof, Hawthorn brick with cream patterning, and cast iron lace, were quite late outcomes of a synthesis seen much earlier, as in Reed's *Ripponlea* of 1867. This palette of forms and components typified many 1880s houses in the Melbourne area, including 36 Alma Road Camberwell, diagonally opposite. At the same time medium-large versions of polychrome or dichromatic brick Italianate were relatively rare in Camberwell. The visual address of the house, to be read diagonally across the garden, is more accentuated than in earlier Italianate, and anticipated Federation in its site placement and emphasis,

and in its accentuated move away from frontality in physical conception. Addison's house at Hendra in Queensland, one of the clear announcements of a Federation synthesis of forms, followed this house by only a year.

### **Assessment Against Criteria**

#### *Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria*

*CRITERION D: The importance of a place or object in exhibiting the principal characteristics or the representative nature of a place or object as a part of a class or type of places or objects.*

The *Thomas Gaggin House* is a representative and externally relatively intact example of a substantial late Victorian Italianate villa, at a size comparatively rare in Camberwell.

*CRITERION E: The importance of the place or object in exhibiting good design or aesthetic characteristics and/or in exhibiting a richness, diversity or unusual integration of features.*

The *Thomas Gaggin House* is a skilled example of design in a dichrome brick Italianate style, typifying contemporary work by the prominent Melbourne architects Oakden, Addison and Kemp. The areas visible from the street are fairly conservative for their period, but its encircling and pedimented verandah is interesting in its hint at Queensland houses and with the growing emphasis on climatic suitability that accompanied the emergence of Federation architecture.

### **Statement of Significance**

The *Thomas Gaggin House* is of local historical and architectural significance a representative and externally generally intact example of a substantial late Victorian Italianate villa, at a size comparatively rare in Camberwell. The *Thomas Gaggin House* is a skilled example of design in a two-toned brick Italianate style, typifying contemporary work by the prominent Melbourne architects Oakden, Addison and Kemp. The house is relatively conservative for their period, but its encircling and pedimented verandah hints at Queensland houses and reflects the growing emphasis on climatic suitability that accompanied the emergence of Federation architecture. The house has a rear vestibule resembling an enclosed kitchen court: this is quite rare in Camberwell (compare 28 Wandsworth Road, Surrey Hills). Though extensive alterations and additions have been made, other than for the modification of the front bay, these generally do not impact on the principal views to the house from the street.

### **Grading Review**

Unchanged.

### **Recommendations**

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme.

### **Identified By**

G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

### **References**

*General:* G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

<sup>1</sup> Shire of Boroondara Rate Books, 1887-8, # 71; 1888-9, # 78; 1889-90, # 81

<sup>2</sup> Oakden, Addison and Kemp call tenders for a house in Camberwell for Thomas Gaggin, *Building Engineering & Mining Journal*, 21 July 1888, supplement p. 5, cited in Miles Lewis Index of Australian Architecture.

<sup>3</sup> Details sourced from City of Camberwell Building Index, # 8666, dated 13 September 1937, # 68033, dated 18 November 1980.

<sup>4</sup> *Weekly Times*, February 13<sup>th</sup>, 1904, p.12.

<sup>5</sup> Shown in existing conditions plan with planned additions by O M Jorgensen, architect, dated 31 August 1937, Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, #8616, dated 3 September 1937; #8666, dated 13 September 1937. 25 Alma Road Camberwell has no alterations or additions permits indexed earlier.

<sup>6</sup> OH Jorgenson, working drawings for north side bay replacement, dated 31 August 1937, held in the Boroondara plan archives. City of Camberwell building index, dated 3 September 1937.

<sup>7</sup> City of Camberwell Building File 40/408/0087, #BA 87954, 1989.

<sup>8</sup> OH Jorgensen, working drawings, dated 10 September 1937, held in the Boroondara plan archives. Permit 8666, sourced from City of Camberwell Building Index, dated 13 September 1937.

<sup>9</sup> V Pyke drawing 1e, 28 11 1980, Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, #68033, dated 28 November 1980.

<sup>10</sup> For this alteration see the City of Camberwell Building Index, #68033, dated 28 November 1980, and Pike's working drawing, 1e, dated 16 October 1980.

<sup>11</sup> Details sourced from City of Camberwell Building Index, #41969, dated 1 November 1967.

<sup>12</sup> The screen appears to have been part of the decking works. Details sourced from Camberwell Building Index #87955, dated 20 April 1969.

<sup>13</sup> See, esp., Don Watson and Judith McKay, *Queensland Architects of the Nineteenth Century*, Brisbane: Museum of Queensland, Brisbane, 1994.

<sup>14</sup> Kemp's role in the Melbourne work by this partnership is discussed by George Tibbits in Ch. 4 of Trevor Howells, ed., contrib., *Towards the Dawn: Federation architecture in Australia, 1890-1915*, Sydney: Hale and Iremonger, 1989, p. 56 esp.

<sup>15</sup> Addison's house at Hendra in Brisbane's north was nearing completion at this time; it was later given publicity in the building journals. See also Don Watson and Judith McKay, *A Biographical Index of Queensland Architects*, Museum of Queensland, Brisbane, 1994.

<b>Name</b>	House	<b>Reference No</b>	
<b>Address</b>	33 Alma Road, Camberwell	<b>Survey Date</b>	September 2005
<b>Building Type</b>	Residence	<b>Grading</b>	B
<b>Date</b>	1888	<b>Previous Grading</b>	B



#### Extent of Overlay

To title boundaries.

**Intactness** ☒ Good ☐ Fair ☐ Poor

**Heritage Status** ☐ HV ☐ AHC ☐ NT ☐ Rec. BPS Heritage Overlay

#### History

The original owner and date of construction of this house are unclear.<sup>1</sup> To date, no architect has been associated with its design.

A Mrs Byrne of Hawthorn owned the house in the 1920s and a Mrs M. Lawlor was an occupier during the 1930s<sup>2</sup>.

Unspecified additions were made to the house in c. 1929; these are assumed to have been at the rear of the site. Subsequent changes have been relatively minor (swimming pool, 1978, rear family room, 1979, carport and garage), fence.<sup>3</sup>

(G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, additional research by Lovell Chen, 2005)

#### Description & Integrity

33 Alma Road is a generally intact house in stuccoed Italianate style, double-fronted with a canted bay, attached iron verandah and two-storey tower. The large barrel-vaulted porch is unusually scaled relative to the house and rare in Melbourne as a porch type. It runs through to an imposing wheel-fanlight over the front door and sidelights, which look original and well-kept. An acanthus leafed frieze links the external composition.

Several of the major trees look original and the garden, though largely changed in its smaller plants, is well shaded and deep. The rear garage shown on site plans now resembles a summer-house of sorts from the street, surrounding the pool of 1978, and a more recent timber frame structure, this time in the open frame and lattice summer-house theme, acts as a garage, just inside the front gate. The largest additions have been a small (2 metre) extension to the family room, facing south and not visible from the street, and accompanied by some internal wall rearrangement at the rear of the

house. The entrance steps are original, if weathered; the paint and wall maintenance is good. Roof is original slate on the front sections at least. The fence and gates date from 1992, the fence is in close grained corrugated steel and draws on fence treatments common in the 1880s and early twentieth century.

### Historical Context

Located relatively close to the railway station at Camberwell, Alma Road, had undergone some development by the late 1880s, with a number of these villas surviving today. The *Sands & McDougall Melbourne Directory* for 1901 lists more than a dozen houses in the street at this date.<sup>4</sup>

### Comparative Analysis

33 Alma Road is interesting primarily for its insistent largeness in scale: its window arches, brackets, and entrance arch are all consistently overscaled, though quietly, and the swags at the tower base and acanthus frieze acts as a fairly subtle restraint. This scaling contrasts with the actual size, which is medium-average for 1880s houses in Hawthorn or Kew. *Alma* has an imposing bearing that belies its size. This presence comes arguably through the richness and large scales of its detailed treatment- as in the arched bay window mouldings, the acanthus- leafed frieze and the deep and quite graceful eave brackets. The large barrel-vaulted porch is unusually scaled relative to the house and unusual in Melbourne as a porch type.

### Assessment Against Criteria

*Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria*

*CRITERION D: The importance of a place or object in exhibiting the principal characteristics or the representative nature of a place or object as a part of a class or type of places or objects.*

*Alma*, including its tower, is generally typical of asymmetrical stuccoed Italianate villas in the Hawthorn, Kew, and Canterbury districts of Boroondara. It is more intact than most, without conspicuous extensions or artificial reshaping.<sup>5</sup>

*CRITERION E: The importance of the place or object in exhibiting good design or aesthetic characteristics and/or in exhibiting a richness, diversity or unusual integration of features.*

*Alma's* design strength is in its quiet but consistent re-scaling of otherwise conventional Italianate elements, and the capacity of this overscaling to convincingly enlarge the presence of a house with otherwise ordinary dimensions.

### Statement of Significance

33 Alma Road, Camberwell is of historical and architectural significance as a fine and externally relatively intact example of an asymmetrical stuccoed Victorian Italianate villa with tower. It is distinguished architecturally from other examples by its quiet but consistent re-scaling of otherwise conventional Italianate elements, effectively enlarging the presence of the house.

### Grading Review

Unchanged.

### Recommendations

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme.

### Identified By

G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

### References

*General:* G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

*Specific:*

<sup>1</sup> There is conflicting information in the 1991 citation for this property. According to Graeme Butler, F.S. Prior, a Toorak dairy proprietor<sup>1</sup>, was the first owner of the house in 1888<sup>1</sup>, leasing it to Robert T. Clayton<sup>1</sup>, however the ratebook for 1888-9 lists FS Prior as owner of a timber house, leased to Clayton (Shire of Camberwell Rate Book, 1889-90, no. 73), see Camberwell Conservation Study, v. 4, p. 12.

Elizabeth Burroughs, listed by Butler as an occupant of Prior's house in the 1890s, owned a brick house in the street in 1889-90 (Shire of Camberwell Rate Book, 1889-90, no. 74).

<sup>2</sup> Details sourced from City of Camberwell Building Index #1041, 1929; *Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria*, 1935

<sup>3</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index: swimming pool, # 64046, dated November 1978; family room and other extensions, # 64865, 20 April 1979; carport, # 84740 and 84926 (the latter a contract variation), dated 17 February and 9 March 1988, # 94676, dated 3 April 1992.

<sup>4</sup> *Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria*, 1901.

<sup>5</sup> For example, in the Shakespeare and Isabella Grove district of Hawthorn.



---

<b>Name</b>	<i>Glenholm; Ngarwee</i>	<b>Reference No</b>	
<b>Address</b>	36 Alma Road Camberwell	<b>Survey Date</b>	26 September 2005
<b>Building Type</b>	Residence	<b>Grading</b>	B
<b>Date</b>	1889	<b>Previous Grading</b>	B



**Extent of Overlay**

To title boundaries.

---

**Intactness**    ☒ Good    ☐ Fair    ☐ Poor

**Heritage Status**    ☐ HV    ☐ AHC    ☐ NT    ☐ Rec.    BPS Heritage Overlay

**History**

James H.B. Crook, of Crook, Busst and Co., wire manufacturers, was the first owner-occupier of this house after its construction in 1889; he also owned adjoining allotments (71,70)<sup>1</sup>. Crook had joined Busst in 1871 at age 22, but stayed with the business for just ten years, before retiring due to bad health. He died in 1893.<sup>2</sup>

The house was known in the 1890s as 'Glenholm,' but was subsequently renamed 'Ngarwee' by Edward Rigby, a solicitor, who occupied the house in the early twentieth century.<sup>3</sup>

A detached sleepout was constructed at the rear of the site in 1950 and a swimming pool was added in 1976.<sup>4</sup> More recently a detached carport has been constructed at the front of the site. A large addition constructed in matching materials has been added on the eastern side of the house set well back from the street; the origins of this are unclear.

(G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, additional research by Lovell Chen, 2005)

**Description & Integrity**

36 Alma Road, variously named *Glenholm* or *Ngarwee*, is broadly typical of its period, a double-fronted single-storey villa of 1889 in a dichrome brick Italianate mode made popular by Joseph Reed and Frederick Barnes in the late 1860s. It is a double fronted brick villa in brown brick with a vigorous striping and keystone-patterning in cream brick. The roof, eaves, brackets, wall surfaces - with their pairing of brown and cream Hawthorn bricks - valance and verandah columns, window sashes and verandah tiling all appear to be original. The front door looks original and uses richly patterned leadlight glass.



The origins of the large extension to the rear of the house (on its eastern side) are unclear. Though constructed using matching materials, it seems likely to date from the post-WWII period. This addition is clearly visible from the main drive on the eastern side. There is a timber carport of recent construction on the eastern side of the house.

The front path appears to have repeated the verandah tiling, albeit probably in newer materials. The fences and driveway are all of recent origins. The driveways are of recent origins and are in a red-brown cement block laid in diamond pattern. The front fence is in brown Hawthorn brick, with a grey-blue moulded cornice characteristic of masonry fences in Melbourne in the 1980s and early 1990s; it screens most of the house and garden details from the street.

A swimming pool at the rear was added in 1976<sup>5</sup>.

### Historical Context

Numerous suburban brick villas were constructed across Camberwell from the 1880s. Alma Road was located off Burke Road and just a short distance south of Camberwell Junction; by 1890, residences had been constructed on both sides of the street.<sup>6</sup>

### Comparative Analysis

The rich consistency of *Glenholm's* prevailing dichrome brick walling compares interestingly with 25 Alma Road opposite, also of 1889. While in most respects it typifies the Melbourne suburban Italianate then in general use, the vigor of *Glenholm's* patterning, particularly over the windows and doors, gives the house some individuality and hints at a grainy High Victorian *wildness*- something seldom seen in Boroondara but frequent in Clifton Hill's polychrome houses of this period.

### Assessment Against Criteria

*Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria*

*CRITERION D: The importance of a place or object in exhibiting the principal characteristics or the representative nature of a place or object as a part of a class or type of places or objects.*

*Glenholm* typifies Melbourne's suburban Italianate of the late 1880s, typical features include its roof, use of dichrome brickwork, iron verandah and cast iron valance, tiled verandah flooring, front door box and stained fanlight glass.

*CRITERION E: The importance of the place or object in exhibiting good design or aesthetic characteristics and/or in exhibiting a richness, diversity or unusual integration of features.*

While a relatively conservative design in general, *Glenholm* exhibits a high degree of consistency and richness in its main street presentation, and has an individual quality which derives from the vigorous voussoir patterning of its dichrome brick.

### Statement of Significance

*Glenholm* is of local historical and architectural significance as a representative and relatively externally intact example of a suburban Italianate brick villa of the late 1880s which is distinguished by its decorative dichrome brickwork. Its canted bay, slate roof, verandah with decorative lacework, and frontality on its site all mark the house as typical of the later period of nineteenth century suburban Italianate. While a fairly conservative design in general, *Glenholm* exhibits a high degree of consistency and richness in its main street presentation, and has an individuality which derives from the vigorous voussoir patterning of its dichrome brick.

### Grading Review

Unchanged.

### Recommendations

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme.

### Identified By

G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

## References

*General:* G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

<sup>1</sup> Shire of Boroondara Rate Books 1889-90, 73; 1888-9, 65, 66.

<sup>2</sup> *Australasian Ironmonger*, 1894, Vol. IX No. 1, p.8, by 1900, Crook, Busst and Co. had broadened their interests to include furniture and wire mattresses having two establishments, one at South Melbourne and one in Condell's Lane.

<sup>3</sup> G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991, vol. 4, p. 13, *Sands and McDougall Melbourne Directory*, 1906.

<sup>4</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, # 4655, dated 1950.

<sup>5</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, #59446, dated 23 July 1976.

<sup>6</sup> *Sands and McDougall Melbourne Directory* 1890.

Name	Rathmore, Rokeby	Reference No	
Address	78 Athelstan Road, Camberwell	Survey Date	2 September 2005
Building Type	Residence	Grading	B (recommended by the Panel for Amendment C64)
Date	1891	Previous Grading	B



#### Extent of Overlay

To title boundaries.

Intactness ☐ Good ☒ Fair ☐ Poor

Heritage Status ☐ HV ☐ AHC ☐ NT ☒ Rec. BPS Heritage Overlay

#### History

Previously known as 76 Althestan Road, the present-day 78 Athelstan Road was constructed in 1891<sup>1</sup> to plans prepared by architects Hyndman & Bates, for Arthur J Fuller, an accountant, previously of Harcourt Street, Hawthorn.<sup>2</sup> The original contract drawing for *Rokeby* is extant in the Bates Smart collection, now held in the University of Melbourne Archives.<sup>3</sup> Of interest, the drawing was amended with the south and west dormers penciled in over the finished and coloured drawing.<sup>4</sup>

The 1892 edition of the *Sands & McDougall Melbourne Directory* listed the private residence of A J Fuller, at Athelstane Road, as it was then known<sup>5</sup>, in the alphabetical section, and from the date of the 1893 edition, provided a directory listing for Athelstane Road. For several years the only residence listed was the subject property. In May 1897 Arthur Fuller sold the property, which at that time had grounds of more than six acres, extending south to Toorak Road. The purchasers were Archibald and Martha Smart, previously of Wellington Street, Kew.<sup>6</sup> Smart, Senior Landing Surveyor at the Customs House resided at the property until 1907.

The name *Rokeby*, given to the property by Smart, first appeared in the 1905 edition of the *Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria*. In 1907 it was acquired by James Lang who retained the name *Rokeby* for the duration of his period of ownership.<sup>7</sup> In February 1911, the property was acquired by John Payne, founder/owner of Payne's 'Bon Marche' drapery in Bourke Street.<sup>8</sup> John Payne apparently renamed the property *Rathmore*.<sup>9</sup>

The address given for the property at this time appeared to vary – the house was listed under Athelstan Road in the *Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria*, while municipal rate records listed it at Bowen Street.<sup>10</sup> The Payne family had a long association with the property with houses being constructed for other members of the Payne family in later years, with addresses in both Bowen Street and Athelstan Road.<sup>11</sup> Portions of the property's land holding were also gradually sold off with the

property's Toorak Road frontage – curiously never listed as the address – sold to Edward Prokter in 1925. A further portion of land had apparently previously been gifted to St. Mary's Church in 1917 with land also acquired by the City of Camberwell for the establishment of the Bowen Gardens in 1923.<sup>12</sup> After the death of John Payne in 1938, the remaining property, now approximately one acre, was acquired by Leslie Wedderburn Thompson in January 1939. The Certificate of Title indicated that the property included a small pathway to Bowen Street behind.<sup>13</sup> The Thompson family retained the property until the 1990s, periodically subdividing further allotments from the property's land holding. Two lots to the south of the house were sold in 1958, with a further subdivision proposed and implemented by then owners Peter and Dianne Power in 1994.<sup>14</sup>

(G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, additional research by Lovell Chen, 2005, 2009)

### Description & Integrity

*Rokeby*, the house at 78 Athelstan Road, is a red brick Federation house with a return verandah and angled corner bay, anchored compositionally by two brick wings to the east and south. The south-east corner bay is emphasized externally by an angled verandah gable. The front wing has a canted bay with a bracketed half-timbered awning-gable over it, framing four bay windows. The scalloped valence is understood to have been added.<sup>15</sup> The south elevation, which has a greater setback, albeit now impacted upon by the property's history of subdivision, may have been designed to be the primary entrance as it has an elaborate entry with side lights with leadlight and stained glass.<sup>16</sup>

Part clad with Swiss pattern terracotta tiles, and Marseille pattern terracotta tiles to the rear section of the house, the roof is framed as a pyramid from which the angled bay and the two main wings project three gables at different heights. As common in Federation designs, the second storey is understated, being represented in two shingled dormers, the south being gabled with an integral shingled balcony, and the east being hipped. The east dormer, though now with different window framing and possibly a later scalloped shingle pattern, appears possibly to have been part of the original structure.<sup>17</sup> Chimneys are corbelled in a manner that became characteristic in earlier Federation architecture, particularly in the 1890s.

Original windows are a mixture of double hung sashes on the east and south sides, and Norman Shaw-derived casements on the east bay. Timber brackets are seen to the sides of the projecting gables (with a coved frieze to the southern elevation); those to the front have a decorative cut-out.<sup>18</sup> The verandah fascia is a simple, firmly shaped design linking thick timber columns on a series of brick plinths all of which are capped with molded cornices.

The garden has some trees of long standing, though much of the smaller growth is later. A recent picket fence and gate pergola has replaced an earlier wire fabric fence.<sup>19</sup> A pittosporum hedge has been reduced in height to reveal the garden more.

The house is largely intact, especially to the front, as described by RBA Architects who undertook a detailed on-site external inspection of the building. RBA Architects identified a series of alterations, predominantly to the sides and rear of the house:

*The house is largely intact, especially to the front. The minor alterations that have occurred include a change to an opening along the north elevation (not widely visible) and the addition of a scalloped fascia above the window at the northern end of the façade. There have also been some changes to the entrance at the southern side of the verandah – the brickwork has been painted white and there are large, modern panes of glass. Presumably there was originally a stair, possibly below the multi-pane window that might have been a transom. None of these changes [other than for the scalloped valence] are apparent from the street.*

*There has been more change to the rear mostly in the form of additions. A timber wing was added circa 1920s in a complementary manner. It has a hip clad in glazed tiles and box frame windows with double hung sash windows. The timber clad room, first floor room the rear of the original has similar detailing. There is a small circa mid-20<sup>th</sup> century addition along the north elevation with face red brick and metal framed windows. The rear verandah and adjacent wall has also been altered.<sup>20</sup>*

## Historical Context

The subject property was the first house constructed in Athelstan Road, and the subdivision of its once extensive grounds over the past hundred years is of a pattern repeated throughout Boroondara. Athelstan Road is characterized by late-Federation and interwar houses on generous allotments, with the subject property still the pre-eminent house in the street.

## Comparative Analysis

*Rokeby*, at 78 Althestan Road is an intact, inventive, vigorous composition by later Federation standards, and comes very early in the history of Federation architecture. It is one of the early clear announcements of the mature Federation house form.

*Rokeby's* double-hung sash windows and corbelled chimneys remained standard elements in Federation architecture all the way through to World War 1, though the double-hung sash was consistently challenged by hinged casements on the 'Norman Shaw' pattern, usually divided in a 1:2 ratio. *Rokeby's* proportions and scaling are well-adjusted to the compositional vigor of this house, though the linkage between the canted bay and verandah is awkward.

The plan around a central stair hall, the diagonal address of the large garden and the roof and wing composition, all produce a rounded example of Federation villa architecture, as do its external brackets, simple verandah and dormer treatment. In an Australian context, *Rokeby* is ahead of Howard Joseland's single-storey Federation bungalow of 1892, George Sydney Jones radial and wing-form Federation houses from 1893, and ahead of the dramatic houses by Talbot Hobbs at Peppermint Grove in Western Australia (1897 ff.). It has few close predecessors in Victoria: Alfred Dunn's double and single-storey bungalows in St Kilda and Hawthorn were precursors, narrowly. Melbourne's other signature houses of the early Federation mode, by Evander McIver at 15 Alma Road Camberwell (q.v., B-graded but recommended for an A in this review) and Arthur Fisher in St Kilda, AB Rieusset in Caulfield and Surrey Hills, Christopher Cowper at Kerang, and J Charlesworth at 620 Riversdale Road, Camberwell (q.v., B-graded) were all contemporary, being commenced or completed in 1891-2. The iconic Federation houses by Beverley Ussher and Henry Kemp did not appear until 1892-4.<sup>21</sup> Then, significantly, several of those appeared in Boroondara.

## Assessment Against Criteria

### *Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria*

**CRITERION E:** *The importance of the place or object in exhibiting good design or aesthetic characteristics and/or in exhibiting a richness, diversity or unusual integration of features.*

*Rokeby* is an early example of a mature Federation design and is one of a relatively small group of houses that announced Federation architecture's complete arrival in the domestic sphere. *Rokeby's* site placement, angled corner bay, and placement of a pyramidal roof form punctuated by projecting sitting room and dining room bays, is a clear and mature reflection of the external massing that would mark the Federation period. Its pinwheel placement of rooms around a central hall became thoroughly characteristic of internal planning in the Federation period. *Rokeby* is quite close to the seminal Federation plans by Alfred Dunn and Beverley Ussher of 1889-1892.

The house also has a directness that presages later moves around Australia toward simpler bungalow composition. The sitting room bay canopy is unusual in Victoria in its combination of scalloped window hood and brackets, and the roof bracket to the north east corner predates a later bungalow characteristic. In general, the design is rich in its combination of form and materials, yet plain and vigorously executed, externally.

## Statement of Significance

*Rokeby* at 78 Althestan Road, Camberwell, is of municipal significance. *Rokeby* is an early and externally relatively intact example of a mature Federation design and is one of a relatively small group of houses that announced Federation architecture's complete arrival in the domestic sphere. *Rokeby's* site placement, angled corner bay, and placement of a pyramidal roof form punctuated by projecting sitting room and dining room bays, is a clear and mature reflection of the external massing that would mark the Federation period. Its pinwheel placement of rooms around a central hall became thoroughly characteristic of internal planning in the Federation period. *Rokeby* is quite close to the seminal Federation plans by Alfred Dunn and Beverley Ussher of 1889-1892.

The house also has a directness that presages later moves around Australia toward simpler bungalow composition. The sitting room bay canopy is unusual in Victoria in its combination of scalloped window hood and brackets, and the roof bracket to the north east corner predates a later bungalow characteristic. In general the design is rich in its combination of form and materials, yet plain and vigorously executed, externally.

### Grading Review

Unchanged (as recommended by the Panel for Amendment C64 to the Boroondara Planning Scheme).

### Recommendations

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme.

### Identified By

G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

### References

*General:* G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991; Pru Sanderson Design Pty Ltd, Kew Urban Conservation Study, 1988, G Butler & Associates, Kew B-graded places study (draft), 2001.

*Specific:*

<sup>1</sup> A notice accepting tenders for the construction of a villa for A J Fuller Esq. by Hyndman & Bates was published in the *Building, Engineering and Mining Journal*, 17 January 1891, cited in Lewis, Miles. *Australian Architectural Index; Sands & McDougall Melbourne Directory*, 1890 – 1892; A floor plan and the south elevation are held in the Bates Smart collection, in the University of Melbourne Archives – cited in the property's record in the *Melbourne Mansions* on-line database.

<sup>2</sup> During 1892 and 1893, Arthur Fuller would be embroiled in the spectacular collapse of the Mercantile Bank, under the directorship of Sir Matthew Davies, Fuller's brother-in-law, and to whom he served as Secretary. See Cannon, Michael. *Land Boom and Bust*, 1972, p. 333.

<sup>3</sup> The present owner of the property located the drawing for Rokeby in the Bates Smart collection in the University of Melbourne Archives and a comparison with the image reproduced in Philip Goad (ed.), *Bates Smart*, Melbourne, 2004, p. 81 indicated the drawing was the same, and has mistakenly been captioned 'Lineda' in the text.

<sup>4</sup> As noted by RBA Architects, there are a number of relatively minor changes between the drawing and the house as built, however given the historical context there seems no doubt the drawing is for the subject property. A recent published survey of the work of Bates Smart and its antecedents reproduced and mistakenly identified *Rokeby* as *Lineda*, another residence constructed by the architects for the same client in Stanley Grove, Canterbury. Miles Lewis, Part 2 in Philip Goad (ed., contrib.), *Bates Smart*, Thames and Hudson, Melbourne, 2004, p. 82.

<sup>5</sup> The present day spelling of Athelstan Road was first listed in the 1909 edition of the *Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria*.

<sup>6</sup> The details of sale and extent of the land holding are outlined in research kindly lent by Peter Andrew Barrett, Architectural Historian, 2005; *Sands & McDougall Melbourne Directory*, 1893.

<sup>7</sup> Town of Camberwell Rate Books, 1907, #227, brick house, nine rooms, addressed as Bowen Street, cited in research provided by P A Barrett noted the rate entry amended and Lang's name substituted for Smart's.

<sup>8</sup> The details of sale and extent of the land are outlined in P A Barrett's research.

<sup>9</sup> The property is not listed under this name in the *Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria*, but is discussed in detail in P A Barrett's research.

<sup>10</sup> Town of Camberwell Rate Books, 1911, #100, Bowen St., John Payne, brick house, 9 rooms, area of land 6.1.26, 6 person dwelling, nav £112.; *Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria*, 1912.

<sup>11</sup> The 1924 edition of the *Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria*, noted residences on either side of the subject house, occupied by William Payne and Miss Jean Payne respectively.

<sup>12</sup> An outline of the dispersal of the six acre estate is provided in research provided by P A Barrett.

<sup>13</sup> Certificate of Title, Vol. 6368, Fol. 538, dated 13 January 1939.

<sup>14</sup> Details sourced from the City of Boroondara Planning File no. 106447, and augmented by information provided by the present owner, May 2007.

<sup>15</sup> Information provided by owners' architect, notes provided by Council, May 2007.

<sup>16</sup> Additional detail from the RBA Architects peer review, October 2008.

<sup>17</sup> Its small-paned windows and insistent shingled grid to either side recall designs in the *Craftsman* magazine and by William Ralph Emerson in the *Massachusetts Architectural Review*, *Architectural Record* and elsewhere in the later 1900s and teens. Locally, this pattern of external timber gridding had shown in Blackett and Forster's Stanley Hunter house at 34 Wolseley Grove, Brighton, of 1914: Bryce Raworth, 'A Question of style', M. Arch. thesis, University of Melbourne, 1993, p. 33. The dormer's grain, and multi-paned windows, look distinct from the spare and conservative character of the other detailing.

<sup>18</sup> Additional detail relating to the physical description of the property is drawn from the peer review by RBA Architects and Conservation Consultants, October 2008. These revisions have been made at the direction of the Panel for Amendment C64 Boroondara Planning Scheme, December 2008.

<sup>19</sup> See Butler, pp. 14-15.

<sup>20</sup> RBA Architects, peer review, October 2008.

<sup>21</sup> A series of these are illustrated by Conrad Hamann in 'Nationalism and Reform in Australian Architecture, 1880-1920', *Historical Studies*, 18, 72, April 1979, pp. 393-411.

---

<b>Name</b>	House	<b>Reference No</b>	
<b>Address</b>	2 Beatrice Street, Glen Iris	<b>Survey Date</b>	21 June 2005
<b>Building Type</b>	Residence	<b>Grading</b>	B
<b>Date</b>	1941	<b>Previous Grading</b>	B



#### Extent of Overlay

To title boundaries.

---

**Intactness**    ☒ Good    ☐ Fair    ☐ Poor

**Heritage Status**    ☐ HV    ☐ AHC    ☐ NT    ☒ Rec.    BPS Heritage Overlay

#### History

This house was constructed for the prominent cartoonist 'Mick' (Harold Barry) Armstrong (1903-1978). Armstrong, who grew up in Sydney, initially drew for the *Sydney Sun*, before moving to Melbourne by 1935. In Melbourne he worked for the *Herald*, *Star*, *Argus*, *Smith's Weekly* and *Truth*.<sup>1</sup> His wartime cartoons in the *Argus* are particularly well-remembered for their amusing and comic 'take' on events during grim times.

Previously a resident of Glen Iris, Armstrong acquired the prominent corner block of land in 1940, where it was rated as a vacant allotment. Construction of the home, described as a 7-roomed brick dwelling, followed during 1940-41 at an estimated cost of £2100.<sup>2</sup> Armstrong resided at the address until 1953 when the house was occupied by Edward Daggard and then an L. A. Daggard until 1966. The house was subsequently occupied by G. Rogers until at least 1974, before it was acquired by the McLaren family.<sup>3</sup> The house was sold to a new owner in 1998.<sup>4</sup>

To date no architect has been associated with this building.

(G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991)

#### Description & Integrity

2 Beatrice Street, Glen Iris, is a two storey house displaying a Moderne asymmetrical massing of face cream brick construction. The parapeted walls conceal upper level terraces and flat roofs and a continuous projecting concrete band above the ground floor windows delineates the floor levels and individual concrete hoods project over first floor windows. The windows generally contain non-original timber-framed awning and fixed sashes screened by canvas awning blinds however the curved corner window adjacent to the main entrance retains an original steel-framed sash. The terraces are



accessed via pairs of timber-framed fully glazed doors whereas the entrance contains a panelled solid timber door. A single door at ground floor level has been replaced with glass bricks.

The terrace and garden paths are concrete paved and a matching cream brick double garage is located at the rear of the property. The frontage is unfenced; however a ti tree fence encloses the rear yard adjacent to the garage.

### Historical Context

Burwood developed as an agricultural area during the mid to late nineteenth century, and as late as the 1930s a number of farms still remained. The inter-war period saw a boom in development, with major improvements to public transport and a rise in popularity of the car. The immediate surrounding area appears to have been subdivided from this period.

### Comparative Analysis

Initially taken up in the late 1920s and early 1930s for use on commercial buildings including city offices and shops and suburban hotels (both new and remodelled), the American Streamlined Moderne idiom was adopted in the early to mid-1930s in a range of domestic commissions by noted architects. The approach gained publicity through its application to cinema design, and consciously stylish film sets, streamlined trains such as the *California Zephyr* and the appearance of unibody streamlined cars such as the 1933 Chrysler *Airflow* or the 1936 Lincoln *Zephyr*. The mode also reflects the radical change to streamlined aircraft design in the 1930s, as with the De Havilland Comet, Boeing 247 or DC 2, of 1933-1934.<sup>6</sup> By the mid-1930s the Moderne had been embraced by the wider community and was popular for small to medium sized middle class houses (both builder and architect-designed). Most adopted a two-storey form with a basically rectilinear plan but generally with some conspicuous curved or 'streamlined' element. Some, like the subject property, had a flat roof, but the majority had a hipped roof, fully or partially concealed by a parapet. These two-storey examples were often constructed in Melbourne's wealthier suburbs, including Kew, Canterbury, Malvern and Caulfield, but examples of Streamlined Moderne occur all over Melbourne in the years surrounding World War 2. Moderne is often hard to distinguish from chapters in European Modern Movement architecture, as witnessed by the waterfall front of Emil Fahrenkamp's 1931 Shell building in Berlin, Fritz Hoyer's vast and ship-like Chilehaus in Hamburg or the streamlined machine-forms of Erich Mendelsohn's public buildings and department stores to 1933. All three architects were well-publicised in Australian architecture and building magazines. Californian historians such as David Gebhard and Esther McCoy were also more inclined to see the bullnosed American Moderne as basically a local development of European Modernism.<sup>8</sup> Gavin Stamp has also noted how widespread it was in Britain.<sup>9</sup>

2 Beatrice Street, Glen Iris, can be compared to the following properties in the municipality:

- 6 Bulleen Road, Balwyn North (A-graded), is an overtly Moderne design with strong massing, defined slab edges and curves and intact details including steel-framed windows and wrought iron balustrades, 'architecturally, a superior residential example';<sup>10</sup>
- 24 Christowel Street, Camberwell (C-graded), while it does not have a flat roof, the house is a good example of Moderne design displaying steel window frames and open terraces;
- 24 Finsbury Way, Camberwell, (C-graded), while the first floor level has a hipped roof form, the ground floor areas and other Moderne stylistic traits such as massing, steel-framed windows, horizontality, curves and terraces distinguish this house;
- 1 Kalonga Road, Balwyn North (A-graded), while initially single-storey, the house evolved in the 1950s and now displays similarities with the Beatrice Street property including Moderne elements, prominent concrete sunhoods, terraces and parapets;
- 1 Montana Street, Burwood (B-graded), manganese brick separates this example from the subject;
- 56 Riverside Avenue, Balwyn North, (B-graded), an alternative form with only the ground floor similar to the subject with exposed, projecting slab edge and steel-framed horizontal fenestration;
- 15 Walbundry Avenue, Balwyn North (A-graded), has a more distinctive Streamlined Moderne character with rendered walls, prominent curves and portholes; and
- 28 Holyrood Street, Kew (B-graded), distinctive triple-fronted parapeted curved façade which addresses its corner siting with strong Moderne horizontality

Considered in the context of the other examples cited here, the subject property appears to lack the distinction (including stronger massing and distinctive detailing) of the A-graded examples, but to be broadly comparable to other B-graded examples. The intactness of the building has been compromised by the apparent replacement of some of the original steel-framed windows with timber and the infilling of a door with glass bricks.

### Assessment Against Criteria

#### *Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria*

*CRITERION D: The importance of a place or object in exhibiting the principal characteristics or the representative nature of a place or object as a part of a class or type of places or objects.*

2 Beatrice Street is a representative and broadly intact example of a substantial and comfortable Moderne-styled suburban residence of the late inter-war period.

*CRITERION E: The importance of the place or object in exhibiting good design or aesthetic characteristics and/or in exhibiting a richness, diversity or unusual integration of features.*

2 Beatrice Street is an assured example of the application of the Moderne idiom to a comfortable two-storey suburban residence of the late inter-war period. It is a relatively simple and austere example, given interest through its asymmetrical massing of forms.

### Statement of Significance

The house at 2 Beatrice Street, Burwood, is of local historical and architectural significance as a good example of a Moderne house of the late inter-war period. The asymmetrical massing of forms takes advantage of the prominent corner siting to address both frontages, a context which sets it apart from the more traditional planning and form of the neighbouring properties. While the integrity of the building has been compromised to a degree by the alterations to windows and a door, the overall composition remains unaltered.

### Grading Review

Unchanged.

### Recommendations

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme.

### Identified By

G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

### References

*General:* G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991

*Specific:*

<sup>1</sup> *Who's Who in Australia 1941*, p. 121.

<sup>2</sup> Details sourced from City of Camberwell Building Index #13799, dated 1940.

<sup>3</sup> *Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria*, various years.

<sup>4</sup> Enquiry dated 24/7/1998 held in the City of Boroondara Building File 40/408/010097.

<sup>5</sup> B Raworth. *A Question of Style*, Masters of Architecture thesis, University of Melbourne, 1993, pp. 119-121.

<sup>6</sup> The local counterparts to these, respectively, were the streamlined cinemas of Guy Crick, Bruce Furze, Taylor, Soilleaux and Overend, Cowper, Murphy and Appleford and Le Poer Terry: see Ross Thorne, *Cinemas of Australia via USA*, Sydney, University of Sydney, 1972, and the distributors' magazines *Film News* and *Film Weekly* of that period.

The trains were paralleled in Australian examples such as Stephenson and Turner's design of the *Spirit of Progress*, 1937, and NSW's *Silver City Comet* of the same year. Holden paralleled new American car design with their locally-modified *Sloper*, a streamlined utility, also in 1937. See Simon Jackson, *The Discipline Without a Name: Industrial Design in Australia*, Ph D Thesis, Monash University, 2002. Radically streamlined aircraft such as the DC 2 and DC3 and Lockheed 10, were quickly bought by Australian airlines after 1935 and their virtues were being disseminated to the Australian public. See *Home Beautiful*, 'Now We Fly in Comfort', July 1938. The new aircraft were also focal in a series of

hugely popular films, from Shirley Temple's *Bright Eyes* of 1934 to Howard Hawks' *Celling Zero* (1936) and *Only Angels Have Wings*(1939). The *Comet* was an earlier namesake of De Havilland's post-war jet airliner.

<sup>8</sup> See, esp. David Gebhard et al., *Guide to the Architecture of Los Angeles and Southern California*, Peregrine Smith, Salt lake City & Los Angeles, 1980, and Esther McCoy, *Richard Neutra*, Braziller, New York, 1961.

<sup>9</sup> See Gavin Stamp, ed., *Britain in the Thirties*, whole issue of *Architectural Design*, 47, 1977.

<sup>10</sup> B Raworth. A Question of Style, M. Arch thesis, University of Melbourne, 1993, p. 123.

<sup>10</sup> G. Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991, vol. 4, p. 47.

<b>Name</b>	House	<b>Reference No</b>	
<b>Address</b>	87-87A Bowen Street, Camberwell	<b>Survey Date</b>	2 September 2005
<b>Building Type</b>	Residence	<b>Grading</b>	B
<b>Date</b>	1934 <sup>1</sup>	<b>Previous Grading</b>	B



#### Extent of Overlay

To title boundaries.

**Intactness** ☒ Good ☐ Fair ☐ Poor

**Heritage Status** ☐ HV ☐ AHC ☐ NT ☐ Rec. BPS Heritage Overlay

#### History

Miss Alice Payne, the daughter of John Payne founder of Payne's Bon Marche (q.v.), commissioned N.P. Anderson to build this house in 1934<sup>2</sup>. It was a two storey, brick house of eight rooms and was estimated to cost £1,775. Ms Payne did not reside at this address until some ten years after its construction.<sup>3</sup> John Patrick Walker, an engineer, was listed as occupant in 1936, with Alice Payne and her brother Herbert James Payne, a gardener, taking up residence from the mid-1940s<sup>4</sup>.

The house was converted to flats in 1950 at an estimated cost of £2,500<sup>5</sup>. The first floor flat comprised five rooms and the ground floor flat six rooms.

(G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, additional research by Lovell Chen, 2005)

#### Description & Integrity

*Stratford*, the house at 87-87A Bowen Street, Camberwell is broadly intact, externally, and has been maintained in general sympathy with its original materials and form. The house is double-fronted and bracketed, compositionally, with two tall cement-rendered chimneys. The roof is steeply pitched and clad in terra cotta Marseilles pattern tiles over its main and projecting wings, with a shallower skillion tiled roof over a ground floor bedroom and entry hall. The porch is formed by a gabled pavilion jutting from this skillion, and is entered through a stilted segmental arch dressed in tapestry brick. Similar brick dresses the bedroom window lintels, a semicircular panel over the ground floor lounge window, and six corbels under the larger gables. The west wing windows both have shutters, but the other windows were all plain insets, most with modernist horizontal glazing bars.

The house was divided into flats in 1950,<sup>6</sup> when a flat roofed bedroom was added to the ground floor at the south-east corner. The drawing for these works shows a new external stair to be constructed on the north elevation providing access to the first floor flat.

The fence is in clinker brick and may be original (albeit altered); an inlay of Roman tapestry brick laid in curves frames the gate and appears to be later, possibly dating from when the house was converted into flats in 1950. The concrete drive looks to be of a similar age.

### Historical Context

Camberwell underwent intensive residential development in the interwar period, particularly in the 1930s. In many streets, including Bowen Street, this phase of development overlaid existing building stock from the Edwardian period or even earlier.

### Comparative Analysis

*Stratford* is a neatly composed, crisply finished essay in the steep pitched roof and cement rendered idiom of the area, and of other parts of Camberwell such as the Reid or Hassett Estates. It is distinct from other Boroondara examples, though, by its combination of this eclecticism with the modernism—clearly perceptible in 1934—of plain cement rendered walling and a determinedly modern glazing detail. Modernism and eclectic references were not an unusual combination in the early 1930s. *Home Beautiful* and other journals emphasised how modern technology's *men of action* often had Tudor and other highly eclectic houses.

In its combination of modernist and eclectic references, and in materials usage, *Stratford's* most direct local counterpart is 177 Glen Iris Road Glen Iris (q.v., B-graded), a slightly larger two-storied house completed in 1935, and the flats at 948 Burke Road, Deepdene. Both those designs were much more imposing and sumptuous visually, with heavily textured and patterned walling, terra cotta shingles, conical or half-conical wing roofing and more extensive use of wrought iron. But *Stratford's* comparative restraint makes it a more individual design in this company. In its combination of steep roofs, shuttered windows and combination of stuccoed brick walling and glazed brick trim it parallels some earlier houses in the Camberwell area, such as Otto Yuncken's own house in Highton Grove, and Keith Klingender's Ian McEachran house; both of these were in Balwyn.<sup>7</sup>

### Assessment Against Criteria

*Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria*

*CRITERION D: The importance of a place or object in exhibiting the principal characteristics or the representative nature of a place or object as a part of a class or type of places or objects.*

In its size and general form, *Stratford* is typical of a comfortable middle-class house in Camberwell in the 1930s.

*CRITERION E: The importance of the place or object in exhibiting good design or aesthetic characteristics and/or in exhibiting a richness, diversity or unusual integration of features.*

While fairly staid compositionally, *Stratford's* combination of modern and eclectic detail is bold and carried through with some assurance. Compared with most early 1930s houses in this area, the surface texture is plain, and the placement of windows and doors is sparing, deliberate and careful.

*Stratford* is unusual in combining eclectic 1930s design—vertical proportions, steep pitched roof, tapestry brick combined with cement rendering, arched entry and main window—with a general plainness in exterior finish and a conscious modernism in its emphatically horizontal glazing bars. (A similar combination appears in Glen Iris Primary School's north wing, completed c. 1937.) In this combination of details the house is distinct from more consistently historicist cement-rendered and tapestry bricked houses elsewhere in the area. The use of emphatically horizontal glazing frames lends a machine aesthetic to the house; this not out of place in an otherwise eclectic design, as the two were not generally thought incompatible in the early 1930s.<sup>8</sup>

### Statement of Significance

*Stratford*, the house at 87-87A Bowen Street Camberwell, is of local historical and architectural significance. In terms of its size, form, and general composition the house is typical of many comfortable middle-class interwar Camberwell residences. It is distinguished from other examples, however, by its combination of typical 1930s eclectic design with a restrained plainness of exterior finish, sparing placement of doors and windows, and consciously modernist horizontal glazing bars.

## Grading Review

Unchanged.

## Recommendations

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme.

## Identified By

G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

## References

*General:* G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

*Specific:*

<sup>1</sup> G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991, vol. 4, p. 31; Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, #4003, dated 19 April 1934.

<sup>2</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, # 4705, dated 27 April 1950.

<sup>3</sup> Electoral Roll, 1936, 1945.

<sup>4</sup> Electoral Roll, 1945; *Sands and McDougall Directory of Victoria*, 1945; 1950.

<sup>5</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, #4705, dated 27 April 1950.

<sup>6</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, #4705, dated 27 April 1950.

<sup>7</sup> 'When an Architect Builds Him a Home', *Australian Home Beautiful*, 1 August 1930, p. 19; 'An Interesting Home at Balwyn', *Ibid.*, 1 June 1929, p. 15. Details sourced by

<sup>8</sup> Critics really only began to separate eclectic and conspicuously modernist design only in the late 1930s, with the publication of Robin Boyd's *Smudges* broadsheet and the appearance of Walter Bunning's regular architectural criticism in Ure Smith's *The Home*. Both Boyd and Bunning intended to purify architectural Modernism to make the aspects of it *they* preferred aspects easier for others to read and follow.

<b>Name</b>	House	<b>Reference No</b>	
<b>Address</b>	930 Burke Road, Balwyn	<b>Survey Date</b>	25 November 2005
<b>Building Type</b>	Residence	<b>Grading</b>	B
<b>Date</b>	Unknown, c.1919-1922	<b>Previous Grading</b>	B



#### Extent of Overlay

To title boundaries.

**Intactness** ☒ Good ☐ Fair ☐ Poor

**Heritage Status** ☐ HV ☐ AHC ☐ NT ☐ Rec. BPS Heritage Overlay

#### History

Bakery owner William Farey moved from his previous residence in Rae Street, Hawthorn to this address soon after World War I.<sup>1</sup> The *Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria* for 1919 is his first listing at this address (307 Burke Road) but his application to connect the property to the sewer was not recorded until 1922.<sup>2</sup>

Graeme Butler has suggested the house may have been designed by the architect Walter Butler, however, this attribution has not been confirmed.<sup>3</sup>

Farey Brothers' Automatic Bakery, a fusion of American Romanesque and Queen Anne-British Freestyle detailing, was a quite skilful industrial building at 20-26 Liddiard Street Hawthorn dating from the early 1900s. It is now a set of offices.

Council planning and building records indicate that a number of alterations and additions have been made to 930 Burke Road; reference is made to these below under Description and Integrity.

(G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, additional research by Lovell Chen, 2005)

#### Description & Integrity

The residence at 930 Burke Road is composed from gables, solidly and rather heavily detailed in their fascias, and juxtaposed in three layers on the elevation facing Burke Road, with a long transverse roof ridge as a backdrop. The house was designed as a streetscape building, unfolding along a broad frontage, with ample space originally either side. A gabled balcony faces north to take advantage of the views, and a garage, added later, fills in the space between the house and its northern boundary. The entrance is through a bowed porch on columns and pedestals, with a balcony immediately above. The other accentuated west gable is supported, visually, by a massive chimney breast driving up

through its fascia. The long roof hips behind the grouped gables form an added element in front of the transverse roof and hint at Federation houses of a decade earlier. The two great chimneys at the front add force to this massing.

The house appears to be broadly intact externally as viewed from the street. Unspecified brick alterations were made and the brick fence constructed in 1946 (both overseen by architects Godfrey & Spowers Hughes Mewton and Lobb) and a swimming pool was added 1980. A fire damaged the house in c.1987, after which repairs and unspecified alterations and additions, estimated to cost \$250,000, were undertaken.<sup>4</sup> The nature of these is unknown, though it is possible that the existing substantial garage formed part of this project.

The age of the concrete driveway and forecourts is uncertain and these may be contemporary with the 1946 fence.

### Historical Context

930 Burke Road is one of a number of dormer and attic-styled houses of the 1910s and early interwar period that appeared around Burke Road and lower East Kew.

### Comparative Analysis

No. 930 Burke Road is an ably and vividly composed house for its time, and is in the tradition of expansive Camberwell houses typified nearby by *Highton*, 1906, at 65 Mont Albert Road (B-graded, q.v.), and *Pontrefract*, 1892, at 199 Whitehorse Road Balwyn (B-graded, q.v.). The Farey brothers had previously commissioned a carefully designed 'Automatic Bakery' at 20-26 Liddiard Street Hawthorn (C-graded in the Hawthorn Heritage Study), a small but important Federation industrial building in a fusion of Free Romanesque and Queen Anne details, and this house looks an appropriate continuation of this approach some fifteen years later. Graeme Butler has observed that the composition of solid masses below and a skilled balancing of the gable pattern above was a major accomplishment in the design of No. 930,<sup>5</sup> though seen widely in earlier Federation work, and this is true; compare Walter Butler's *Bishopscourt*, Hotham Street, East Melbourne (addition) of 1904-6, or more locally, *Ospringle* at 24 Chaucer Crescent Canterbury, of 1905 (B-graded, q.v.). No. 930 has a very strong presence on Burke Road, notwithstanding a varied streetscape context and the visual demands of continually heavy traffic.

### Assessment Against Criteria

*Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria*

*CRITERION A: The historical importance, association with or relationship to Boroondara's history of the place or object.*

The historical association with local bakery owner, William Farey is of interest but is not considered to elevate the significance of the place over others associated with local business people.

*CRITERION D: The importance of a place or object in exhibiting the principal characteristics or the representative nature of a place or object as a part of a class or type of places or objects.*

930 Burke Road is a fine representative example of the larger attic house type common in wealthier areas in the early interwar period.

*CRITERION E: The importance of the place or object in exhibiting good design or aesthetic characteristics and/or in exhibiting a richness, diversity or unusual integration of features.*

930 Burke Road is a highly skilled composition. Using a long transverse hipped roof as a compositional spine, the house derives a strong presence in its busy streetscape through use of juxtaposed gables and boldly scaled, carefully placed chimneys.

### Statement of Significance

930 Burke Road, Balwyn is of local historical and architectural significance as a fine and generally externally intact example of a substantial attic house constructed in Melbourne's wealthier middle ring suburbs in the early interwar period. Architecturally, it is a highly skilled composition that uses a long



transverse hipped roof as a compositional spine and is dominated by the use of juxtaposed gables and boldly scaled, carefully placed chimneys.

### **Grading Review**

Unchanged.

### **Recommendations**

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme.

### **Identified By**

G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

### **References**

*General:* G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

*Specific:*

<sup>1</sup> *Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria*, 1918.

<sup>2</sup> Melbourne and Metropolitan Board of Works, Drainage Plan Application, no 126735.

<sup>3</sup> G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991, v. 4, p. 58. Butler attributes the design of the house to Walter Butler, noting as follows: 'Alterations done for Farey in 1946, cite the involvement of architects, Godfrey & Spowers, Hughes Mewton & Lobb<sup>3</sup>. Hence it is likely that the earlier design was done under the partnership of Butler and Martin (Mewton worked with Martin), and designed by Walter Butler'.

<sup>4</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, #19176, dated 19 December 1946 (fence and 'brick alterations' by Godfrey and Spowers, Hughes, Mewton & Lobb); #67832, dated 28 October 1980 (swimming pool); # 81973, dated 8 January 1987 (fire repair and additions).

<sup>5</sup> G Butler, City of Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, v. 4, p. 58.

---

<b>Name</b>	House	<b>Reference No</b>	
<b>Address</b>	458 Camberwell Road, Camberwell	<b>Survey Date</b>	2 September 2005
<b>Building Type</b>	Residence	<b>Grading</b>	B
<b>Date</b>	1933-4	<b>Previous Grading</b>	B



#### Extent of Overlay

To title boundaries.

---

**Intactness**    ☒ Good    ☐ Fair    ☐ Poor

**Heritage Status**    ☐ HV    ☐ AHC    ☐ NT    ☐ Rec.    BPS Heritage Overlay

#### History

Frederick G. Woods, an auctioneer, commissioned builder C. J. Smith to erect this house in 1933. It was to cost £1,290 and house over 20 squares of floor area.<sup>1</sup>

Approval was given for the addition of a flat-roofed projecting bay window in 1962 and for the construction of a carport in 1965.

(G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, additional research by Lovell Chen, 2005)

#### Description & Integrity

The house at 458 Camberwell Road is in clinker brick with two gabled wings, one single and the other two-storied. The site is oddly shaped, in a wedge form with a square extension to the west, with the entrance to the main house placed at the intersection of these two shapes. The roof is steeply pitched, clad in terra cotta Marseilles tiles and marked asymmetrically by two tall chimneys. One is at the rear of the east wing; the other, at the front end of the west wing, broadens into a chimney-breast in two asymmetrical steps - a common 1930s Tudor motif in Melbourne generally. The lower roof to the rear is a lean-to. The chimneys have plain corbelled tops giving a slight Tudor reference; other Tudor notes are in half timbering over the first floor level east bay and the garage gable below, and on the main upper gables. On the east gable half-timbering is combined with a herringbone pattern in Roman-thickness brick. On the garage, the half-timbering is coupled with shingles under the bargeboard. Tapestry brick forms voussoir and quoin patterns round the entry arch and porch.

At first floor level the east wing gable front appears to be a glassed-in former balcony, its windows having a differing frame thickness from those on the rest of the house. The other windows are either double-hung sashes or leadlight portholes, three arranged together by the entrance and another on the upstairs main wing. Two windows are placed either side of the west wing chimney, suggesting an

ingle, and these are marked out with different lead lighting from that of the portholes. The garage doors are original in plain vertical planking, each with a slit window in stippled glass.

The building is broadly intact externally to its original form (other than for the enclosure of the first floor balcony on the east elevation). The only other major addition has been a bay window with a flat roof added on the north-west side in 1962. A standard steel carport, added in 1965,<sup>2</sup> stands to one side of the driveway, clear of the house's front elevation. The fence is original and is partly a low retaining wall, in a clinker brick matching that of the house.

### Historical Context

Camberwell underwent intensive residential development in the interwar period, particularly in the 1930s. Much of this development came in the form of builder-designed houses such as 458 Camberwell Road.

### Comparative Analysis

This is one of many Tudor-flavoured houses in the Camberwell area, of which Marcus Barlow's Gillespie house in Mont Albert Road, Canterbury, is arguably the most notable<sup>3</sup>. 14 Stodart Street Camberwell is closer to 458 Camberwell Road in its budget and resources and site size, but is stiff and static by comparison.<sup>4</sup> The builder-designer of 458 Camberwell Road achieved a well-sculpted form and rhythm without overcrowding the composition. Houses of this period often had side gates linked to the main house form with a masonry arch, but this house is somewhat atypical in having a carefully integrated garage in its front elevation. The use of tapestry brick dressing is common in this area and in Glen Iris, but is more usually set against white or pale-painted roughcast wall rendering rather than brick as is the case here.

### Assessment Against Criteria

*Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria*

*CRITERION E: The importance of the place or object in exhibiting good design or aesthetic characteristics and/or in exhibiting a richness, diversity or unusual integration of features.*

The house is a fine local example of an interwar suburban residence combining contemporary Tudor references. The house is early in having a garage integrated into its front elevation, and a staggered driveway that fits the garden contours. The builder shows an assurance in proportions and a command of architectural episodes in ensemble.

### Statement of Significance

*Stratford*, at 458 Camberwell Road, Camberwell, is of local historical and architectural significance as a fine and generally intact example of an interwar suburban residence combining contemporary Tudor references. The careful integration of a garage into the front elevation of the house is of note and the survival of the original fence and driveway configuration contributes to the setting of the house.

### Grading Review

Unchanged.

### Recommendations

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme.

### Identified By

G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

### References

*General:* G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991

*Specific:*

<sup>1</sup> MMBW Drainage Plan Application 192486; City of Camberwell Building Index, # 3575, 27 September 1933, Electoral Roll, 1934.

<sup>2</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, # 31723, dated 17 September 1962; # 36486, dated 27 January 1965.

<sup>3</sup> G Butler, City of Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, v. 4, p. 194-5. See also Marcus Barlow's *Australian Bungalows*, Melbourne, 1926.

<sup>4</sup> G Butler, City of Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, v.4, p. 264.

<b>Name</b>	<i>Coolattie</i>	<b>Reference No</b>	
<b>Address</b>	29 Canterbury Road, Camberwell	<b>Survey Date</b>	27 September 2005
<b>Building Type</b>	Residence	<b>Grading</b>	B
<b>Date</b>	1896-7 <sup>1</sup>	<b>Previous Grading</b>	B



**Extent of Overlay**  
To title boundaries.

**Intactness** ☒ Good ☐ Fair ☐ Poor

**Heritage Status** ☐ HV ☐ AHC ☐ NT ☐ Rec. ☐ BPS Heritage Overlay

### History

Richard Guthridge, described in the 1890s as a gentleman (retired), acquired land from the Victorian Permanent Building Society and commissioned the construction of a ten room brick house there in 1896<sup>2</sup>. Son Richard M. Guthridge, himself an architect and possibly the designer of the house, assumed ownership in 1902, and remained there until c.1908.<sup>3</sup>

Little is known of the architectural career of Richard Guthridge Jnr. He was in the office of WR Butler before commencing his own practice in 1895.<sup>4</sup> Graeme Butler notes that Guthridge designed brick warehouses, mainly in King Street, Melbourne, including one for Guthridge and Co. in Goldie Alley,<sup>5</sup> while the Miles Lewis Index of Australian Architecture identifies him as the architect for a number of brick villas in the late 1880s and 1890s.<sup>6</sup>

The house appears to have been divided into flats for a period in the post WWII period, but was converted back to a single residence by owner D H Hume in 1957-8<sup>7</sup>. In the process, renovation works were undertaken at substantial cost (3,600 pounds). The property was subdivided in 1977 with the rear (north) section of the original grounds forming a new allotment.<sup>8</sup>

Substantial additions and alterations were undertaken in the late 1980s and 1990s.

(G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, additional research by Lovell Chen, 2005)

### Description & Integrity

*Coolattie* (also spelt *Collattie*), the house at 29 Canterbury Road, Camberwell, is a large villa in red brick dressed with stucco. The footprint of the house appears to have remained virtually identical to that shown on the early MMBW Detail Plan No. 70 (of 1905) until the construction of rear additions in

1986-7. These additions included a sun room at the north-west corner, and the construction of a first floor addition over the original bedroom.<sup>9</sup> Additions and alterations are thought to have been undertaken in the 1990s, however the exact nature of these has not been established.<sup>10</sup> The two verandahs were rebuilt in 2001; it is not clear whether these were constructed to match the original.<sup>11</sup>

Notwithstanding the fact that the house has undergone a series of alterations and additions, it remains broadly intact in terms of its original presentation to the south and west. The original house presents a large-dimensioned, but domestically scaled, exterior to the Canterbury Road – Stanley Grove corner. This is dominated by a return verandah on a three- course bluestone base with tiled surfacing, cast iron columns and lace valance, and a bull-nosed roof clad in corrugated galvanized steel. The roof, hipped and clad in its original slate, is separated from the verandah roof and supported with an emphatic set of timber brackets. The south elevation terminates at the south-west with a corner emphasized by a canted bay near the corner and by vermiculated quoins at the corner itself. In a characteristic Federation composition, the return verandah is framed by two projecting wings, one to the west housing the living room, and one to the south which houses the dining room. The dining room divides the main verandah from a smaller bedroom verandah to the south-east. The dining and living room wings each have a brick and stucco bay treated as a breakfront, housing two full- height windows with stilted segmental arches that spring from a molded string course. These arches are built up with dichromatic brick and surrounded with plaster molding. Dichromatic brick is also used to form quoin patterns at the corners of these bays.

The keystones in each wing are given a mannerist treatment of a type usually seen at much larger scale in city commercial buildings of the period: each is a concave, stylized triglyph supporting a studded entablature that in turn carries a miniature rounded pediment.<sup>12</sup> This detail is part of several other similarly mannerist Queen Anne elements in this design, including the high tympanum of the west and south wing pediments which hint at the Queen Anne movement's favored equilateral triangle, and the finely grained chimney cornices.

The slate-roofed timber bay facing east, with Art Nouveau lead lighting, is an addition, but its pediment and vertical proportions sit sympathetically with the rest of the original exterior. The west-facing sunroom, added in 1986, now a living room, has a set of newer plate glass casements with shallow segmental top frames that tentatively pick up the line of the original living room windows.<sup>13</sup> The 1986-7 extension is quite tight, which makes it fairly unobtrusive from the south and southwest sides. Its concession to the historical character of the earlier house is in a tall, arched stair window, and in a turned wooden stair frame.

The garden has some mature trees but has generally been renewed in its smaller scale plantings. A high red brick fence was constructed around two sides of the site in c.1984.<sup>14</sup> This screens *Coolattie* from Canterbury Road, though it refers to the house in its combination of diamond-patterned red brick and grey cement cornice moldings.

### Historical Context

*Coolattie* is one of a series of large houses constructed in Camberwell in the 1890s, in development which was generated in part as a result of improved rail transport links to the suburb. The MMBW Detail Plan No. 70 of 1905 shows the south side of Canterbury Road developed for a series of brick villas (as part of the Tara Estate). Development on the north side (west of *Coolattie*) was sparse by comparison, with a small number of larger residences – including *Parlington*, *Linda* (today's 19 Canterbury Road), and *Versailles* – all generally set well back from the street. Much of the land associated with these larger estates was subdivided and developed in the early twentieth century and into the interwar period.

### Comparative Analysis

*Coolattie's* is distinctive in its plan, which is transversely proportioned and quite centralized, a foretaste of later Federation plan and those which later mark Bungalow designs, as with Kenneth Milne's houses in Adelaide's south-eastern suburbs.<sup>15</sup> This is belied by the exterior, which is more of its time in fusing Italianate and early Federation composition and employing a range of Queen Anne details.

*Coolattie* continues the hybrid character of many of the houses in the Tara Estate (on the other side of Canterbury Road), including, for example, *Rosstrevor* at 58 Canterbury Road directly opposite (graded B), of 1901<sup>16</sup> or *Charnwood* at 22 Stanhope Grove (graded D) nearby.

### Assessment Against Criteria

#### *Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria*

*CRITERION A: The historical importance, association with or relationship to Boroondara's history of the place or object.*

*Coolattie* was one of a large number of substantial houses constructed in Camberwell in the late Victorian period. In this regard it is not considered to be of particular distinction when compared with other examples.

*CRITERION E: The importance of the place or object in exhibiting good design or aesthetic characteristics and/or in exhibiting a richness, diversity or unusual integration of features.*

*Coolattie* is a complex and sophisticated design in its planning and verandah usage, and in its scaling of surface ornament and sculpture.

Its most distinctive aspect is its plan, which is transversely proportioned and quite centralized, in the manner of a later Federation plan and those which mark early Arts and Crafts and Bungalow designs. The plan reflects the diagonally oriented, 'facadeless' system then gaining momentum in contemporary Federation architecture<sup>17</sup>, and the roof and elevations express internal plan circumstances clearly. The wing placement reflects the growing recognition of climate in the early Federation period, in creating both south-west wind protection for the entry porch and a greater control of shade for the verandah to the west.

*Coolattie's* external presentation, with its mixture of Italianate and Federation elements, is an interesting and quite successful resolution, while suggesting a stylistic transition in domestic architecture. The design is impressive in its control of scale and encompasses a broad range of detail spanning Italianate, Queen Anne and more distinctly Federation approaches. *Coolattie's* combination of late Victorian Italianate and early Federation elements is found in numerous other villa residences in the immediate area, however, it is one of a smaller number of examples in Camberwell to bring this transitional approach to a more substantial house.

### Statement of Significance

*Coolattie*, at 29 Canterbury Road Camberwell, is of local historical and architectural significance. It is a handsome and relatively intact example of a substantial late Victorian residence in Camberwell combining a distinctive transversely proportioned and centralized plan form with a complex elevational treatment. The design is impressive in its control of scale and encompasses a broad range of detail spanning Italianate, Queen Anne and more distinctly Federation approaches. *Coolattie's* combination of late Victorian Italianate and early Federation elements is found in numerous other villa residences in the immediate area, however, it is one of a smaller number of examples in Camberwell to bring this transitional approach to a more substantial house.

### Grading Review

Unchanged.

### Recommendations

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme.

### Identified By

G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

### References

*General:* G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

*Specific:*

<sup>1</sup> G Butler, City of Camberwell Conservation Study, v. 4, p. 74.

<sup>2</sup> Shire of Camberwell Rate Books, 1895-6, 51; 1896-7, 51, 52; 1898-9, 54. It is interesting to note that Guthridge called tenders for a brick villa residence in Camberwell in April 1897, *Building, Engineering and Mining Journal*, 24 April 1897, supp, p. 2.

<sup>3</sup> Shire of Boroondara and Camberwell Rate Book, 1902-3, 58; Electoral Roll, 1908.

<sup>4</sup> *Building Mining and Engineering Journal*, 17 July 1895, p. 238, cited in Miles Lewis Index of Australian Architecture.

<sup>5</sup> G Butler, City of Camberwell Conservation Study, v. 4, p. 74.

<sup>6</sup> Miles Lewis Index of Australian Architecture, references for Richard M Guthridge.

<sup>7</sup> G Butler, City of Camberwell Conservation Study, v. 4, p. 74; The original property is shown on the MMBW Detail Plan No. 70 of c. 1905. The apartment subdivision is mentioned in the City of Camberwell Building Inspection Record, 5 March 1957- 27 December 1958: 'Met Mrs Hume re convert former apartment house back into a dwelling'. City of Camberwell Building Index, # 21180, dated 23 August 1957.

<sup>8</sup> City of Boroondara Planning File 1002:29.

<sup>9</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, #78117, dated 18 June 1986, and accompanying drawings by J&R Drafting; #81488, dated 27 October 1986.

<sup>10</sup> City of Camberwell Building Index, # 98137, dated 17 September 1993 and # 2600, dated 13 September 1994.

<sup>11</sup> Building Permit no. 01/01730, dated 12 September 2001, City of Boroondara Building File 40/408/04887. See letter to Ms FF Sadler, 26 November 2002, and 'key plan' showing reconstructed verandas, June 2001.

<sup>12</sup> This nineteenth-century mannerism- or 'montage classicism'- was first discussed by Peter Kohane in 'Classicism transformed: a study of façade composition in Victoria', *Transition*, July 1983, revising cumulative arguments advanced by George Tibbits in 'The classical tradition in Victoria: represented structure and style', in David Saunders, ed., *Architectural papers 1976*, Sydney: Art Association of Australia, 1977.

<sup>13</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, #78117, dated 18 June 1986 and accompanying drawings by J&R Drafting.

<sup>14</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, #76159, dated 24 August 1984; #98147, dated 20 September 1993.

<sup>15</sup> Milne's designs were published in *The Salon* in 1912-17. See also Donald Leslie Johnson, *Australian Architecture 1901-51: Sources of Modernism*, Sydney, University of Sydney Press, 1981. *Western Architect* and *The Architectural Record* published similar plans, mainly for bungalows and other free style houses, in the United States after c. 1905, by Wilson Eyre, Harrie Lindeberg, C Howard Walker and others.

<sup>16</sup> G Butler, City of Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, v. 4, p. 75-6.

<sup>17</sup> See, esp., Miles Lewis, 'The Victorian house', in Richard Apperly, et al., *The History and Design of the Australian House*, Melbourne, Oxford, 1985; Conrad Hamann, 'The inclusive tradition in Victoria's architecture', in AGL Shaw, ed., *Victoria's Heritage*, Sydney, Allen and Unwin, 1986.



<b>Name</b>	<i>Ericstane</i>	<b>Reference No</b>	
<b>Address</b>	136 Canterbury Road, Canterbury	<b>Survey Date</b>	17-18 November 2005; inspected
<b>Building Type</b>	Residence	<b>Grading</b>	B
<b>Date</b>	1893	<b>Previous Grading</b>	B



#### Extent of Overlay

To title boundaries.

**Intactness** ☒ Good ☐ Fair ☐ Poor

**Heritage Status** ☐ HV ☐ AHC ☐ NT ☐ Rec. ☐ BPS Heritage Overlay

#### History

John Grieve, who was described as a gentleman (retired), owned and occupied this nine room brick house, on allotments 1 and 22 of the Griffin Estate, from 1893 until 1898 when it was leased to manufacturer Burdett Laycock<sup>1</sup>. After a short period of re-occupation by John Grieve, the *Melbourne Directory* replaces him with Mrs Annie Grieve, possibly after his death<sup>2</sup>.

Graeme Butler has noted that Grieve may have been of Connibere, Grieve and Connibere, warehousemen of Melbourne, however this has not been confirmed. There is equally no evidence for the inferred link between this house and the prominent architect, Beverley Ussher, who Butler notes worked for the Grieve family in the area during 1907.<sup>3</sup>

The timber structure shown on the MMBW Detail Plan No. 70 of c. 1905 at the north-west corner of the house is thought to have been a conservatory; this has been demolished. Minor alterations and additions have been made to the house; these are noted below under Description and Integrity.

The rear section of Ericstane's allotment has been subdivided and developed for a separate residence (date unknown).

(G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, additional research by Lovell Chen, 2005)

#### Description & Integrity

*Ericstane* is a substantial house in the Italianate manner, set well away from the street on its primary (Canterbury Road) street frontage. It is a single-storey brick residence with an asymmetrical front elevation with projecting canted bay and return bull-nosed verandah set clear of the roof eave line with cast iron columns and cast iron lace frieze. The site drops away to the south with the result that

the main wing extending along Marlowe Street appears two-storey. In fact it houses an extensive undercroft cellar with stairs up into the main house, now sealed off, and some sleeping accommodation for servants. This is lit from the south by a set of undercroft windows directly below the living room. *Ericstane* has a hipped slate roof ridged in galvanized iron, and regular-spaced brackets. The verandah springs from just below the eave brackets, and is of galvanized iron supported on a set of cast-iron columns and fitted with a decorative frieze in cast iron lace. A conservatory was on the northeast corner of the main house, but this had deteriorated structurally and has been demolished pending a replacement. Walls and chimneys are in umber Hawthorn brick picked out in an energetic polychrome with cream stripes, impost, and quoins, red brick window surrounds, red patterning below the eaves and alternating red and cream brick voussoir-bricks over each window. The quoins are set out marginally from each wall corner.

The house appears to be generally intact externally, the main addition being a bathroom and associated verandah (the reference is to Bath Rm Ver.) in 1964. An outside laundry has been refurbished more recently and screened by a lattice, and the neighbouring toilet has been renewed. A freestanding dual carport was added in 1992, with roller doors facing onto Marlowe Street. The other alterations are not easily visible from Marlowe Street, however.<sup>4</sup> The interior has been completely refurbished in a manner compatible with the original house, and intended to reinstate the original décor. This includes the provision of William Morris wallpaper throughout the living and sleeping rooms, careful maintenance of the joinery, much of which is in a Queen Anne pattern of detailing, and a modified kitchen and scullery area with an additional toilet. The bathrooms have been refurbished in an early twentieth century manner with exposed chromium shower plumbing and 1900s-1920s pattern furniture. The living room has a spectacular arcade of windows, with beveled patterning and leadlighting dating from the 1920s. The fireplaces have been refurbished with renewed tiling from other sites, and have almost all their mirrored Queen Anne mantels intact.

Extensive garden plantings in recent years and raising the hedge screen have largely obscured the house from the street, though some details can be viewed from Marlowe Street to the immediate east. The main trees- a palm and conifers, are long-standing, as are most of the garden plantings.

The property has a new timber picket fence, added in 1986. The gate posts incorporate what appear to be reused cast iron finials from the original fence.<sup>5</sup>

### Historical Context

By the early twentieth century, this section of Canterbury Road had developed with a mix of residences and commercial buildings, the latter concentrated around the railway line.<sup>6</sup> The c. 1905 MMBW Detail Plan No. 71 shows No. 136 (*Ericstane*) as one of the more prominent residences in the immediate area.

### Comparative Analysis

Butler reports that the renowned architect Beverley Ussher was working for the original clients around 1907, but *Ericstane*, completed much earlier, looks like another's design. The vigorously woven polychrome is a distinctive element, visibly different from the Joseph Reed-derived polychromy of 1885-91 elsewhere in Boroondara, and differs also from the stripped High Victorian of 12 Vincent Street, Surrey Hills (q.v., B-graded), completed around the same time, or the nearby *Tarawarra*, 13 Victoria Avenue, of 1890 (q.v., B-graded).<sup>7</sup> In general form and details it looks closer to the 1888-91 houses in Alma Road Camberwell (15, 25, 33, 36, q.v., all B-graded). The interior has been largely refurbished, but in a sympathetic manner that emphasizes the extensive arts and crafts and Queen Anne fittings that evidently marked out the original house. This combination of an Arts and Crafts-Queen Anne interior, coupled with an Italianate exterior, compares with Charles Webb's *Mandeville Hall* in 10 Mandeville Crescent Toorak, of 1876-8.<sup>8</sup>

### Assessment Against Criteria

*Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria*

*CRITERION D: The importance of a place or object in exhibiting the principal characteristics or the representative nature of a place or object as a part of a class or type of places or objects.*

*Ericstane* is a handsome and externally relatively intact example of a polychrome Italianate house, typical of medium-to-large residences in the Camberwell area just prior to the shift to the Federation styles. It has a dignified sense of command on its hill site.

*CRITERION E: The importance of the place or object in exhibiting good design or aesthetic characteristics and/or in exhibiting a richness, diversity or unusual integration of features.*

The polychrome brickwork, vigorously patterned and woven, is *Ericstane's* most distinctive element, and the house is accomplished and well-crafted in its details.

### Statement of Significance

*Ericstane*, at 136 Canterbury Road, Canterbury, is of local historical and architectural significance as a handsome and externally relatively intact example of a polychrome Italianate house, typical of medium-to-large residences in the Camberwell area just prior to the shift to the Federation styles. It has a dignified sense of command on its hill site, and its well-placed in its rich garden. The polychrome brickwork, vigorously patterned and woven, is *Ericstane's* most distinctive element, and the house is accomplished and well-crafted in its details.

### Grading Review

Unchanged.

### Recommendations

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme.

### Identified By

G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

### References

*General:* G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

*Specific:*

<sup>1</sup> Shire of Camberwell Rate Books, 1893-4, 1123; 1898-9, 1036; 1899-1900, 1114.

<sup>2</sup> Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria, 1905; 1906.

<sup>3</sup> Reference is to Miles Lewis Index of Australian Architecture.

<sup>4</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, # dated 21 April 1964.

<sup>5</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, # 34987, dated 21 April 1964 (new bathroom and verandah); #79541, dated 8 January 1986 (fence); #95304, dated 13 July 1992 (garage). The garage permit is listed as a carport but it is now, at least, an enclosed garage with automatic doors.

<sup>6</sup> See Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria, 1901, MMBW Detail Plan No. 71, c. 1905.

<sup>7</sup> Outlined in G Butler, City of Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, vol. 4, pp. 291 (Tarawarra) and 295-6 (12 Vincent Street).

<sup>8</sup> See Philip Goad, *Melbourne Architecture: a Guide*, Watermark, Sydney, 1999, p. 60. Illustrated extensively in Suzanne Forge, *Victorian Splendour*, Oxford, Melbourne, 1985.

---

<b>Name</b>	House	<b>Reference No</b>	
<b>Address</b>	138 Canterbury Road, Canterbury	<b>Survey Date</b>	17-18 November 2005
<b>Building Type</b>	Residence	<b>Grading</b>	B
<b>Date</b>	1908-9	<b>Previous Grading</b>	B



**Extent of Overlay**

To title boundaries.

---

**Intactness**    ☒ Good    ☐ Fair    ☐ Poor

**Heritage Status**    ☐ HV    ☐ AHC    ☐ NT    ☐ Rec.    BPS Heritage Overlay

**History**

Preston architect, C. H. Richardson, designed and built this house for his own use in 1909, remaining there until c1914.<sup>1</sup> The house was to be of brick, 26 squares area and two storeys.<sup>2</sup> A series of owners followed, including William McCleary, William Bedford, a Mrs L. Talbot and Percy K. Watts.<sup>3</sup>

(G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, additional research by Lovell Chen, 2005)

**Description & Integrity**

138 Canterbury Road is a representative example of a late Federation villa. It has a terracotta tiled roof in the characteristic Marseilles pattern, with a central hip and integrated flared verandahs framed by a short projecting wing facing Canterbury Road and a longer wing facing Marlowe Street. The combination of these with a corner bay and conical tower above that was again typical of Federation design, in the wake of Alfred Dunn, Evander McIver and Beverley Ussher's seminal essays in the mode, 1889-91.<sup>4</sup> In this example the corner tower has been shifted from its customarily central placing, possibly to allow for views of the Dandenong Ranges. The verandah valances are in solid fretwork arch patterns of a type common in Melbourne's suburbs, and the verandah posts have several Art Nouveau flourishes. The wall treatment, in red brick with rough-cast stucco, friezes, is also characteristic.

While they may not be the original, the fence and diagonally braced gateposts are in an appropriate style. A red brick garage was added in 1981 and is of sympathetic design.<sup>5</sup> A swimming pool was planned in 1989 but was not proceeded with.<sup>6</sup>

## Historical Context

By the early twentieth century, this section of Canterbury Road had developed with a mix of residences and commercial buildings, the latter concentrated around the railway line.<sup>7</sup> The c. 1905 MMBW Detail Plan was prepared some years prior to the construction of No 138, though on the other side of Marlowe Street, No. 136 (*Ericstane*) was standing at this time.

## Comparative Analysis

Though more modest, this corner composition by Richardson compares with Ussher and Kemp, Christopher Cowper and other better-known architects active in Boroondara in the Federation period. The house is smaller than most of these better-known architects' designs, and the main corner view has a simplicity in form and line, without a strong vertical element such as an accentuated set of gables or a conspicuous drum for its tower. This, plus a regular and conspicuous accentuation of rafters, suggests an early drift toward bungalow form.<sup>8</sup> A larger but formally direct counterpart was Ward and Carleton's *St Hilary's* of 1904 at the Mont Albert Road- Victoria Avenue corner, now demolished.<sup>9</sup>

## Assessment Against Criteria

*Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria*

*CRITERION D: The importance of a place or object in exhibiting the principal characteristics or the representative nature of a place or object as a part of a class or type of places or objects.*

138 Canterbury Road is a fine and externally intact example of a middle-to-late brick Federation period house which is shown to advantage on this corner site.

*CRITERION E: The importance of the place or object in exhibiting good design or aesthetic characteristics and/or in exhibiting a richness, diversity or unusual integration of features.*

138 Canterbury Road is of minor interest for the suggestion, albeit subtle, of a shift towards an emerging Australian bungalow form within what is still very much a Federation house, and for the general dominance of its roof form over the more usual vertical relieving or counterbalancing elements seen in Federation architecture.

## Statement of Significance

138 Canterbury Road, Canterbury is of local historical and architectural significance as a fine and externally intact example of a middle-to-late brick Federation period house which is shown to advantage on its corner site. It is of minor interest stylistically in its anticipation of an emerging Australian bungalow form within what is still very much a Federation house, and for the general dominance of its roof form.

## Grading Review

Unchanged.

## Recommendations

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme.

## Identified By

G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

## References

*General:* G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

*Specific:*

<sup>1</sup> *Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria*, 1914; MMBW Drainage Plan Application # 66078; Camberwell Building Permit Applications 1899-1918, 1108.

<sup>2</sup> Camberwell Building Permit Applications 1899-1918, 1108.

<sup>3</sup> *Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria*, 1915; 1920; 1925; 1935.

<sup>4</sup> McIver's *Elderslie*, 15 Alma Road Camberwell, is discussed elsewhere in this review. For the Dunn and Ussher's contributions to the approach see *Australasian Builder and Contractor's News*, 1889 (for

Dunn's houses on the Irving Road Estate, Windsor) and *The Building and Engineering Journal*, 8.184, 9 January 1892, p. 14 (Ussher's *Cottage by the Sea*).

<sup>5</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, # 69519, dated 17 August 1981.

<sup>6</sup> Details sourced from City of Camberwell Building Index, # 89255, dated 17 October 1989, and #89563, dated 30 November 1989.

<sup>7</sup> See *Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria*, 1901, MMBW Detail Plan No. 71, c. 1905.

<sup>8</sup> The shift toward the bungalow was under way by about 1906, as suggested by Reginald Prevost's *Australian Bungalow and House Designs* of that year, modelled as a 'bungalow book' on the Californian or Craftsman pattern. The relative plainness of the house also coincides with a reaction against the formal complexity of contemporary Federation architecture, seen in professional journals such as *Art and Architecture* and their contemporary criticism. Arguably, Australia's emergent 'bungalow' of the period 1908-1915 was as much a transformation of Federation architecture and a response to the British Edwardian free styles as it was to any specifically Californian or Craftsman precedent.

<sup>9</sup> No 147 Mont Albert Road, demolished in the c. late 1990s was B-graded building in the Camberwell Conservation Study. Its demolition and replacement with stuccoed townhouses provoked a wide outcry and stimulated Save our Suburbs action in the Camberwell area.



---

<b>Name</b>	House and Surgery	<b>Reference No</b>	
<b>Address</b>	169 Canterbury Road, Canterbury	<b>Survey Date</b>	16 November 2005
<b>Building Type</b>	Residence	<b>Grading</b>	B
<b>Date</b>	1903-4	<b>Previous Grading</b>	B



#### Extent of Overlay

To title boundaries.

---

**Intactness**    ☒ Good    ☐ Fair    ☐ Poor

**Heritage Status**    ☐ HV    ☐ AHC    ☐ NT    ☐ Rec.    BPS Heritage Overlay

#### History

Surgeon, George H. Armstrong practised from this house after its construction for him in c. 1903-4, to the design of renowned domestic architects, Ussher & Kemp.<sup>1</sup> The builders were E. and N. Lyon.<sup>2</sup>

Armstrong remained there until the 1920s when Emily Scipell of Box Hill owned the house.<sup>3</sup> After serving as a boarding house it was subsequently bought by the Baptist Union,<sup>4</sup> who later built the church next door. The residence was subsequently converted by the Baptist Union for use as a special accommodation Lodge for Boys.<sup>5</sup> The laundry was extended in 1958; the kitchen, staffroom and cool room were altered and extended slightly in 1971, and a fire escape was added at the rear.<sup>6</sup>

No. 169 was converted to a house and consulting rooms for a new owner, Mr Li Wong, in 1983 and gained new rear and side fences in 1988.<sup>7</sup>

(G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, additional research by Lovell Chen, 2005)

#### Description & Integrity

169 Canterbury Road is a two-storey Federation house with a south-facing verandah flanked by a gabled wing, facing Canterbury Road, to the immediate south, and a corner tower formed from a curved bay built into the verandah. A smaller single-storeyed bay is built into a half-timbered screen near the front door. The roof is terra cotta tiles in a Marseilles pattern; the large Gryphon is a more recent addition. There is no verandah valance and the balustrading combines timber slats in groups of three, arranged into a rather Japanese-looking pattern with paired slats supporting balustrade. A round arch with slats is over the entry toward the front door. The arches around the verandah's western tower bay are pointed, and the verandah posts are in turned timber. The south gabled bay has its upper storey in a hung tile surface of terracotta which flares into a bracketed hood over the ground floor's bay window. All four bay windows on the south side are canted, with large casements,

glazed in a grid of small panes, with large segmentally arched or flat topped sashes in three of the bays, and surmounted in three of the bays by smaller lights, again in segmentally arched frames. The upper floor bedroom windows are in a differently sized paning and thinner in their framing and trim, suggesting they have been altered. The walls are otherwise in a plain coursed red brick, with a half timbered roughcast stucco frieze running across the ground floor corner bay and entrance screen. The west side is marked by an asymmetrically stepped chimney breast with a stack that pierces another half-timbered gable, which in turn is played off against three roof slopes alongside and below. The roof, south, west and east elevations appear intact, and the north side has not had substantial alterations either. The cyclone-wire fence dates from 1957, as does the gravelled car court to the immediate west. The garden is relatively dense and contains at least one mature tree.

### Historical Context

By the early twentieth century, this section of Canterbury Road had developed with a mix of residences and commercial buildings, the latter concentrated around the railway line.<sup>8</sup> It is noted that the c. 1905 MMBW Detail Plan does not show No 169, this anomaly perhaps suggesting that it had not been completed at the time the survey was undertaken for the plan.

### Comparative Analysis

169 Canterbury Road compares directly with other Canterbury and Camberwell houses by Ussher, and by Ussher and Kemp after 1899. The nearest is their house and pharmacy, 198 Canterbury Road, next to the railway station, of 1899.<sup>9</sup> Their Camberwell designs also include the Cupples house, *Travancore*, at 104 (now 608) Riversdale Road of the same year (A-graded), the Halsey house, 69 Broadway, 1900-1 (B-graded), and 27 Balwyn Road (1906, A-graded). Larger Ussher and Kemp houses in Canterbury area include Ussher's highly influential Hedges house at 20 Knutsford Street, c. 1895, now hemmed in by subdivisions, and his Mellor house, *Coorinyah*, 150 Mont Albert Road, 1898-9, the latter being graded A in the Camberwell Conservation Study of 1991.<sup>10</sup> No. 169 is one of several doctors' houses and surgeries designed by Ussher and Kemp, and is similar in proportions and detail to one at Bellair Street, Kensington in 1898-9<sup>11</sup> and the 1904 Laidlaw house at Hamilton in Western Victoria.<sup>12</sup> Both No. 169 Canterbury Road and the Hamilton house use similar window framing ribbons of half timbering across their ground floors, almost an Ussher and Kemp signature, and they counterbalance square flanking wings with a semicircular or faceted bay. Some aspects of No. 169's detail recur in Henry Kemp's best known house design, *Dalswraith* at 99 Studley Park Road, Kew, of 1906 (A-graded in the Kew Urban Conservation Study), particularly the double bracketing under the tile-hung upper gable wing, which is very similar, the double-bracketed half-timbered gable and the ribbons of half timber and roughcast stucco.<sup>13</sup> In general No. 169 Canterbury Road has a tightness and verticality in its composition that suggests Kemp as the controlling designer.<sup>14</sup>

### Assessment Against Criteria

#### *Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria*

*CRITERION D: The importance of a place or object in exhibiting the principal characteristics or the representative nature of a place or object as a part of a class or type of places or objects.*

169 Canterbury Road is characteristic of Federation two-storey houses at the high tide of that period in Australian architecture.

*CRITERION E: The importance of the place or object in exhibiting good design or aesthetic characteristics and/or in exhibiting a richness, diversity or unusual integration of features.*

169 Canterbury Road, Canterbury is an accomplished composition combining corner bay and flanking wing and making inventive use of half-timbered patterning. It reflects the main compositional elements running in Ussher and Kemp's design work of the period.

*CRITERION G: The importance of the place or object in demonstrating social or cultural associations*

169 Canterbury Road is one of the more prominent designs by the renowned residential partnership of Ussher and Kemp at a time when the practice was at its peak. It compares directly- and favorably- with other leading designs of theirs, particularly among their two-storey houses, and is a direct predecessor to Kemp's renowned *Dalswraith* in Kew.



## Statement of Significance

Designed by Ussher and Kemp for surgeon George H Armstrong and constructed in 1903-4, No. 169 Canterbury Road is of local historical and architectural significance. It is a fine, representative and externally intact example of a two-storey Federation residence which is distinguished architecturally by its accomplished design, combining corner bay and flanking wing and making inventive use of half-timbered patterning. It is of significance as a prominent commission by renowned domestic architects Ussher and Kemp, completed at a time when the practice was at its peak. It compares directly- and favorably- with other leading designs of theirs, particularly among their two-storey houses, and is a direct predecessor to Kemp's renowned *Dalswraith* in Kew.

## Grading Review

Unchanged.

## Recommendations

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme.

## Identified By

G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

## References

*General:* G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

*Specific:*

<sup>1</sup> Shire of Boroondara Rate Book, 1904-5, 38; Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria, 1905; MMBW Drainage Plan Application, No. 57777. George Tibbits dates the house at 1903. See Ch 4 in Trevor Howells, *Towards the Dawn: Federation Architecture in Australia 1890-1915*, Sydney, Hale and Iremonger, 1989, pp. 62-3. Ussher and Kemp form a major part of Tibbits' discussion in this chapter, and comparative examples discussed in this report draw from that account in dating and other information. This chapter was a development from an earlier essay, 'The so-called Melbourne Domestic Queen Anne', *Historic Environment*, 2, 2, 1981, pp. 4-42, 2, 3, pp. 42-3.

<sup>2</sup> City of Camberwell Building Applications, 1899-1918, # 385.

<sup>3</sup> MMBW Drainage Plan Application, No. 57777.

<sup>4</sup> MMBW Drainage Plan Application, No. 57777.

<sup>5</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index: unspecified alterations to *Weller Lodge*, for the Baptist Union, dated 17 September 1934; # 5425, dated 23 August 1950; #19150, dated 7 September 1956. Described as a boarding house, 13 February 1956; a hostel, # 37586 (??), dated 3 August 1965. The fence was #50155, dated 25 November 1971 (as a Lodge for Boys).

<sup>6</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, # 23139, dated 24 July 1958 (laundry); #49185, dated 25 May 1971, (kitchen area) and RJ O'Connor, working drawings, same date.

<sup>7</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, # 84564, # 84680, dated 19 January 1988 and 11 February 1988 respectively.

<sup>8</sup> See *Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria*, 1901, MMBW Detail Plan No. 71, c. 1905.

<sup>9</sup> Listed in Andrew Trollope, 'Henry Kemp', architectural research project, University of Melbourne, c. 1969.

<sup>10</sup> These houses are discussed by George Tibbits in Ch 4 of Trevor Howells (ed., contrib.), *Towards the Dawn: Federation architecture in Australia 1890-1915*, Hale and Iremonger, Sydney, 1989, pp. 47-86. The Canterbury chemist's is listed by Andrew Trollope in his study of Henry Kemp, Faculty of Architecture, University of Melbourne, c. 1969. The Hedges house, not listed in Butler's study, was illustrated extensively in the *Building, Engineering and Mining Journal*, 16, 576, 13 November 1897, p. 355, cited by Tibbits, n. 27, p. 209. Tibbits' biography of Kemp is in the *Australian Dictionary of Biography*, 9, 1891-1939, MUP, Melbourne, 1983, pp. 562-3.

<sup>11</sup> Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, v. 4, p. 79.

<sup>12</sup> Illustrated in Howells, *Towards the Dawn*, front and rear endpapers.

<sup>13</sup> Tibbits, in Howells, *Towards the Dawn*, pp. 54-5, 57-8. Rated A by Sanderson, Kew Urban Conservation Study, 1988.

<sup>14</sup> Graeme Butler has suggested that this house has a more pronounced European demeanour rather than the American affinity common in Federation architecture (as, perhaps, in H H Richardson's Watts Sherman house at Newport, Rhode Island, of 1874).<sup>14</sup> But Federation architecture was syncretic by nature and these components were more a matter of degree than defining stylistic characterizations.



<b>Name</b>	<i>Ospringle</i>	<b>Reference No</b>	
<b>Address</b>	24 Chaucer Crescent, Canterbury	<b>Survey Date</b>	16 November 2005
<b>Building Type</b>	Residence	<b>Grading</b>	B
<b>Date</b>	c.1905	<b>Previous Grading</b>	B



#### Extent of Overlay

Note that this residence appears to be on an unusual shaped block which extends in part through to Dudley Parade. Only the Chaucer Crescent section of the block need be included in the Heritage Overlay.

**Intactness** ☒ Good ☐ Fair ☐ Poor

**Heritage Status** ☐ HV ☐ AHC ☐ NT ☐ Rec. BPS Heritage Overlay

#### History

Mrs Rebecca Newbold commissioned Camberwell builder, James Currie, to erect this eight room brick house in 1905.<sup>1</sup> It was subsequently leased to Andrew Newbold Phair, a warehouse assistant and probably a relative, whilst Rebecca lived next door at 26 Chaucer Crescent.<sup>2</sup> The c. 1905 MMBW Detail Plan No. 71 shows the subject site as vacant, although the house at No. 26 Chaucer Crescent is shown. Another Andrew Phair, (Andrew Thomas) who worked with the railways, also lived in Chaucer Crescent, as did Christiana and Chrissie Phair, a stenographer. The Phair family occupied the house at No. 24 through the 1920s-30s.

Numerous alterations and additions are recorded in Council's files for the property. These are referred to below under Description & Integrity.

(G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, additional research by Lovell Chen, 2005)

#### Description & Integrity

*Ospringle* is a large Federation house of 1905. It has a large transverse gable bisected with two wing gables pushing toward the street, and a verandah, integral with the roof, to the north-west corner. One of the gables is an expanded, floating dormer; the other is a main wing gable fronting the main bedroom. The terracotta tiling is in Marseilles pattern, with a light fascia on exposed rafter tips and vigorously scaled half-timbered gables. The windows are segmentally arched casements, each topped with a frame of two smaller lights, with shutters (the latter possibly added later). Walls are a combination of red brick with roughcast stucco just under the eaves and gables, and the verandah is supported on turned timber posts interspersed with segmental arches and timber slats. The balustrade is similarly consistent slatting.

The house is generally intact as viewed from Chaucer Crescent, though numerous alterations and major additions have occurred at the rear. At the front of the house, the main change has been the addition of a flue designed in the form of a Federation dove-cote-chimney. Alterations are more extensive to the rear of the house, where a study was added on the west side and a family room and library space to the east side between 1975 and 1976.<sup>3</sup> The kitchen was also redesigned and rebuilt. The study projects 2m to the west side, while the family room and library area are flush with the original east wall.<sup>4</sup>

Additions included a garage further to the rear, linked to a large two-storey cabana, with a half-timbered gable and two dormers, which was approved after some deliberations on 4 July 1975. A verandah to the cabana was added in 1976, and a billiard room was remodelled on the first floor. A solarium was added in 1984.<sup>5</sup> The garage and cabana were designed in a recreated Federation mode, complete with small-paned windows, half-timbering and terracotta ridge capping. Earlier photographs on file taken from the back garden also show that a second large dormer was added to the rear elevation later, and that a simple garage/shed was placed where the current garage-cabana is now.<sup>6</sup> The new fenestration on the rear wall was part of the alterations of 1975-6.

In the 1970s a high fence was added. A swimming pool followed in September of that year, and a high front fence was added in October.<sup>7</sup>

With the exception of the flue, most of the alterations and additions to the house pre-date the 1991 Camberwell Conservation Study. Most are set well back from the street and/or held clear so that the house continues to be read clearly in its original configuration. The exceptions are the study, which protrudes 2m on the west side, and the new heating flue, which rises from the main gable at the front. In the 1991 Camberwell Conservation Study survey Graeme Butler noted incompatible paint colors, however, the pink he noted there has been replaced by a warm stone and dark green combination, more typical of the period.<sup>8</sup>

The house is set on an unusually shaped allotment, which appears to extend in part through to Dudley Parade, and has allowed for the construction of major rear additions.

### Historical Context

Chaucer Crescent was partly developed in the Federation period and there are other examples in the street, though generally not as intact to their original street presentation.

### Comparative Analysis

*Ospringle* is a richly proportioned and varied Federation composition, recalling earlier designs with vigorous multi gable compositions, such as Guyon Purchas' *Tay Creggan* at 30 Yarra Street Hawthorn, of 1891-2 (graded A2 in the Hawthorn Heritage Study). The details are more characteristic of the 1900s, however, particularly of Ussher and Kemp houses in the area. This is seen particularly in the window framing, the proportioning of the half timbered gables, and with the verandah, the solid timber posts, frieze and balustrade.

### Assessment Against Criteria

*Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria*

*CRITERION D: The importance of a place or object in exhibiting the principal characteristics or the representative nature of a place or object as a part of a class or type of places or objects.*

*Ospringle* is a fine, broadly externally intact and representative example of a single-storey Federation residence and is characteristic of the residential building stock of Canterbury's early twentieth century consolidation. It is an assured composition with solid and original detail on its north side, with the later additions largely concentrated to the east side and rear, allowing the original house form to read clearly.

### Statement of Significance

*Ospringle* is of local historical and architectural significance as a fine, broadly externally intact and representative example of a single-storey Federation residence. It is richly proportioned and varied composition with solid and original detail on its principal north elevation, with the later additions largely concentrated to the east side and rear, allowing the original house form to read clearly. In its

form and architectural style and detailing, it is characteristic of the residential building stock of Canterbury's early twentieth century consolidation

### **Grading Review**

Unchanged.

### **Recommendations**

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme.

### **Identified By**

G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

### **References**

*General:* G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

*Specific:*

<sup>1</sup> MMBW Drainage Plan Application no. 48426; City of Camberwell Building Applications 1899-1918, no. 533.

<sup>2</sup> Electoral Roll 1912; *Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria*, 1925.

<sup>3</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, see construction inspection notes.

<sup>4</sup> Drawings by Steen and Tan, architects dated 18 April 1975, sourced from City of Camberwell Building Index, # 57168, dated 6 June 1975.

<sup>5</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building index, # 63892 (billiard room) dated 13 October 1975; # 72922, (verandah to cabana and shade house) dated 8 March 1983; #6836 (solarium), dated 5 February 1984.

<sup>6</sup> Photographs sourced through the City of Camberwell Building index.

<sup>7</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, #57168, dated 6 June 1975 (internal alterations and extensions, garage); #57316, dated 4 July 1975 (detached playroom); 57759-(?), dated 18 September 1975 (swimming pool); and 57833, dated 2 October 1975 (fences).

<sup>8</sup> G Butler, City of Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, v. 4, p. 90.

---

<b>Name</b>	House	<b>Reference No</b>	
<b>Address</b>	44 Currajong Avenue, Camberwell	<b>Survey Date</b>	2 September 2005
<b>Building Type</b>	Residence	<b>Grading</b>	B
<b>Date</b>	1919-20	<b>Previous Grading</b>	B



**Extent of Overlay**

To title boundaries.

---

**Intactness**    ☒ Good    ☐ Fair    ☐ Poor

**Heritage Status**    ☐ HV    ☐ AHC    ☐ NT    ☐ Rec.    BPS Heritage Overlay

**History**

In 1919 John Francis Storie, a clerk, purchased Allotment 71 and had a brick, five roomed house built on the property. John and Iris J. Storie lived here until the early 1960s.<sup>1</sup>

A number of alterations and additions have been undertaken in recent years (refer Description & Integrity).

(G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, additional research by Lovell Chen, 2005)

**Description & Integrity**

The house at 44 Currajong Avenue, Camberwell, is a double-fronted bungalow constructed in 1919. It is of red brick to a level just above the verandah, relieved by clinker brick dressing on the verandah piers. Above, the two front gables overlap, compositionally, in the manner of many Australian bungalows on standard sites, and are clad in textured stucco,<sup>2</sup> weatherboards and shingles. The roof is medium to low pitch for its period, clad in terracotta Marseilles pattern tiles. The verandah is a striking and simple transverse structure, flat roofed, showing its beams and rafters, and supported by timber posts and diagonal struts. The low verandah fence appears to be a later addition. The verandah's beams project beyond the west gutter line of its roof, heightening a Japanese effect. A Federation vestige is in the double canted bays at the northwest corner, which combine to form a five-sided corner bay.

External alterations and additions include a weatherboard lean-to sun room on the west side (c. 1990)<sup>3</sup> and a rear addition of relatively recent origins<sup>4</sup> with a roofline that rises about a metre above the main gable of the original house and matches the original gable angles. Though visible, this rear wing is not unsympathetic and does not dominate.

A timber carport, with weatherboard cladding down to car height and a tile roof matching that of the house has also been constructed on the west side of the house and is set well back. The garden includes some mature trees (Australian natives) which may have been planted in the c.1970s. The western half of the front yard has been brick paved to form a car parking area and the fence is non-original.

### Historical Context

The Sunnyside Estate was laid out in the late 1910s to a plan by surveyor Walter Webb. It was a controlled subdivision, with residential only 'zoning', materials and setbacks controls and a requirement that each lot be developed for a single dwelling with a minimum construction price of 600 pounds (excluding architect's fees). It was promoted as having 'no equal in Australia', 'every lot ... a perfect piece of nature's handiwork', and at 'the very summit of Burke Road ... Right on the Electric Tram Route'.<sup>5</sup> Unlike other estate subdivisions of the period, Sunnyside was sold and built on immediately following the end of WWI, with most original houses dating from c. 1918-1926.<sup>6</sup>

### Comparative Analysis

44 Currajong Avenue is a leading example of the bungalow as it appeared in Camberwell and Surrey Hills subdivisions immediately after World War I. The house is more elegant in its composition than most bungalow designs of this period, and is marked by a simple poise in its modulation of surface cladding and materials. It compares well with A-graded houses by Leslie Perrott and others in the Camberwell area, such as 10 Donna Buang Street.<sup>7</sup> Its additions, though unremarkable in design, are largely unobtrusive in relation to the original house, and avoided the first floor extension often seen on other bungalows of this type (compare the extensions to 14 Pine Avenue, q.v., for example).

### Assessment Against Criteria

*Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria*

*CRITERION A: The historical importance, association with or relationship to Boroondara's history of the place or object.*

The building forms part of a precinct that when surveyed in 1991 was considered to have a high level of intactness and consistency and to reflect, more than any other area in Camberwell, the character of development in the immediate post-WWI period. While the subject building is of historical interest as part of the Sunnyside Estate, it would not be elevated above any other building in the estate.

*CRITERION D: The importance of a place or object in exhibiting the principal characteristics or the representative nature of a place or object as a part of a class or type of places or objects.*

In plan and general form 44 Currajong Avenue is characteristic of the bungalows constructed in subdivisions in south Camberwell in the period immediately following World War 1, and is one of the more elegant examples. Its retention of some Federation characteristics is typical of bungalows in this period.

*CRITERION E: The importance of the place or object in exhibiting good design or aesthetic characteristics and/or in exhibiting a richness, diversity or unusual integration of features.*

The house has an elegance and spread of bearing in its composition that mark it out from the great majority of bungalows then appearing in the south Camberwell- Surrey Hills area. The verandah appears to float in a way not often seen in contemporary designs, and the house has a distinctive simplicity and balance in its materials and finishes.

### Statement of Significance

44 Currajong Avenue is of local historical and architectural significance as an interesting and distinctive example of a bungalow constructed in the period immediately following WWI. While in its planning and general form 44 Currajong Avenue is characteristic of the bungalows constructed in subdivisions in south Camberwell in the period immediately following World War 1, it is one of the more elegant examples. The verandah appears to float in way not often seen in contemporary designs, and the house has a distinctive simplicity and balance in its materials and finishes. It is located in a streetscape and broader precinct (Sunnyside Estate) of relatively consistent interwar bungalow character.

## Grading Review

Unchanged.

## Recommendations

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme. In making this recommendation, it is noted that the subject building is located within a precinct (Sunnyside Estate) which was identified in the 1991 Camberwell Conservation Study, where it was recommended for planning scheme control. While not surveyed as part of this review, it is likely that the precinct retains a high proportion of graded buildings (predominantly C and D graded buildings), and may still warrant consideration for inclusion in the Heritage Overlay.

## Identified By

G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

## References

*General:* G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

*Specific:*

<sup>1</sup> City of Camberwell Rate Book, 1924-25, 21398, Electoral Roll 1912; City of Camberwell Rate Book, 1917-18, 605; 1919-20, 689; *Sands and McDougall Directory of Victoria*, 1919, 1940, 1950, 1960, 1974.

<sup>2</sup> G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, v. 4, p. 110.

<sup>3</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, #78460, dated 6 August 1985; #89840, dated 18 January 1990, and accompanying existing floor plan drawing by Princeton Homes, dated 18 January 1990. The sunroom is earlier, being shown as cutting through the west-facing canted bay in an earlier version. See 'existing conditions', Princeton Homes working drawings. This sun room was subsequently pulled clear of the corner bay. A rear verandah was also added as part of these additions. The house was reblocked in 1984: see City Camberwell Building Index, #76852, 30 November 1984.

<sup>4</sup> The building records for the property are somewhat unclear, with a number of applications for works apparently not proceeded with. The Building File for the property refers to the construction of an attic loft over the rear family room and it is assumed that this is the date of the addition, Building Application #201426, dated 1 November 2001, City of Camberwell Building File 40/408/2347.

<sup>5</sup> G Butler, City of Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991, v. 3, Precinct 8.

<sup>6</sup> G Butler, City of Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991, v. 3, Precinct 8.

<sup>7</sup> As at 10 Donna Buang Street. Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991, v. 4, p. 115.



---

<b>Name</b>	<i>Mallow</i>	<b>Reference No</b>	
<b>Address</b>	33 Deepdene Road, Balwyn	<b>Survey Date</b>	25 November 2005
<b>Building Type</b>	Residence	<b>Grading</b>	B
<b>Date</b>	1923	<b>Previous Grading</b>	B



**Extent of Overlay**

To title boundaries.

---

**Intactness**    ☒ Good    ☐ Fair    ☐ Poor

**Heritage Status**    ☐ HV    ☐ AHC    ☐ NT    ☐ Rec.    BPS Heritage Overlay

**History**

Charles Foster Browne, alternatively described as a banker or a manufacturer was the first owner-occupier of *Mallow*, described in rate books as a twelve room brick house.<sup>1</sup> Graeme Butler has related Browne's career from 1905, which included the acquisition and management of pastoral property, as well as involvement in various areas of the manufacturing sector.<sup>2</sup>

Other than for a new fence, constructed in 1996, the house does not appear to have been substantially altered.<sup>3</sup>

(G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, additional research by Lovell Chen, 2005)

**Description & Integrity**

*Mallow*, at 33 Deepdene Road is a, transversely massed house of 1923,<sup>4</sup> asymmetrically composed with a projecting wing to the south, and a hipped roof in terracotta tile in a Marseilles pattern, with two chimneys and two hipped wings over the south rooms and the porch. It has boxed eaves in timber planking, and unpainted stucco walls. The main east-facing windows are in three sets with two as curved bays, all have white timber framing and small flat metal hoods. The porch is dominated by a large arch over two inward projecting impost-balustrades, and over which the name *Mallow* is painted in gold. The street presentation of the house is intact, and the garden, behind a 1996 fence, is of long standing and in a sympathetic style. The lawn previously extended right across the east front, bisected by a curving path toward the driveway. This lawn now terminates at the porch and has been replaced with a concrete car court on the northeast side. Other than that, there are no other recorded additions or alterations.<sup>5</sup>

**Historical Context**

33 Deepdene Road is located in area which was developed for the most part in the interwar period, in a street of contemporary bungalows, opposite the Catholic Church and School of Our Lady of Good

Counsel, built some time later; near the contemporary Deepdene Shopping Centre, the (then) Outer Circle Railway spur remnant<sup>6</sup> and the Whitehorse Road trams.

### Comparative Analysis

*Mallow* is an inventive house in simple bungalow plan with minimized chimneys common to the time. It compares with other broadly symmetrical houses of the period, examples of which are located in Prospect Hill Road, Camberwell, and Tooronga Road Hawthorn, albeit both in red brick rather than stucco, as here. The broad and dominating arches on these houses, the horizontal proportions of their hipped roofs, and the simplicity and clarity of their elevations, suggest a resemblance to the Prairie School and its American successor movements, not so much that of Wright as of Purcell and Elmslie, Louis Christian Mullgardt or John Hudson Thomas, in both the Midwest and California. The boxed eaves and hipped roofing is also common to both the Prairie School in the US, and the Colonial Revival bungalows popular in gracious architecture circles in the early and mid 1920s, and well-published by then in Hardy Wilson's writings for *Art in Australia*.<sup>7</sup> The broad entrance arches on these houses relate both to the Prairie School and to contemporary Australian Bungalow usage, and are in this an inflection of the more general round porch arches becoming popular in the wake of C F A Voysey and other leaders of the British Edwardian Free Styles in the period 1890-1914. The result is a building that shares several characteristics of the 1920s in a distinctive general form. Graeme Butler has observed that it is also distinct from the typical 'California' bungalow of its period, lacking the prominent verandahs and juxtaposed gables that generally marked the bungalow's Melbourne career.<sup>8</sup> Arguably the fusion seen here has more to do with the emerging suburban vernacular seen further north and east in Camberwell in the 1940s and 1950s.<sup>9</sup>

### Assessment Against Criteria

*Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria*

*CRITERION A: The historical importance, association with or relationship to Boroondara's history of the place or object.*

The historical association with businessman, Charles Browne, is of interest but is not considered to elevate the significance of the place over others associated with local business people.

*CRITERION D: The importance of a place or object in exhibiting the principal characteristics or the representative nature of a place or object as a part of a class or type of places or objects.*

*Mallow* is a fine, representative and externally intact example of a bungalow of the early 1920s, with a partially intact and sympathetic setting.

*CRITERION E: The importance of the place or object in exhibiting good design or aesthetic characteristics and/or in exhibiting a richness, diversity or unusual integration of features.*

*Mallow* fuses several major 1920s modes, particularly the bungalow in a general single-storied, rather than 'Californian' sense, and elements of the boxed-eave colonial revival. It has the heavy scale and proportions characteristic of the 1920s, but with marked degree of stylistic synthesis in its exterior.

### Statement of Significance

*Mallow* is of local historical and architectural significance as a fine, representative and externally intact bungalow of the early 1920s, which retains its unpainted stucco finish and generous garden setting. Stylistically, *Mallow* fuses several major 1920s modes, particularly the bungalow in a general single-storied, rather than 'Californian' sense, and elements of the boxed-eave colonial revival. It has the heavy scale and proportions characteristic of the 1920s, but with an impressive degree of stylistic synthesis in its exterior.

### Grading Review

Unchanged.

### Recommendations

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme.

## Identified By

G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

## References

*General:* G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

*Specific:*

<sup>1</sup> City of Camberwell Rate Book, 1923-4, 2401; 1925-6, 2145; 1926-7, 2440.

<sup>2</sup> Graeme Butler notes the following: 'Browne began his career in 1905 by acquiring the Mount Hope grazing property at Barfold, with his brother A.V. Browne. This company purchased Delmo Brothers (formerly Macaroni manufacturers at Ringwood) in 1906-7 and created T.W. Cotton Pty Ltd (ventilating engineers), in association with its namesake, during 1918. Charles Browne became managing director of Delmo Bros. Then broadened to Cereal Food Manufacturers (Macaroni) and the Australian Heel Company Pty Ltd, after partnering A.C. Farrow in the formation of the company in 1920. His grazing interests continued into the 1930s at Mayfield Station near Albury (1929 *Who's Who*, p.896). Browne typifies a certain Melbourne business type of the later nineteenth century. His career commenced with a large rural holding which he linked to processing industries in food and metal work. His move to this suburban address apparently came after his urban business interests flourished, yet he maintained an interest in pastoralism. The building has historical interest as representing the domestic style of an entrepreneur of the early twentieth century, with a foot in both urban and rural holdings; his home makes a clear contrast with the rural homesteads of an earlier generation of pastoralists and investors. His house illustrates Camberwell's role in providing a home to members of this later group of urban and rural entrepreneurs.'

<sup>3</sup> City of Boroondara Building File 40/408/03656, # 7382, 6 May 1996.

<sup>4</sup> See G Butler, City of Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, v. 4, p. 110.

<sup>5</sup> Details sourced from City of Boroondara Building File 40/408/03656, # 7382, 6 May 1996.

<sup>6</sup> The East Camberwell-East Kew section was closed in the early 1930s and replaced for some decades with a bus service.

<sup>7</sup> Notably *Art in Australia: On Richmond Bridge, 1918*, *Domestic Architecture in Australia*, whole issue, 1919; *The Macquarie Book*: whole issue, 1921. Wilson's *Purulia*, hipped roofed, with boxed eaves and solidly scaled in a similar manner to *Mallow*, was published in the *Domestic Architecture* issue in 1919, and by 1923 was being emulated by 12 to 14 architects in Sydney and Melbourne alone. See Conrad Hamann, 'Paths of Beauty: the afterlife of Australian Colonial Architecture', *Transition*, 27, Summer 1988; Philip Cox and Clive Lucas, *Australian Colonial Architecture*, Melbourne, Lansdowne, 1974, pt. 3.

<sup>8</sup> This raises the question as to how much Australian bungalow design of the 1920s was inherently 'Californian'. The term had obvious commercial appeal given the new prominence of California in film viewers' imagination, and a range of motifs from Pasadena and Alameda originals appeared in Australian houses after c. 1910. But taken as a general mode, Australian bungalows also read as a pragmatic simplification of Federation architecture, incorporating elements of Colonial Revivalism, British Free Style architecture and other approaches. It is also worth noting that the original Californian 'Bungalows' were almost always two-storied. Cf. David Gebhard, Robert Winter et al., *Guide to the Architecture of Los Angeles and Southern California*, Peregrine Smith, Salt Lake City, 1977.

<sup>9</sup> c.f. 35 Balwyn Road, 1932, 1292 Toorak Road, of 1931, and 1297 Toorak Road, 1940 (all B-graded), all early prototypes in varying degrees for the suburban vernacular of the postwar period and all discussed elsewhere in this survey and review.

---

<b>Name</b>	<i>Xanadu</i>	<b>Reference No</b>	
<b>Address</b>	119 Doncaster Road, North Balwyn	<b>Survey Date</b>	24, 25 November 2005
<b>Building Type</b>	Residence	<b>Grading</b>	B
<b>Date</b>	1948	<b>Previous Grading</b>	B



**Extent of Overlay**

To title boundaries.

---

**Intactness**    ☒ Good    ☐ Fair    ☐ Poor

**Heritage Status**    ☐ HV    ☐ AHC    ☐ NT    ☐ Rec.    BPS Heritage Overlay

**History**

In 1941 R. Lockwood commissioned Arthur E. Pretty to design a residence.<sup>1</sup> Pretty designed a seven roomed, timber dwelling that was estimated to cost £1,950.<sup>2</sup> However the building application was cancelled in the same year, 1941, possibly because of the war.<sup>3</sup>

By 1948 the allotment had been acquired by Dr Alexander F. Roche who resided at the time at Yaneacoon, Healesville.<sup>4</sup> Prentice Builders built a two storey brick house of seven rooms that was estimated to cost £5,400 to a design by architect Vincent Ward.<sup>5</sup>

Dr Alexander Roche was a medical practitioner who lectured at the Melbourne University Medical School. In 1962 he was appointed reader of anatomy in the school.<sup>6</sup>

(G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, additional research by Lovell Chen, 2005)

**Description & Integrity**

*Xanadu*, at 119 Doncaster Road, was the second of two designs intended for this site, the first being an Arthur Pretty design of 1941. The present building was designed as a residence and consulting rooms by Vincent T Ward and dates from 1948.<sup>7</sup> Ward's design was a mixture of Georgian, Jacobean and Italianate, in a two storey cream-brick block of two juxtaposed masses, divided by a long rectangular entry hall, stair and powder room. Ward unified the design with a simple double-fronted hipped roof in terracotta shingles, with boxed eaves. Below it he brought in a range of complex variations, expressing different functions. Ward divided the house into four differing modules- 10', 13', 6'6" and 15', that ran cleanly from one side of the house to the other, so that the transverse walls in the house work rather as wing walls in more modern-looking contemporary designs. The client had his doctor's waiting room and surgery on the north side, linked to the house section of the plan by a

large double door (perhaps suggesting that the houses and surgery combination may have been seen as temporary or at least convertible later). Originally the family lived in the south side and over the medical rooms on the first floor. The medical rooms opened onto a terrace which formed a potential entrance, and are expressed from the front with a deep frieze over the waiting room west window, which incorporates a gesture at sun protection in the form of a stubby sunblind canopy. The family entrance and living room pairing forms a single-storey projecting block on the west side. Externally this pairing is expressed as an ornamented door aedicule with scroll pediment and a blind parapet above it, plus an octagonal light in the wall directly behind it. This is linked directly to an Italianate balustrade with waisted balusters. On the east side, the stair hall is expressed in a tall window with a flattened arch at its top. Fenestration varies on both ground floor sides according to the internal spaces, and is at the same time traditionalised by elaborate aedicules and moldings. Most windows are small-paned and, on the western side, support small balconettes in wrought iron and have little voussoirs rising from each.

The house is generally externally intact. A cream brick garage was added (generally in the location anticipated in the original 1948 drawings) in 1953.<sup>8</sup> Additions were made in 1962 (also to the design of the original architect, Vincent T Ward) however these appear to have been located to the rear of the house.

The garden, heavily grown, has most of the larger trees and shrubs still in place. The drive was a concrete slab with crazy paving over it, and is still in use.

### Historical Context

This area of North Balwyn developed slowly from the late interwar period, with most development occurring in the early post-WWII years (pre-1960).

### Comparative Analysis

In this area *Xanadu* compares with 91 Maud Street, Balwyn North, by G Burridge Leith, of 1941 (q.v., B-graded), and with earlier Neo-Georgian and Mediterranean mixtures such as *Ingoda*, 10 Fitzgerald Street Balwyn, of 1924 (q.v., B-graded). The tall proportions, solid compositional values and rich surface texture are common to each, and this solidity converts the otherwise quite inventive external expression of *Xanadu* into a model of cream-brick propriety. It reads as a quite inventive Colonial Revival, Neo-Georgian type, faithfully expressing a plan shifted to complete asymmetry within an ostensibly symmetrical shell and using the details normally associated with symmetrical buildings. Though a somewhat scaled down version, in its form, stylistic qualities, choice of wall detail and its shingle-tiled terracotta roof, the house is broadly comparable to many interwar residences in socially desirable suburbs such as Toorak.

### Assessment Against Criteria

*Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria*

*CRITERION D: The importance of a place or object in exhibiting the principal characteristics or the representative nature of a place or object as a part of a class or type of places or objects.*

*Xanadu* is a representative and externally intact example of the two-storey neo-Georgian brick residence with prominent hipped roof and chimneys, in this case executed in cream brick and distinguished by the asymmetrical treatment of its principal elevation. The house shows a characteristic palette of materials and forms for the interwar and early postwar period: cream brick, minimal aedicules and ornamentation; the octagonal 'keynote' window; and massing by simple overlay under a sheltering, flared roof.

*CRITERION E: The importance of the place or object in exhibiting good design or aesthetic characteristics and/or in exhibiting a richness, diversity or unusual integration of features.*

*Xanadu* reflects a mixture of both progressive architectural thinking (expression of function through fenestration), and studied traditionalism. Its detail is conscientiously applied and connected to the compositional whole, the two combining powerfully in a still quite contained building mass.

### Statement of Significance

*Xanadu*, at 119 Doncaster Road, Balwyn, is of local historical and architectural significance. Constructed in 1948, it is a representative and externally intact example of a two-storey neo-Georgian brick residence with prominent hipped roof and chimneys, in this case executed in cream brick and distinguished by the asymmetrical treatment of its principal elevation. The house shows a characteristic palette of materials and forms for the interwar and early postwar period: cream brick, minimal aedicules and ornamentation; the octagonal 'keynote' window; and massing by simple overlay under a sheltering, flared roof. *Xanadu* reflects a mixture of both progressive architectural thinking (expression of function through fenestration), and studied traditionalism. Its detail is conscientiously applied and connected to the compositional whole, the two combining powerfully in a still quite contained building mass.

### Grading Review

Unchanged.

### Recommendations

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme.

### Identified By

G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

### References

*General:* G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

*Specific:*

<sup>1</sup> Drawing dated 19 January 1948 sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index # 1173, dated 9 February 1948.

<sup>2</sup> Drawing dated 19 January 1948 sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index # 1173, dated 9 February 1948.

<sup>3</sup> Drawing dated 19 January 1948 sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index # 1173, dated 9 February 1948.

<sup>4</sup> Drawing dated 19 January 1948 sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index # 1173, dated 9 February 1948, MMBW Drainage Plan Application 241493.

<sup>5</sup> Drawing dated 19 January 1948 sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index # 1173, dated 9 February 1948.

<sup>6</sup> Russell, K.F. *The Melbourne Medical School 1862-1962*, p.187

<sup>7</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, #1173, dated 9 February 1948 (house generally); #12360, 10 July 1953 (garage); #30617, dated 14 March 1962, 28 February 1962 (conversion of basement into rumpus room, underneath the north deck). Pretty's earlier design is lodged as #14608, dated 4 June 1941.

<sup>8</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, # 12360, dated 10 July 1953.



Name	<i>Ingoda</i>	Reference No	
Address	10 Fitzgerald Street, Balwyn	Survey Date	26 November 2005
Building Type	Residence	Grading	B
Date	1924	Previous Grading	B



#### Extent of Overlay

To title boundaries.

Intactness ☒ Good ☐ Fair ☐ Poor

Heritage Status ☐ HV ☐ AHC ☐ NT ☒ Rec. BPS Heritage Overlay

#### History

George Henry Hallandal, an architect, purchased Allotment 14 from James Allan in 1922-23.<sup>1</sup> A brick house of five rooms was built on the allotment in 1924, to Hallandal's own design.<sup>2</sup> Formerly a pupil of the architect Robert Haddon, Hallandal joined the Commonwealth Department of Works in 1923; in his career there he contributed to or was responsible for the design of large numbers of military and non-military buildings, both in the ACT, Victoria and Tasmania, including the Commonwealth Building.<sup>3</sup> He also had a substantial private practice, which included the design of more than 27 hotels. Amongst the best-known of Hallandal's buildings is the Army Medical Corps Drill Hall in A'Beckett Street, Melbourne (1938-9), which has been included in the Victorian Heritage Register.<sup>4</sup> He was awarded the prestigious Silver Medal and an MBE for services to architecture.<sup>5</sup>

Hallandal is reported to have lived in the house with his parents until c. 1927, before he moved to East Melbourne, while his father Henry Hallandal (a butcher) and mother remained at Fitzgerald Street.<sup>6</sup> Ernest W Hallandal, (George Hallandal's uncle) became the occupant of the house in Fitzgerald Street from the 1950s.<sup>7</sup> The house was purchased by George Hallandal's daughter, Joy Dandie, in 1955.<sup>8</sup> In April 2007, Joy's daughter, Bronwyn Dandie, purchased the house.<sup>9</sup>

In 1963 two bedrooms, built by A.V. Jennings, were added to the house for a subsequent owner Joy Dandie.<sup>10</sup>

(G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, additional research by Lovell Chen, 2005)

#### Description & Integrity

*Ingoda*, at 10 Fitzgerald Street Balwyn, is a two-storied house in stuccoed brick, of 1924. It sits under a pyramidal roof in terracotta Cordova tiles, symmetrically composed at first sight but with each window group actually performing quite different roles and with a front door curiously placed right at

the south-east corner. The windows, with fairly small panes, are set well into the walls, emphasizing their thickness. There is a centrally placed chimney, just behind the pyramid apex to the roof. The trees flanking the garden are mature. The iron-rod fence is a 1990 addition.<sup>11</sup> A large pergola of recent origins on the northern side is placed over a patio, which itself adjoins the main living room, spread out towards the north side. The garage looks original and the concrete driveway dates from 1956.<sup>12</sup> The latter is not easily seen from the street, but was noted in the 1991 Camberwell Conservation Study as having vertically planked doors and diamond venting suggesting it was contemporary the house.<sup>13</sup>

### Historical Context

Very little development had occurred in Fitzgerald Street when this house was constructed, though by c.1932, when the MMBW Detail Plan No. 150 was updated, about half the allotments in the street were built on.

### Comparative Analysis

*Ingoda* compares with several Camberwell houses of this period, which all attempt related things. 1292 Toorak Road, 1931 (B-graded, q.v.), is one: basically symmetrical on its (main) west elevation, it is topped with a sheltering roof and an entry drawn sideways through an otherwise symmetrical balcony. The King brothers' 35 Balwyn Road, 1932 (B-graded, q.v.) and similarly stuccoed, is another. The architect George Hallandal, who is thought to have designed this house, was later renowned for his virtuoso abilities in moulding vibrant institutional buildings- drill halls as at A'Beckett and Victoria Streets, particularly, into staccato embodiments of movement against site, however there is hardly any of this projected movement in this house. Graeme Butler notes Hallandal's fusion of both Georgian and Mediterranean themes in this design, comparing it with similar fusions in Sydney by Leslie Wilkinson, in particular.<sup>14</sup> In its Neo-Georgian dimension the house compares with houses by Blackett, Forster and Craig in Winmalee Road, from the same period,<sup>15</sup> and with Marcus Martin's own house in Domain Road, South Yarra, of c. 1933.<sup>16</sup> It is of interest to note that in 1923 (contemporary with the design of this house) Hallandal won a Royal Victorian Institute of Architects medal for his design for a block of flats in a Spanish Mission style.<sup>17</sup>

### Assessment Against Criteria

#### *Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria*

**CRITERION A:** *The historical importance, association with or relationship to Boroondara's history of the place or object.*

George Hallandal designed this house and is reported to have resided there between 1924 and 1927. It has been owned and occupied by various members of the Hallandal family since that time. The association of this house with the architect George Hallandal is of historical interest.

**CRITERION D:** *The importance of a place or object in exhibiting the principal characteristics or the representative nature of a place or object as a part of a class or type of places or objects.*

*Ingoda* is a representative and intact example of a two-storey stuccoed brick residence of the early 1920s, embodying the Neo-Georgian and Mediterranean fusion that interested architects at the time. In common with various other Neo-Georgian and freely referenced designs, *Ingoda* carries hints of the simple, blocky form and hipped-roof architecture that became a suburban vernacular after World War II.

### Statement of Significance

*Ingoda* is of local historical and architectural significance as a representative and intact example of a two-storey stuccoed brick residence of the early 1920s, embodying the Neo-Georgian and Mediterranean fusion that interested architects at the time. In common with various other Neo-Georgian and freely referenced designs, *Ingoda* carries hints of the simple, blocky form and hipped-roof architecture that became a suburban vernacular after World War II. Though the front fence is recent, the house retains an early or original concrete driveway and timber garage. The association of this house with the architect George Hallandal is of historical interest.

### Grading Review

Unchanged.



## Recommendations

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme.

## Identified By

G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

## References

*General:* G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

*Specific:*

<sup>1</sup> City of Camberwell Rate Books, 1920-21, 4308; 1923-24, 5557.

<sup>2</sup> City of Camberwell Rate Book, 1924-25, 4697.

<sup>3</sup> Information supplied by Bronwyn Dandie 2007 and Joy Dandie, 4 August 1997.

<sup>4</sup> Allom Lovell & Associates, Former Army Medical Corps Drill Hall, Assessment of the Architectural and Historical Significance, Melbourne, 1990, refer section 5.0, information based in large part on an interview with George Hallendal.

<sup>5</sup> Information supplied by Bronwyn Dandie 2007 and Joy Dandie, 4 August 1997.

<sup>6</sup> Information supplied by Bronwyn Dandie 2007 and Joy Dandie, 4 August 1997.

<sup>7</sup> City of Camberwell Rate Book, 1930-31, 5165; *Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria*, 1925; 1935; 1950; 1952.

<sup>8</sup> Information supplied by Bronwyn Dandie 2007 and Joy Dandie, 4 August 1997.

<sup>9</sup> Information supplied by Bronwyn Dandie 2007 and Joy Dandie, 4 August 1997.

<sup>10</sup> Details sourced from City of Camberwell Building Index, # 33154, dated 11 June 1963.

<sup>11</sup> Details sourced from City of Camberwell Building Index, # 91528, 10 October 1990.

<sup>12</sup> Information supplied by Bronwyn Dandie 2007 and Joy Dandie, 4 August 1997.

<sup>13</sup> G Butler, City of Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, V. 4, p. 127.

<sup>14</sup> G Butler, City of Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, V. 4, p. 127. Wilkinson's own house, *Greenway*, was built in the same year as *Ingoda*.

<sup>15</sup> These two are not mentioned in Butler's study, but figured prominently in Marcus Barlow's *Australian Bungalows*, Melbourne, 1926.

<sup>16</sup> Illustrated in Peter Cuffley, *Australian Houses of the 'Twenties and 'Thirties*, Five Mile, Melbourne, 1989, p. 84.

<sup>17</sup> Allom Lovell & Associates, Former Army Medical Corps Drill Hall, Assessment of the Architectural and Historical Significance, Melbourne, 1990, refer section 5.0.

---

<b>Name</b>	House	<b>Reference No</b>	
<b>Address</b>	177 Glen Iris Road, Glen Iris	<b>Survey Date</b>	20 September 2005
<b>Building Type</b>	Residence	<b>Grading</b>	B
<b>Date</b>	1935	<b>Previous Grading</b>	B



**Extent of Overlay**

To title boundaries.

---

**Intactness**    ☒ Good    ☐ Fair    ☐ Poor

**Heritage Status**    ☐ HV    ☐ AHC    ☐ NT    ☐ Rec.    BPS Heritage Overlay

**History**

Builder J.L. Richards was commissioned to build a residence for Roy William Newton, an engineer, in 1935.<sup>1</sup> The nine roomed, brick residence was estimated to cost £2,850.<sup>2</sup> Newton continued in residence until at least 1952.<sup>3</sup>

(G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991)

**Description & Integrity**

The Roy Newton house, at 177 Glen Iris Road, is a nine-roomed, two storey house in clinker brick relieved with glazed tapestry brick at the doorways and the curving front gate reveals. It has a projecting central wing, like a deepened break front but stepped out in two layers. The ground floor layer is enclosed with iron framed windows that curve at each end, and is topped with a flat roof forming an upstairs balcony with brick and wrought iron parapet. The first floor wing juts out behind this, again lined with cantilevered iron-framed windows. A north-facing wing has a rounded end below a half-conical roof wing. All eaves are boxed with spaced planking and conceal their guttering behind large fascias. The roof is clad in terra cotta shingles and punctuated by two brick chimneys patterned in a symmetrical Art Deco design. Similar Art Deco patterning appears over the front door, using Roman and other brick textures. The basic form, texture and all window frames appear original; the garage and rear fences, facing Ashburton Road, appear to have been added soon after the original house was complete.<sup>4</sup> The garden is mature; it largely obscures the north side from the street but has higher leaf cover to the west side, allowing good views of the house from Glen Iris Road.

## Historical Context

Extensive suburban residential development occurred in Glen Iris in the interwar period, generally on subdivisions that had occurred around WWI but were built on the 1920s. It was an area which was relatively well-served by public transport (both train and tram services).

## Comparative Analysis

The Roy Newton house was a prototype for what is now known as the 'Postwar Vernacular' housing that dominated Australian suburbs after World War II<sup>5</sup>. The house was published in *Home Beautiful* in 1937 and was widely known at the time.<sup>6</sup> In Boroondara it is a clear antecedent to the curved bay apartment complex at the Burke Road-Whitehorse Road corner, from just after WWII, and to two-storey houses in Balwyn North's Mortgage Hill area of c. 1939-58, east of Bulleen Road and south to Myrtle and McLeay Parks and the Hislop and Barnard Reserves. It is roughly contemporary with A V Jennings' Beauview and Beaumont estates at Ivanhoe, that firm's first foray into brick-surfaced Moderne and Modernism.<sup>7</sup> It recalls the simplified Colonial Revival seen in designs by R M and M H King in Mont Albert Road, Camberwell and in Ballarat from c. 1931 on, and the bow-fronted Irwin and Stevenson house for Edgar Fullwood in Mont Albert Road, of c. 1926, both of which were antecedents for Australia's predominant suburban style after c. 1939-40. Conrad Hamann argues that what is now seen as 'post war vernacular' was actually developed through the late 1920s and early-mid 1930s by a series of well-known architects: the King brothers, G M Sneddon, Hume Sherrard, Arthur Ziebell, even Marcus Barlow and Harry Norris- who adapted modernism as seen overseas to an amalgam of neo-Georgian and simply applied pitched roof designs in brick and tile. A number of these designs were built in Camberwell.<sup>8</sup> Through its able and detailed application of Art Deco and Streamlined Moderne details,<sup>9</sup> primarily through brick patterning and the use of curved, iron-framed 'cantilever' windows, the Newton house makes a major contribution to the developing canon of form that marked a new direction for Australian suburban housing in this period.

In the local context, the house forms a group with other designs in the area that mix traditional references with architectural modernism. These include two local schools, Glen Iris Primary's 1938 wing diagonally opposite, and the more homogeneous Solway Primary in Taylor Street, Ashburton, both by the Public Works department under Percy Everett's direction.<sup>10</sup>

## Assessment Against Criteria

### *Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria*

*CRITERION A: The historical importance, association with or relationship to Boroondara's history of the place or object.*

The Newton house is a two-storey prototype of what would become known as *post-war vernacular*, or *Australian post-war*, being constructed some 10 or 12 years before the Australian post-war mode gathered momentum. The Newton house is one of several in the municipality that marked the initial formation of a suburban style that would spread throughout Australia (see comparative analysis, above). Boroondara was not the exclusive location for this development, but its role was an important one and this was a key example in the early development of the style.

*CRITERION E: The importance of the place or object in exhibiting good design or aesthetic characteristics and/or in exhibiting a richness, diversity or unusual integration of features.*

The Newton house design is skilled in balancing the inherent weight of tile and brick cavity wall construction with a series of robust details and solid scaling. The design shows a sense for the richness of its contemporary materials and exploits this in a vivid manner.

## Statement of Significance

The Roy Newton House, 177 Glen Iris Road, Glen Iris, is of historical and architectural significance at a municipal level as a two-storey prototype for what is now known as the 'Postwar Vernacular' housing that dominated Australian suburbs after World War II. It is one of the earliest and key examples within Boroondara which demonstrate the adoption of this new direction in suburban housing style.

Architecturally, the Newton house design is skilled in balancing the inherent weight of tile and brick cavity wall construction with a series of robust details and solid scaling. The design shows a sense for the richness of its contemporary materials and exploits this in a vivid manner.

## Grading Review

Unchanged.

Note that the Roy Newton House is broadly contemporary with other key developments in the development of the 'Post-war Vernacular' including the AV Jennings Beauview and Beaumont estates at Ivanhoe. Subject to more detailed comparative analysis, the building may be assessed as significant at a higher level (possibly A grading/state significance)

## Recommendations

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme.

## Identified By

G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

## References

*General:* G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

*Specific:*

<sup>1</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index # 5582, dated 4 October 1935, Electoral Roll 1938.

<sup>2</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index # 5582, dated 4 October 1935.

<sup>3</sup> *Sands and McDougall Directory of Victoria, 1940; Sands and McDougall Directory of Victoria, 1952.*

<sup>4</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, #5582, 4 October 1935.

<sup>5</sup> See, esp., Graeme Davison Tony Dingle, Seamus O'Hanlon, eds., contrib., *The Cream Brick Frontier: Histories of Australian Suburbia*, Melbourne: Monash Publications in History 19, 1995. In their introduction Davison and Dingle present the suburban house style as primarily a post war influx of Americanism, fitting a general interpretation of America as being 'discovered' by Australian society during and after World War 2. They note its Melbourne underpinning by the brick veneer system, ascribed (significantly) to a Camberwell house by John S Gawler of 1915: p. 10, citing *The Age*, 27 February 1961, and note, briefly, A V Jennings' origins in the 1930s. See also Don Garden, Ch. 11, p. 142, and *Builders to the Nation: the A V Jennings Story*, Melbourne, 1992. The perception of the housing style as synonymous with the post war building recovery reflects, arguably, Robin Boyd's interpretation of the mode as originating post war in the wake of architectural modernism, which he 'gives' to the 1930s: *Victorian Modern*, Melbourne: RVIA, 1947, *Australia's Home*, Melbourne: University Press, 1952, and Don Garden's emphasis on Jennings as an economic rather than an architectural history.

<sup>6</sup> *Home Beautiful, 1937*, photographed from the journal in 1983 and used as a teaching slide by Conrad Hamann at Monash University. Slide is in Monash University Slide and Multimedia Library, Faculty of Arts. c.f. Conrad Hamann, 'Architecture', in Andrew Brown-May and Shurlee Swain, eds., contrib., *The Encyclopedia of Melbourne*, Melbourne: Cambridge, 2005.

<sup>7</sup> Graeme Butler, 'A V Jennings: the early Estates', *Historic Environment*, 3, 2, 1983, pp. 32-46, esp. pp. 34-42. The Beaumont houses by Edgar Gurney, Jennings' architect, date from 1937-8, including Gurney's own house: pp. 38-40. c.f. Don Garden, *Builders to the Nation, The A V Jennings Story*, esp. pp. 40-1

<sup>8</sup> C Hamann, 'Architecture', in *The Encyclopedia of Melbourne*. Peter Cuffley illustrates The King brothers' Cindcrete house at Preston: *Australian houses of the '20s and '30s*, Melbourne, Five Mile Press, 1989, p. 142; he links it visually to other Cindcrete houses of 1938, p. 145, and parapet-roofed houses by Hedley Sanders in *Home Beautiful, 1935*, pp. 143-4.

<sup>9</sup> Graeme Butler credits 177 with being an 'early example of the Modern style', seeing it as commencing in Victoria with Oakley and Parkes' Yuille House, Melbourne, in 1932: Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, v. 4, p. 129. *Art Deco*, while taking its name from the 1925 International Exposition of Decorative Arts held in Paris, developed from transformations of Art Nouveau after c. 1903, particularly in Germany, Austria and Finland, and its emerging forms can be seen in the architecture of Eliel Saarinen, Josef Hoffmann, Josef Maria Olbrich and Alfred Messel, and later Bertram Goodhue and Raymond Hood in the United States. Kenneth Frampton has described this change as a 'crystallisation' infused with mysticism and an equation of new architecture with glass and gleaming surfaces: *Modern Architecture*, London, Thames and Hudson, 1979. Part of the intention, though, was to reconcile Classical and Gothic styles- a quest widely seen as solving the problem of a genuinely contemporary architecture. Compositions were often symmetrical or in balanced asymmetry. In Australia Art Deco gained ground as part of an admiration for these European and

American-based architects, and its patterning and details were used in Australia from around 1927 onwards. *Streamlined/Moderne* fused Art Deco with the developing machine aesthetic seen in Expressionist and early Functionalist architecture, and by 1935 was emerging as a major commercial mode in Australia, particularly in cinema design.

<sup>10</sup> Details sourced from their foundation stones.

---

<b>Name</b>	House	<b>Reference No</b>	
<b>Address</b>	32 Hortense Street, Burwood	<b>Survey Date</b>	20 September 2005
<b>Building Type</b>	Residence	<b>Grading</b>	B
<b>Date</b>	1938	<b>Previous Grading</b>	B



**Extent of Overlay**

To title boundaries.

---

**Intactness**    ☒ Good    ☐ Fair    ☐ Poor

**Heritage Status**    ☐ HV    ☐ AHC    ☐ NT    ☐ Rec.    BPS Heritage Overlay

**History**

32 Hortense Street was designed by architect Leslie Reed and constructed by builder N Johnston for owner-occupier CM Johnston in 1938. A brick garage was added the following year.<sup>1</sup> Johnston remained at the property until the 1950s.<sup>2</sup> Alterations and additions were made in 1957, a sunroom was added in 1970s, and further alterations and additions were made to the house in 1990. A swimming pool was added in the same year, and alterations were also made to the fence and garage (refer details below under Description & Integrity).

The architect Leslie J R Reed practiced predominantly in the interwar period, specializing in residential work with some small industrial commissions.<sup>3</sup>

(G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, additional research by Lovell Chen, 2005)

**Description & Integrity**

32 Hortense Street is a triple-fronted, two storey house of 1938, designed by the architect Leslie Reed.<sup>4</sup> It has double brick walls clad in rough stone, with half-timbering over a north wing and a thickly grained slate roof with no ridge-capping. It has unusual cement or fireclay chimney shafts, halfway between a stack and a chimney pot, with a spiral external pattern. The stair window is a lancet; the ground floor living room windows in a trio with a blind arch over each; the first floor main bedroom window is a plate glass and sash 'Chicago' type. The north wing windows are plain sheets, and the upstairs wing, with half timbered spandrels, looks glassed-in. The front fence in scoria stone looks original, though the metal pickets may be later, the general garden layout and large trees all look original. The original plan was a simple, tight arrangement of rooms in an L shape with the stair well positioned in the angle of the L, forming three steps to the north east side, the intersection of Ariel Street. Behind the house, on the Ariel Street side, is a large extension in stone similar to that of

the original house that alters the original geometry and makes the house appear more expansive.<sup>5</sup> Behind that is a newer garage (possibly replacing or incorporating the original) and some later fence additions, which look quite different from those of the original house.<sup>6</sup> Notwithstanding these additions, the original front section still reads as a distinct entity from the north-east, east and south-east sides.

### Historical Context

Comprising almost 600 houses, the Summerhill Estate was laid out in 1925, with the sole selling agent local entrepreneur T M Burke. 'Gas, water and electric light' were to become available and the Council had acquired land for nearby Summerhill Park, in anticipation of development. Like many other subdivisions of the period, years passed before the estate was fully developed, though a good deal of Summerhill was built up by the late 1930s. Within the estate, Hortense Street is characterised by predominantly 1930s houses.

### Comparative Analysis

32 Hortense Street is of similar scale and proportions to the post-war suburban vernacular seen as emerging in the late 1940s.<sup>7</sup> It has some applied half-timbering on its north wing, and a thickly grained slate roof without hip flashing. The cement or fireclay chimney shafts with external spiral pattern give a medieval touch that is most unusual in Melbourne.<sup>8</sup> This is complemented, albeit rather shakily, by three living room windows with blind arches facing east, and a large, more conventional 'Chicago' plate and sash window for the main bedroom immediately above. This juxtaposition is naïve but not incongruous in a suburban house that strives all out for vivid and rich effect. The lancet stair window is unusual in twentieth century Melbourne applications, though double height rectangular stair windows were in vogue in the Camberwell region, particularly in the Mont Albert Road area. The house has an extensive addition to the rear, north-west, and a newer, visibly dissimilar garage. The front fence facing Hortense Street and Ariel Avenue is original (though the metal pickets may be later), and the garden looks mature in its smaller plantings, front path pattern and main trees. The house is unusual in its intense projection of the suburban refuge in fantasy, piling a series of Tudor and Medieval references into a fairly small site and footprint.<sup>9</sup> In its heated delight in the Medieval, 32 Hortense Street has a Hollywood touch of theatricality, and compares in this stylization with 125 Highfield Road, also rated B.<sup>10</sup> 32 Hortense Street may have been a source for other rough stone dressed houses in the region, as in Clyde Street, Box Hill North, or Huntingdale Road, Jordansville, in the early post-war period.

### Assessment Against Criteria

#### *Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria*

*CRITERION A: The historical importance, association with or relationship to Boroondara's history of the place or object.*

32 Hortense Street is located within a major interwar residential subdivision in Burwood by a prominent local developer, TM Burke. In considering this historical association, however, the building is not considered to be of more importance than others of the period in the Summerhill Estate.

*CRITERION E: The importance of the place or object in exhibiting good design or aesthetic characteristics and/or in exhibiting a richness, diversity or unusual integration of features.*

The Medieval and Tudor bearing of this house makes it a rich, intense example of Tudor eclecticism in standard-sized Melbourne houses of the 1930s. The house has an original plan that is simple and direct in its spatial usage, though rather stiff and vertically proportioned. The external materials are richly applied and varied, and well linked to the texture and scale of the garden. The window configurations are rather naïve in their juxtaposition, but this complements the general boldness of the design in a standard suburban setting. It makes an important contribution to Hortense Street and this section of Burwood, where many 1930s houses used this general approach.

### Statement of Significance

32 Hortense Street is of local historical and architectural significance. Located in one of Boroondara's major interwar residential subdivisions, the Summerhill Estate, the building is a distinctive example of the application of eclectic Tudor styling to a standard size two-storey 1930s Melbourne residence. Designed by experienced residential practitioner, architect Leslie Reed, 32 Hortense Street is a

confident composition which is distinguished by a combination of Medieval and Tudor references and its varied and richly applied external materials. Though altered through the construction of rear additions, the principal street presentation of the building remains generally unaltered and the property retains its original fence and a sympathetic garden setting. The building makes a strong contribution to the predominantly interwar character of Hortense Street.

### Grading Review

Unchanged.

### Recommendations

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme.

In making this recommendation, it is noted that the subject building is located within a precinct (Summerhill Estate) which was identified in the 1991 Camberwell Conservation Study, where it was recommended for planning scheme control. While not surveyed as part of this review, it is likely that the precinct retains a high proportion of graded buildings and may still warrant consideration for inclusion in the Heritage Overlay.

### Identified By

G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

### References

*General:* G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

*Specific:*

<sup>1</sup> Details and drawings sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, #10703, dated 5 December 1938. Drawings by Leslie J W Reed, architect, 23 November 1938. For the garage, details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index #11878, dated 4 August 1938.

<sup>2</sup> D1950

<sup>3</sup> List of Leslie Reed projects compiled by Allom Lovell & Associates in 1999.

<sup>4</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Buildings Index, #10703, dated 5 December 1938. Plans drawn by Leslie J W Reed, architect, 23 November 1938, in City of Camberwell archives.

<sup>5</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Buildings Index, #20806, dated 28 June 1957.

<sup>6</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Buildings Index, #63842, dated 2 October 1978.

<sup>7</sup> Compare with the Newton house, 177 Glen Iris Road, Glen Iris.

<sup>8</sup> Spiral patterned chimney stacks are more usually seen in terra cotta on brick pedestals, as with Guyon Purchas' *Tay Creggan* at Yarra Street, Hawthorn, of 1887. See Philip Goad, ed., contrib., *Melbourne Architecture: a guide*, Sydney, Watermark Press, 1999, Ch. 7.

<sup>9</sup> Its Medieval and Tudor references were characteristic enough for the time, but the range of materials employed- stone, plaster, window pane detailing, suggest an antiquarian intensity of that was unusual.

<sup>10</sup> G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, v. 4, p. 132-3.



<b>Name</b>	House	<b>Reference No</b>	
<b>Address</b>	30 Howard Street, Glen Iris	<b>Survey Date</b>	20 September 2005
<b>Building Type</b>	Residence	<b>Grading</b>	B
<b>Date</b>	1894-5	<b>Previous Grading</b>	B



#### Extent of Overlay

To title boundaries.

**Intactness** ☒ Good ☐ Fair ☐ Poor

**Heritage Status** ☐ HV ☐ AHC ☐ NT ☐ Rec. ☐ BPS Heritage Overlay

#### History

In 1894-95 the Australian Alliance Investment Company had a brick house constructed on an allotment they owned within the Glen Iris Estate. The residence was occupied by Mrs Mary Lewis.<sup>1</sup> By late 1895 the property was owned by the Victorian Permanent Building Society and occupied by Arthur Davis.<sup>2</sup> William Seymour Findlay resided here by 1905 in what was described as a brick house of nine rooms.<sup>3</sup>

After Findlay, James Alexander Weir, a secretary, and Lillian Weir occupied the house until James enlisted in 1916<sup>4</sup>. In 1925 John J. McAllister purchased the property and became the first owner-occupier<sup>5</sup>. McAllister constructed a garage on the property in 1929; this appears to have been replaced by a later version in 1989.<sup>6</sup> By the end of the 1930s the property had been purchased by Jonathon Morcombe and he remained there until the early 1950s<sup>7</sup>. Substantial rear additions which are largely obscured from the street were constructed in 1990 to a design by architects John & Thurley O'Connor.<sup>8</sup>

(G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, additional research by Lovell Chen, 2005)

#### Description & Integrity

30 Howard Street is a double-fronted, two-storey brick house from the early Federation period. It has a slate roof in two intersecting gables patterned in five broad bands, with two plain chimneys, a brick gable facing the side and a half-timbered gable facing the street. A timber-framed gallery sits above the front verandah, topped by a coved soffit in stucco and half-timbering. The verandah valance is in paneled slats over five segmental spandrels supported on turned fretwork posts. The front window bay is a three-light, single-storey breakfront with shingled roof, and other windows are double-hung sashes with stilted segmental arches. Walls are in red brick punctuated by polychrome banding in

cream and brown brick. The window arches are shaped in moulded brickwork that carries the cream and brown striping over each window.<sup>9</sup> The picket fence and its posts are recent. Though they appear to have involved intervention into the original fabric, later additions to the house are all to the rear, and from the street the house appears basically intact to its original construction in 1895. The garage, clear of the main house and sited to the rear dated from 1989.

### Historical Context

Close to rail transport, the area around Gardiner's Creek and High Street in Glen Iris underwent significant development in the late Victorian and Federation periods, with further development in the interwar period. 30 Howard Street dates from the earlier phase in the development of the area.

### Comparative Analysis

There are two similar houses, in form and age, in nearby streets: Bourne and Kerferd Roads. In its brick polychromy 18 Kerferd Road (ungraded) is closer to 30 Howard Street, though 24 Bourne Road (ungraded) has a Japanese-patterned veranda that relates to timber details at No. 30. The dichromatic window heads, in cream brick, compare with the earlier *Tarrawarra*, in Victoria Avenue, Canterbury, of 1890, also rated B.<sup>10</sup> In general form it suggests American free style precedents, then termed Queen Anne in the United States but now regarded as part of a general free manner termed *Shingle Style*.<sup>11</sup> The house was preceded by the Queen Anne and Richardson Romanesque fusions in houses by Reed, Henderson and Smart's and Reed, Smart and Tappin between 1883 and 1891, several of which included timber-framed galleries or related forms at the ground or first floors, and were similarly vertical to 30 Howard Street in their proportions.<sup>12</sup>

### Assessment Against Criteria

*Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria*

*CRITERION D: The importance of a place or object in exhibiting the principal characteristics or the representative nature of a place or object as a part of a class or type of places or objects.*

30 Howard Street is a prominent and relatively intact representative example of the two-storeyed 'Queen Anne' or early Federation Style in Boroondara and Camberwell, and shows its affinity with contemporary American free style architecture. It compares well with other examples in the municipality.

### Statement of Significance

30 Howard Street, Glen Iris is of local historical and architectural significance as a fine and prominent representative example of the two-storeyed 'Queen Anne' or early Federation Style in Boroondara and Camberwell, and shows its affinity with contemporary American free style architecture. Notwithstanding that alterations and additions have been undertaken at the rear of the house, the building is generally intact as viewed from the street.

### Grading Review

Unchanged.

### Recommendations

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme.

### Identified By

G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

### References

*General:* G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

*Specific:*

<sup>1</sup> Shire of Camberwell Rate Books, 1893-94, 242; 1894-95, 267.

<sup>2</sup> Shire of Camberwell Rate Book, 1895-96, 263.

<sup>3</sup> Shire of Boroondara and Camberwell Rate Book, 1905-6, 290.

<sup>4</sup> Town of Camberwell Rate Books, 1910-11, 403; *Sands and McDougall Directory of Victoria*, 1915; Electoral Roll, 1912.

<sup>5</sup> City of Camberwell Rate Books, 1925-26, 22965; *Sands and McDougall Directory of Victoria*, 1925; 1935.

<sup>6</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Buildings Index, #638, dated 27 July 1929, and #89030, dated 12 September 1989.

<sup>7</sup> *Sands and McDougall Directory of Victoria*, 1940;1950.

<sup>8</sup> Drawing sourced from the City of Camberwell Building File 40/408/277701.

<sup>9</sup> Details sourced from Graeme Butler, *Camberwell Conservation Study* 1991, v. 4, pp. 244-5.

<sup>10</sup> Details of Victoria Avenue are sourced from Butler, *Camberwell Conservation Study* 1991, p. 291.

<sup>11</sup> See Mark Girouard, *Sweetness and Light: The Queen Anne Movement 1860-1900*, Oxford: University Press, 1977, Ch. 9 esp, and Vincent Scully, *The Shingle Style and the Stick Style*, New Haven: Yale, 1955, 1975. The apposite buildings in Scully's account are H H Richardson's Watts-Sherman house in Newport Rhode Island, 1874, and Wilson Eyre's William Ashurst house in Chestnut Hill, Pennsylvania, 1885.

<sup>12</sup> Miles Lewis, Ch. 2 in Philip Goad, ed., contrib., *Bates Smart: 150 Years of Australian Architecture*, Melbourne: Thames and Hudson, 2004, pp. 75-82. At least five of these were in Boroondara: *Mooroolbeek*, Kew, 1883, demolished, p. 77; *Urangeline*, now Carey Grammar School, Barkers Road Kew, of 1883-4, pp. 77-8, *Cabana*, 4 Stawell Street Kew, of 1889-90, p. 77; *Shenton*, Kinkora Road, Hawthorn, 1890, p. 77, and *Holyrood* at 816 Riversdale Road, Camberwell, 1890, 3 km to Howard Street's north. pp. 82-3. Butler graded *Holyrood* A in the *Camberwell Conservation Study* 1991, v. 4, pp. 244-5.

---

<b>Name</b>	<i>Westraillia</i>	<b>Reference No</b>	
<b>Address</b>	27 Inglesby Road, Camberwell	<b>Survey Date</b>	26 September 2005
<b>Building Type</b>	Residence	<b>Grading</b>	B
<b>Date</b>	1890	<b>Previous Grading</b>	B



**Extent of Overlay**

To title boundaries.

---

**Intactness**    ☒ Good    ☐ Fair    ☐ Poor

**Heritage Status**    ☐ HV    ☐ AHC    ☐ NT    ☐ Rec.    BPS Heritage Overlay

**History**

Frederick Edmonds, a Camberwell general storekeeper,<sup>1</sup> was the original owner of this house in 1890. Graeme Butler has noted that Edmonds then leased it to the engineer and Boroondara Shire Secretary, Robert Smellie.<sup>2</sup> A series of other tenants followed, including Loftus Connor, Mrs Elizabeth Reid, James Paterson and William Robson.<sup>3</sup> Edmonds subsequently occupied the house early in the twentieth century.

Later owners were Mrs M Charlton and C W Game; under the latter ownership, it was converted to apartments in 1951.<sup>4</sup>

A plan of subdivision on Council's planning file shows the subdivision of the property into three allotments in 1996, at which time a pair of two-storey brick townhouses was constructed at the rear of the site (10-12 Inkerman Road).<sup>5</sup>

(G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, additional research by Lovell Chen, 2005)

**Description & Integrity:**

*Westraillia*, at 24 Inglesby Road, Camberwell, is a double-fronted brick house of 1890 with a hipped slate roof and three-sided verandah, with a cast iron lace valance and posts. Its dichromatic brickwork and form are in a common late 1880s Italianate style; the brick patterning is in diamond patterns at wall corners and around windows and doors. Its eave brackets are linked to a series of cream brick patterns just above the verandah roof: a convex bowed type, its galvanised iron cladding being replaced recently. The slate roof is original, with ridges replaced more recently in powder coated galvanized iron. The windows are original. The chimneys have been stuccoed and painted, probably later.

In 1951 the architect Robin Boyd redesigned the kitchen, converting it from 'a dilapidated lean-to' and added a flat roofed dining area, along with a kitchenette in the original dining room.<sup>6</sup> As noted above, in 1996 a pair of double-storey units were added on subdivided land at the rear of the original site, clear of the original house and separated by a fence.<sup>7</sup> A garage was constructed against the eastern side of the house at this time.<sup>8</sup>

Other than for these modifications, the house appears to be externally intact, as are the north-west corner gate and the fences to both Inkerman and Inglesby Roads. *Westraillia* has a recent but broadly sympathetic garden layout around its verandah, though the asphalt paths described in Graeme Butler's 1991 Camberwell Conservation Study<sup>9</sup> have been replaced with concrete tiled paving.

### Historical Context

The area south of Riversdale Road and north of Inglesby Road in Camberwell was a focus of civic development (municipal offices, churches and other public buildings) from the 1880s and this was accompanied by a boom in residential development in this area.<sup>10</sup> The MMBW Detail Plan No. 76 of c.1905 shows the south side of Inglesby Road had been almost fully developed with a series of villas facing the municipal reserve and Shire offices on the north side.

### Comparative Analysis

*Westraillia* at 27 Inglesby Road Camberwell, typifies many Italianate houses in this area from the late 1880s to around 1890. It has dichrome brick tuckpointed and diamond patterned to suggest quoins or enrichments around tall its corners, as with 25 and 36 Alma Road (both 1889, B-graded, q.v.) two streets away, and many other houses of the period.

### Assessment Against Criteria

*Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria*

*CRITERION A: The historical importance, association with or relationship to Boroondara's history of the place or object.*

Graeme Butler has noted the historical associations of this house with local storekeeper/grocer, Frederick Edmonds and with engineer and Shire secretary, Robert Smellie. While of interest, these associations are not considered to add to the significance of the place.

*CRITERION D: The importance of a place or object in exhibiting the principal characteristics or the representative nature of a place or object as a part of a class or type of places or objects.*

*Westraillia* is a representative and externally intact example of a late 1880s dichromatic Italianate house of a type relatively common in Boroondara. Located on a prominent corner site, it is distinguished by its relatively high level of intactness and the survival of its original fence and gates.

### Statement of Significance

*Westraillia*, 27 Inglesby Road, Camberwell is of local historical and architectural significance as a representative and externally intact example of a late 1880s dichromatic Italianate house of a type relatively common in Boroondara. Located on a prominent corner site, it is distinguished by its relatively high level of external integrity and the survival of its original fence and gates.

### Grading Review

Unchanged.

### Recommendations

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme.

### Identified By

G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

### References

*General:* G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

<sup>1</sup> According to Graeme Butler, Frederick Edmonds was the son of George Edmonds, carried on his father's ten year old grocery business in Camberwell Road from 1882: announcing then that hay, corn and ironmongery were to be added to his already comprehensive stock. He died in 1941. Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, v. 4, p. 139.

<sup>2</sup> Electoral Roll 1912; City of Camberwell Rate Books 1889-90, 9; 1890-1, 6009; 1891-2, 10.

<sup>3</sup> *Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria*, 1896; 1901; 1903; 1906.

<sup>4</sup> Details sourced from City of Camberwell Building Index # 17625, 29 January 1946; # 8585, 10 October 1951.

<sup>5</sup> City of Boroondara Planning File 40/409/11681, City of Boroondara Building File 10/408/00335.

<sup>6</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, # 8585, titled 'Convert to apartments', dated 10 October 1951. The drawing is unsigned but is in Robin Boyd's handwriting and uses the elongated plan calligraphy that Boyd was using in the early 1950s. Letter from C W Game to Town Clerk, Camberwell, 25 February 1957.

<sup>7</sup> Correspondence from City of Boroondara Building to Trecomax P/L, 18 April 2005 on City of Boroondara Building File 40/408/00335 refers to permit #C96/96, dated 8 February 1996; #96/361, dated 16 February 1996, #96/396, dated 6 March 1996. Final certificates were issued for the constructions in 26 August 1996 and 5 February 1997.

<sup>8</sup> Refer permit # 96/362, referred to in correspondence to Trecomax P/L on City of Boroondara Building File 40/408/00335.

<sup>9</sup> See G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, v. 4, p. 139.

<sup>10</sup> Refer citation for Camberwell Civic Precinct in the Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991, v. 3, Precinct 32.



---

<b>Name</b>	House	<b>Reference No</b>	
<b>Address</b>	6 Kitchener Street, Balwyn	<b>Survey Date</b>	21 June 2005
<b>Building Type</b>	Residence	<b>Grading</b>	B (Provisional)
<b>Date</b>	1913	<b>Previous Grading</b>	B



**Extent of Overlay**

To title boundaries.

---

**Intactness**    ☒ Good    ☐ Fair    ☐ Poor

**Heritage Status**    ☐ HV    ☐ AHC    ☐ NT    ☐ Rec    BPS Heritage Overlay

**History**

This house was constructed by owner builder John Maule Rule in 1913.<sup>1</sup> The house was described as being of six rooms with 'concrete walls'.<sup>2</sup> John and Ella Rule and later their son David Rule, a plasterer, resided there until at least 1974.<sup>3</sup>

A change of ownership occurred after this time and applications for the construction of a swimming pool and a two-storey bedroom and kitchen extension to the house were made in 1991 and 1992 respectively.<sup>4</sup>

(G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991; additional research by Lovell Chen, 2005)

**Description & Integrity**

6 Kitchener Street, Balwyn, is a single storey double-fronted Edwardian bungalow. The reported concrete construction of the house has not been confirmed and a more detailed physical inspection is required.<sup>5</sup> External walls have a textured rendered finish. The roof is a steep bellcast hipped roof clad with corrugated galvanised steel; this relatively common roof form is distinguished in this case by an unusual combination of a King post, which projects through the apex of the roof, flanked by dormer windows and slender brick chimneys with rendered corbelled caps. The return verandah has slender tapered concrete posts and concrete floor. The end bay of the verandah is infilled and clad with fibre cement. The windows generally contain timber-framed double-hung sashes with casement sashes to the dormers. The entrance contains a glazed timber door and the enclosed section of verandah is accessed via a panelled timber door.

Extensive additions have been constructed at the rear of the property. While visible, these additions are set well into the site, to the rear of the original residence.

The property has a non-original picket fence and lych gate.

### Historical Context

The subject property is sited in a portion of Balwyn which developed immediately after the turn of the previous century. Kitchener Street's location near to the Outer Circle railway may have spurred development in this area, and the subject property sits harmoniously within its predominately Edwardian and inter-war streetscape.

### Comparative Analysis

Assuming that the subject property is of concrete construction and depending on the specific nature of its construction, there would appear to be few directly comparable buildings in Boroondara. Two examples of concrete houses of the c.1910s-20s have been identified in earlier studies of Camberwell. The *Banff House* at 150 Winmalee Road, Balwyn of 1915 (q.v., B-graded), is a bungalow which is thought to have been designed by noted concrete technologist Hugh R Crawford. Crawford had also been responsible for some earlier Queen Anne styled concrete houses in Mont Albert Road, Canterbury and Camberwell East (though to have been demolished).<sup>6</sup> These had reinforced concrete walls and brick chimneys. A later example is the distinctive 7 Warwick Avenue, Surrey Hills (1923), which was designed by Walter Burley Griffin and constructed using his patented Knitlock roof and wall tiles. This building is included in the Victorian Heritage Register.

Again, assuming the concrete construction can be confirmed (including the specific form used), 6 Kitchener Street may prove to be of technological interest and potential significance in the wider context. Note that until its demolition, a house constructed entirely of reinforced concrete in 1912 in Beaumaris (the *George Higgins House*) was said to be the earliest surviving complete concrete house in Victoria.

Setting aside the issue of the concrete construction, the building is broadly conventional in terms of its form and architectural style (compare with the residence at 7 Bowen Street, Kew, for example), albeit differing from other examples in terms of the unusual elements which are incorporated into its roof form.

### Assessment Against Criteria

*Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria*

*CRITERION E: The importance of the place or object in exhibiting good design or aesthetic characteristics and/or in exhibiting a richness, diversity or unusual integration of features.*

The application of concrete construction, slender verandah posts and projecting King post provides an atypical composition for this otherwise relatively conventional house type.

*CRITERION F: The importance of the place or object in demonstrating or being associated with scientific or technical innovations or achievements.*

The house is potentially of technological significance for its relatively early and uncommon method of concrete construction.

### Statement of Significance

*Provisional only*

The residence at 6 Kitchener Street, Camberwell, is of local historical, scientific (technological) and architectural significance as a relatively early surviving example of a concrete residence. While relatively conventional in terms of its form and architectural style, the building incorporates some unusual features (projecting King post and slender verandah posts) which appear possibly to be related to its concrete construction.

Further physical and historical investigation is required to confirm its significance in this context.

### Grading Review

B (Provisional)



### **Recommendations (provisional)**

On the basis that the concrete construction of the house can be confirmed, 6 Kitchener Street, Camberwell is recommended for inclusion in the Heritage Overlay.

It is recommended that a further site inspection be carried out to confirm the provisional grading.

### **Identified By**

G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

### **References**

*General:* G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

*Specific:*

<sup>1</sup> City of Camberwell Rate Books, 1912-13, #2275; 1913-14, #2240, cited in G. Butler, *Camberwell Conservation Study*, 1991, Volume Four, p. 154.

<sup>2</sup> Details sourced from City of Camberwell Building Index, # 92069 (swimming pool), and # 95269 (additions and alterations).

<sup>3</sup> Information compiled from the City of Camberwell Rate Books and the *Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria*, various years.

<sup>4</sup> Planning Permit #92096, dated 18 January 1991 and #95269, dated 7 July 1992, City of Boroondara Building File 40/408/011809.

<sup>5</sup> Note however that Graeme Butler's inspection confirmed concrete construction. *Camberwell Conservation Study*, 1991, Volume Four, p. 154.

<sup>6</sup> M Lewis, *200 Years of Concrete*, p.26.

Name	<i>Colongulac</i>	Reference No	
Address	11 Luena Road, North Balwyn	Survey Date	25 November 2005
Building Type	Residence	Grading	B
Date	c.1892	Previous Grading	B



#### Extent of Overlay

Note that the existing property boundaries appear to include a section of land at the rear of the site which was previously subdivided. This could be excluded from the extent of the overlay.

Intactness ☒ Good ☐ Fair ☐ Poor

Heritage Status ☐ HV ☐ AHC ☐ NT ☒ Rec. BPS Heritage Overlay

#### History

Though its date of construction has not been conclusively established, *Colongulac* appears to have been constructed c. 1892-3.<sup>1</sup> Rate books for 1892-3 show Robert W. Cerutti was owner-occupier of a house on twelve acres of land, rated at £125.<sup>2</sup> In 1893-94 the rate for Cerutti's house on twelve acres had been halved to £65, possibly as a reflection of the broader economic downturn rather than a change in the nature of the property.<sup>3</sup> A brick house of twelve rooms on the Bonnie View Estate was the first detailed description given by the rate books in 1894-95, with an increased rate of £90.<sup>4</sup> E. Weidemann owned the property but leased it to an E.W. Smith.<sup>5</sup> Archibald M. McArthur, a clerk, leased the brick house, now described as being of eleven rooms, from the Australian Deposit and Mortgage Bank, owners of the property from 1898 to 1901.<sup>6</sup> During this period the rates of the property had reduced to £75.<sup>7</sup> Alexander William Adney, a veterinary surgeon, was the owner-occupier of this property from the early 1900s until at least 1916.<sup>8</sup> Whilst residing here he increased the property size from twelve acres to thirty-two acres and named it *Colongulac*.<sup>9</sup> Consequently the rates increased to £150.<sup>10</sup>

By 1920 *Colongulac* was owned by Emilie Harper and occupied by Patrick Rose Harper, a law clerk.<sup>11</sup> The property comprised an eleven roomed brick house on land 188 x 300 feet and was rated at £55.<sup>12</sup> The owner-occupier of the property was Patrick Rose Harper by 1930 and Mrs Ethel Harper by 1935.<sup>13</sup> *Colongulac* became the Penquite Convalescent Home from the late 1930s until the mid-1950s and then the Oriental Missionary Society until at least 1974.<sup>14</sup> The property was progressively reduced in size during the twentieth century, with land to the east and south subdivided and developed.

A series of building works dating from the late 1950s through to 2003 are identified in Council's building records, though the exact nature of some of these works has not been established.<sup>15</sup>

(G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, additional research by Lovell Chen, 2005)

## Description & Integrity

*Colongulac* is a single-storey brick hipped slate-roofed house with galvanized iron ridge-capping, and a central tower, parapeted with a lookout, its elevated site offering views to the Great Dividing Range and the Dandenongs. The house has an encircling non-original timber verandah with hipped roof. Walls are in umber Hawthorn brick punctuated with an orange-cream striping. Flanking windows to the ground floor are timber double-hung sash, while the three narrow vertical windows to the tower have dichrome flat arches in the brickwork over. The central entry with large door case is approached by a series of steps up to the verandah.

As advised by the current owners, the house has undergone a series of restorative/reconstruction works in recent years. The verandah was substantially or fully reconstructed in 2000 apparently based on photographic evidence. As reconstructed it has turned timber posts with diagonal bracing and simple wooden frieze below a red colorbond roof. Flooring is in tongue and grove hardwood which has been fitted over earlier c.1950s tiling.<sup>16</sup> The urn finials to the tower are also of recent origins (and not detailed on the basis of documentary evidence) and the chimneys have been rebuilt. Other works undertaken have included repair and tuckpointing works to the brickwork. A new entry is reported to be located on the north side of the house.<sup>17</sup>

Other than for the reconstructed/replaced elements and modifications listed above, as viewed from the west, the house appears generally intact. A two-storey addition has been constructed to the rear of the original house to which it is linked by a glazed conservatory.<sup>18</sup>

The garden has several large mature trees. Smaller plantings cluster round the house and the current front garden is largely open lawn. A 1981 swimming pool is not visible from the street. The garage is a 1985-6 addition, held clear of the original house and fronted by a broad gravel drive. The gates and high timber picket fence are also recent, though Butler notes that the unpainted picket fence (albeit two metres high) is sympathetic to the construction date of the house.<sup>19</sup> It effectively screens the house from the street.

## Historical Context

As shown on the MMBW Detail Plan, in the early twentieth century, *Colongulac* stood in isolation on its elevated site, with very little development having occurred in this area of North Balwyn.<sup>20</sup> The area was not fully developed until the post-WWII period.

## Comparative Analysis

Stylistically, the design of *Colongulac* makes a series of references. As noted by Graeme Butler, it has a combined medievalist and Romanesque ancestry,<sup>21</sup> via the orange-cream brick banding contrasting with the general umber Hawthorn brick. The brick banding is spare on flat surfaces and concentrated over windows and doors, in a structural emphasis that give the house a churchly feel; in the specifics of its application it is closer to the Gothic Revival usage in churches than the more widespread Joseph Reed patterning, which favoured quoin and flat surface treatments. Thought to have been reconstructed based on documentary evidence, the slender-proportioned verandah, with its concave roof, suggests the Colonial Regency. Constructed in c. 1892, *Colongulac* to a degree reflects the shift from the later Victorian Italianate to Federation.

## Assessment Against Criteria

### *Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria*

**CRITERION A:** *The historical importance, association with or relationship to Boroondara's history of the place or object.*

While broadly similar to other suburban villas of the period in the broader Melbourne context, in this location *Colongulac* provides a clear reference - through its siting, form and architectural treatment - to an earlier phase of development in the North Balwyn area. Though now surrounded by post-WWII development, *Colongulac* is a landmark in the local area.

**CRITERION D:** *The importance of a place or object in exhibiting the principal characteristics or the representative nature of a place or object as a part of a class or type of places or objects.*

While it has undergone a series of works, including the replacement/reconstruction of some original elements, *Colongulac* remains a fine, representative and, at least as viewed from the west, a relatively intact example of the late Victorian Italianate, incorporating hybrid characteristics associated with the emerging Federation style. This mixture was common in Melbourne by c. 1892.

*CRITERION E: The importance of the place or object in exhibiting good design or aesthetic characteristics and/or in exhibiting a richness, diversity or unusual integration of features.*

Though its basic form is Italianate, *Colongulac* has additional architectural interest deriving from its incorporation of varied stylistic references. In particular, the brick banding has more connection with Gothic Revivalism than most domestic Melbourne examples of the period.

### Statement of Significance

*Colongulac* is of local historical and architectural significance. It is of historical significance for its association with and ability to demonstrate an early phase in the historical development of North Balwyn. Albeit now surrounded by post-war development and on a reduced allotment, in its hilltop siting, form, and architectural treatment, the house demonstrates aspects of the early history of the area. It is also a fine, representative and – as viewed from the west – a relatively intact example of the late Victorian Italianate, incorporating hybrid characteristics associated with the emerging Federation style. Though its basic form is Italianate, *Colongulac* has additional architectural interest deriving from its incorporation of varied stylistic references. In particular, the brick banding has more connection with Gothic Revivalism than most domestic Melbourne examples of the period.

### Grading Review

Unchanged.

### Recommendations

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme.

### Identified By

G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

### References

*General:* G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

*Specific:*

<sup>1</sup> Based on the rate book research undertaken for the 1991 Camberwell Conservation Study, refer v. 4, p, 158.

<sup>2</sup> Shire of Boroondara Rate Book, 1892-93, 2828.

<sup>3</sup> Shire of Boroondara Rate Book, 1893-94, 2272.

<sup>4</sup> Shire of Boroondara Rate Book, 1894-95, 2194.

<sup>5</sup> Shire of Boroondara Rate Book, 1894-95, 2194.

<sup>6</sup> Shire of Boroondara Rate Books 1898-99, 1980; 1900-1, 1987.

<sup>7</sup> Shire of Boroondara Rate Books 1898-99, 1980; 1900-1, 1987.

<sup>8</sup> Shire of Boroondara and Camberwell Rate Books 1905-6, 947; 1915-16, 3207.

<sup>9</sup> Shire of Boroondara and Camberwell Rate Books 1905-6, 947; 1915-16, 3207; Town of Camberwell Rate Book, 1910-11, 1027.

<sup>10</sup> Town of Camberwell Rate Book, 1910-11, 1027.

<sup>11</sup> City of Camberwell Rate Books, 1920-21, 4767; 1924-25, 11580.

<sup>12</sup> City of Camberwell Rate Books, 1920-21, 4767; 1924-25, 11580.

<sup>13</sup> *Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria*, 1935; 1930; City of Camberwell Rate Book, 1930-31, 13274.

<sup>14</sup> *Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria*, 1940; 1952; 1963; 1974.

<sup>15</sup> In 1977 the property was described as having a frontage to Luena Road of 113 feet and 10 inches and a depth of 210 feet, see MMBW application for a permit, 1972, on City of Camberwell Planning (old Property) File 2157/11.

<sup>16</sup> Information provided by Housing Solutions Architects, on behalf of Warwick and Bernadette Foster, 14 June 2007.

<sup>17</sup> Information provided by Housing Solutions Architects, on behalf of Warwick and Bernadette Foster, 14 June 2007.

<sup>18</sup> Information provided by Housing Solutions Architects, on behalf of Warwick and Bernadette Foster, 14 June 2007.

<sup>19</sup> G Butler, *Camberwell Conservation Study* 1991, v. 4, p. 158. Details of alterations and additions sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index,: # 22306, dated 11 March 1958 (carport); #52069, dated 14 November 1972 (reblocking); #67890, dated 10 November 1980 (unspecified alterations); #70040, dated 26 October 1981 (swimming pool); #75336, dated 11 April 1984 (front fence); #77599, dated 4 April 1985 (new timber garage); #80820, dated 29 July 1986 (enlargement of garage and shed). More recently, there have been other works: 101/24881, dated 4 January 2002 (unspecified alterations); 102/27103, dated 3 September 2002 (privacy screens); B5-1455/20030203/0, dated 6 August 2003 (conservatory and other additions).

<sup>20</sup> MMBW Detail Plan No. 150, c.1905 (possibly with later amendments).

<sup>21</sup> G Butler, *City of Camberwell Conservation Study*, 1991, v. 4, p. 158.

---

<b>Name</b>	<i>Shenley Croft</i>	<b>Reference No</b>	
<b>Address</b>	7-9 Mangarra Road, Canterbury	<b>Survey Date</b>	21 June 2005
<b>Building Type</b>	Residence	<b>Grading</b>	B
<b>Date</b>	1905-6	<b>Previous Grading</b>	B



**Extent of Overlay**

To title boundaries.

---

**Intactness**    ☒ Good    ☐ Fair    ☐ Poor

**Heritage Status**    ☐ HV    ☐ AHC    ☐ NT    ☐ Rec.    BPS Heritage Overlay

**History**

Initially known as 5 Mangarra Road, *Shenley Croft* was built for Hans W H McNalty (or McNulty), manager of the Port Melbourne branch of the Melbourne Savings Bank, in 1905-6. The architect was John Edmund Burke and the house was built by O'Brien & Joyce.<sup>1</sup> It apparently replaced a 7-roomed weatherboard house, which had been McNalty's home since 1893 - before this date he had resided in Burwood Road, Hawthorn.<sup>2</sup> Two rooms were added to the residence in 1908, the architect again being Burke.<sup>3</sup>

The house was owned by Hans McNalty until c.1953, when the *Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria* listed the house as being occupied by William Waterworth from this date. During 1960, the neighboring house was constructed, and the street was renumbered. *Shenley Croft* subsequently became 7-9 Mangarra Road.<sup>4</sup> In 1963, R M James acquired the house. In 1965 he lodged an application for a permit to construct a two-storey brick addition comprising a full height recreation/music room and additional bathroom accommodation to the rear of the property. Approval was granted and the extension, by Blackburn Plan & Décor Service, was subsequently constructed.<sup>5</sup>

Approval was granted in 1984 for the construction of the existing timber fence.<sup>6</sup>

Architect John Edmund Burke was initially articled to Walter Butler and Beverley Ussher, who were noted for their work in the Queen Anne style, which was particularly favoured in the inner eastern suburbs. He then worked in the office of R C Gordon, Melbourne City Council architect before opening his own practice. Between c.1895 and 1901, Burke was in partnership with Robert M Schreiber. Burke initially designed church buildings in rural areas before undertaking commissions for private residences and commercial premises in Melbourne.<sup>7</sup>

(G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991; additional research by Lovell Chen, 2005)

## Description & Integrity

*Shenley Croft*, 7-9 Mangarra Road, Canterbury, is a single-storey timber Edwardian villa constructed in 1905-6 in the broadly Queen Anne style with Old English/medieval overtones, with early additions (1908) by the same architect. The steeply pitched slate roof rises to a hip around a prominent ribbed bichrome brick chimney while bracketed projecting gables and window bays feature terracotta ridge cresting and half-timbered gable ends. The house is clad with dark-stained shingled boards and the asymmetrical façade contains a deep verandah with timber posts and Tudor arch fretwork. Projecting bays contain bay windows and windows have timber-framed double-hung and casement sash windows with coloured glass fanlights. The entrance contains a pair of timber-framed multi-paned glazed doors with matching single doors elsewhere.

Assuming it was constructed, the music room addition of c. 1965 is set well behind the original house and is not visible from the street.

A tall non-original paling fence and gates screen the property and the house is surrounded by mature native landscape which is supplemented by more recent exotic vegetation.

## Historical Context

The subject property is located in an area of Canterbury that was developed and subdivided during the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries for large mansion houses, which were set in substantial grounds, and more modest residences, such as the subject property.<sup>8</sup>

## Comparative Analysis

As a fine and substantially intact example of an Edwardian house in the Queen Anne idiom, *Shenley Croft*, 7-9 Mangarra Road, Canterbury, can be compared in a general sense with numerous other residences in Boroondara.

One example of more relevance than most is *Banool*, 26 Victoria Avenue, Camberwell (q.v, B-graded), designed by Burke & Schreiber in 1899-1900.

## Assessment Against Criteria

*Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria*

*CRITERION D: The importance of a place or object in exhibiting the principal characteristics or the representative nature of a place or object as a part of a class or type of places or objects.*

*Shenley Croft*, 7-9 Mangarra Rd, Canterbury, is a fine and substantially intact example of a large detached timber Edwardian residence. It is representative of the type of house being constructed in the area in the first decade of the twentieth century.

*CRITERION E: The importance of the place or object in exhibiting good design or aesthetic characteristics and/or in exhibiting a richness, diversity or unusual integration of features.*

Though broadly typical of the Queen Anne style, *Shenley Croft*, 7-9 Mangarra Rd, Canterbury is of architectural interest for its relatively simple form and incorporation of a number of Old English/medieval references.

## Statement of Significance

*Shenley Croft*, 7-9 Mangarra Road, Canterbury, is of local historical and aesthetic (architectural) significance, as a fine and substantially intact example of a large timber Edwardian residence in the Queen Anne style and incorporating a number of Old English/medieval references. In particular, the dark stained cladding, steeply pitched roof and crowning chimney add to its distinctive and impressive character.

## Grading Review

Unchanged.

## Recommendations

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme.

## Identified By

G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

## References

*General:* G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

*Specific:*

<sup>1</sup> City of Camberwell Building Approvals, 1899-1918, #616, cited in G. Butler, *Camberwell Conservation Study*, 1991, vol. 4, p. 174.

<sup>2</sup> Shire of Boroondara Rate Books, 1895-6, 103.

<sup>3</sup> City of Camberwell Building Approvals, 1899-1918, #1100, cited in G. Butler, *Camberwell Conservation Study*, 1991, vol. 4, p. 174.

<sup>4</sup> Information compiled from the *Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria*, various years.

<sup>5</sup> Details sourced from the City of Boroondara Property File #1017:7.

<sup>6</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, #75375, dated 17 April 1984.

<sup>7</sup> Biographical notes drawn from the Miles Lewis' *Australian Architectural Index*.

<sup>8</sup> MMBW Detail Plan No. 70, c. 1905.



<b>Name</b>	House	<b>Reference No</b>	
<b>Address</b>	91 Maud Street, North Balwyn	<b>Survey Date</b>	25 November 2005
<b>Building Type</b>	Residence	<b>Grading</b>	B
<b>Date</b>	1940	<b>Previous Grading</b>	B



#### Extent of Overlay

To title boundaries.

**Intactness** ☒ Good ☐ Fair ☐ Poor

**Heritage Status** ☐ HV ☐ AHC ☐ NT ☐ Rec. ☐ BPS Heritage Overlay

#### History

In 1940, Alexander Harold Lowe commissioned Thornbury builder, J.G. White, to erect a residence to a design of the State Bank Building Department.<sup>1</sup> The two-storied brick house was of nine rooms and had an estimated cost of £1,733.<sup>2</sup> Alexander Lowe, a secretary, lived at this address with Mavis A. Lowe until at least 1974.<sup>3</sup>

The house was considered for demolition and replacement with two units in 2005,<sup>4</sup> and was also considered for a conversion into a child care centre (there is one diagonally opposite), however, a covenant on the title limits the use of the land to be for a single dwelling of brick construction.<sup>5</sup>

(G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, additional research by Lovell Chen, 2005)

#### Description & Integrity

91 Maud Street, is a two-storey, flat-fronted brick house in a careful and thoroughly typical neo-Georgian style: type CF 7 by the architectural office of the State Savings Bank of Victoria under G Burridge Leith, who had run that office since the 1920s.<sup>6</sup> It has simple cube form, a hipped roof with a single chimney at the east end, and symmetrically placed windows and front door. A wrought iron balconette frames the central first floor window, and shutters frame the outer windows on both floors. The smaller upstairs windows suggest an attic level; while the course line and vaguely ceremonial front steps, with their wrought iron balustrade, hint at a basement.

The low picket fence, noted by Graeme Butler as part of the original specification,<sup>7</sup> has been removed since the 1991 Camberwell Conservation Study, though the side paling fence, with flat top may be early. The garage, with stepped top, was added either at the end of construction or just after the houses was completed.<sup>8</sup> It is a simply treated brick box with boarded and braced doors, typical of

many of the interwar and early post-war years.<sup>9</sup> Apart from a kitchen, meals and patio area added at the rear in 1986,<sup>10</sup> the house appears to be intact externally.

The plan was comparatively open for its time, with a stair hall opening into living and dining rooms through double doors to either side. This may reflect Leith's wide experience in weatherboard Bungalow design during the 1920s. Surprisingly, the house has little if any climatic recognition, its generously windowed west and north walls topped with almost vestigial eaves in a way that suggests suburban house design of the 1990s.

### Historical Context

This area of North Balwyn developed slowly from the late interwar period; the subject property was one of the earliest houses built in this street, completed before the ban on private building was enforced in 1942 as a result of the Second World War. Development of the area had resumed by the late 1940s, with the street nearly fully developed by the early 1960s.

### Comparative Analysis

A conservative design by 1940, 91 Maud Street, reflects the broad acceptance of the Georgian or Mediterranean amalgams as the preferable style for Australian housing. Two-storey variants of this type were being designed in numbers by Stacey Neave, Augustus Aley and John D Moore and others in Hardy Wilson's circle from 1919 on.<sup>11</sup> The exterior of the house reflects an increasing gravitation to Neo-Georgian that appears in the State Bank's Garden City housing of the late 1920s and early 1930s. But it also evokes Toorak, South Yarra and other elite suburbs as well, and had clear overtones of gracious living. 91 Maud Street's open plan recalls the earlier Bungalow work done by the State Savings Bank's architectural office.

Another conservative neo-Georgian residence is *Xanadu* at 119 Doncaster Road, North Balwyn (q.v., B-graded), a comparatively ornate house and surgery was designed designs by Vincent Ward in 1948.

### Assessment Against Criteria

*Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria*

*CRITERION D: The importance of a place or object in exhibiting the principal characteristics or the representative nature of a place or object as a part of a class or type of places or objects.*

91 Maud Street is a representative and externally highly intact example of a two-storey Neo-Georgian brick residence of the late interwar period. It demonstrates one form of the State Bank housing prototypes for use by the general public, as they were conceived in 1940. The Neo-Georgian form of the design was a response to suburban aspirations to graciousness and substantial achievement, and is refined and unassuming while still economical.

### Statement of Significance

91 Maud Street is of local historical and architectural significance as a representative and externally highly intact example of a two-storey Neo-Georgian brick residence of the late interwar period. It demonstrates one form of the State Bank housing prototypes for use by the general public, as they were conceived in 1940. The Neo-Georgian form of the design was a response to suburban aspirations to graciousness and substantial achievement, and is refined and unassuming while still economical.

### Grading Review

Unchanged.

### Recommendations

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme.

### Identified By

G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

### References

*General:* G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

<sup>1</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, # 13592, dated 7 October 1940; MMBW Drainage Plan Application, # 220337.

<sup>2</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, # 13592, dated 7 October 1940.

<sup>3</sup> *Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria*, 1944-45; 1950; 1963; 1974.

<sup>4</sup> City of Boroondara Planning File # 40/409/10851.

<sup>5</sup> City of Boroondara Planning File # 40/409/10851.

<sup>6</sup> Leith's designs figured prominently in *Home Beautiful* and elsewhere during the 1920s, and he remained prominent as a house designer during the 1930s, developing designs that were prototypes for the post war 'brick veneer'. For Leith and the State Bank Office, see Peter Cuffley, *Australian Houses of the 1920s and 1930s*, Five Mile, Melbourne, 1989, passim.

<sup>7</sup> G Butler, City of Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, vol.4, p. 181. The fence appears in Butler's photograph.

<sup>8</sup> Detail sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, # 13592, dated 7 October 1940.

<sup>9</sup> The City of Camberwell Building Index lists unspecified 'Additions and alterations' (costing \$25,000) in # 81111, dated 5 September 1986.

<sup>10</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, #81111, dated 5 September 1986, and working drawings (86-148 F) by Allan A Armstrong Pty Ltd.

<sup>11</sup> For general accounts of this tendency see Conrad Hamann, 'Paths of Beauty: the afterlife of Australian Colonial architecture', *Transition*, Spring 1988; Peter Cuffley, *Australian Houses of the 1920s and 1930s*, Five Mile, Melbourne, 1989, Ch 5; and Philip Cox and Clive Lucas, *Australian Colonial Architecture*, Part 3, Lansdowne, Melbourne, 1974.

<b>Name</b>	<i>Roystead</i>	<b>Reference No</b>	
<b>Address</b>	51 Mont Albert Road, Canterbury	<b>Survey Date</b>	16 November 2005
<b>Building Type</b>	Residence	<b>Grading</b>	B
<b>Date</b>	1885	<b>Previous Grading</b>	B



#### Extent of Overlay

To be established on site. This should preferably be done in consultation with the owner.

The extent of the Heritage Overlay needs to establish a generous curtilage to the north and east sides with a more limited extent on the more altered west and south sides.

<b>Intactness</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Poor
<b>Heritage Status</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> HV	<input type="checkbox"/> AHC	<input type="checkbox"/> NT
	<input type="checkbox"/> Rec.	BPS Heritage Overlay	

#### History

Architects Twentyman & Askew let tenders for a new residence for tea merchant Oliver Vial in 1885.<sup>1</sup> The property first appears in the rate books in 1884-85 as a house and acres of land with a NAV of £110.<sup>2</sup> In 1885-86 the property was defined as 15 acres of land with a house and a NAV of £120.<sup>3</sup> The *Camberwell Conservation Study* notes that the NAV increased to £250 in 1886-87 and to £400 in 1888-89,<sup>4</sup> possibly suggesting major alterations and additions took place at this time. In 1889-90 the NAV decreased to £330 and in 1892-93 to £200.<sup>5</sup> Based on an entry in the Twentyman & Askew Day Book describing 'additions to Oliver Vial's res', however, a date of 1890 seems more likely for additions to the property.<sup>6</sup>

By 1896-97 the property was rated in two parts; the brick house and 4 acres as having a NAV of £145, and 10 acres of land having a NAV of £50.<sup>7</sup> Oliver Vial, while continuing to own Roystead, no longer occupied it, but rented it instead to George R. Rand, a gentleman.<sup>8</sup> Vial again occupied the property in 1900.<sup>9</sup>

The MMBW Detail Plan no. 70 of c. 1905 shows *Roystead*, like other houses in the street - *Killegran* (*Kingussey*), *Banool* and *Highton* - all facing to the north away from Mont Albert Road. In the case of *Roystead*, a long carriage drive, entered from a recessed gateway on Mont Albert Road, curved around the front of the house and reached the stables on the west side of the property. At that date a tennis court was shown some distance to the north east of the property (now the Camberwell Grammar oval).<sup>10</sup> Outbuildings were located to the west. The house is shown with verandahs facing north, south and west, two protruding room bays, and a cellar.

Alexander Macneil, a merchant and importer purchased *Roystead* from Oliver Vial in 1902.<sup>11</sup> Macneil owned Briscoe & Company, the wholesale ironmongers and merchants of 396 Little Collins Street, in

1900.<sup>12</sup> He owned and occupied *Roystead* until it was sold in the early 1930s to Camberwell Grammar School.<sup>13</sup> The property is still part of the Grammar School complex today.

(G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, additional research by Lovell Chen, 2005)

### Description & Integrity

*Roystead* (after which a nearby outer circle railway halt was named) is a two-storey stuccoed Italianate house designed by the practice of Twentyman & Askew and constructed in 1885, with early additions by the same architects of c.1890. Now on the consolidated Camberwell Grammar School site, the house does not address Mont Albert Road.

The principal north elevation is dominated by a two-storey arcaded verandah with arches carried on slender columns in the manner of Joseph Reed's *Ripponlea*, 1868, or Charles Webb's Hotel Windsor, of 1883-4. The arch arrangement is unusual, being of round arches on the ground floor and segmental arches on the first floor, rather than the reverse. These arcades, though part of a return verandah system, centre on the entrance bay. This forms a symmetrical episode in an otherwise asymmetrical design. At the western end of the north elevation is a two-storey wing, projecting forward to the north, with arched windows at ground floor level and rectangular windows to the first floor. Graeme Butler has suggested that this wing may date from a separate construction phase,<sup>14</sup> and it is possible that this may have been the c. 1890 addition. The east end of the arcaded verandah returns in single-storey (originally open terrace) form around onto the east elevation. This element appears to be an (early twentieth century?) addition, and is not shown on the MMBW Detail Plan of c. 1905. It has since been built on at first floor level and partly enclosed at ground level. The terrace is terminated on the eastern elevation by an original canted bay facing east. This has fairly elaborate window settings, in arches with double-stepped reveals.<sup>15</sup> The roof was originally slate and that is still in place, ridged with galvanized iron.

The main approach to the house is still via the central garden front steps with their balustrades sweeping round to support and dramatize a pair of pedestal lights. The front door is emphasized by a protruding bay from roof level down: marked first by a breakfront in the bracketed cornice, then by panels flanking the central verandah arch on the first floor, and finally by the imposing door and its fanlight, which has additional flanking panels. The ground floor windows are simple arched sashes with no flanking aedicules. The upper windows are oblong sashes. The ground floor verandah breaks out through its net of columns and transforms into two rounded terraces, with later tiled surfacing.

The east and north sides of the building are relatively intact to their original or early forms (other than for the addition, date unknown, of the eastern arcaded verandah with terrace above). During the twentieth century sections of the arcaded verandahs were enclosed to form additional rooms,<sup>16</sup> including one still in place on the east side. A verandah is shown on the western side of the building on the c.1905 MMBW Detail Plan; this has been demolished. A series of single-storey extensions have been made on the west and south elevations. These include a single-storey lean-to on the west elevation (c. 1950s?). Next to that is a single-storey outbuilding of uncertain origins with hipped slate roof and, again, galvanized iron ridges, with windows and doors from different periods. It frames the south elevation, where it is linked to the house by a further addition incorporating a substation. This links up with the original or early rear wing. The south-east corner of the house is punctuated by a reinforced concrete bridge, railed in iron, which leads across to the adjacent first floor Chapel.

Incorporated into the broader Camberwell Grammar School campus, *Roystead* now retains very little of its original setting. Notwithstanding the fact that it always faced away from Mont Albert Road, the house was separated from the street by later buildings. All *Roystead's* original outbuildings have been demolished and the original approach drive has been obliterated. NOTE: Since this original report was written in late 2005, the Chapel and its accompanying buildings to the immediate south side have been entirely demolished, leaving the rear view of *Roystead* quite open, across a bare demolition site from Mont Albert Road. This work entails some alterations to *Roystead's* south side.

### Historical Context

Several large villa estates were located in the area north of Mont Albert Road and east of the railway line at the turn of the twentieth century. Regardless of their street access, these were generally oriented northward to take advantage of the views. Villas included *Roystead*, *Kaleno* (to its west), *Highton*, *Myambert* and *Nowa Nowa* to the east and *Belmont* and *Larino* to the north facing

Whitehorse Road. These areas were generally subdivided in the 1920s (Central Park, Belmont Heights and Cotham Hill estates) and developed in the later interwar period.<sup>17</sup>

### Comparative Analysis

*Roystead* compares with a number of houses in the Boroondara municipality, such as *Strathearne*, now Rossbourne House School, in Power Street Hawthorn, *Ashwick*, 2 Daniell Place, Kew, of 1887, and Reed, Henderson and Smart's *Urangeline* of 1884, now Carey Grammar, at 349 Barkers Road Kew. The first two were Italianate; the third, though in a free style with Queen Anne and Free Romanesque detailing, parallels *Roystead* in its various timber and brick additions. The *Strathearne-Ashwick* line went back to other imposing, arcaded Italianate or quasi-renaissance houses, among them Reed and Barnes' *Ripponlea* of 1868 ff.,<sup>18</sup> or Charles Webb's arcaded *Mandeville Hall* west front of 1867 ff, interesting also for its use of bowed terraces. These houses are all a step up, compositionally and in terms of budget and resources, from the common form of double fronted stuccoed Italianate houses appearing around Australia in the 1860s-1880s. By contrast these were marked by short return verandahs, often in cast iron rather than in masonry as here, and usually framed with one or two canted bays.

### Assessment Against Criteria

*Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria*

*CRITERION A: The historical importance, association with or relationship to Boroondara's history of the place or object.*

Though the association of this house with wealthy merchant, Oliver Vial and subsequent early owners and occupants is of interest, it is not considered to elevate the significance above that of other houses in Boroondara. The later historical association with Camberwell Grammar School (established in the mid-1880s but located on this site since the 1930s), one of the best known private schools in the area, is of more interest.

*CRITERION D: The importance of a place or object in exhibiting the principal characteristics or the representative nature of a place or object as a part of a class or type of places or objects.*

*Roystead* is a relatively intact example of a substantial Italianate house and compares with other examples surviving in Hawthorn, Kew, Toorak and Ripponlea, which demonstrate the idea of Italian villas in the suburbs.

*CRITERION E: The importance of the place or object in exhibiting good design or aesthetic characteristics and/or in exhibiting a richness, diversity or unusual integration of features.*

*Roystead* is inventive in having modulated north side verandahs to centralize its composition and accentuate its front door. In this, various resources are used, from a breakfront cornice to a less common fanlight treatment over the north side door.

### Statement of Significance

*Roystead*, 51 Mont Albert Road, Canterbury, is of local historical and architectural significance. It is a relatively intact example of a substantial two-storey Italianate house with a notable two-storey arcaded verandah. *Roystead* is inventive in having modulated north side verandahs to centralize its composition and accentuate its front door. In this, various resources are used, from a breakfront cornice to a less common fanlight treatment over the north side door. The building is also of historical significance for its association since the 1930s with Camberwell Grammar School.

### Grading Review

Unchanged.

### Recommendations

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme.

### Identified By

G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

## References

*General:* G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

*Specific:*

<sup>1</sup> 'Contract let in 1890 for additions to res of Oliver Vial', Twentyman & Askew Day Book, SLV MS138/3, p. 277, cited in Melbourne Mansions Data Base, record no. 2984, RB 1884-85, 605

<sup>2</sup> Shire of Boroondara Rate Book, 1884-85, 605.

<sup>3</sup> Shire of Boroondara Rate Book, 1885-86, 834.

<sup>4</sup> Shire of Boroondara Rate Books, 1886-87, 972; 1888-89, 1668.

<sup>5</sup> Shire of Boroondara Rate Books, 1889-90, 84; 1892-93, 704.

<sup>6</sup> Twentyman & Askew Day Book, SLV MS138/3, p. 1885, cited in Melbourne Mansions Data Base, record no. 2984,

<sup>7</sup> Shire of Boroondara Rate Book, 1896-97, 379, 380.

<sup>8</sup> Shire of Boroondara Rate Book, 1896-97, 379, 380.

<sup>9</sup> Shire of Boroondara Rate Book, 1900-1, 395.

<sup>10</sup> MMBW Drainage Plan # 2002, c1927?

<sup>11</sup> Shire of Boroondara Rate Book, 1901-2, 435.

<sup>12</sup> *Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria, 1900.*

<sup>13</sup> *Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria, 1910; 1920; 1930; 1935.*

<sup>14</sup> G Butler, City of Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, v.4, p. 188.

<sup>15</sup> A favourite device of John Soane and Francis Greenway's, but here more related to sixteenth century Italian usage, as in Michele Sanmicheli's original use of the motif in his Verona gateways and palaces.

<sup>16</sup> Some of these are visible in a c. 1968 photograph by John Collins, State Library of Victoria, image no. jc003175.

<sup>17</sup> Refer G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, citation for Precinct 18, v. 2.

<sup>18</sup> Dates sourced from Philip Goad et al., *Melbourne Architecture: a guide*, Watermark, Sydney, 1999; and G Butler, Kew B-graded places study (draft) 2001.



<b>Name</b>	<i>Highton</i>	<b>Reference No</b>	
<b>Address</b>	65 Mont Albert Road, Canterbury	<b>Survey Date</b>	16 November 2005
<b>Building Type</b>	Residence	<b>Grading</b>	B
<b>Date</b>	1906	<b>Previous Grading</b>	B



#### Extent of Overlay

To be established on site. This should preferably be done in consultation with the owner.

**Intactness** ☒ Good ☐ Fair ☐ Poor

**Heritage Status** ☐ HV ☐ AHC ☐ NT ☐ Rec. BPS Heritage Overlay

#### History

George Doery, a woollen manufacturer of the firm Davids, Doery & Co., owned vacant acres here in 1905-6 until he erected a ten-room brick house in the period 1906-7.<sup>1</sup> By courtesy of the Doery family, *Highton* became the Camberwell Convalescent Home for soldiers during the World War I, reverting to Edward Doery's occupation until it went to Walter H. Buxton in 1923.<sup>2</sup> Samuel Henry Rye was the new owner-occupier prior to the next decade. Samuel Rye was Managing Director of Buckley & Nunn Ltd from 1934 after starting at Robert Reid & Co. in Adelaide (1907) and working up to manager in 1926. He was also a council member of Camberwell Boys' Grammar School and the Melbourne Chamber of Commerce. Dare Holyman owned it from the mid 1930s, living further east on Mont Albert Road (146), and Camberwell Grammar by the 1970s.<sup>3</sup> Holyman was a marine engineer whose travels brought him back to the family firm in 1919, eventually becoming a director and Traffic Manager of Holyman's Airways Pty Ltd (1933) and manager of ANA Freight in 1941.

The house continues to form part of Camberwell Grammar School's Mont Albert Road complex.

(G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, additional research by Lovell Chen, 2005)

#### Description & Integrity

*Highton*, 65 Mont Albert Road, of 1906, is now a part of Camberwell Grammar School, housing its music rooms. As with *Roystead* nearby (51 Mont Albert Road, B-graded, q.v., also part of Camberwell Grammar School), *Highton* was designed and sited to take advantage of views to the north, looking away from Mont Albert Road.

*Highton's* brickwork was painted white or pale grey for some years but more recently stripped back to reveal the original red brick texture and coloration.<sup>4</sup> The bricks are dense and appear to have survived this stripping well. This house has a complex massing even by Federation standards. This is



focused on a hipped, broadly pyramidal north side roof, breaking into two closely placed gables on the south. Five radial wings of uneven length and detailing spread out from this core: two on the south side, three on the north, forming an X-plan plus an extra wing. Adding to the complexity of its planning, *Highton* also progresses from single storey (flanking wings to the south); two-storey (paired gables over the south entry); to three storeys (north-east wings, verandah and basement). The roof is terracotta tile in a Marseilles pattern, and the chimneys have red brick stacks with strapwork trim and roughcast stuccoed tops.

The north side of the building is dominated by the three upper floor wings, together radiating in an arrowhead pattern. The fronts of each wing are quite plain: flat, plain-coursed brick, with the gable tympanum pushed out over the window bays on the east and north-east wings but replaced with a skeleton frame barge board on the north wing. The north and north-east wings are linked by a triangular terrace/verandah. This is simply treated, with a slat balustrade and some floral detailing, and a plain frieze in shallow segmental arches. Behind this verandah/terrace, the ground floor level of the building appears to have been extensively altered though the details of these changes have not been confirmed. Below the verandah/terrace, access is provided to an assumed basement level via service doors. This lower area also appears to have been altered possibly through infilling and certainly through the alteration of door and window openings. The half-timbered looking cement sheet and strap plank wall along the rest of the north side looks like a later infill. It terminates part way across the original west wing, which is again in plain brick with a flat front and a skeleton bargeboard pulled clear, and a non-original off-centre window. A projecting rectangular bay with a shallow tiled roof frames the composition at the east end. On the upper levels, the windows are relatively plain, being trios of sashes with smaller-paned upper halves and some leadlighting, over long single-piece sills. The north wing's gable end window has a segmental top, but the other windows are all rectangular, suggesting some alteration has occurred. By comparison with the south side, a reasonable amount of alteration has occurred on the north side of the building.

The south side presents two broad-angled wings that converge on a large entry porch. Again the roof geometry is simple and direct, with two transverse pitches converging on to gables, near to a pairing and linked with a stucco parapet inscribed *Highton*. Below this parapet is another balcony, curved this time, again with plain slat balustrading, and below that an imposing porch valance in three bays in a slatted valance. The three doors opening onto the balcony appear to be of recent origins, and the balustrading to the balcony reinstated since the Camberwell Conservation Study was completed in 1991. The porch is supported on five horseshoe arches over turned timber posts. Behind that the front door and two large flanking bays form a broad wall of glass and timber framing. The south elevation's general symmetry is broken primarily by a gabled front on the west wing only, with a tall central window in a stilted arch flanked by two rectangular windows, like components of a Serlian arch spread across the gable bay. The east wing terminates in a half-timbered gable placed directly over a canted bay. A counter-balancing unity is reasserted on the south side with a brick dado below a stuccoed upper walling; this is consistent across the south side.

Other than for the alterations noted above (which are more numerous on the north side), the house appears to be broadly intact externally. Notwithstanding this, it is commented that the unusual and complex form of the building, together with the limited documentation for works, make it difficult to identify all changes that have occurred.

The setting of the building has been extensively altered following its incorporation into the Camberwell Grammar School campus. The original front garden has been replaced by a terraced space between *Highton* and the classroom block to its immediate south. The original drive has been obliterated for the development of this garden and an asphalted car park to the east side, next to Belmont Park. This car park now extends to the north of *Highton* itself, replacing its former garden.

### Historical Context

Several large villa estates were located in the area north of Mont Albert Road and east of the railway line at the turn of the twentieth century. Regardless of their street access, these were generally oriented northward to take advantage of the views. Villas included *Highton*, *Roystead* and *Kaleno* (to its west), *Myambert* and *Nowa Nowa* to the east and *Belmont* and *Larino* to the north facing Whitehorse Road. These areas were generally subdivided in the 1920s (Central Park, Belmont Heights and Cotham Hill estates) and developed in the later interwar period.<sup>5</sup>

## Comparative Analysis

*Highton* is a late Federation house, from a time when Australian architects were beginning to react against the complexity of detail in Federation houses at their high tide. At this stage Australian architects began aligning their detailing with that seen in contemporary free style<sup>6</sup> or Art Nouveau architecture abroad, particularly in Britain and the United States. Hence the brick courses are plain rather than tuckpointed, the window and gable treatments are comparatively plain, and the angled wings are simply shaped, avoiding the detailed and highly episodic shaping of earlier wings in the Federation period. At the same time the general composition is quite complex, as in the manner of 'reforming' houses in this period such as B J Waterhouse's *Brent Knowle* in Sydney (1907)<sup>7</sup>

In plan the house suggests the butterfly form used, in British free style architecture, by Edward Prior's *The Barn*, Devon, in 1896-7, and expressed more quietly in Charles Voysey's *Annesley Lodge*, Hampstead, of 1896. Both rely, compositionally, on central entries placed in a diagonal between two converging wings. Prior's design is symmetrical externally but Voysey's has an asymmetrical composition similar to *Highton*, mainly in fenestration.<sup>8</sup> At the same time the broad arrow composition of the three converging north wings is closer to an earlier Australian prototype of the free style butterfly or in this case a three-quarter X plan: George Sydney Jones' AE Joseph house at Homebush, NSW, of 1893.<sup>9</sup> A second formal link to more contemporary free style composition is in *Highton*'s use of closely paired gable peaks, with the massing below each often fusing. This was a recurring element in houses by Voysey, Prior, Baillie Scott and Lutyens, and made a contemporary Australian appearance in Horbury Hunt's *Pibrac* on Sydney's North Shore, 1889-90.<sup>10</sup> In Camberwell, Desbrowe Annear returns to this motif in 1933 with 7 Muriel Street (B-graded, q.v.).

Graeme Butler attributes the design to Inskip and Butler, but this has not been confirmed.

## Assessment Against Criteria

*Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria*

*CRITERION A: The historical importance, association with or relationship to Boroondara's history of the place or object.*

While of interest, the associations of this house with its early owners and occupants are not considered to elevate the significance of the house above others in Boroondara. Though the connection is not of such long standing, as in the case of *Roystead* (B-graded, q.v.), *Highton* is of some historical interest for its association with Camberwell Grammar School.

The building is of historical significance for its ability to demonstrate the pattern of siting of large villa houses on the rise to the north of Mont Albert Road. The siting of the building facing away from Mont Albert Road and north toward the view is similar to that of *Roystead* (q.v.), but is more readily discernible from Mont Albert Road. Unlike *Roystead*, *Highton* is visible from Mont Albert Road (having the nearest classroom block sited to one side rather than directly in front), and there is equally no visual obstruction between *Highton* and Camberwell Grammar's north boundary.<sup>11</sup>

*CRITERION E: The importance of the place or object in exhibiting good design or aesthetic characteristics and/or in exhibiting a richness, diversity or unusual integration of features.*

*Highton* is among the more interesting examples of Federation era houses in Boroondara. It extends radial tendencies in the general Federation plan and shows clarity in applying Federation detail. While not as refined in its resolution as some, the building has innovations that commend it on different grounds. Principal amongst these is the planning of the building; *Highton* is of wide interest for its use of a radial 'butterfly' plan on the Mont Albert Road elevation and a five-winged plan in total. Similarly, its pairing of gables in its north and south elevations reflects a contemporary Arts and Crafts-influenced form.

## Statement of Significance

*Highton* is of local historical and architectural significance. The building is of historical significance for its ability to demonstrate the pattern of siting of large villa houses on the rise to the north of Mont Albert Road, facing away from Mont Albert Road and north toward the view. It is also of historical interest for its association since the 1970s with Camberwell Grammar School. Architecturally, *Highton* is among the more interesting examples of Federation era houses in Boroondara. It is of particular

significance for its unusual planning, employing a radial 'butterfly' plan on the Mont Albert Road elevation and a five-winged plan in total. The design employs a range of simplified late Federation detail and is generally intact externally.

### Grading Review

Unchanged.

### Recommendations

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme.

### Identified By

G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

### References

*General:* G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

*Specific:*

<sup>1</sup> Town of Camberwell Rate Books, 1906-7, 525; 1905-6, 490.

<sup>2</sup> Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria, 1920; 1923; Camberwell Library File A3 (1933) STR; City of Camberwell Rate Book, 1922-3, 2092.

<sup>3</sup> Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria, 1928; MMBW Drainage Plan Application # 51870; Details sourced from Camberwell Building Index # 5428, dated 27 August 1935; # 49197, dated 27 May 1971.

<sup>4</sup> See the illustration in Graeme Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, v.4, p. 191.

<sup>5</sup> Refer G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, citation for Precinct 18, v. 2.

<sup>6</sup> Alastair Service argues the case for *free style* as a descriptive term for Arts and Crafts –influenced architecture outside the conspicuously Gothic, or contemporary renderings of the Renaissance or Baroque. Edwardian Architecture, Thames and Hudson, London, 1977. He describes *free style* variously as 'free or non-historicist design (p. 6); conspicuously *free* versions of earlier British styles (p. 13); related to *organic* design and plans that would link houses physically to their immediate area through climatic recognition, materials, or form (p. 20, 42); free asymmetrical planning and composition (p. 46). *Architectural Design* used the term interchangeably with 1900s Art Nouveau and Arts and Crafts in a special number in 1979, though the same magazine saw Charles Jencks' confusing adaptation of it as a term for Classicist design in 1982. *The free manner*, as contemporaries in Australia were calling it as early as 1890s, already pervaded Federation architecture's planning and composition and a general desire to both express region and escape architectural rules and formulae. The shift after 1900 was to make to system plainer in its results. Apperly et al. refer to *Federation Free Style* as a term for larger public buildings of the time: *Identifying Australian Architecture*, Angus and Robertson, Sydney, 1989, pp. 136-9, but the concept pervaded contemporary architecture across a wide range of adaptations in design.

<sup>7</sup> 'Brent Knowle' in Robert Irving et al., *Fine Houses of Sydney*, Sydney, 1986.

<sup>8</sup> See Alastair Service, *Edwardian Architecture*, Thames and Hudson, London, 1977, pp. 24-7, 31, 90-1, 94. Here, Service notes three Prior designs in this butterfly or X-plan mode, along with related butterfly designs by Ernest Gimson and Detmar Blow, and some Baillie- Scott designs followed the pattern. The Free Style distinction is important since the common predecessor was arguably Norman Shaw's X-planned *Chesters* in Northumberland, 1889-91. This was a Baroque Revival house externally, as was Lutyens' *Papillon Hall*, Leicestershire, of 1903. See Service, pp. 64, 90.

<sup>9</sup> See Conrad Hamann, 'Forgotten reformer: the architecture of George Sydney Jones, 1865-1927', *Architecture Australia*, October 1979.

<sup>10</sup> See Peter Reynolds et al., *John Horbury Hunt: Radical Architect 1838-1904*, Historic Houses Trust of New South Wales, Sydney, 2002, pp. 140-1. This was extended in John Sulman's 1899 addition to *Pibrac's* south side. Hunt's designs were widely known in Australian architectural circles and the architecture- rather than the personality behind it- was certainly admired.

<sup>11</sup> Apart from two high chain-link fences.

Name	<i>Haselmere</i>	Reference No	
Address	137 Mont Albert Road, Canterbury	Survey Date	16 November 2005
Building Type	Residence	Grading	B
Date	1889	Previous Grading	B



#### Extent of Overlay

To title boundaries.

Intactness ☒ Good ☐ Fair ☐ Poor

Heritage Status ☐ HV ☐ AHC ☐ NT ☒ Rec. BPS Heritage Overlay

#### History

Richard M. Humphries Quittenton, a clothier, was the first owner-occupier of this 10 room brick house in 1889, sited on a prestigious 2 acres, at the corner of Balwyn and Mont Albert Roads.<sup>1</sup> He remained there for over 35 years; a later owner-occupier being George Wiseman from the 1930s.<sup>2</sup> Quittenton was of the firm Quittenton Brothers '...clothiers, purchasers of gentlemen's left-off wearing apparel...' of Russell Street, Melbourne.<sup>3</sup>

(G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991)

#### Description & Integrity

*Haselmere*, at the north-west corner of the Mont Albert Road-Balwyn Road intersection, commanded wide views. Sited on the edge of Mont Albert Road's long ridge, *Haselmere* is a two-storey brick house with a brick-walled cellar,<sup>4</sup> stuccoed externally and overpainted. The house has a return verandah, with cast iron posts<sup>5</sup> and valance frames that may be original, enclosing decorative panels of cast iron lace. Lace is used here for a prominent series of fanned column junctions and a set of framed friezes. *Haselmere* has a south-west corner bay with a wide bracketed eave and an Italianate balustraded parapet above that, facing south-west.<sup>6</sup> To the extent that the house is visible from the street, the current footprint matches that shown on the c. 1905 MMBW Detail Plan.<sup>7</sup>

Alterations and additions appear to have been generally internal and/or at the rear of the house,<sup>8</sup> other than for the construction of a garage and carport. The major surrounding trees are mature and as Graeme Butler has noted, are sympathetic to the style of the house, being conifers and silky oaks. He has also noted that vestiges of the original garden survive in adjoining, subdivided blocks, reflecting the subdivision of *Haselmere's* land over time.<sup>9</sup>

## Historical Context

A series of large villa estates were located along the ridge north of Mont Albert Road at the turn of the twentieth century.<sup>10</sup> Many were oriented northward to take advantage of the views.

## Comparative Analysis

The roof plan, return verandah, external walling and footprint are typical of larger house plans in the later nineteenth century. The verandah, with cast iron posts and valance frame, resembles the framed verandahs at 25 Alma Road Camberwell (q.v., B-graded). The plain window frames suggest the design is stylistically located in the 1870s and 1880s, making its completion date (1889) still typical but fairly late.

## Assessment Against Criteria

### *Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria*

*CRITERION D: The importance of a place or object in exhibiting the principal characteristics or the representative nature of a place or object as a part of a class or type of places or objects.*

*Haslemere* is a relatively externally intact and representative example of a large Italianate villa residence of the late 1880s, its street presentation dominated by its imposing two-storey verandah.

*CRITERION E: The importance of the place or object in exhibiting good design or aesthetic characteristics and/or in exhibiting a richness, diversity or unusual integration of features.*

Its framed verandah lace is seen elsewhere in Camberwell, as in several Alma Road houses, and its faceted south-east corner bay is a variation on Camberwell's familiar lookout and widow's walk themes.

## Statement of Significance

*Haslemere*, at 137 Mont Albert Road, Canterbury, is of local historical and architectural significance as a fine, representative and generally externally intact example of a large Italianate villa residence of the late 1880s, its street presentation dominated by its imposing two-storey verandah. Its framed verandah lace is seen elsewhere in Camberwell, as in several Alma Road houses, and its faceted south-east corner bay is a variation on Camberwell's familiar lookout themes.

## Grading Review

Unchanged.

## Recommendations

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme.

## Identified By

G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

## References

*General:* G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

*Specific:*

<sup>1</sup> City of Camberwell Rate Books, 1889-90, 849.

<sup>2</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, # 1965, dated 20 October 1930.

<sup>3</sup> *Sands & McDougall Melbourne Directory*, 1890.

<sup>4</sup> Noted in the City of Camberwell Building Index, just above the numbered entries.

<sup>5</sup> Information provided by Michael Slifirski July 2007.

<sup>6</sup> Graeme Butler notes that the second bay, to the south-east, has this treatment also, which he suggests may indicate the hand of an architect; G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, vol. 4, p. 198.

<sup>7</sup> MMBW Detail Plan, No. 75, c.1905.

<sup>8</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, 1965, dated 20 October 1930 (unspecified); #31605, dated 29 May 1962, #67072 (internal alterations) #32102, dated 20 November 1962 (a carport). Details and working drawings sourced from the City of Camberwell

Building Index: #67072, dated 30 May 1980 (internal alterations to the north wing and an ensuite added to the main two-storey block, within the 1905 footprint and costing \$20,000.

<sup>9</sup> G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, vol. 4, p. 198.

<sup>10</sup> MMBW Detail Plan No. 70, c. 1905.

<b>Name</b>	House	<b>Reference No</b>	
<b>Address</b>	158 Mont Albert Road, Canterbury	<b>Survey Date</b>	17 November 2005
<b>Building Type</b>	Residence	<b>Grading</b>	B
<b>Date</b>	1920	<b>Previous Grading</b>	B



#### Extent of Overlay

To title boundaries.

**Intactness** ☒ Good ☐ Fair ☐ Poor

**Heritage Status** ☐ HV ☐ AHC ☐ NT ☐ Rec. BPS Heritage Overlay

#### History

Prolific Melbourne Architects, Gawler and Drummond designed this house for Robert R. Ross formerly of View Street, Canterbury in 1919.<sup>1</sup> After Ross's short tenure, Duncan S. Smith was an occupier in the 1920s and later Catherine Stobie (c1932) who had previously resided at 19 Victoria Avenue.<sup>2</sup> David G. Stobie had been among the first Boroondara Road Board members (1956-7) and served as the superintendent and secretary of the giant Benevolent Asylum in North Melbourne.<sup>3</sup>

Alterations and additions to the house and cabana-garage were in the course of being carried out at the time of survey.

(G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, 2001, additional research by Lovell Chen, 2005)

#### Description & Integrity

158 Mont Albert Road was a house and detached cabana-garage, designed in 1919 and completed the following year.<sup>4</sup> The house is two-storey in rendered brick, with a shallow hipped roof with deep bracketed eaves (reading almost as a cornice element) and simple cuboid central massing, broken by a rectangular balcony on the east side and a canted bay on the west, both two-storeyed. The east side balcony has a sheltered terrace underneath with tiled flooring. The house is surfaced in stucco, smooth for the expressed structure in the piers and pilasters, and textured on the wall surfaces in between. Compositionally the house reads as broadly asymmetrical, the regularity of its pilaster and voussoir details interrupted by an off-centre stair window with two tall arched lights and circular window at the top, in between. This drives through to the ground floor, interrupting the awning on the north side. The flanking windows are fairly plain sashes, with small panes in their upper facets. The most distinctive detail in the house, though, is the commercial touch suggested by the awnings, which were thick iron shop awnings braced with tension rods from the first floor, and seem to have transplanted a CBD retailing form.

The cabana/garage block is asymmetrical, with a two-storey lodge at one end and originally a lower run of garage spaces at the other. This was later converted into a pool house.<sup>5</sup>

The house appears to be broadly intact as viewed from the street (other than for the overpainting of the stucco noted by Graeme Butler in 1991, and the introduction of cedar planking for new awning soffits). Both house and cabana/garage are undergoing renovation at the time of writing. The current works appear to be focused on the rear sections of the house where some demolition and new building works are occurring. The one exception is that a section of the front awning (at the north-west corner) appears to be identified for demolition.<sup>6</sup>

A swimming pool was installed in 1986; this is now being rebuilt. A tennis court was placed alongside, and this is now being resurfaced as a piazza. The mature trees in the front garden remain; Butler notes a Canary Island palm among them. The Renaissance-derived facade details on both the house and outbuilding have the stylization and exaggeration associated with the Edwardian Baroque. Graeme Butler has suggested that the existing high rendered brick fence may be original.<sup>7</sup>

### Historical Context

As shown on the MMBW Detail Plan no. 70 of c. 1905, several large villa estates were located in the area north of Mont Albert Road and east of the railway line at the turn of the twentieth century. These were generally oriented northward to take advantage of the views. Villas included *Roystead*, *Kaleno* (to its west), *Highton*, *Myambert* and *Nowa Nowa* to the east and *Belmont* and *Larino* to the north facing Whitehorse Road. The south side of Mont Albert Road also has some large villas with some smaller residences set up closer to the street frontage. Subsequent development along Mont Albert Road occurred in the interwar period.<sup>8</sup>

### Comparative Analysis

The architects for this residence were Gawler and Drummond, designers of a number of interwar buildings at the University of Melbourne, as well as churches such as St Bartholomew's Anglican, Burnley. This house is one of the practice's livelier and more inventive efforts. It has affinities with the broad, fairly rectangular houses being designed in the US around this time: by Charles Platt, Robert McGoodwin, Herbert Langford Warren and others in various levels of free reference- either to Renaissance or more free style forms, but sometimes mixing them. This is a mixture of both, being a rather skilful asymmetrical 'Renaissance' in its details facing Mont Albert Road, and comparatively freer on its side elevation and balcony, which is a simple column and beam structure with shingled spandrels. The Renaissance touches are relatively free too, with the exaggerated voussoirs and oversize pilaster capitals of the Edwardian Baroque, then just starting to wane as a mode in public buildings. The round-arched stair window is a bold and whimsical idea, emphasizing the asymmetrical internal plan and answered well with the asymmetrically placed canted bay on the west side. The Baroque qualities compare with houses designed by Howard Joseland, Walter Vernon and John Sulman in Sydney suburbs around 1909-14, and more locally with Harold Desbrowe Annear's MH Baillieu and Kaye houses, both in Toorak, both of 1925, and the Merfield house, completed the following year.<sup>9</sup> Annear favoured Palladian over the Baroque, however, and his houses lack the vigorous commercial note intruded in the awnings to 158 Mont Albert Road.

### Assessment Against Criteria

#### *Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria*

*CRITERION A: The historical importance, association with or relationship to Boroondara's history of the place or object.*

The historical association with the Stobie family is of interest but is not considered to elevate the significance of the building.

*CRITERION D: The importance of a place or object in exhibiting the principal characteristics or the representative nature of a place or object as a part of a class or type of places or objects.*

158 Mont Albert Road, Canterbury is a fine and relatively intact example of a generously proportioned society house of the interwar period influenced by contemporary design in the United States. It retains an original cabana-garage and a fence which may be original or early.



*CRITERION E: The importance of the place or object in exhibiting good design or aesthetic characteristics and/or in exhibiting a richness, diversity or unusual integration of features.*

The building has a bold asymmetry, particularly in its north elevation, that works well in bringing a sense of informality to a design otherwise marked by imposing Renaissance components. The use of a heavy commercial awning is a vigorous and successful gesture, enlivening the presence of the house.

#### **Statement of Significance**

158 Mont Albert Road, Canterbury is of local historical and architectural significance as a fine and relatively intact example of a generously proportioned society house of the interwar period influenced by contemporary design in the United States. It retains an original cabana-garage and a fence which may be original or early. The building has a bold asymmetry, particularly in its north elevation, that works well in bringing a sense of informality to a design otherwise marked by imposing Renaissance components. The use of a heavy commercial awning is a vigorous and successful gesture, enlivening the presence of the house.

#### **Grading Review**

Unchanged.

#### **Recommendations**

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme.

#### **Identified By**

G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

#### **References**

*General:* G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

*Specific:*

<sup>1</sup> MMBW Drainage Plan Application, # 115486.

<sup>2</sup> *Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria* 1925; D1935; MMBW Drainage Plan Application, # 115486.

<sup>3</sup> WD Wise (publisher), *Victoria Post Office Directory*, 1893-4; Blainey, *A History of Camberwell*, pp. 13-14, 121.

<sup>4</sup> Details sourced from Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, v. 4, p. 201-2. Butler remarks that the stucco walls were unpainted until shortly before he made his study.

<sup>5</sup> Based on site observations.

<sup>6</sup> Drawings by Catt Architects dated March 2005. sourced from City of Boroondara Building File #40/408/26852.

<sup>7</sup> G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, v. 4, p. 202.

<sup>8</sup> Refer G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, citation for Precinct 18, v. 2.

<sup>9</sup> The Sydney houses were illustrated in both *Art and Architecture* and *The Salon*, and found Melbourne counterparts in some outer suburban public buildings, such as Box Hill Post Office. For Desbrowe-Annear, see Harriet Edquist, *Harold Desbrowe-Annear: a Life in Architecture*, Miegunyah, Melbourne, 2004, pp. 143-6, 153-4.

<b>Name</b>	House	<b>Reference No</b>	
<b>Address</b>	1 Montana Street, Glen Iris	<b>Survey Date</b>	20 September 2005, access visit 19 April 2006
<b>Building Type</b>	Residence	<b>Grading</b>	B
<b>Date</b>	1941	<b>Previous Grading</b>	B
		<b>Extent of Overlay</b>	To title boundaries



**Intactness** ☒ Good ☐ Fair ☐ Poor

**Heritage Status** ☐ HV ☐ AHC ☐ NT ☐ Rec BPS Heritage Overlay

### History

Artist Douglas Harman was the first and major owner-occupier of this house after its construction in 1941.<sup>1</sup> He remained there at least until the 1950s.<sup>2</sup>

Additions were made to the side porch in 1945<sup>3</sup> and a bedroom, garage and carport were added to the building in 1964.<sup>4</sup> Rear additions were made for T. & J. Baker in the 1980s by A.V. Jennings;<sup>5</sup> these comprised an additional bathroom, sun room, garage and 'garden room'.

(G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, additional research by Lovell Chen, 2005)

### Description & Integrity

The house at 1 Montana Street was constructed in distinctive umber salt-glazed manganese brickwork in 1941, possibly to designs by C S Cameron, who had completed similar houses at 123 Mont Albert Road, Canterbury, and 6 Bulleen Road, North Balwyn.<sup>6</sup> The house has an integral parapet, trimmed in white glazed brick, concealing a flat roof. All north and west facing windows in the living area share a continuous shallow cantilevered concrete awning as sun protection. The plan responded to the acute angled site, at the corner of Montana Street and Prosper Parade, combining a bank of bedrooms, kitchen and bathroom areas with an L-shaped living room at an acute angle to the bedroom wing. The living room area has two rounded north facing corners and a trailing apse-bay drawing in views to the south-west. Externally, this apse is marked by a recess in the umber brick and a streamlined light fitting. The original living area has broad windows facing north-west across the tapering front garden toward the intersection of Montana Street and Prosper Parade. The original steel window framing remains, though a glass brick window has been added to the original east elevation. A door on the Prosper Parade side of the house provided access to the garden, past a full height sidelight window in

amber glass. The current front entry is located at the intersection of the living and bedroom wings, and is screened behind a spur wall of manganese brick, patterned ornamentally.

The house appears to be intact to the extent of its principal elevations to Montana Street and to the Montana Street-Prosper Parade corner. The eastern elevation, to Prosper Parade, has had some alterations, with an additional window being introduced and a bedroom, garage and carport added in 1964. Additions have also been made at the southern end of the house in works undertaken by AV Jennings in 1986, when the bedroom wing was extended to include a garden room, bathroom, sunroom and garage. These additions were designed in sympathy with the existing house, with brickwork to match the original. Overall, though some changes have occurred, these are not such as to undermine the presentation of the building.

### Historical Context

1 Montana Street is situated on a prominent corner site, and when approached from the north, it is the first house in a precinct of predominately single-storey residences constructed in the interwar period. The streetscape presentation of 1 Montana Street is enhanced by its plantation of cypress trees which further signpost the house's prominent position within its neighbourhood.

### Comparative Analysis

The manganese glazed brick, parapet, flat roof and bull-nosed cantilever steel-framed window framing used at 1 Montana Street were all elements coming into favor in Melbourne suburban usage at this time.<sup>7</sup> Glazed brick was used extensively in patterning in the Burwood - Ashburton area at this time, as seen on one nearby house in Adrian Street and several in the Ward Street-Highgate Grove area of Ashburton, immediately south. Manganese brick usage can also be seen on *Marston*, 24 Cristowel Avenue, on the Camberwell Golf Links Estate.

1 Montana Street is distinctive in terms of its planning. Canted wings were appearing in Melbourne houses from the late 1930s,<sup>8</sup> but this design is unusual in elaborating the canted wing into a free-formed plan outline and squeezing its link to the bedroom and bathroom wing through a narrow hall and kitchen linkage. This acoustic and visual separation of living and sleeping areas to either side of an entrance is accentuated in the external massing of the building.<sup>9</sup>

While a direct influence seems unlikely in this suburban Melbourne context, there are some parallels between the plan of 1 Montana Street and the work of Le Corbusier and Oscar Niemeyer in their plans for institutional buildings in the 1930s, where slab-form buildings were coupled to a more sculptural gesture-mass that projected out at an angle and often shifted into a canted, curving mass. In Corbusier and Niemeyer buildings this was usually a reception or dining area, or a lecture hall.<sup>10</sup>

### Assessment Against Criteria

*Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria*

*CRITERION D: The importance of a place or object in exhibiting the principal characteristics or the representative nature of a place or object as a part of a class or type of places or objects.*

The house is a fine and relatively intact example of the glazed brick, parapet-roofed and conspicuously modern houses which appeared in Boroondara after c. 1937.

*CRITERION E: The importance of the place or object in exhibiting good design or aesthetic characteristics and/or in exhibiting a richness, diversity or unusual integration of features.*

The house is an assured and successful composition, using its corner siting well and incorporating a series of interesting building forms and materials. It is distinctive for the extensive use of glazed manganese brick to all facades.

It is of also some significance for its planning, specifically in its articulation of a bi-nuclear plan.

### Statement of Significance

1 Montana Street, Glen Iris, is of local historical and architectural significance. It is a fine and relatively intact example of the glazed brick, parapet-roofed and conspicuously modern houses which

appeared in Boroondara after c. 1937. The house is an assured and successful composition, using its corner siting well and incorporating a series of interesting building forms and materials. It is distinctive for the extensive use of glazed manganese brick to all facades. It is also of some significance for its planning, specifically in its articulation of a bi-nuclear plan.

### Grading Review

Unchanged, B.

### Recommendations

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme.

### Identified By

G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

### References

*General:* G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

*Specific:*

<sup>1</sup> G Butler cites 'BA in computer data'; *Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria 1944-5*; SLV Biography file.

<sup>2</sup> *Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria, 1952.*

<sup>3</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, #17045, dated 30 July 1945.

<sup>4</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, # 36202, dated 20 November 1964

<sup>5</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, # 798275, dated 26 February 1986, variation to this # 79966, dated 21 March 1986.

<sup>6</sup> G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, v. 4, p. 205, suggests the link.

<sup>7</sup> See Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, v. 4. The most similar in materials is *Marston*, at 24 Christowel Street, which also used salt-glazed manganese bricks, and was built by JAE Humphries in 1939. The parapeted roof and streamlined style seen at 1 Montana Street was paralleled in a series of Camberwell houses. See pp. 27 (Beatrice Street Glen Iris, B-graded, 1941, q.v.), 46 (6 Bulleen Road Balwyn North, A-graded, 1951), 124 (24 Finsbury Way, C-graded, 1938), 128-9 (177 Glen Iris Road, Glen Iris, B-graded, 1935, q.v.), 144 (1 Kalonga Road, Balwyn North, A-graded, 1948-55) 196 (123 Mont Albert Road, B-graded, 1942, demolished), and 229 (8 Reid Street, B-graded, demolished, 1937-8, by Mewton and Grounds), and 296 (15 Walbundry Avenue, Balwyn North, A-graded, 1936, the earliest Boroondara counterpart). 43 Kireep Road, Balwyn, A-graded, by Robin Boyd, was the first genuinely bi-nuclear house to appear in Camberwell after 1 Montana Street. See p. 152.

<sup>8</sup> As with Billson and Mewton's house in Hopetoun Road Toorak, 1938. Straight-sided canted wings were popular in Age-RVIA Small Homes Service designs after 1949.

<sup>9</sup> The house predates the bi-nuclear plans that became popular in Australian architectural circles around 1950-55. Indeed it precedes Marcel Breuer's highly publicized bi-nuclear plan houses in the US, which date from the mid 1940s, though these were predicated on a much more radical approach to structure and expression through a dynamic structure and roof form.

<sup>10</sup> See for example, Corbusier's Salvation Army Refuge in Paris, 1931-3, and Pavillion Suisse, 1929-33; Niemeyer's Pampulha Yacht Club, Belo Horizonte, Brazil, 1940.

<b>Name</b>	House	<b>Reference No</b>	
<b>Address</b>	7 Muriel Street, Glen Iris	<b>Survey Date</b>	20 September 2005
<b>Building Type</b>	Residence	<b>Grading</b>	B
<b>Date</b>	1932	<b>Previous Grading</b>	B



#### Extent of Overlay

To title boundaries.

**Intactness** ☐ Good ☐ Fair ☒ Poor

**Heritage Status** ☐ HV ☐ AHC ☐ NT ☐ Rec. ☐ BPS Heritage Overlay

#### History

Mrs Linda Eloise Gair of 44 Alfred Road, Burwood owned two allotments of land in Muriel Street, Allotment 37 and 38, in 1931.<sup>1</sup> In 1932 she commissioned builder T.F. Crabbe to construct a two-storey brick house on those allotments.<sup>2</sup> The fourteen roomed house was designed by well-known architect Harold Desbrowe Annear and was estimated to cost £2,384.<sup>3</sup> Linda Gair continued to reside at Alfred Road leasing 7 Muriel Street to Mrs Caroline Louisa Gair.<sup>4</sup> Caroline had been living at Alfred Street with Linda and Mackay Gair.<sup>5</sup> Caroline continued to occupy this property until the early 1940s when it was sold to Lawrence E. Tewksbury and she moved back to Alfred Street to live with Linda and Geoffrey Hugh Gair, a solicitor.<sup>6</sup>

The eastern part of this once extensive property was subdivided (date unknown) and Gair Court was formed. From this date, the house was given a Muriel Street address and was approached from what was originally its rear. Relatively recently, a large two-storeyed addition has been constructed on the south side of the original house.

(G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, 2001, additional research by Lovell Chen, 2005)

#### Description & Integrity

The Gair house was one of several half-timbered, two and three-storey houses designed by the architect Harold Desbrowe Annear, who completed several other houses in Kew in the 1920s.<sup>7</sup> It is possibly the last house fully attributable to Desbrowe-Annear. Originally it was approached by a long driveway through a huge front garden that ran from 45 Alfred Road, 200 metres away, but this front garden was later subdivided around a new street, Gair Court, and the site boundary was cut right back to the immediate east side of the house.<sup>8</sup> The house now has the street address of 7 Muriel Street, a cul-de-sac to the immediate west. The house is screened by a brick fence added in 1969.<sup>9</sup>

The main wing of the residence (albeit originally the rear elevation) is two-storey with an additional attic storey remaining the dominant element in views to this property from Muriel Street. This wing presents as a transverse gable (actually double-gabled) with smaller gable projecting forward to the west. The upper levels are half-timbered right round and marked by tall, plain brick chimneys, while the ground floor is surfaced in tan unpainted stucco. The roof is in terra-cotta Marseilles pattern tiling, simple and unglazed. The double-gabled form of this wing is visible in views to the property from the south (Hartwell Sports Reserve). Windows are multi-paned. The single-storey wing which extends south of this main wing, and parallel with Muriel Street is thought to be original but has been modified.

As noted above, a large gabled extension has been constructed on the south of the original house, fronting the Hartwell Sports Ground. This addition obscures (at least in views from the sports ground) much of the original paired gable south front which is marked by an interesting diagonal crossing pattern of timber beams across a plaster façade. The additions also reduce the visual command the Gair house once had over the neighboring park.

Early garages, c.1942, were demolished and replaced with steel carports in 1984.<sup>10</sup>

### Historical Context

When constructed, the Gair house would have been a noticeably large and imposing residence in an outer suburban area characterized by more modest dwellings on standard allotments. As noted above, its grounds have now been extensively subdivided and developed.

### Comparative Analysis

The Gair house is one of a series of eclectic houses with conspicuous half-timbering and projecting upper stories from later in Annear's career. These were typified by *Westerfield*, the Grimwade house at Frankston, 1924, and *Westridge*, the Lane-Poole house, Yarralumla, ACT, 1927, similar in plan to the Gair house.<sup>11</sup> The living and dining rooms were entered from a short hall through sliding doors, an arrangement seen as radical open planning in Annear's Eaglemont houses of 1903, in particular the second Chadwick house, and in the McGeorge house at Alphington, 1910.<sup>12</sup> The half-timbering motif also compares with houses by Alsop & Klingender in the Toorak area, and with houses by Marcus Barlow and Robert Hamilton in both Toorak and Boroondara, as at 92 Mont Albert Road, 1926 (A-graded), or 6 Myambert Avenue, Balwyn, 1935 (B-graded).<sup>13</sup> The Gair house differs from these in having a major subdivision, and in now being entered from the rear of its site. But the house is, as with most Desbrowe-Annear houses, designed to be seen and experienced in the round, and does not seem especially disadvantaged by its present orientation. The bold crossing pattern in the original south gables' half timbering recalls Desbrowe-Annear's Eaglemont houses and his use of half-timbering in more experimental ways than his contemporaries. The paired gable also evokes notable free style houses such as Horbury Hunt's *Pibrac*, at Warrawee, NSW, of 1889-90,<sup>14</sup> and later Edwardian and Federation free style houses, seen locally in *Highton*, 65 Mont Albert Road, of 1906 (B-graded).<sup>15</sup>

### Assessment Against Criteria

#### *Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria*

*CRITERION D: The importance of a place or object in exhibiting the principal characteristics or the representative nature of a place or object as a part of a class or type of places or objects.*

The house is representative generally of the larger Tudor-flavored houses in Camberwell of the 1930s, and though its site has been subdivided, and is now viewed from the rear, the house itself is relatively intact and remains distinguishable from its added south wings.

The house is of additional interest as one of a series of eclectic houses with conspicuous half-timbering and projecting upper stories from later in architect Harold Desbrowe Annear's career.

*CRITERION E: The importance of the place or object in exhibiting good design or aesthetic characteristics and/or in exhibiting a richness, diversity or unusual integration of features.*

The Gair house is unusual in having a split gable, and in the bold diagonal patterning in its half-timbered south elevation.

## Statement of Significance

The former Gair residence, 7 Muriel Street, Glen Iris, is of local historical and architectural significance. The house is representative generally of the larger Tudor-flavored houses in Camberwell of the 1930s, and though its site has been subdivided, and is now viewed from the rear, the house itself is relatively intact and remains distinguishable from its added south wings. The house is of additional interest as one of a series of eclectic houses with conspicuous half-timbering and projecting upper stories from later in architect Harold Desbrowe Annear's career. It is unusual in having a split (double) gable, and in the bold diagonal patterning in its half-timbered south elevation.

## Grading Review

Unchanged.

## Recommendations

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme.

## Identified By

G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

## References

*General:* G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

*Specific:*

<sup>1</sup> City of Camberwell Rate Books, 1931-32, 30701, 30700.

<sup>2</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, # 2613, 1932.

<sup>3</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, # 2613, 1932.

<sup>4</sup> City of Camberwell Rate Books, 1932-33, 30676; Electoral Roll, 1936.

<sup>5</sup> *Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria*, 1933, City of Camberwell Rate Books, 1931-32, 30700.

<sup>6</sup> *Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria*, 1945; Electoral Roll, 1945; Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, # 15612, 2 November 1942.

<sup>7</sup> See Harriet Edquist, *Harold Desbrowe-Annear, a Life in Architecture*, Melbourne: Miegunyah, 2004, Catalogue of Works, pp. 257-278. These included five projects in Kew: the Springthorpe Memorial, 1897-1900, p. 259, a house in Princess Street, Kew, 1910, demolished, p. 262; 16 Raven Street, Kew, 1912, p. 264; Boatshed and workshop, Kilby Road, 1914, p. 266; 107 Sackville Street Kew, 1924, p. 273. In Hawthorn: 124 Power Street, Hawthorn, 1912, demolished, p. 264, 108 Barkers Road, 1913, burnt out and demolished, p. 264; Tower Street, 1917, p. 269.

<sup>8</sup> See Harriet Edquist, *Harold Desbrowe-Annear: a Life in Architecture*, Melbourne: Miegunyah, 2004, esp. pp. 167-8, and p. 278. The house is second last in Edquist's listing of Desbrowe-Annear's projects; the last, Dr Lear's house and surgery at Preston, has been claimed by one Ross Farrow as his own design.

<sup>9</sup> Details sourced from City of Camberwell Minute Sheet, dated 22 June 1970 (report on fence), and The City of Camberwell Building Index, #45384, dated 3 June 1969 (fence).

<sup>10</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, #2623, April 1932; #15612, 2 November 1942 (garage additions), and #75778, dated 19 June 1984 (steel garages).

<sup>11</sup> Edquist, 162-4, 164-167.

<sup>12</sup> Robin Boyd, *Victorian Modern*, Melbourne: Students' Society, RVIA, 1947: 'Annear and the Half-brick'. H Edquist, *Harold Desbrowe-Annear: a Life in Architecture*, pp. 65-6, 73.

<sup>13</sup> G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, vol. 4, pp. 194, 212.

<sup>14</sup> Max Freeland, 'John Horbury Hunt 1838-1904', in Howard Tanner, *Architects of Australia*, Melbourne: Macmillan, 1981, p. 84.; Peter Reynolds, Lesley Muir and Joy Hughes, *John Horbury Hunt: Radical Architect 1838-1904*, Sydney: Historic Houses Trust of New South Wales, 2002, pp. 140-1. This was later worked on by Sulman and Power.

<sup>15</sup> G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, vol. 4, p. 191-2, graded B, and a possible attribution to Samuel Inskip and Walter Butler.



<b>Name</b>	House	<b>Reference No</b>	
<b>Address</b>	622 Riversdale Road, Camberwell	<b>Survey Date</b>	18 November 2005
<b>Building Type</b>	Residence	<b>Grading</b>	A
<b>Date</b>	1892	<b>Previous Grading</b>	B



#### Extent of Overlay

To title boundaries.

**Intactness** ☒ Good ☐ Fair ☐ Poor

**Heritage Status** ☐ HV ☐ AHC ☐ NT ☐ Rec. BPS Heritage Overlay

#### History

Graeme Butler has suggested that Thomas A Moody may have been the mortgagee for the construction of this ten room brick house in 1892.<sup>1</sup> Moody was a publisher, by occupation, working for F.A. Thompson and Co., wholesale newsagents of Little Collins Street.<sup>2</sup> He had moved to Camberwell from Liddiard Street, Hawthorn.

J. Charlesworth was the architect for the house, the design for which was published as 'Villa Residence Camberwell,' in the *Building and Engineering Journal* of 31 October 1891.<sup>3</sup>

Early occupants of the house included Thomas Press manager of the Rosella Preserving Co. in North Melbourne, who took the house for the first 3 years of the twentieth century, and Lindsay Russell, a civil engineer, who succeeded him.<sup>4</sup>

(G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, additional research by Lovell Chen, 2005)

#### Description & Integrity

622 Riversdale Road is a double-fronted brick residence with a return verandah, perched on a steeply banked site overlooking Riversdale Road. The roof is of terracotta tile in a Marseilles pattern, hipped in the main body and framed with a gabled wing at the north-east corner. It is punctuated by corbel-topped chimneys. The verandah roof is integrated into the main roof, and is in turn punctuated by a corner tower with a prominent and distinctive cupola, heavy enough to read as a distinct event in the general design. The gable is half-timbered, as is the drum for the cupola, through this has arched tops to the half-timbering detail. The wing below the gable is in two broad surface textures, having red brick on the lower walls and a heavy-looking stuccoed dado on the upper, subsuming the upper window lights into its surface with two smooth stuccoed dividers in masonry. The window is topped



with the Collegiate Gothic drip moulding, and the upper panes are chamfered at the top to reveal shallow scrolling.

Few alterations have been made to the house. It was converted to medical rooms in 1954,<sup>5</sup> but has since reverted to a residential use. Alterations and additions were made to a design prepared by architect Robert Sands in 2002; these are generally not visible from the street and the original front section of the building has been retained.<sup>6</sup> Earlier applications to build a new fence were approved in 1995.<sup>7</sup>

### Historical Context

By the beginning of the twentieth century the MMBW Detail Plan No. 76 (date unknown) shows this section of Riversdale Road had been substantially developed for residential purposes, with the building stock a mix of brick and timber and with some larger villa residences. A small number of larger residences (probably Victorian) are shown on more substantial allotments and set back from the street.

### Comparative Analysis

With a construction date of 1892 (and its design published late 1891), *Kantara* is early in the emergence of Australian Federation architecture. It follows the seminal *Elderslie*, at 15 Alma Road (q.v.) by only a year, and has an integral verandah roof and dramatized corner tower expression that is usually only seen in much later Federation designs.<sup>8</sup> Certainly its clearest local comparisons, Ussher and Kemp's *Travancore* at 608 Riversdale Road (A-graded) and Richard Bate's house at 633 Riversdale Road (B-graded)<sup>9</sup> are signatures of Federation design. But these date from 1900-1 and 1906-8 respectively. The verandah details at *Kantara* are in cast iron- but that is a sustained local characteristic and widely seen in generally much later Tara Estate buildings around Camberwell Station. *Kantara's* main bay detail is both individual and progressive, referring to the division of upper windows by flat-fronted masonry seen in HH Richardson's American architecture of the early and mid-1880s, and typifying Australian architects' conversion of Richardson's rugged stone textures to stuccoed masonry in aedicules. Though its origins are not known, the layout of the garden, with simple brick-pier gate and curving entry path, is characteristic of Federation garden design in its response to a banked site. The treatment remained popular for three more decades, as seen in the related landscaping of 1920s houses in the curve of High Street Glen Iris, or on other main roads.<sup>10</sup>

### Assessment Against Criteria

*Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria*

*CRITERION A: The historical importance, association with or relationship to Boroondara's history of the place or object.*

The historical associations of this house with early owners and occupants are of interest but are not considered to elevate the significance of the place.

*CRITERION E: The importance of the place or object in exhibiting good design or aesthetic characteristics and/or in exhibiting a richness, diversity or unusual integration of features.*

*Kantara* shows all the frontal characteristics of an Australian Federation house, but does so in the earliest period of Federation architecture. As an early expression of the new Federation architecture, it is paralleled by relatively few other published designs. The design draws together a range of generally compatible themes; of particular note are the integral verandah roof and dramatized corner tower (cupola) expression, both usually only seen in much later Federation designs, and the detailing to its main bay.

### Statement of Significance

Designed in 1891 by little-known architect, J Charlesworth, *Kantara*, 622 Riversdale Road, Camberwell, is of local historical and state architectural significance as an early example of Australian Federation villa design. *Kantara* shows all the frontal characteristics of an Australian Federation house, but does so in the earliest period of Federation architecture. As an early expression of the new Federation architecture, it is paralleled by relatively few other published designs. The design draws together a range of generally compatible themes; of particular note are the integral verandah roof and

dramatized corner tower (cupola) expression, both usually only seen in much later Federation designs, and the detailing to its main bay.

The building is intact as viewed from the street and has a sympathetic garden setting which may retain elements of an early garden layout.

### Grading Review

Review to A.

### Recommendations

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme.

### Identified By

G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

### References

*General:* G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

*Specific:*

<sup>1</sup> No reference is provided for this. G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, vol. 4, p. 232.

<sup>2</sup> *Sands and McDougall Melbourne Directory, 1894*

<sup>3</sup> *Building and Engineering Journal* 31 October 1891, illustration entitled *Villa Residence Camberwell, J Charlesworth, Architect*.

<sup>4</sup> Shire of Boroondara Rate Books, 1900-1, 290; WD Wise (publisher), Victoria Post Office Directory, 1900, Shire of Boroondara Rate Books, 1901-2, 308; Shire of Boroondara and Camberwell Rate Book, 1902-3, 325; 1904-5, 328.

<sup>5</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, # 13920, dated 7 April 1954.

<sup>6</sup> Details sourced from the City of Boroondara Building Index, BS-1092/981061/0, dated 9 September 2002; permit files 40/408/17717/Planning -223.3033.622 (temp.)

<sup>7</sup> Details sourced from the City of Boroondara Building Index, Consent to construct a 2.3 m high fence, dated 22 November 1995; Permit 6300, for a new fence, dated 18 December 1995.

<sup>8</sup> Graeme Butler has observed that it could pass for a mainstream Federation house of ten years later. G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, v. 4, p. 232.

<sup>9</sup> See Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, pp231, 236.

<sup>10</sup> *Kantara* invites comparison with the emerging garden patterns in the Federation manner, published that year in the building journals: among them Beverly Ussher's *Cottage by the Sea* at Queenscliff, and Arthur Fisher's 1892 house in St Kilda. *Building and Engineering Journal*, VIII, 184, 9 January 1892. Cited by George Tibbits in Ch. 4 of Trevor Howells' *Towards the Dawn: Federation architecture in Australia*, Hale and Iremonger, Sydney, 1989, see also Conrad Hamann, 'Nationalism and reform in Australian architecture, 1880-1920', *Historical Studies*, October 1979.

Name	Warrawee	Reference No	
Address	626-8 Riversdale Road, Camberwell	Survey Date	18 November 2005
Building Type	Residence	Grading	B (Provisional)
Date	1884-5	Previous Grading	B



#### Extent of Overlay

To title boundaries.

Intactness ☒ Good ☐ Fair ☐ Poor

Heritage Status ☐ HV ☐ AHC ☐ NT ☒ Rec. BPS Heritage Overlay

#### History

A maltster, Thomas A. Fielding was the first owner of Warrawee when it was erected on four acres in 1884-5.<sup>1</sup> This followed closely the construction of the adjoining *Astolat* (q.v., A-graded) for the Derham family, reputedly by the same builder, James Swan.<sup>2</sup> Graeme Butler has noted that signatures on the internal plaster wall and remnant wallpaper make reference to dates of February 1885 and 1891 respectively<sup>3</sup>.

The first detailed rate description (1898-9) of the house was for a brick house of 8 rooms, still on 4 acres<sup>4</sup>. By the mid-1920s, the land had shrunk to 152 x 404 feet and the ownership changed to Arthur E. Fielding, solicitor<sup>5</sup>.

The next owner was Arthur S. Cudmore, an investor, who owned the property for some 22 years. He replanted the garden using many Australian native plants; creating today's dense front garden<sup>6</sup>. A later long-term owner was the radiologist, Dr Boyard Taft, (34 years)<sup>7</sup>. By the 1980s the house had grown to some 50 squares, but with only 3 bedrooms. Its coachhouse was used for a four-car garage, sited next to the old stables<sup>8</sup>. A swimming pool had been added on the west side.

A building permit was issued for a new fence in May 2000.<sup>9</sup>

(G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, additional research by Lovell Chen, 2006)

#### Description & Integrity

*Note that the following description is based on information contained in the Camberwell Conservation Study and limited photographic<sup>10</sup> and documentary evidence and that its accuracy would need to be confirmed on site. Access to the site was not available during the review.*

Warrawee, 626-628 Riversdale Road, Camberwell, is a large single-storey double-fronted Italianate villa constructed of brick on an asymmetrical plan. The hipped slate-clad roof features bracketed

eaves, moulded entablature, carved serrated fascia and rendered brick chimneys with moulded caps. The façade includes a prominent projecting canted bay and was noted in 1991 as retaining its unpainted render finish. It is encircled by a concave corrugated galvanised steel verandah supported by cast iron columns with cast iron frieze and brackets. The verandah floor has been replaced with brick paving and the verandah is accessed via wide bluestone steps. The main entrance appears to contain a panelled timber door with glazed surrounds. Fenestration includes tall timber-framed double-hung sashes and windows are surrounded by moulded architraves and consoled sills.

It appears that former outbuildings may have been incorporated into later garaging and extensive additions have been constructed along the western side of the house as well as a smaller canted bay on the rear south elevation.

The frontage is fenced by a non-original steel and timber plank fence with brick gate piers. The garden is mature, screening the house with a range of large trees, most of long standing.

### Historical Context

*Warrawee* and its neighbour *Astolat* provide evidence of the first phase of development of this portion of Camberwell, considered far-flung until the advent of the Outer Circle railway in the last years of the nineteenth century. Despite later development in the area and the encroachment on its original grounds of four acres, *Warrawee* retains enough of its setting today to provide evidence of the era of the 'garden villa', when the middle classes settled in the district, ahead of the subdivision boom in the later 1880s.

### Comparative Analysis

*Warrawee* can be compared with a number of substantial single-storied Italianate villas in Boroondara, notwithstanding there are variations within this general typology in terms of planning, details and finishes. The house is similar in many respects to the stuccoed 8 Balwyn Road, Canterbury and 50 Wandsworth Road, Surrey Hills (both B-graded, q.v.), and with the polychrome 25 Alma Road Camberwell (q.v., B-graded), 136 Canterbury Road, Canterbury (q.v., B-graded), and 26A Wandsworth Road, Surrey Hills (q.v., B-graded), all of which date from the same period. The large, single-storied Italianate house was a popular building type in Camberwell, its homestead overtones emphasizing the possibility of country life in the city. Like 8 Balwyn Road, Canterbury, the house is distinctive for the manner in which its verandah extends around the canted bay. It is also relatively unusual in retaining an unpainted render finish (assuming it survives in its unpainted condition).

### Assessment Against Criteria

#### *Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria*

**CRITERION D:** *The importance of a place or object in exhibiting the principal characteristics or the representative nature of a place or object as a part of a class or type of places or objects.*

*Warrawee* is a fine, representative and relatively externally intact example of the large, single storey Italianate villas which appeared in the Camberwell-Canterbury-Surrey Hills areas in the middle to late 1880s. The house is set in a mature and impressive garden.

**CRITERION E:** *The importance of the place or object in exhibiting good design or aesthetic characteristics and/or in exhibiting a richness, diversity or unusual integration of features.*

*Warrawee* is distinctive in this group for the manner in which its verandah extends around the front canted bay, and for the retention of its original unpainted render finish.

### Statement of Significance

#### *Provisional only*

*Warrawee*, at 626-628 Riversdale Road, Camberwell, is of local historical and architectural significance. It is a fine, representative and relatively externally intact example of the large, single storey Italianate villas which appeared in the Camberwell-Canterbury-Surrey Hills areas in the middle to late 1880s. *Warrawee* is distinctive in this group for the manner in which its verandah extends around the front canted bay, and for the retention of its original unpainted render finish. The house is set in a mature and impressive garden.

## Grading Review

B (Provisional)

## Recommendations (Provisional)

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme on a provisional basis.

It is recommended that a further site inspection be carried out to confirm the provisional grading.

## Identified By

G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

## References

*General:* G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

*Specific:*

<sup>1</sup> C. Kellaway, National Trust of Australia (Vic.) Research notes, 1980, FN970, cites Shire of Boroondara Rate Book, 1883-4, # 214-215.

<sup>2</sup> G Butler cites pers.com. owners, 1991.

<sup>3</sup> See D Derham 'Frederick Thomas Derham', in B Nairn, G Serle and R Ward (eds), *Australian Dictionary of Biography*, Vol. 4, MUP, 1972, pp. 56-58.

<sup>4</sup> Shire of Boroondara Rate Book, 1898-9, # 296.

<sup>5</sup> City of Camberwell Rate Book, 1925-6, # 13956.

<sup>6</sup> *The Age*, 21 May 1983; D Saunders, *Historic Buildings of Victoria*, p.151.

<sup>7</sup> *The Age*, 21 May 1983.

<sup>8</sup> *The Age*, 21 May 1983.

<sup>9</sup> Building permit (Allied Building Services) # 1078002585, demolition of wall and construction of new fence, 12 May 2000, City of Boroondara Building file, no. 40/408/13143.

<sup>10</sup> Including photographs taken in 1965 and 1983 by John T Collins and held in the collection of the State Library of Victoria.

---

<b>Name</b>	House	<b>Reference No</b>	
<b>Address</b>	660 Riversdale Road, Camberwell	<b>Survey Date</b>	16 November 2005
<b>Building Type</b>	Residence	<b>Grading</b>	B
<b>Date</b>	1938	<b>Previous Grading</b>	B



#### Extent of Overlay

To title boundaries.

---

**Intactness**    ☐ Good    ☒ Fair    ☐ Poor

**Heritage Status**    ☐ HV    ☐ AHC    ☐ NT    ☐ Rec.    BPS Heritage Overlay

#### History

In 1938, Samuel Whitehead, himself a builder of Hope Street, Camberwell, commissioned builder L.R. Whitehead of Kew to construct a dwelling on this property.<sup>1</sup> The two-storied brick and timber dwelling was of seven rooms and was estimated to cost £1,400.<sup>2</sup> The property was vacant in 1940 but by 1944-45 had been acquired by Harold G. Williams.<sup>3</sup> A. Ambrose Erswell occupied the property in 1950 but Arthur Louey Gook had purchased and occupied the residence by September of that year.<sup>4</sup> During his ownership, the house was extended by one room.<sup>5</sup> By 1962 the property again had a new owner, F.L. Phelan.<sup>6</sup>

A number of alterations and additions have been made to the house; these are detailed below under Description and Integrity.

(G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, additional research by Lovell Chen, 2005)

#### Description & Integrity

660 Riversdale Road<sup>7</sup> is an example of Old English suburban housing, dating from 1938.<sup>8</sup> It utilizes a corner site, at Riversdale Road and Woodlands Avenue, and is not similar to building stock in the nearby Golf Links and Hassett estates in its general style and approach. It is distinctive in using a vivid tapestry brick, interspersed with relieving bricks in burnt sienna and blue clinker. The roof is in terracotta tile, Marseilles pattern, with a roofline in three hips facing the corner. The third hip is over a large wing facing south-west, which is an addition, possibly dating from 1950),<sup>9</sup> with boxed eaves and simplified window treatment. This differs from the other first floor elevations which were corbelled and surfaced in appliqué half-timbering, on the original sides facing Riversdale Road and Woodlands Avenue.

Overall, the house reads as a set of wings rather than the near oblong which is its actual plan. A gabled 'wing', actually a stepped breakfront, projects toward Riversdale Road, fronted by a flat wall and bay, half timbered and corbelled on the upper level, left clear on the ground floor to accentuate a segmentally arched front door. To one side the main frontal gable cuts back to continue down in a long diagonal across a second half-timbered wing, this time under one of the roof hips. This element does not express the stair, which runs back at right angles to Riversdale Road, but rather, was probably intended to provide a visual link between the original garage entry and the front door. The original drawings show a double door in plank panels to what was originally an integrated garage under a second segmental arch to the immediate west side of the main entry.<sup>10</sup> The garage has been converted to a new use and the original doors replaced by a multi-paned casement window, with a single plate-glass eyelet filling the rest of the arch above it. There is no verandah, but the front door and former garage are also linked visually by an entry patio enclosed on the north side by a shallow wall.

Two other arched windows, drawn up into points and hinting at narrow 'archer slits', were positioned on the north-east side of the main wing and again on the east wing, one lighting the hall, the other lighting a nook by the lounge room chimney. The lounge room window alongside is a typical 1930s 'Chicago' frame with two casements on either side of a large fixed plate glass centre pane. The main bedroom windows are three equally-sized casements.

A series of alterations and additions are recorded in Council's files for the property. A brush fernery was added in 1940, and an addition to the house (possibly the two-storey hipped roof wing) was constructed in 1950. A new garage was added in 1951, at which time the original driveway may have been removed. Unspecified additions were made in 1957 (possibly the single-storey hipped-roof extension to the rear) and a carport (1963) and swimming pool (1975) were also constructed. Further additions were made in 1984 and 1988. These included the addition of a family room (1984), brick garage and a substantial corner lych-gate in tiles and timber to match the house. To the extent that they are visible, these later additions have been broadly sympathetic to the original exterior.

### Historical Context

By the beginning of the twentieth century the MMBW Detail Plan No. 76 (date unknown) shows this section of Riversdale Road had been substantially developed for residential purposes, with the building stock a mix of brick and timber and including some larger villa residences. A small number of larger residences (probably Victorian) are shown on more substantial allotments and set back from the street. A large area in the immediate vicinity of the subject site was shown vacant at this time (this appears to have formed part of the grounds of an earlier residence, *The Pines*) and was developed later.

### Comparative Analysis

660 Riversdale Road compares with 102 Mont Albert Road of 1937 (q.v., B-graded) in scale and general massing, and adaptive use of a corner site. 294 Camberwell Road, 1933 (q.v., B-graded) precedes the subject building in introducing a garage as integral with the main elevation, but in the case of No. 660 Riversdale Road, the original garage was drawn right into the structure of the house, making the latter of interest for its integrated garage. A strong visual connection was established between the original garage doors and the front door of the house.

Unfortunately the garage was moved later, leaving 660 as a vivid but otherwise fairly conventional 1930s house in its plan and detailing. The fenestration is more conventionally 1930s than that of the wayward and intense 32 Hortense Street Glen Iris of 1938 (q.v., B-graded). Externally, the house is of interest for the builder's capacity to make it read as a set of wings rather than as a fairly simple rectangular cube as in 35 Balwyn Road of 1931-2 or 1292 Toorak Road of 1931 (both q.v., B-graded) as its actual plan would suggest. The house is marked by attention to details such as the corbelled upper elevations, stepped and turned chimney and lively use of the bricks' patterning. The composition is bold in use of the diagonal, matching similar Camberwell examples as at Clayton and Porter Roads Balwyn or 11 Chatfield Avenue Camberwell of 1932-3 (B-graded).<sup>11</sup>

Two other houses in the Camberwell area still had fully integrated garages at the time of the 1991 Camberwell Conservation Study survey; these include 4 Marlborough Avenue and 49 The Ridge, Camberwell, of 1935-8, and 1936 respectively (both C-graded). Several other houses have equally or more striking compositions, as with 125 Highfield Road, 1933 (B-graded), 13 Marlborough Avenue,

1935 (C-graded), 66 The Boulevard, Balwyn North, 1938 (C-graded), and the earlier and magisterial Knowlton, by Marcus Barlow, 92 Mont Albert Road, of 1926 (A-graded).<sup>12</sup>

### Assessment Against Criteria

*Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria*

*CRITERION D: The importance of a place or object in exhibiting the principal characteristics or the representative nature of a place or object as a part of a class or type of places or objects.*

660 Riversdale Road is a lively and interesting example of a larger Camberwell house in the Old English manner. While it has had a series of additions over a long period, these are generally sympathetic to the original form and texture. Its plan is closer to the generalised stuccoed houses of the 1930s, leading toward the form now identified as 'post-war vernacular'.

*CRITERION E: The importance of the place or object in exhibiting good design or aesthetic characteristics and/or in exhibiting a richness, diversity or unusual integration of features.*

No. 660 Riversdale Road is of particular interest for its use of materials in expressing texture. The design is also of interest for its ability to generate a spreading wing form in appearance, belying a fairly compact working plan.

### Statement of Significance

No. 660 Riversdale Road is of local historical and architectural significance as a substantial brick residence in the Old English manner. It is distinctive for its incorporation of a garage (now converted) into the main body of the house, and for its use of materials in expressing texture, using a vivid tapestry brick, interspersed with relieving bricks in burnt sienna and blue clinker. The design is also of interest for its ability to generate a spreading wing form in appearance, belying a fairly compact working plan. While it has had a series of additions over a long period, these are generally sympathetic to the original form and texture.

### Grading Review

Unchanged.

### Recommendations

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme.

### Identified By

G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

### References

*General:* G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

*Specific:*

<sup>1</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index #10990, dated 14 February 1938; Electoral Roll, 1938.

<sup>2</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index #10990, dated 14 February 1938.

<sup>3</sup> Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria 1940; 1944-45.

<sup>4</sup> Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria 1950; details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, #5632, 21 September 1950.

<sup>5</sup> Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria 1950; details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, #5632, 21 September 1950.

<sup>6</sup> Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria 1962; details sourced from City of Camberwell Building Index, #32434, dated 30 January 1963.

<sup>7</sup> No. 154 on the road's old numbering system.

<sup>8</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index # 10990, dated 14 February 1938.

<sup>9</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, #5632, dated 21 September 1950.

<sup>10</sup> A separate application was made for a garage in early 1940 (#12568 in the City of Camberwell Building Index, dated 23 January 1940), but the integrated garage is shown on the original drawing for the house.

<sup>11</sup> 11 Chatfield Avenue is illustrated by G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, vol. 4, p. 88.



<sup>12</sup> G Butler, *Camberwell Conservation Study 1991*, vol. 4: 92 Mont Albert Road, pp. 194-5; 4 Marlborough Street: pp. 176-7; 13 Marlborough Street, pp. 178; 49 The Ridge, pp. 271-2; 125 Highfield Road, pp. 132-3; 66 The Boulevard, pp. 269-70.

---

<b>Name</b>	<i>Kinnoul</i>	<b>Reference No</b>	
<b>Address</b>	11 The Avenue, Surrey Hills	<b>Survey Date</b>	20 September 2005
<b>Building Type</b>	Residence	<b>Grading</b>	B (Provisional)
<b>Date</b>	1902	<b>Previous Grading</b>	B



**Extent of Overlay**

To title boundaries

---

**Intactness**    ☒ Good    ☐ Fair    ☐ Poor

**Heritage Status**    ☐ HV    ☐ AHC    ☐ NT    ☐ Rec    BPS Heritage Overlay

3.

**History**

In June 1902, Thomas Hogg applied for a building permit for a residence in Surrey Avenue, as The Avenue was then named<sup>1</sup>. R.L. Phillips built the brick dwelling that had an area of 3385 square feet<sup>2</sup>. Thomas Hogg, a manufacturer, lived at the property with his wife Florence and daughter Constance until after 1952<sup>3</sup>. For some years the house has been occupied by a former Premier of Victoria (1992-1999), the Hon Jeffrey G Kennett, and his family.

(G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, amended by Lovell Chen 2006)

**Description & Integrity**

*The following preliminary description is based on limited views of the house, and on earlier photographs and documents and would need to be confirmed on site.*

The house at 11 The Avenue, Surrey Hills, is a large Federation Bungalow with a spreading roof clad in terracotta Marseilles-pattern tiles, sited on the south-western quarter of a deep site. The house is identified as *Kinnoul* on the 1909 MMBW plan for Surrey Hills, at which time it was one of five houses in 'Surrey Avenue'.<sup>4</sup>

As shown on the MMBW plan, the house was approached from the north-west by a curved entry path, which appears to have been broadly similar to the existing path in its placement and alignment. The verandah extends around the north, west and south sides of the house, and includes a semicircular entry porch on the north side. The verandah columns are in tapered timber, suggesting columns in the classical tradition, and are capped with unusual orientalising cross-heads. A gable is set into the verandah on its west side; this is supported on brick piers with stylized Ionic capitals. While not

visible from the street, Graeme Butler noted in 1991 that the verandah is also punctuated by a gabled bay on the south side, featuring detailed leaded glass insets.

Red brick is used to outline quoins around windows and doors, and the rest of the walls are in either solid red brick or with a red brick dado with integral cornice moulding below a stuccoed upper level. An unusual hexagonal porthole is set into the north wall towards the street entrance.

A detached building comprising a timber bed-sit over a double garage appears to have been constructed in 1994, sited south of the main house.<sup>5</sup> At the same time, an addition was constructed at the rear of the house, comprising a conservatory, bedroom, deck and meals area.

The fence and gates are of recent origins, and the house is generally concealed from view by a hedge, and mature garden behind.

The current northern and southern boundaries of the site appear to have been altered from those shown on the 1909 MMBW Detail plan.

### Historical Context

*Kinnoul* was one of the first houses to be constructed in The Avenue and was built of brick rather than of timber, the building material used for the other four houses shown on the 1909 MMBW plan of Surrey Avenue.

### Comparative Analysis

Constructed in 1902 at the high tide of the Federation styles, aspects of *Kinnoul's* design also suggest a shift into later domestic modes. The broad, quasi-homestead roof outline, broad, plain walls and pedestal-based verandah columns all reflect a shift toward the simplification of Federation house forms which occurred in this period and which led to the development of bungalow forms from around 1910-15. In this regard, and in its horizontality of line, the house can be compared with Christopher Cowper's designs for 62 Riversdale Road, Hawthorn (A-graded), and 26 Balwyn Road Canterbury, (ungraded), both from the same period.

The use of brick piers with Ionic capitals on pedestals is also of interest and reflects an interest in introducing Edwardian Baroque details into basically Federation house forms.

### Assessment Against Criteria

*Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria*

*CRITERION A: The historical importance, association with or relationship to Boroondara's history of the place or object.*

*Kinnoul*, at 11 The Avenue, Surrey Hills, is of historical significance for its association with former Victorian Premier, JG Kennett.

*CRITERION D: The importance of a place or object in exhibiting the principal characteristics or the representative nature of a place or object as a part of a class or type of places or objects.*

The house is a fine and relatively externally intact example of a substantial Federation residence set on a large allotment with mature garden.

*CRITERION E: The importance of the place or object in exhibiting good design or aesthetic characteristics and/or in exhibiting a richness, diversity or unusual integration of features.*

Constructed in 1902, *Kinnoul* is a relatively early and accomplished example of a simplified Federation Bungalow residence which successfully combines a series of interesting features and details. Of note are the verandah columns on pedestals, predating the use of this detail in the Bungalow period, 1915-30. The Ionic capitals, combined use of roughcast stucco with plain brick quoining and the canted entry porch all allude to Edwardian Baroque usage, then just beginning to make an appearance in house design. Other details, such as the hexagonal porthole near the front door and the orientalising cross-heads on the verandah fascia, are unusual elements at this time.

## Statement of Significance

*Provisional only*

*Kinnoul*, at 11 The Avenue, Surrey Hills, is of local historical and architectural significance. Constructed in 1902, the house is a fine and relatively externally intact example of a substantial Federation residence set on a large allotment with mature garden. Architecturally, it is a relatively early and accomplished example of a simplified Federation Bungalow residence which successfully combines a series of interesting features and details. Of note are the verandah columns on pedestals, predating the use of this detail in the Bungalow period, 1915-30. The Ionic capitals to the verandah columns, combined use of roughcast stucco with plain brick quoining and the canted entry porch all allude to Edwardian Baroque usage, then just beginning to make an appearance in house design. Other details, such as the hexagonal porthole near the front door and the orientalising cross-heads on the verandah fascia, are unusual elements at this time. *Kinnoul*, at 11 The Avenue, Surrey Hills, is of historical significance for its association with former Premier of Victoria (1992-1999), JG Kennett.

## Grading Review

B (Provisional)

## Recommendations (provisional)

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme.

It is recommended that a further site inspection be carried out to confirm the provisional grading.

## Identified By

G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

## References

*General:* G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

*Specific:*

<sup>1</sup> City of Camberwell Building Index, # 13602, cited in G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991, vol. 4, p. 267.

<sup>2</sup> City of Camberwell Building Index, # 13602, cited in G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991, vol. 4, p. 267.

<sup>3</sup> *Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria* 1920; 1940; 1952; Electoral Roll, 1951, all cited in G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991, vol. 4, p. 267.

<sup>4</sup> MMBW Plan No. 72 (Surrey Hills), 160'-1", dated 1909.

<sup>5</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Buildings Index, #100044, dated 16 June 1994. Working drawings by Spaces Constructions, # 93 278, dated April 1994.

<b>Name</b>	House	<b>Reference No</b>	
<b>Address</b>	899 Toorak Road, Camberwell	<b>Survey Date</b>	27 September 2005; 25 November 2005
<b>Building Type</b>	Residence	<b>Grading</b>	B (Provisional)
<b>Date</b>	1921	<b>Previous Grading</b>	B



#### Extent of Overlay

To title boundaries

**Intactness** ☐ Good ☐ Fair ☐ Poor

**Heritage Status** ☐ HV ☐ AHC ☐ NT ☒ Rec BPS Heritage Overlay

#### History

Allotment 15 was purchased by Julia Cuise (?) in 1920 from Frederick W. Kerr, care of the Town Hall, Camberwell.<sup>1</sup> A brick house of five rooms was built on the allotment.<sup>2</sup> By 1924-25 the property was owned by Mrs Howard Atchison and occupied by Charles B. Atchison, a leather merchant who had earlier lived in Malvern<sup>3</sup>. Charles Bently Atchison occupied this property with Florence L. Atchison until at least 1945<sup>4</sup>. The property was occupied for a short period in 1935 by Sydney E. Tucker.<sup>5</sup>

(G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study)

#### Description & Integrity

*The house could not be described in detail as it is not visible from the street and access was not available during the course of the Review. The following description is based on existing documentation (Camberwell Conservation Study 1991 and drawings) and would need to be confirmed on site.*

The house is obscured from the street by a 2.5 metre high stained timber paling fence with galvanized steel gates. The upper section of the main gable, together with the clinker-brick chimney, is visible from the street, along with other elements of the roof. The roof is in its original terracotta tiles, and the gable has its original shingles and pattern of fascias, albeit repainted.

The photograph and description in the 1991 Camberwell Conservation Study<sup>6</sup> show an asymmetrical composition with a bay balanced with a skillion-roofed porch-verandah around a simple clinker brick chimney with a cornice one course thick, in the manner of chimney tops from the bungalow period. The gable is linked to the front wall at the west end with a sheet of shingles applied down past a

simple three-light porthole. The gable has a small vent at its top and is supported by a single slender bracket, and is set off by a transverse gable to the rear, on similar shallow gradient to the verandah canopy and the front gable. The shaped rafter points, linear stylization and verandah supports build up a Japanese quality set off by the masonry walls in roughcast stucco cladding and clinker brick, a more consciously European reference echoing the general finish of Arts and Crafts Movement houses. The front door is located on the west side of the house.<sup>7</sup>

The garden is not visible from the street, though the presence of some mature trees is noted.<sup>8</sup>

The extent of alteration is unclear. A conversion to a medical centre was proposed in 1994, however the application appears to have been withdrawn.<sup>9</sup>

### Historical Context

This section of Toorak Road was substantially built up during the 1920s, in part due to the improvement of public transport in the area, in particular the north-south Burke Road tram route, which connected with Gardiner and Camberwell railway stations. The local shopping centre also dates from this period, as does the area of south Hawthorn on the west side of Burke Road.

### Comparative Analysis

This house has an elegance and boldness in composition which distinguishes it from many other contemporary examples. A comparable example in tarred wood at Monomeath Avenue, Canterbury, c.1917-19, has been demolished, though another in Currajong Avenue, Camberwell (q.v., B-graded) survives. Compositionally, the house has echoes of Horbury Hunt's Spurling house at Black Street Middle Brighton, but a more proximate source in composition might be the Bungalow courts illustrated in Henry Saylor's US *Bungalows* in 1911,<sup>10</sup> again showing part-length verandah skillions terminated by stepped chimney breasts under shingled gables. This found some parallels in the Sydney architect Reginald Prevost's houses, included in his seminal *Australian Bungalow and House Designs* of 1912.<sup>11</sup> More locally, similar compositions recur in 1 Muswell Hill, Glen Iris, of 1927 (C-graded),<sup>12</sup> and 37 Normanby Road, Kew, of 1920 (B-graded).<sup>13</sup> Further away it has compositional parallels with some of Algernon Elmore's tarred weatherboard Bungalows, as with 17 Main Street, Blackburn.<sup>14</sup>

As Graeme Butler has noted, the house cultivates a conspicuous Japanese character, which is of interest in the context of the influence of Japanese forms on the original houses of this type in the United States (Pasadena and Alameda).

### Assessment Against Criteria

*Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria*

*CRITERION D: The importance of a place or object in exhibiting the principal characteristics or the representative nature of a place or object as a part of a class or type of places or objects.*

899 Toorak Road is a fine and relatively externally intact example of a sophisticated Bungalow design from the early 1920s.

*CRITERION E: The importance of the place or object in exhibiting good design or aesthetic characteristics and/or in exhibiting a richness, diversity or unusual integration of features.*

The asymmetrical composition is robust, elegant and powerful, and tending to the abstract in comparison with most local bungalow counterparts. It is also distinctive for its Japanese character.

### Statement of Significance

*Provisional only*

899 Toorak Road, Camberwell, is of local historical and architectural significance, as a fine and relatively externally intact example of a sophisticated Bungalow design from the early 1920s. Its asymmetrical composition is robust, elegant and powerful, and tending to the abstract in comparison with most local bungalow counterparts. It is also distinctive for its Japanese character.

## **Grading Review**

B (provisional)

## **Recommendations (provisional)**

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme on a provisional basis.

It is recommended that a further site inspection be carried out to confirm the provisional grading.

## **Identified By**

G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

## **References**

*General:* G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

*Specific:*

<sup>1</sup> City of Camberwell Rate Books, 1920-21, # 933; 1921-22, # 977.

<sup>2</sup> City of Camberwell Rate Books, 1920-21, # 933; 1921-22, # 977.

<sup>3</sup> City of Camberwell Rate Books, 1924-25, # 21726; Electoral Roll, 1912.

<sup>4</sup> Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria, 1930; Electoral Roll, 1938; Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria, 1944-45.

<sup>5</sup> Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria, 1935.

<sup>6</sup> G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, vol. 4, p. 275.

<sup>7</sup> As shown on

<sup>8</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, #29538, dated 10 August 1961 (sunroom); #33627, dated 28 August 1963 (garage).

<sup>9</sup> Later preliminary drawings, n.d., City of Boroondara plan archive. Details sourced from the City of Boroondara Building Index, #40/408/20945, dated 1 February 2001; City of Camberwell Building Index, # 106808, dated November 1994.

<sup>10</sup> Cited by Graeme Butler in *The Californian Bungalow in Australia*, Lothian, Melbourne, 1992, p. 33.

<sup>11</sup> Cited by Butler in *The Californian Bungalow*, p. 27.

<sup>12</sup> Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, p. 209.

<sup>13</sup> Details sourced from Pru Sanderson, City of Kew Urban Conservation Study, 1988, B Grade Listings.

<sup>14</sup> See Angela Taylor, 'The Elmore Bungalows'. *Historic Environment*, 1, 1983, provides a general outline of Elmore's life and work.



<b>Name</b>	House	<b>Reference No</b>	
<b>Address</b>	931 Toorak Road, Camberwell	<b>Survey Date</b>	2 September 2005
<b>Building Type</b>	Residence	<b>Grading</b>	B
<b>Date</b>	1925	<b>Previous Grading</b>	B



#### Extent of Overlay

To title boundaries.

**Intactness** ☒ Good ☐ Fair ☐ Poor

**Heritage Status** ☐ HV ☐ AHC ☐ NT ☐ Rec. BPS Heritage Overlay

#### History

A brick, nine roomed dwelling was built on this property in 1925 for Thomas H. Bee who resided here until 1930.<sup>1</sup> In 1930 James H. Nettleton, an oil merchant, purchased the property and lived here until, in 1950, Mrs J.E. Nettleton became the owner-occupier.<sup>2</sup> Mrs Nettleton remained in residence until at least 1962, but by 1974 the residence had been converted to flats.<sup>3</sup>

James Henry Nettleton J.P. and S.M., was born at Carlton in 1880 and educated at the Model School, Melbourne. He was a Justice of the Peace, Special Children's Magistrate, President of the Hardware Club and President of the Boy Scouts' Association of Camberwell. In 1932-34 Nettleton was the Mayor of Camberwell.<sup>4</sup>

Alterations at the rear of the residence were made in the 1980s (refer Description & Integrity below).

(G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, additional research by Lovell Chen, 2005)

#### Description & Integrity

931 Toorak Road is a simply massed two storey attic bungalow design with a large central dormer in its Marseilles-pattern tiled roof, plain red brick walls and verandah columns, and a brick paneled fence with its original segmentally arched gate pergola. The main roof is in two pitches only, punctuated by a chimney running behind the fascia at the west end, and the window and door details, at least as viewed from Toorak Road, appear original. There have been alterations at the rear of the house, and a new garage constructed. Both are visible from Rowell Avenue but do not dominate views to the house.<sup>5</sup>

#### Historical Context

Numerous residences (shown on the MMBW Detail Plan 76 as a mix of brick and timber) were constructed on both sides of Toorak Road in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries.



Substantial development then occurred in the interwar period, with large numbers of bungalows constructed in the vicinity.

### Comparative Analysis

931 Toorak Road is an attic house in a characteristic 1920s bungalow mode- that is 'bungalow' in its mood of informality rather than technically correct as in 'single-storey'.<sup>6</sup> It resembles so-called Dutch Colonial or Adirondack bungalows of the eastern United States. These were made popular by Katherine Budd in her articles for the Massachusetts *Architectural Review* in the 1900s, and by Gustav Stickley, Will Bradley and others in *The Craftsman* magazine. One of Melbourne's earliest examples, the Harry Martin bungalow of 1910 in Malvern (demolished) by Oakden and Ballantyne, was very similar in design, though in timber, and the type proliferated wherever there were good views to be had.<sup>7</sup> Another example is at 16 Alma Road Camberwell, of c. 1923-4 (C-graded).<sup>8</sup>

### Assessment Against Criteria

*Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria*

*CRITERION A: The historical importance, association with or relationship to Boroondara's history of the place or object.*

Though constructed for the original owner, Thomas Bee, between 1930 and 1950, the house is of interest for its historical association with James Nettleton, Mayor of Camberwell 1932-4 and prominent in public affairs in the local area and further afield. Nettleton lived in the house between 1930 and 1950 and the property remained in the Nettleton family until at least the 1960s.

*CRITERION D: The importance of a place or object in exhibiting the principal characteristics or the representative nature of a place or object as a part of a class or type of places or objects.*

931 Toorak Road is an intact and well-preserved example of a two-storey attic house in a popular Melbourne form following the US Bungalow pattern championed by Katherine Budd and Gustav Stickley. The house is well integrated with an original fence and entry pergola, and is set in a mature garden.

*CRITERION E: The importance of the place or object in exhibiting good design or aesthetic characteristics and/or in exhibiting a richness, diversity or unusual integration of features.*

The house is demonstrative of the importance of Eastern US house design in influencing Melbourne's Bungalow period, alongside better-known influences from California.

### Statement of Significance

931 Toorak Road is of local historical and architectural significance. Architecturally, it is of significance as an intact and well-preserved example of a two-storey attic house in a popular Melbourne form following the US Bungalow pattern championed by Katherine Budd and Gustav Stickley. It is demonstrative of the influence of Eastern US house design on Bungalow forms in Melbourne in the 1920s, alongside better-known influences from California. The house retains its setting, including original fence and entry pergola, and is set in a dense garden.

Though constructed for the original owner, Thomas Bee, between 1930 and 1950, the house is also of historical interest for its association with James Nettleton, Mayor of Camberwell 1932-4 and prominent in public affairs in the local area and further afield. Nettleton lived in the house between 1930 and 1950 and the property remained in the Nettleton family until at least the 1960s.

### Grading Review

Unchanged.

### Recommendations

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme.

### Identified By

G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

## References

*General:* G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

*Specific:*

<sup>1</sup> Sands and McDougall Directory of Victoria, 1929.

<sup>2</sup> Sands and McDougall Directory of Victoria, 1930; 1944-45; 1950

<sup>3</sup> Sands and McDougall Directory of Victoria, 1962; 1974

<sup>4</sup> Grant, C.A. 500 Victorians, 1934, p.176.

<sup>5</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, #81464, dated 23 October 1986, (laundry, toilet and new window to sun room); # 87310, dated 26 January 1989, # 89162, dated 3 October 1989 (garage).

<sup>6</sup> The original Pasadena 'Bungalows' by Charles and Henry Greene were almost all two-storied. The term *Bungalow* in its American usage refers more to an assumed informality of living and moving close to nature, according to a major historian of the form, Robert Winter. Single-storey American Bungalows were more abundant outside central Los Angeles and Pasadena, particularly 'export versions' in the suburban south-east of Los Angeles- Alameda, Redlands, Riverside, in Tulsa Oklahoma and Charleston South Carolina. Interviews and travel notes by Conrad Hamann, June-July 1979.

<sup>7</sup> As in Glen Iris, overlooking High Street and Gardiner Creek. For the Martin Bungalow, see *Building*, April 1912, republished in Peter Cuffley, *Australian Houses of the 1920s and 1930s*, Five Mile, Melbourne, 1989, pp. 56-7. Cuffley also reproduces a Craftsman bungalow from Stickley's magazine *The Craftsman*, April 1914. See P Cuffley, *Australian Houses of the 1920s and 1930s*, p. 58.

<sup>8</sup> G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, v. 4, p. 9.

<b>Name</b>	House	<b>Reference No</b>	
<b>Address</b>	1292 Toorak Road, Glen Iris	<b>Survey Date</b>	20 September 2005
<b>Building Type</b>	Residence	<b>Grading</b>	B
<b>Date</b>	1931	<b>Previous Grading</b>	B



**Extent of Overlay**

To title boundaries.

**Intactness** ☒ Good ☐ Fair ☐ Poor

**Heritage Status** ☐ HV ☐ AHC ☐ NT ☐ Rec. ☐ BPS Heritage Overlay

**History**

In 1931, Dr Alan Murray commissioned A.J. Edmond to construct a two-storeyed dwelling for him on Lot 3 in Toorak Road.<sup>1</sup> The brick house of eleven rooms was estimated to cost £2,500.<sup>2</sup> Dr Murray owned and occupied the property until after 1974.<sup>3</sup>

(G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991)

**Description & Integrity**

1292 Toorak Road is a large-storey brick house with stucco rendering. Characterised by broad and simple massing, it has a hipped roof clad in Marseilles-pattern terracotta tile. The entry faces Beryl Street to the west, approached by a cement path running to the corner. The elevations facing Toorak Road and Beryl Street have had little, if any, external alteration.<sup>4</sup> The windows are horizontally proportioned and there is a shingled oriel. The porch has triple arches, its slightly processional looking west elevation suggesting the Mediterranean or California.

The brick and stucco fence is original and complements the house, and is keyed to an encircling hedge and garden typical of the period.

**Historical Context**

This area of Toorak Road underwent a degree of residential development in the late Victorian and Edwardian periods, as is shown on MMBW Detail Plan No. 74. The street was still mixed in its character however, with the Burwood Poultry Farm located a short distance to the east. A subsequent layer of development occurred in the interwar period, as with 1292 Toorak Road. This building occupies a major corner site in this mixed area.

## Comparative Analysis

Graeme Butler ascribes both Arts and Crafts and Georgian Revival affinities to the house,<sup>5</sup> and vestiges of both run through most of the more ambitious houses in that area, along with a Mediterranean interest that was congenial with these modes in influential circles of the day.<sup>6</sup> The solid, simple massing recalls free style houses by B J Waterhouse and others in Sydney during the 1900s, and the solidity of British Arts and Crafts designs before that<sup>7</sup> - albeit at some conceptual and atmospheric distance. 1292 Toorak Road is typical of stock in the nearby Hassett and Golf Links Estates, though this is a particularly intact example, and as Butler notes, few houses there have the prominent site that this house does. The shingled bay echoes the more complex 'Manhattan Bungalows' and apartment modes seen in inner suburbs, built during the 1910s and 1920s, particularly those by Harold Lawson in his earlier days, in the Dandenong-Toorak and St Kilda Road areas.<sup>8</sup>

## Assessment Against Criteria

*Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria*

*CRITERION D: The importance of a place or object in exhibiting the principal characteristics or the representative nature of a place or object as a part of a class or type of places or objects.*

1292 Toorak Road is a representative, intact and prominently sited example of eclectic domestic architecture in the eastern sections of Camberwell. The house obliquely incorporates a range of details and forms common in Melbourne architecture of the day.

## Statement of Significance

1292 Toorak Road, Glen Iris is of local historical and architectural significance as a representative, intact and prominently sited example of a substantial two-storey residence of the interwar period, which retains its original setting, including the brick and stucco fence. Typical for the period, the house is an assured composition which consciously blends elements taken from diverse stylistic and cultural sources.

## Grading Review

Unchanged.

## Recommendations

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme.

## Identified By

G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

## References

*General:* G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

*Specific:*

<sup>1</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, # 2395, dated 20 October 1931.

<sup>2</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, # 2395, dated 20 October 1931.

<sup>3</sup> *Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria* 1952; 1962; 1974.

<sup>4</sup> The only council permits are for the house and garage, both completed in 1931.

<sup>5</sup> G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, v. 4, p. 277.

<sup>6</sup> In Australia Hardy Wilson and his circle favoured combinations of Colonial Georgian and Mediterranean references in their designs, as did Leslie Wilkinson, the first professor of architecture at the University of Sydney. They gained major influence through Ure Smith publications such as *Art in Australia* or *The Home*, both current when this house was built. Locally, related modes were pursued by Desbrowe-Annear, Irwin and Stevenson, Barlow and Hawkins and Blackett, Forster and Craig, all of whose offices designed houses in the Boroondara region. The shingled bay on the north side echoes Bungalow and attic houses built around Melbourne in the 1910s and 1920s.

<sup>7</sup> Especially Waterhouse's *The Crossways*, Centennial Park Corner, NSW, 1909, illustrated in *Art and Architecture*; or Charles Rennie Mackintosh's 1904 *Hill House* at Helensburgh or, as Butler suggests, CFA Voysey's Studio house in London or *Perrycroft* in the West Country. Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, v. 4, p. 277. These comparisons do, it would seem, flatter the Toorak Road house, though; the presence and action of these sources is arguably fairly dilute in this version.

<sup>8</sup> These had gained some prominence in magazines such as the *Australian Home Builder*, later the *Australian Home Beautiful*.

<b>Name</b>	House	<b>Reference No</b>	
<b>Address</b>	1293 Toorak Road, Burwood	<b>Survey Date</b>	15 September 2005
<b>Building Type</b>	Residence	<b>Grading</b>	B
<b>Date</b>	1915	<b>Previous Grading</b>	B



**Extent of Overlay**  
To title boundaries.

**Intactness** ☒ Good ☐ Fair ☐ Poor

**Heritage Status** ☐ HV ☐ AHC ☐ NT ☐ Rec. BPS Heritage Overlay

### History

Arthur H. Coverlid, an estate agent and sworn valuer, moved from Power Street, Hawthorn to become owner-occupier of this property in 1915. He resided here until the early 1940s<sup>1</sup>. Stella Katie Coverlid occupied the eight roomed brick house with Arthur until the mid 1940s when she became the sole occupier of the property<sup>2</sup>. Stella Coverlid remained at this address at least until 1952<sup>3</sup>. Two physicians, W.Carroll and J.D. Bishop occupied the premises (possibly used as consulting rooms) in the early 1960s<sup>4</sup>.

Original owner-occupier Arthur H. Coverlid was an estate agent with the firm John Coverlid Pty. Ltd. of 520 Toorak Road<sup>5</sup>.

The property appears on the MMBW Detail Plan no. 74 (undated but possibly from a base dating from the early twentieth century) as *Chatham*. The site at this time extended west to Through Road; the original allotment has been subdivided and this western section of the site is now 1291 Burwood Road.

(G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, additional research by Lovell Chen, 2005)

### Description & Integrity

1293 Toorak Road is a double-fronted brick Federation bungalow with a projecting wing at its east end, a return verandah and a corner tower anchoring the verandah on its west side. Compositionally, the wing and tower create an armature that 'holds' in place and counterbalances the mobility implied by the verandah, by expressing movement in an outward direction rather than movement around the central mass of the building. Central unity derives from a hipped central roof, not unlike that of a country homestead. This is characteristic Federation composition, punctuated by touches of free style timber detailing around the doors and windows, related to the *Queen Anne* movement in England and

America and as a general label applied at the time to such houses.<sup>6</sup> The timber detailing is stylized here into a set of slatted balusters, as in the wave-slatted verandah frieze and balustrade, and the half timbering suggestions around the wing window and the gable above it.

The verandah was partly enclosed in 1955, and a sun room was added in 1961.<sup>7</sup> A garage was added in 1975. The house is sheltered from Toorak Road by an unsympathetic full-height fence built in 1976.<sup>8</sup> As noted above, the original allotment has been subdivided and the garden has been extensively paved, to allow drive-in parking and reduced maintenance.

### Historical Context

This area of Toorak Road underwent a degree of residential development in the late Victorian and Edwardian periods, as is shown on MMBW Detail Plan No. 74. The street was still mixed in its character however, with the Burwood Poultry Farm located a short distance to the east.

### Comparative Analysis

Architecturally, 1293 Toorak Road comes at the chronological close of the Federation period, for which time it is a fairly conservative (albeit lively) design. The conservative quality of the design is seen in the gable brackets on the projecting east wing and the corbelled chimneys, details more associated with the emergent Federation architecture of the early 1890s. Other details, such as the wave slatting on the verandah valance and the fairly unified and linear patterning of the surface detail, are more contemporary. The house compares most interestingly with 15 Alma Road Camberwell, of 1889-90, one of the prototypes of Australian Federation architecture. That has similar proportions, double-fronted composition, similarly flared main roof, and a similarly proportioned elaboration of massing on the corner of its return verandah. The difference is that the massing at the verandah turn has now evolved into a diagonally turned corner tower, and the expression of structure in rhythmic half-timbering is more integrated with the wall surfaces. The house shows a real effort in its unification of this rhythmic patterning, which carries through the gabled wing, the box over the projecting windows, the windows themselves, and the scale of the arched slats in the verandah valance. The vigor is pronounced at a time when compositional restraint and containment was ascendant, and the house recalls earlier estates and groups in Boroondara, such as the Wattle Valley Road houses in Canterbury of c. 1892-1907. It also has their sense of episodic, compressed eventfulness in a limited space and on limited structural resources, and in this the half-timbered patterning works well to unify the design. More generally, the house embodies the central compositional aspects of the Federation style: a return verandah, an eventful massing at the verandah's turn, the compositional anchoring of the verandah at one or both ends with a projecting wing; the iconic hint at Britishness through the half-timber, the transformation of this in Australian circumstance into a spreading and more universalizing pattern; and the Italianate-derived roofscape composition of chimney balancing the wing gables and corner tower.<sup>9</sup>

### Assessment Against Criteria

*Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria*

*CRITERION D: The importance of a place or object in exhibiting the principal characteristics or the representative nature of a place or object as a part of a class or type of places or objects.*

The house at 1293 Toorak Road is a fine, representative and broadly externally intact example of a villa from the late phases of the Federation period. It exemplifies the central aspects of Federation composition: return verandah, major event at the verandah turn, anchorage of the verandah at either end with projecting wings that imply an L-shaped armature or spine of rooms and more solid massing, with the corner behind the verandah dissolving into a fabric of robust turned woodwork, filtering the sun.

### Statement of Significance

The house at 1293 Toorak Road is of local historical and architectural significance as a fine, representative and externally intact example of a villa from the late phases of the Federation period. While relatively conservative for its construction date, the building exemplifies the central aspects of Federation composition: return verandah, major event at the verandah turn, anchorage of the verandah at either end with projecting wings that imply an L-shaped armature or spine of rooms and more solid massing, with the corner behind the verandah dissolving into a fabric of robust turned woodwork, filtering the sun.

## Grading Review

Unchanged.

## Recommendations

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme.

## Identified By

G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

## References

*General:* G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

*Specific:*

<sup>1</sup> Sands and McDougall Directory of Victoria, 1915; 1925; 1940; Electoral Roll, 1912; 1936.

<sup>2</sup> Sands and McDougall Directory of Victoria, 1944-45; Electoral Roll 1936; 1945.

<sup>3</sup> Sands and McDougall Directory of Victoria, 1952.

<sup>4</sup> Sands and McDougall Directory of Victoria, 1962.

<sup>5</sup> Sands and McDougall Directory of Victoria, 1930.

<sup>6</sup> See Mark Girouard, *Sweetness and Light: the 'Queen Anne' movement, 1860-1900* Oxford University Press, Oxford, 1977. Queen Anne was a term hastily applied to a free and loosely historical manner of housing developed by Norman Shaw and his inventive London contemporaries in the 1870s. The red brick and white window trim and other small decorative details were the only element that really linked this architecture with the actual terraces and houses of Queen Anne's time, but the term stuck. As a descriptive term Queen Anne became synonymous with any late nineteenth or turn of the century architecture that was generally experimental and free in its approach to period styles.

<sup>7</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, #16580, dated 5 July 1955; # 18502, dated 25 May 1956; #30180, dated 1 December 1961.

<sup>8</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, #57378, dated 18 July 1975 (garage); # 59053, dated 24 May 1976 (fence).

<sup>9</sup> Miles Lewis talks about the characteristic diagonality of Federation style plans- 'the first truly Australian style there is' in 'The incipient Federation Styles', Ch. 3 of Richard Apperly et al., *The History and Design of the Australian House*, Oxford, Melbourne, 1985, pp. 83-7 and 80-1. See also Conrad Hamann, 'The inclusive tradition in Victoria's architecture', in AGL Shaw, ed., *Victoria's Heritage*, Sydney, Allen and Unwin, 1985, which considers the external massing and compression of picturesque form in contemporary front yard and street designs.



<b>Name</b>	House	<b>Reference No</b>	
<b>Address</b>	1297 Toorak Road, Burwood	<b>Survey Date</b>	15 September 2005
<b>Building Type</b>	Residence	<b>Grading</b>	B
<b>Date</b>	1940	<b>Previous Grading</b>	B



#### Extent of Overlay

To title boundary

**Intactness** ☒ Good ☐ Fair ☐ Poor

**Heritage Status** ☐ HV ☐ AHC ☐ NT ☐ Rec. ☐ BPS Heritage Overlay

#### History

Theodore G. Macintosh, an engineer, commissioned Canterbury builder, E.W. Saunders, to construct this two-storey residence in 1940.<sup>1</sup> The building was designed by the architectural practice of Leith and Bartlett (refer discussion below). Estimated to cost £2,750, the brick and timber dwelling was of eight rooms.<sup>2</sup> Theodore Macintosh owned and occupied the property with Queenie Macintosh until after 1952.<sup>3</sup> By 1962 F. Williams was the owner-occupier.<sup>4</sup>

A number of alterations have been made to the house in recent years (refer Description & Integrity below) and approval was achieved in 2002 for the development of the rear of the site for a separate residential building.<sup>5</sup> The rear of the site was subsequently subdivided off from its original allotment.<sup>6</sup>

(G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, additional research by Lovell Chen, 2005)

#### Description & Integrity

The Macintosh house, 1297 Toorak Road, formerly 345 Toorak Road, was designed by Leith and Bartlett, later prominent as a large corporate firm and including G Burridge Leith, the former architect to the State Savings Bank of Victoria and notable in developing the suburban bungalow style and later eclectic styles.<sup>7</sup> The Mackintosh house was simply massed in a rectangular cube, though in plan the stair well and garage roof suggest a triple-front. The house is of two storeys, with a shallow hipped roof emphasizing its rectangular massing towards Toorak Road. The garage, dug down into the site, projected at a lower level and had a broad pergola originally, giving it the appearance of a carport. This was used as the frame for an actual carport front added later, in 1962.<sup>8</sup> The house was originally in cream clinker brick, but this has been painted in white more recently as part of an extensive series of alterations. These are mostly on the north and west sides, and apart from the painting, are either inconspicuous or unseen from the Toorak Road frontage. The carport in the lower front is still in

place, as are the tubular balustrade and plate-glass fronted stair hall, the dominant compositional elements of the principal elevation. A tennis court originally filled the back yard space. The architect Rhys Hopkins, later of Clarke, Hopkins and Clarke, added a louvred laundry as a lean-to in 1952.<sup>9</sup> A new fence was added in 1992, and in 1998 the architect Graeme Jones designed a series of alterations to the house.<sup>10</sup> He also designed two units in a separate but similar-looking building over the tennis court. Though these were not given a permit initially they were allowed on appeal in 2004.<sup>11</sup>

### Historical Context

By the interwar period, this area of Toorak Road had developed as a predominantly residential area. A small strip shopping centre had developed to the east at Toorak Road and Melton Avenue in the 1920s and 1930s.

### Comparative Analysis

No. 1297's cuboid massing, shallow hipped roof, dramatized stair hall window and spare, elegantly placed windows compare with a set of houses in Camberwell built at the time, such as in Mont Albert Road (now demolished), c. 1938, 113 Yarrbat Avenue Balwyn, 1940<sup>12</sup>, and 56 Riverside Avenue (q.v.) and 46 The Boulevard, Balwyn North, of 1940 and 1941 respectively.<sup>13</sup> A similar surface detailing, in multi-winged houses appears in AK Lines' 136 Whitehorse Road and *Clovelly*, 26 Reid Street, both Balwyn, both of 1938,<sup>14</sup> 1 Mountain View Road, Balwyn North, of 1939,<sup>15</sup> *Guelo*, 5 Salisbury Street Camberwell, 1941.<sup>16</sup> No. 1297 also represents a distillation of earlier cuboid types such as the King brothers' 35 Balwyn Road Canterbury and the related 1292 Toorak Road, diagonally opposite, both of 1931,<sup>17</sup> and the simply cubed, consciously regal designs of an even earlier period, such as Gawler and Drummond's 158 Mont Albert Road, of 1919.<sup>18</sup> These connections put the house partly within the emerging modernism of Melbourne suburban houses. The south side, which is elegantly composed and strongly planar in its external reading, resembles Roy Grounds' better known but slightly later houses and flats of 1940-1, particularly the COR Fenner house at Moralla Road, Kooyong, and the *Quamby* flats at Glover Court, Toorak, though these both had flat roofs.<sup>19</sup> This elegance sets 1297 apart from more usual Camberwell stock of the period, where details and wall expression tends to be solid or quite heavy. 1297's plain brick walls and shallow hipped roof also link it to some of Leighton Irwin's houses of the early and mid-1930s. Houses like this one were discussed in *Home Beautiful* in these years, and the design has equal importance in the emerging suburban style now known as Postwar Vernacular. One of the partners in 1297's design firm, G BurrIDGE Leith, had already produced several single-storey houses, published in *Home Beautiful*, that are prototypes for the more general suburban style. 1297 also has some significance as a recognizably Camberwell 'type'. The entry path is up from Toorak Road through a rough rockery.

### Assessment Against Criteria

#### *Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria*

*CRITERION D: The importance of a place or object in exhibiting the principal characteristics or the representative nature of a place or object as a part of a class or type of places or objects.*

1297 Toorak Road is an externally well-preserved example of a type of house common in Camberwell in the late 1930s and early 1940s, in its simple rectangular composition, avoidance of stylistic flourishes and shallow hipped roof. As with other designs in this Camberwell group, however, the design is a distillation of earlier treatments of the two-storey house, not least the one diagonally opposite. It also looks forward to the builder-designed suburban vernacular of the post war period, 1945-70. The overpainting is a significant change, but is common to other houses of this type which used stucco wall surfacing.

*CRITERION E: The importance of the place or object in exhibiting good design or aesthetic characteristics and/or in exhibiting a richness, diversity or unusual integration of features.*

The house has an elegance in composition, a planar sense to its walls and a lightness in detail that sets it apart from its consistently solid and gesturally more cautious Camberwell counterparts of the period. It is among the earlier phase of suburban houses of the Melbourne area to integrate its garage as part of the frontal composition, and it does so convincingly.

### Statement of Significance

The house at 1297 Toorak Road, Burwood is of local historical and architectural significance. It is fine and broadly intact example of a residential typology appearing in Camberwell in the late 1930s and early 1940s, in its simple rectangular composition, avoidance of stylistic flourishes and shallow hipped roof. As with other designs in this Camberwell group, the design is a distillation of earlier treatments of the two-storey house, but also looks forward to the builder-designed suburban vernacular of the post war period, 1945-70. The house has an elegance in composition, a planar sense to its walls and a lightness in detail that sets it apart from its consistently solid and gesturally more cautious Camberwell counterparts of the period. It is among the earlier phase of suburban houses of the Melbourne area to integrate its garage as part of the frontal composition, and it does so convincingly. While it has been altered, most of the changes that have occurred do not affect the main presentation of the house to Toorak Road.

### Grading Review

Unchanged.

### Recommendations

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme.

### Identified By

G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

### References

*General:* G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991; Pru Sanderson Design Pty Ltd.

*Specific:*

<sup>1</sup> Details sourced from City of Camberwell Building Index, # 13255, dated 9 July 1940.

<sup>2</sup> Details sourced from City of Camberwell Building Index, # 13255, dated 9 July 1940.

<sup>3</sup> Electoral Roll, 1945, *Sands and McDougall Directory of Victoria*, 1952.

<sup>4</sup> *Sands and McDougall Directory of Victoria*, 1962.

<sup>5</sup> City of Camberwell Planning File, 40/409/06356.

<sup>6</sup> City of Camberwell Planning File, 40/409/06356.

<sup>7</sup> See Working Drawings, 22 June 1940, held in the City of Camberwell drawing archive. Drawings sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, # 13255, dated 9 July 1940.

<sup>8</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, # 31080, dated 31 May 1962.

<sup>9</sup> Details and drawings sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, # 9739, dated 24 April 1952. See working drawing by Rhys Hopkins, n.d.

<sup>10</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, # 95584, dated 24 August 1992, and Graeme Jones, working drawings, 9 July 1998. The proposal for two connected units to be built on the tennis court was initially refused by the City of Boroondara, 24 November 2000, but allowed on appeal to VCAT, approved 4 February 2002. City of Camberwell Planning File 40/409/06356.

<sup>11</sup> Details and drawings sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, # 95584, dated 24 August 1992, and Graeme Jones, working drawings, 9 July 1998.

<sup>12</sup> G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, Vol. 4, p. 324.

<sup>13</sup> G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, Vol. 4, pp. 268-9

<sup>14</sup> G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, Vol. 4, pp. 230, 312-3.

<sup>15</sup> G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, Vol. 4, p. 207.

<sup>16</sup> G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, Vol. 4, p. 255.

<sup>17</sup> G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, Vol. 4, pp. 22, 277.

<sup>18</sup> G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, Vol. 4, p. 201.

<sup>19</sup> See C Hamann, *The leaders of Modern Architecture in Melbourne: Roy Grounds, Frederick Romberg*, Robin Boyd, Ph D thesis, Monash University, 1978.

<b>Name</b>	<i>Kirklands</i>	<b>Reference No</b>	
<b>Address</b>	89 Union Road, Surrey Hills	<b>Survey Date</b>	16 September 2005
<b>Building Type</b>	Residence	<b>Grading</b>	B
<b>Date</b>	1888-90	<b>Previous Grading</b>	B



#### Extent of Overlay

To the extent of the main body of the title. If the small section of land to the rear of No. 91 Union Road remains part of the title it would not be necessary to include it.

**Intactness** ☒ Good ☐ Fair ☐ Poor

**Heritage Status** ☐ HV ☐ AHC ☐ NT ☐ Rec. ☐ BPS Heritage Overlay

#### History

Though the ratebook evidence is not conclusive, Graeme Butler has suggested a date of construction of 1888-90 for this house, which was constructed for owner-occupier John Woodhead, resident of Camberwell from the c. early 1870s. As Butler notes, at the end of the 1870s, Woodhead had owned some 5.5 acres of land in this location; the land was subdivided in the late 1880s when this section of Union Road was developed.<sup>1</sup> No architect has to date been associated with the design of *Kirklands*.

*Kirklands* is shown on the c. 1909 MMBW Detail Plan No. 72. At this time it occupied a large site extending through from Union Road to Surrey Avenue (now The Avenue). A service drive extended from Union Road along the south side of the house providing access to the rear outbuildings and connecting through to The Avenue.

The original block has subsequently been subdivided forming new residential allotments to the rear onto The Avenue and to the north at No. 91 Union Road. Boundary adjustments were made between 2001 and 2004.<sup>2</sup>

Few major alterations appear to have been made to the house, although there are records for the construction and demolition of a number of outbuildings on the site.<sup>3</sup> The house was for a time used as three flats, though it appears to have been converted back into a single residence more recently.<sup>4</sup>

(G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, additional research by Lovell Chen, 2005)

#### Description & Integrity

*Kirklands* is sited on a ridge site with commanding city views. In common with many larger suburban houses in later nineteenth century Australia, it is in a two storey double-fronted Italianate mode with a

hipped slate roof, paired eave bracketing, canted bay, segmentally arched sash windows and a two-storey verandah with cast iron columns and lace. As Graeme Butler has noted previously, the eave brackets are interspersed with garlands, and the window drip moldings, heavily accentuated, are supported with pilasters on the ground floor and brackets on the first floor.<sup>5</sup> Door and window joinery appears to be original or early.

A large timber shed to the immediate south side may be the 'garage' noted as having been moved to the site from Maling Road Canterbury in 1938.<sup>6</sup> Building records indicate that four earlier outbuildings have been demolished: one in 1940, the other three in 1997. In 2004 excavations were made on the site in preparation for a tennis court, but these had no permit and were later ordered to be filled in.<sup>7</sup> Construction of a retaining wall was commenced in 2004 (not visible from the street). This may not have been completed, as it has no final certificate.<sup>8</sup>

Graeme Butler has suggested that that a row of cypresses along the south side of the property may relate to the earlier service drive in this location.<sup>9</sup> A later concrete driveway, with rubble stone retaining walls,<sup>10</sup> angles in off Union Road in a climbing curve and appears to be in the location of the original entry. While this appears disused, a front gate in the Cyclone wire fence which surrounds the site still allows access from Union Road. Apart from the two mature Norfolk Pines noted by Graeme Butler in 1991 and some older shrubs along Union Road, most of the garden plantings have been removed.

### Historical Context

As noted above, the southern section of Union Road (south of Canterbury Road) was subdivided at the end of the 1880s (refer above). The c.1909 MMBW Detail Plan no. 72 shows four villa residences in this block (*Montalto* and *Hillside* on the west side of the street and *Clifton* and *Kirklands* on the east).

### Comparative Analysis

In composition, type and generally in its detailing, *Kirklands* is typical of many two-storey Italianate houses appearing in Camberwell and other parts of Boroondara in the 1870s and 1880s. The general form and details are also similar to Italianate modes as found in other Melbourne suburbs - particularly Elwood - and in large areas of Sydney's nineteenth-century suburbs. *Kirklands* is a late example, and is relatively intact. The ornamentation is well-developed and quite conspicuous compared with other examples of Australian suburban Italianate. This, coupled with fairly generous and weighty proportions and horizontal emphasis, hints at an early warming to the attractions of 'American Romanesque'.<sup>11</sup>

### Assessment Against Criteria

*Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria*

*CRITERION D: The importance of a place or object in exhibiting the principal characteristics or the representative nature of a place or object as a part of a class or type of places or objects.*

In its overall form and siting, *Kirklands* is representative of the later nineteenth-century Victorian Italianate residence, of a type that spread through suburbs round south-eastern Australia. As viewed from the street, the house is relatively intact and does not appear to have undergone any major external alterations.

*CRITERION E: The importance of the place or object in exhibiting good design or aesthetic characteristics and/or in exhibiting a richness, diversity or unusual integration of features.*

*Kirklands* is distinguished from many other example of the suburban Italianate in Melbourne by the comparative richness of its detailing, specifically the

### Statement of Significance

*Kirklands* is of local historical and architectural significance as a representative and externally intact example of a two-storey stucco Victorian Italianate residence in a suburban setting. Such houses were constructed in numbers in Camberwell and other parts of Boroondara in the 1870s and 1880s. *Kirklands* is distinguished from other examples by its siting (on a rise), its generous scale, its intactness and the comparative richness of its detailing.

## Grading Review

Unchanged.

## Recommendations

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme.

## Identified By

G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

## References

*General:* G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

*Specific:*

<sup>1</sup> Graeme Butler's historical analysis is as follows (footnotes in parentheses): A house on 5.5 acres of land preceded the present one from as early as the 1870's, located on the opposing side of the Union Road (then non-existent south of Canterbury Road) (RB 1879-80, 274). By 1887 the owner, John Woodhead, had subdivided his holdings, into over 30 allotments, retaining 1.5 acres around his house and continuing Union Road southward through his subdivision (RB 1887-8, 1070). An increase in ratable value from £60 to £80 in 1888, £10 in 1889 and a further £5 in 1890 plus a change in description from 'house' to 'brick house', suggest a construction date of 1890 (RB 1890-1, 2332; RB 1886-7, 769; RB 1888-9, 1256; RB 1889-90, 2215; RB 1890-1, 2332). Later descriptions allot ten rooms to the house (RB 1898-9, 1955). Woodhead remained there until the first decade of this century; a Mrs Jeannie Woodhead followed (RB 1903-4, 2056; D1915). Woodhead was listed in Melbourne directories (1897-8) as a grocer, of Canterbury Road, Surrey Hills whilst rate entries consistently described him as a 'gentleman' (retired), from 1888-9, and before that a 'carrier'<sup>7</sup>. The Boroondara Shire voters' roll of 1877 describes Woodhead as a carrier, resident in Canterbury Road, and the shire plan of c1872 shows his house approximately located on Suffolk Street. The Melbourne Directory for 1870 places Woodhead in Richmond.

<sup>2</sup> See City of Boroondara Planning File 40/409/03227; permits BOR/01/00469, dated 22 November 2001; BPP02/00867, dated 31 March 2003. Chris Runting and Associates, Plan of Building Envelope, 1699BE7, dated 31 March 2003.

<sup>3</sup> City of Boroondara Planning File 40/409/03227 and Building File 40/408/04501, see also City of Camberwell Building Index entries.

<sup>4</sup> City of Camberwell Building File, 40/408/04501.

<sup>5</sup> G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, v. 4, p. 284.

<sup>6</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, # 10049, dated 21 July 1938. An earlier shed was removed soon after: #13780, dated 25 November 1940.

<sup>7</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, #13780, dated 25 November 1940; and notes on later permits and building orders: C97136 (demolition of three outbuildings), and building orders served to fill in excavations for a tennis court, 27 February 2004.

<sup>8</sup> See City of Boroondara Planning File 40/409/03227. Retaining wall: 1093/2004 00393/0, dated 21 June 2004. A final certificate was still not received at 11 November 2004.

<sup>9</sup> G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, v. 4, p. 284.

<sup>10</sup> These may be part of a 34 (121 ft) metre 'fence' referred to in the City of Camberwell Building Index, dated 10 May 1955.

<sup>11</sup> See Myra Orth, The influence of the "American Romanesque" in Australia', *Journal of the Society of Architectural Historians*, 32, 1, March 1975. Nahum Barnet and others were also producing designs in Queen Anne and other modes at this time which, while not in Richardson's distinctly free Romanesque, had all the weight and the specific scale of Richardson's designs. See Barnet's *Austral Buildings* in Collins Street, of 1891: described in Philip Goad, *Melbourne Architecture: a Guide*, Watermark, Sydney, 1999, p. 82.



---

<b>Name</b>	<i>Gooloowan</i>	<b>Reference No</b>	
<b>Address</b>	7 Victoria Avenue, Canterbury	<b>Survey Date</b>	21 June 2005
<b>Building Type</b>	Residence	<b>Grading</b>	B
<b>Date</b>	1891	<b>Previous Grading</b>	B



**Extent of Overlay**

To title boundaries.

---

**Intactness**    ☒ Good    ☐ Fair    ☐ Poor

**Heritage Status**    ☐ HV    ☐ AHC    ☐ NT    ☐ Rec.    BPS Heritage Overlay

**History**

S J Welsford, a merchant and general importer of British, Continental and American merchandise, owned the adjoining house to the south before constructing *Gooloowan* in 1891.<sup>1</sup>

Described in the ratebooks as an 11 room brick house, *Gooloowan* was occupied by Mrs Annie Green from 1892, suggesting that the house may have built by Welsford speculatively or specifically for Mrs. Green.<sup>2</sup> The house remained in the ownership of the Green family – subsequently Miss C. Green and then Miss Lucy M Green - until c. 1940, when it is thought to have been purchased by an H. Barker.

In the mid-twentieth century – as occurred with many other Victorian residences across Melbourne - *Gooloowan* was converted to residential flats. In 1940, owner H Barker requested Council permission to convert the house into two self-contained flats – a six room flat plus bath on first floor and a five room flat plus bath on the ground floor, to plans prepared by architect L J W Reed.<sup>3</sup> Permission to retain the outbuildings, which were in sound condition, was also requested and granted. Note that the property was described in Barker's letter as an apartment house, possibly suggesting that the Misses Green may have conducted the premises as an apartment or boarding house in previous years.

The entire property was acquired by Dr. A.W. Dempster in c.1966 and the flats designation subsequently disappeared, suggesting the property reverted to use as a single residence again from this time.

In 1976 Dr Dempster applied to have the southern portion of the property, which was occupied at the time by a swimming pool, subdivided off and a new residence was subsequently constructed on this new allotment (No. 5 Victoria Avenue).<sup>4</sup> The mature tree specimen (Moreton Bay Fig) in the garden of No. 5 would have been part of the garden to the subject site.

In 1981 a subsequent owner of *Gooloowan* applied to extend the house at the rear to include a family room and to construct an in-ground swimming pool, and a permit was subsequently also granted to construct a wine cellar in 1995.<sup>5</sup>

(G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991; additional research by Lovell Chen, 2005)

### Description & Integrity

*Gooloowan*, 7 Victoria Avenue, Canterbury, is a large two storey Italian Renaissance villa of brick construction. The hipped roof is clad with slate and is penetrated by rendered brick chimneys with moulded caps; it features bracketed eaves and a finely detailed pierced fascia. The asymmetrical façade is rendered and has a projecting double storey faceted bay flanked by a double storey arcaded verandah with cast iron columns. The verandah has a tessellated tile floor, bluestone steps and moulded archivolt, keystones and balustrade. The side elevations are brick, now overpainted. Windows contain timber-framed double-hung sashes and those in the façade have round arched heads and moulded architraves. The entrance contains a panelled timber door with stained glass fanlight and sidelights.

Overall, with the exception of the overpainting of the brickworks to the side elevations (and notwithstanding that alterations and additions may have been undertaken at the rear of the property), as viewed from Victoria Avenue, *Gooloowan* appears to be substantially intact.

The property is fronted by a non-original paling fence and a carport has been constructed on the northern side.

### Historical Context

The property boom of the 1880s saw a good deal of subdivision and residential development in Camberwell. This development included mansion houses (set in large grounds) and substantial two-storey villas such as *Gooloowan*, set on generous allotments, as well as more modest smaller single-storey brick villas.<sup>6</sup> The MMBW Detail Plan of c.1905 indicates a mix of residential types in the area around Mont Albert Road, including local landmarks such as the mansion 'Shrublands' and 'The Grange' alongside timber cottages and brick villas. Residences in Victoria Avenue appear to have been predominantly substantial brick residences of a similar scale to *Gooloowan*.

### Comparative Analysis

In its overall form and Italian Renaissance styling, *Gooloowan*, 7 Victoria Avenue, Canterbury, can be compared to numerous other large late Victorian residences in Camberwell, Hawthorn and Kew. While its design is not particularly unusual in this context, *Gooloowan* is a fine example of the type, featuring a distinctive two-storey arcaded verandah with cast-iron columns.<sup>7</sup> In considering comparisons in the former municipality of Camberwell, Butler suggests 89 Union Road (B), 19 Mangarra Road and 10 Trafalgar Road (B) as the typical, with 3 Fermanagh Road (B) as the atypical. Of these, the slightly earlier 3 Fermanagh Road (1887) is the more relevant example.

### Assessment Against Criteria

*Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria*

*Criterion D The importance of a place or object in exhibiting the principal characteristics or the representative nature of a place or object as a part of a class or type of places or objects.*

7 Victoria Avenue is a good and substantially intact example of a substantial two-storey brick Victorian villa residence.

*Criterion E The importance of the place or object in exhibiting good design or aesthetic characteristics and/or in exhibiting a richness, diversity or unusual integration of features.*

While there are numerous other examples in Boroondara of the Italian Renaissance style as applied to two-storey Victorian villa, 7 Victoria Avenue is an accomplished example which is of interest for its prominent and distinctive two-storey arcaded verandah, contrasted with a finely detailed and intact valance.



### **Statement of Significance**

*Gooloowan*, 7 Victoria Avenue, Canterbury, is of local historical and architectural significance as a fine and substantially intact example of a large Victorian villa residence, albeit sited now on a reduced allotment. Architecturally, it is of significance as an accomplished example of the Italianate Renaissance style, in this case featuring a prominent and distinctive double storey arcaded verandah, contrasted with a finely detailed and intact fascia.

### **Grading Review**

Unchanged.

### **Recommendations**

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme.

### **Identified By**

G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

### **References**

*General:* G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

*Specific:*

<sup>1</sup> Shire of Camberwell Rate Book, 1891-2, 295. .

<sup>2</sup> Shire of Camberwell Rate Book, 1891-2, 295, and 1898-9, 200.

<sup>3</sup> Correspondence held in the City of Camberwell Property File 1024/7, dated 30 September 1940. From 1942 the property was listed as flats.

<sup>4</sup> The Dempsters then moved to this address.

<sup>5</sup> Permit applications and approvals held in the City of Camberwell Property File 1024/7.

<sup>6</sup> G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, v. 2, pp. 17-18.

<sup>7</sup> G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991, v. 4, p. 290.

<b>Name</b>	<i>Tarawara/Tarawera</i>	<b>Reference No</b>	
<b>Address</b>	13 Victoria Avenue, Canterbury	<b>Survey Date</b>	16 November 2005
<b>Building Type</b>	Residence	<b>Grading</b>	B
<b>Date</b>	1890	<b>Previous Grading</b>	B



**Extent of Overlay**

To title boundaries.

**Intactness** ☒ Good ☐ Fair ☐ Poor

**Heritage Status** ☐ HV ☐ AHC ☐ NT ☐ Rec. BPS Heritage Overlay

**History**

Little is known of the origins of this house. Hudson Oldfield leased out the eight room brick house from its construction date in 1890, until it was acquired by James Paterson, who was variously described as a 'lamp maker' (James Paterson) or wine merchant (Julius James Paterson).<sup>1</sup> Rate records also list a Paterson, as an estate agent when he was listed as the first occupier after the house was built.<sup>2</sup> Graeme Butler has speculated that Paterson was Oldfield's agent and that he obtained the freehold, only to resell almost immediately to George A. Rowell.<sup>3</sup> Rowell leased the house to Henry Jenkins, an assayer, and Robert Hooke, an auctioneer early this century.<sup>4</sup>

(G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, amended by Lovell Chen, 2005)

**Description & Integrity**

A two-storey brick residence with multiple roof gables, a modest tower and elegant chimneys, *Tarawara*, at 13 Victoria Avenue, dates from the lead up to the Federation period in architecture. A somewhat eclectic composition, it shows some early characteristics of an emerging style, combined with elements of established Victorian design. Of note is its frontal composition in three episodes side by side, suggesting the French Chateau form popular in free style architectural imagery at that time, both in Australia and elsewhere. More distinct Federation elements include the tall windows with smaller paned upper sections, the large machined red brick construction and the varied chimney treatments. The polychrome, in the use of cream-brick voussoirs over each window and the striation in umber brick, is a high Victorian characteristic. The blank escutcheon on the stair tower is more a mid-Victorian Gothic touch. The roof is slate with galvanized iron ridge-capping, and the ground floor bay has a galvanized iron roof. The verandah faces east, and is on iron posts with composite capitals and a pinwheel squared lattice pattern in its frieze.

The north side has a narrow projecting laundry, bathroom and pantry area that appears to have been added.<sup>5</sup> Otherwise, the house appears to be broadly intact as viewed from the street. In 1978 a series of rear internal alterations and additions were undertaken.<sup>6</sup> The adjoining garage, added in 1985, continues the voussoir motif and brick colouration of the original house.<sup>7</sup> There are a range of other alterations and additions, but these are either internal or not visible from the street.<sup>8</sup> The high timber fence was added in 1982.<sup>9</sup> The garden is mature and provides a sympathetic setting.

### Historical Context

The property boom of the 1880s saw a good deal of subdivision and residential development in Camberwell. This development included mansion houses (set in large grounds) and substantial two-storey villas such as this one and others in the street, set on generous allotments, as well as more modest smaller single-storey brick villas.<sup>10</sup> The MMBW no. 71 Detail Plan of c.1905 (which identifies the subject house with the spelling *Tarawera*) indicates a mix of residential types in the area around Mont Albert Road, including local landmarks such as the mansion 'Shrublands' and 'The Grange' alongside timber cottages and brick villas. Residences in Victoria Avenue appear to have been predominantly substantial brick residences of a similar scale to *Tarawera* and its near neighbour, *Gooloowan* (7 Victoria Avenue, q.v., B-graded).

### Comparative Analysis

Butler notes a similar Chateau form in Ward and Carleton's renowned *St Hilda's*, Clarendon Street, East Melbourne, of 1907.<sup>11</sup> A closer Camberwell example (albeit single-storey) is *Malford* (23 Royal Crescent, 1901, B-graded) suggesting a *Chambord* chateau with its elongated chimneys, radial triple-gable and finials.<sup>12</sup> The chateau suggestion was common in American Free Romanesque usage, and there is a reference to that movement in the emphatic voussoir treatment over each window.<sup>13</sup> Though by no means the earliest or best example, the house is a good illustration of an early move toward Federation architecture and stands in contrast to the more static Victorian Italianate designs which were more typical of the period (see, for example, *Gooloowan*, 7 Victoria Avenue, also of 1890, q.v., B-graded).<sup>14</sup>

### Assessment Against Criteria

*Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria*

*CRITERION E: The importance of the place or object in exhibiting good design or aesthetic characteristics and/or in exhibiting a richness, diversity or unusual integration of features.*

*Tarawera* is an interesting proto-Federation house, quite early for its set of compositional elements and its direct expression of materials, and dating from before the Federation house had clearly emerged. The house also has indirect links to the free Romanesque architecture beginning to appear in Australian public buildings, and reflects the architectural eclecticism in some quarters of Melbourne suburban architecture at this time.

### Statement of Significance

*Tarawera*, 13 Victoria Avenue, Canterbury, is of local historical and architectural significance. A picturesque and somewhat eclectic composition, it is an interesting proto-Federation house, quite early for its set of compositional elements and its direct expression of materials, and dating from before the Federation house had clearly emerged. The house also has indirect links to the free Romanesque architecture beginning to appear in Australian public buildings, and reflects the architectural eclecticism in some quarters of Melbourne suburban architecture at this time. Other than for a narrow two-storey addition on the north side and a more recent brick garage, the building appears intact as it presents to the street.

### Grading Review

Unchanged.

### Recommendations

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme.

### Identified By

G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

## References

*General:* G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.I

*Specific:*

<sup>1</sup> Shire of Boroondara Rate Books, 1890-1, 3349; 1895-6, 211; 1896-7, 212.

<sup>2</sup> Shire of Boroondara Rate Books, 1890-1, 3349.

<sup>3</sup> Shire of Boroondara Rate Books, 1898-9, 198.

<sup>4</sup> Shire of Boroondara Rate Books, 1898-9, 198; 1899-1900, 174; 1903-4, 204.

<sup>5</sup> Being shown in an earlier photograph of the house with an earlier picket fence and then fairly overgrown garden, as up to about 1970-71, before the house was resold. Sourced from <http://boroondara.spydus.com/cgi-bin/spydus.exe/RECOP/OPAC?COMB/29141/1.3>. Accessed 23 November 2005. Unspecified additions were made in 1974; details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, #54800, dated 6 March 1974.

<sup>6</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, #63753, dated 15 September 1978, and working drawings in the Boroondara archive dated 27 July 1978.

<sup>7</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, #77403, dated 12 March 1985.

<sup>8</sup> Detail sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, #76596, 77107, dated 1 November 1984 and 10 January 1985 respectively (swimming pool); 76926, dated 7 December 1984 (a garden shed); 78936, dated 17 October 1985 (retaining wall). An application to subdivide the property into two lots was refused, 15 October 1990.

<sup>9</sup> Detail sourced from City of Camberwell Building Index, 71077, dated 30 April 1982.

<sup>10</sup> G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, v. 2, pp. 17-18.

<sup>11</sup> G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, v. 4, p. 291.

<sup>12</sup> G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, vol. 4, p. 253.

<sup>13</sup> As suggested by G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, vol. 4, p. 253.

<sup>14</sup> A small number of key architectural practices, including Reed and Barnes, Hyndman and Bates, and their successor offices took the proto-Federation two-storey house further in the middle 1880s, and in several Boroondara examples. See Philip Goad, George Tibbits, Miles Lewis, Julie Willis, *Bates Smart*, Thames and Hudson, Melbourne, 2004, esp. Lewis' Part 2, pp. 68-83 esp.

<b>Name</b>	House (formerly <i>Surrey College, Norton</i> )	<b>Reference No</b>	
<b>Address</b>	12 Vincent Street, Surrey Hills	<b>Survey Date</b>	16 September 2005
<b>Building Type</b>	Residence	<b>Grading</b>	B
<b>Date</b>	c.1892	<b>Previous Grading</b>	B



#### Extent of Overlay

To title boundaries.

**Intactness** ☒ Good ☐ Fair ☐ Poor

**Heritage Status** ☐ HV ☐ AHC ☐ NT ☐ Rec. ☐ BPS Heritage Overlay

#### History

The subject property formed allotment 15, sometimes referred to in rate entries as allotment 15A of the 'Railway Station Estate', Surrey Hills. Records for the Shire of Boroondara's 1890-91 rate cycle listed Rosalie Hanson as the owner of allotments 13-18, each approximately 71' x 132' all of which were vacant and accorded a nav (net annual value) of £12 each<sup>1</sup>. By the following year, the Reverend Frederick Darling was recorded as the owner of vacant allotments 15 and 16, the nav of each having decreased to £10. Reverend Darling, Presbyterian minister and school teacher resided nearby in a newly-built house in Kent Street, later Kent Road, Surrey Hills, upon allotment 56 of the 'Surrey Park Estate', a short distance from the subject property.<sup>2</sup> According to J Alex Allan's unpublished history of Camberwell, the Reverend Darling had served as minister to the nascent Surrey Hills congregation, and resigned from this post in 1892 to concentrate on the management of a college. He continued however, to conduct services at Canterbury in an honorary capacity.<sup>3</sup>

Records of the Shire's 1892-93 rate cycle recorded that the subject allotment was now occupied by a brick college, with a nav of £20. The adjoining allotment, allotment 16, remained vacant. Reverend Darling however is thought to have continued to occupy his residence in nearby Kent Road.<sup>4</sup> The college continued to be listed in the following year's rate books – described as a brick college in 1894-95 and 1895-96, with the rated value dropping to £16. The property was last listed as a college in records of the 1899-1900 rate cycle, and was subsequently described from this date onwards as a four-roomed brick building.<sup>5</sup> At this time in Kent Street, the Reverend Darling was in the process of acquiring neighboring allotments. This same year his Kent Street property was now described as a 17 room college, subsequently expanding to 22 rooms by the 1901-02 rate cycle and occupying allotments 56, 58, 23 and 26, to the corner of Kent Street and Union Roads.<sup>6</sup> Subsequently, it would be listed in the rate books as 'Surrey College'.<sup>7</sup>

Returning to the Vincent Street property, rate records indicate that it was extended in c. 1903, and now comprised six rooms. The Reverend Darling was still listed as its owner as well as of the vacant allotment next door.<sup>8</sup> In 1908-09, the property was recorded as being tenanted by Alfred James Jeffery, an engineer.<sup>9</sup> By this date other allotments in Vincent Street were being developed with primarily weatherboard buildings being constructed.<sup>10</sup>

By 1915, Reverend Darling had moved to Woolstonecraft in Sydney, where in time he would become the seventh director of the Presbyterian Church in New South Wales. At this time the subject property had been named *Norton*, was still occupied by Jeffery and four others and consisted of six rooms.<sup>11</sup> Darling retained ownership of the Vincent Street property until c.1921. Records from the 1919-20 rate cycle listed the building as now being tenanted by Joseph T Poynton, a rubber worker, and eight others. The adjoining allotment - allotment 16 - had been sold by this date and a weatherboard house had been constructed upon it.<sup>12</sup> By the 1921-22 rate cycle Joseph Poynton was listed as both the occupant and owner of the property.<sup>13</sup> Poynton occupied the property until the end of the 1920s. From 1930 until the late 1950s the property was occupied by the Barber family. Listings in the *Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria* between 1957 and 1961 recorded the occupant as 'not available', suggesting the property may have fallen into disrepair and remained vacant for several years. By 1962 it was occupied by J Toth, who remained in residence until at least 1974.<sup>14</sup>

(G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, amended by Lovell Chen, 2005)

### Description & Integrity

12 Vincent Street, of c. 1892, was originally a small school. It is not clear whether it combined a residential function as well.

Graeme Butler has noted that the building is described as having an iron roof; if this was accurate, this roof is now covered in slate, with galvanized iron ridge-capping. The original windows, visible from the street, had pointed arches and colored upper panes; these have had new sashes added to them and the two front west windows have been extended down to the floor-line more recently. The verandah, with its Japanese patterned frieze, looks stylistically different and may have been added in 1902; along with, perhaps, the gable trussing and window frames.<sup>15</sup> The massive and vertically planked front door is understood to have replaced the original.<sup>16</sup>

The walls are in simply polychromed, plain-coursed brick in the 'new style' of the early 1890s, closer to contemporary Gothic Revival usage than the increasingly fanciful patterning common in most contemporary houses. Graeme Butler has suggested that the Gothic details worked to mark out the school room area from the rest of the house.<sup>17</sup> The arches are marked out with polychrome at their stress points, and on the verandah wall the umber brick line is turned on its head.

The MMBW Detail Plan no. 72 (c. 1909) shows that in 1909 it was one of only four houses in Vincent Street.<sup>18</sup> Its present site boundaries were established, and it had a small outbuilding.<sup>19</sup> This may have been incorporated into the present 'bungalow' arrangement toward the rear of the site, adjacent to a more recent carport. The dormer above the verandah is a later addition (1999),<sup>20</sup> and the internal plan has been changed.

The front fence was added around the time of the dormer and internal alterations, and the driveway was repaved in brick.

### Historical Context

As noted above, by 1909 only limited development had occurred in Vincent Street, with four residences shown. It is interesting to note that this area of Surrey Hills is said to have had a fair number of private hospitals and small institutional buildings scattered through its streets.<sup>21</sup>

### Comparative Analysis

It is difficult to identify direct comparisons for this building, as a purpose-built schoolroom in the Gothic style. Graeme Butler has observed that this building is distinctive in being a small school of just one or two dedicated rooms rather than the much larger type of school being more generally built at the time.<sup>22</sup> The institutional use of the building is well marked in the wall treatments, and the house has a serious yet endearing demeanour, unusual in domestic-scaled renderings of the Gothic.

As noted by Butler, the deliberate accentuation of Gothic arches marks out No. 12's identity as a public building,<sup>23</sup> presumably with church connections.

### **Assessment Against Criteria**

#### *Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria*

*CRITERION A: The historical importance, association with or relationship to Boroondara's history of the place or object.*

The house is of historical significance as an unusual example in Boroondara of a diminutive schoolhouse possibly also with a residential function, and for its association with the Rev. Frederick Darling, later a director of the New South Wales Presbyterian Church and minister at its socially important St Stephens' Sydney.<sup>24</sup>

*CRITERION E: The importance of the place or object in exhibiting good design or aesthetic characteristics and/or in exhibiting a richness, diversity or unusual integration of features.*

The building is of interest for its combination of Gothic form and detailing with the distinctive Japanese inspired timber verandah and timber gable trussing and window (albeit the latter elements possibly early alterations).

*CRITERION G: The importance of the place or object in demonstrating social or cultural associations*

The house is distinctive as a 'public building' constructed at residential scale; its original use as a schoolhouse, possibly combined with a residential function, is well-expressed in its external detailing and representation of Gothic form.

### **Statement of Significance**

12 Vincent Street, Surrey Hills is of local historical and architectural significance. The house is of historical significance as an unusual example in Boroondara of a diminutive schoolhouse, and for its association with the Rev. Frederick Darling, later a director of the New South Wales Presbyterian Church and minister at its socially important St Stephens' Sydney.<sup>25</sup> It is of architectural significance as a 'public building' constructed at residential scale; its original use as a schoolhouse, possibly combined with a residential function, is well-expressed in its external detailing and representation of Gothic form. The building is also of interest for its combination of Gothic form and detailing with the distinctive Japanese inspired timber verandah and timber gable trussing and window frames (albeit the latter elements possibly early alterations).

### **Grading Review**

Unchanged.

### **Recommendations**

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme.

### **Identified By**

G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

### **References**

*General:* G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

*Specific:*

<sup>1</sup> Shire of Boroondara Rate Books, 1890-91, #3665-3666, nav £12 each.

<sup>2</sup> Shire of Boroondara Rate Books, 1891-92, #720-21, vacant land, nav £10 each; #1711, house and land, Kent Road, nav £40.

<sup>3</sup> Allan, J Alex, *The History of Camberwell (Victoria): 1841-1950*, unpublished typescript, 1954, p. 188.

<sup>4</sup> Shire of Boroondara Rate Books, 1892-93, #1685, College, lot 15a, nav £20; #1686, land, lot 16, nav £7; #1291, brick house, allotment 56, nav £35.

<sup>5</sup> Shire of Boroondara Rate Books, 1899-1900, #753, college, 4 rooms brick, lot 15a, nav £16; 1900-01, #782, 4 rooms brick, lot 15a, nav £16; #783, land, lot 16, nav £4.

---

<sup>6</sup> Shire of Boroondara Rate Books, 1901-02, #1066, 22 rooms brick, lots 56, 58, 23, 26, nav £141.

<sup>7</sup> Shire of Boroondara Rate Books, 1902-03, #1124, 'Surrey College', 22 rooms brick, nav £141.

<sup>8</sup> Shire of Boroondara Rate Books, 1903-04, #1628, 6 rooms, brick, lot 15a, nav £22.

<sup>9</sup> Borough of Camberwell Rate Books, 1908-09, #1838, 6 rooms, brick, lot 15a, Alfred James Jeffery, rated person, Reverend F Darling, owner, nav £22.

<sup>10</sup> The MMBW survey plan, no. 72, scale 160':1", dated 1909 showed four other houses in Vincent Street, with 'Col Col' on the same side of the street as the subject property, to its north. All the houses are shaded on the plan as being of weatherboard construction, including, mistakenly the subject property.

<sup>11</sup> Borough of Camberwell Rate Books, 1914-15, #1498; Allan, J Alex, *The History of Camberwell (Victoria): 1841-1950*, unpublished typescript, 1954, p.188.

<sup>12</sup> Borough of Camberwell Rate Books, 1919-20, #1691, 6 rooms, brick, lot 15a, Joseph Poynton, rated person, Reverend F Darling, owner, nav £30.

<sup>13</sup> City of Camberwell Rate Books, 1921-22, #1750, 6 rooms, brick.

<sup>14</sup> Pattern of occupation derived from listings in the *Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria*, various years, between 1926 and 1974.

<sup>15</sup> G Butler, City of Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, vol. 4, pp. 295-6.

<sup>16</sup> Information provided by current owner, April 2007.

<sup>17</sup> G Butler, City of Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, vol. 4, pp. 295-6.

<sup>18</sup> Note that this plan shows the building as of timber construction, a curious anomaly.

<sup>19</sup> MMBW Plan No. 72, (Surrey Hills), scale 160'-1", dated 1909.

<sup>20</sup> City of Boroondara Building File # 40/408/17212.

<sup>21</sup> Conversation with Henry Jamieson, local retailer and resident since the mid-1930s, 2002.

<sup>22</sup> G Butler, City of Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, vol. 4, pp. 295-6.

<sup>23</sup> G Butler, City of Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, vol. 4, pp. 295-6.

<sup>24</sup> G Butler, City of Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, vol. 4, pp. 295-6.

<sup>25</sup> G Butler, City of Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, vol. 4, pp. 295-6.



<b>Name</b>	<i>Guildford (Montserrat)</i>	<b>Reference No</b>	
<b>Address</b>	26A Wandsworth Road, Surrey Hills	<b>Survey Date</b>	16 September 2005; access 13 December 2005
<b>Building Type</b>	Residence	<b>Grading</b>	B
<b>Date</b>	1889	<b>Previous Grading</b>	B



#### Extent of Overlay

To title boundaries.

**Intactness** ☒ Good ☐ Fair ☐ Poor

**Heritage Status** ☐ HV ☐ AHC ☒ NT ☐ Rec. ☐ BPS Heritage Overlay

#### History

George Jobbins, architect and surveyor, designed this large brick house for his own use in 1888, being listed in residence by 1889, on six allotments of the surrounding subdivision.<sup>1</sup> By 1893, Jobbins had vacated the house, leasing it to Charles M. Robertson.<sup>2</sup> A variety of occupiers followed in the early 1900s, including William Holmes (Chief Electrical Engineer of the Victorian Railways<sup>3</sup>), A.D. Groome, Angus McNaughton and Edward Tuck.<sup>4</sup> Ernest Whitworth was there in the 1920s and Mrs Ellen Wilson in the 1930s.<sup>5</sup>

Jobbins practised from an office in Collins Street and later, Elizabeth Street designing such buildings as the Lonsdale Stores (Lonsdale Street) which was claimed as the first all wrought-iron framed building in Australia (demolished). He was also the favoured architect of the Colonial Bank, designing some 22 branches throughout Victoria (e.g. Kilmore, Northcote and Newmarket).

Phillip Parer, of the noted catering and hotelier family called the house *Montserrat* during this family's tenure (c1906-23).<sup>6</sup> The Surrey Hills area was reputedly the home of other similarly well-known Spanish immigrants; the Parer family being amongst the most well-known.<sup>7</sup>

The house faced south to Mont Albert Road originally,<sup>8</sup> however that frontage was excised by a subdivision during the c.1920s, giving the house a Wandsworth Road address. No. 26 Wandsworth Road to the west was a bungalow already completed (now demolished).<sup>9</sup>

A number of alterations and additions have been made to the house in the twentieth century; these are detailed below under Description and Integrity.

(G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, amended by Lovell Chen, 2005)

### Description & Integrity

26A Wandsworth Avenue is a single-storey brick residence in an Italianate style with a slate roof ridged in galvanised iron, supported on paired brackets. The roof and its bay tops are almost entirely hipped, save for one small gable-hip facing south. The chimneys have umber brick stacks with heavy stuccoed coping in sandstone and unusually prominent pitched or pyramidal tops to their main stacks. The walls are in an umber Hawthorn brick. The walls are striped with thick stuccoed course lines which spread into heavy quoin arrays, in sandstone according to Graeme Butler's 1991 survey,<sup>10</sup> around each window. The windows are in turn framed by pilasters, creating a quasi-aedicule around each. A return verandah is on the east and south sides,<sup>11</sup> originally facing Mont Albert Road, now facing corners of the garden. A smaller verandah, also with cast iron lace, is on the west side screening the bathroom. The main verandah has a roll-topped awning in galvanised iron with a frieze and columns in cast iron, and is framed by two wings projecting to the east and south. These wings are each terminated with a smaller bay, each with three pilasters bracketed out from the base. The cast iron verandah columns are paired, each pair being linked by an unusual miniature balustrade, left open between each column pair. The entrance was originally from the east side of the main verandah.

The house originally had a large courtyard, 15.5 m X 6m, facing Wandsworth Road, which was roofed over and enclosed from an early date,<sup>12</sup> with this space being described by later owners, the Nesbitts, as a ballroom or dance area.<sup>13</sup> A 'minstrel gallery' was included in the space, which was enclosed at its northern end by a wall (enclosed porch arrangement) facing north to Wandsworth Road and incorporating two distinctive windows. This was subsequently substantially replaced in works undertaken in the late 1980s by architects Bates Smart McCutcheon. The windows themselves have been reused elsewhere on the site (on the garage).

Minor alterations occurred in 1943-44, and a garage was added in 1954. A carport, presumably alongside, was ordered removed in 1957. A new laundry and toilet were added in 1957, and a verandah 'rebuilt' (perhaps repaired?) in 1964.<sup>14</sup>

In 1988 new owners began a range of alterations and conservation-related works to designs by architects Bates Smart McCutcheon.<sup>15</sup> As noted above, the non-original lightweight wall at the north end of the ballroom was substantially replaced and a new window with leadlit glass introduced. The iron roof to the ballroom was replaced with grey Colorbond and sections of the earlier slate roof were repaired.<sup>16</sup>

### Historical Context

The 1909 MMBW Detail Plan no. 72 shows a series of houses facing Mont Albert Road (ie: facing away from Wandsworth Avenue, with a cluster of smaller timber residences in the block bounded by Chertsey and Weybridge Streets and Wandsworth Avenue. Further development occurred in the late Edwardian and interwar periods, with numerous bungalows constructed in the area.

### Comparative Analysis

*Guildford* is comparable in terms of scale to other substantial Camberwell houses such as 25 and 36 Alma Road, and *Hazeldene*, 8 Balwyn Road, q.v. (all B-graded), all completed in the same year; *Ericstane*, 136 Canterbury Road, of 1893 or the later *Malford* in Royal Crescent, of 1901.<sup>17</sup> In its planning in particular, it has affinities with 25 Alma Road, in having a large enclosed area to the rear. In general composition and profile *Guildford* typified the last stages of Victorian Italianate, but as Butler observes, it has a richness in ornament<sup>18</sup> that sets it apart from contemporaries. This is seen, particularly, in the pilaster formations of the bay windows; these have a Grecian cast to them that hints at the pervasive legacy of Alexander ('The Greek') Thompson and resembles the classicized rationalism and crisply incised detailing in central Adelaide houses of the period.<sup>19</sup> Though now on a subdivided block, in garden size, too, it resembles 25 Alma Road, and as there, the trees are of long standing. The house has a complex history of subdivision and alterations, but the general direction of the recent alterations has been to return the house much closer to its original form.

### Assessment Against Criteria

*Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria*

*CRITERION A: The historical importance, association with or relationship to Boroondara's history of the place or object.*

The association of the house with the Parer family is of historical interest but is not considered to elevate the significance of the house.

The house is considered to be of limited historical significance for its association with its designer and original owner-occupier, the architect George Jobbins.

*CRITERION D: The importance of a place or object in exhibiting the principal characteristics or the representative nature of a place or object as a part of a class or type of places or objects.*

*Guildford* is broadly typical of a number of large single-storey Italianate designs of the later boom period within Boroondara generally, and Camberwell in particular. Though now on a reduced allotment and addressing a different street frontage, it retains a generous garden setting. The house is relatively intact, other than for alterations of long-standing relating to the enclosure of the courtyard and the creation of a new entry on the north side of the house following subdivision of the original frontage to Mont Albert Road.

*CRITERION E: The importance of the place or object in exhibiting good design or aesthetic characteristics and/or in exhibiting a richness, diversity or unusual integration of features.*

The house is generally richly detailed; of particular interest is the classicising detail around the windows, which is unusual among large single storey Italianate houses of this period.

### **Statement of Significance**

26A Wandsworth Avenue is of local historical and architectural significance. Designed in 1889 by the architect George Jobbins as his own residence, the house is a representative and relatively intact example of a large single-storey Italianate designs of the later boom period, featuring distinctive and rich detailing. Though now on a reduced allotment and addressing a different street frontage, it also retains a generous garden setting. The house is relatively intact, other than for alterations of long-standing relating to the enclosure of the courtyard and the creation of a new entry on the north side of the house following subdivision of the original frontage to Mont Albert Road.

### **Grading Review**

Unchanged.

### **Recommendations**

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme.

### **Identified By**

G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

### **References**

*General:* G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

*Specific:*

<sup>1</sup> Shire of Boroondara Rate Book, 1889-90, 1032; *Sands & McDougall Melbourne Directory*, 1888.

<sup>2</sup> Shire of Boroondara Rate Book, 1894-5, 1335.

<sup>3</sup> P. Nicholls (owner), letter 21.1.90.

<sup>4</sup> *Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria* 1901; 1903; 1905; 1906.

<sup>5</sup> *Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria* 1925; 1935.

<sup>6</sup> See The Knoll, 50 Wandsworth Rd, q.v.

<sup>7</sup> *Who's Who in Australia*, 1950.

<sup>8</sup> MMBW Detail Plan No. 72, 1909. The house is labelled on this plan as '*Guildford*'.

<sup>9</sup> No. 26 was demolished in 1987 and the site redeveloped for a single residence. The house was owned by the Nesbitt family in the c. 1970s and 1980s and was visited at this time by Conrad Hamann of Lovell Chen. *Guildford* was then referred to as 'Nesbitt's' after the owners of the day.

<sup>10</sup> G Butler, City of Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, vol. 4, p. 299.

<sup>11</sup> Description based in part on drawings on file. Drawings prepared by Bates Smart McCutcheon, 1988, sourced from City of Camberwell Building File 2043:26A.

<sup>12</sup> The space is shown as roofed on the MMBW Detail Plan No. 72 of 1909.

<sup>13</sup> The house was owned by the Nesbitt family in the c. 1970s and 1980s and was visited at this time by Conrad Hamann of Lovell Chen. *Guildford* was then referred to as 'Nesbitt's' after the owners of the day.

<sup>14</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, # 15959, dated 25 November 1943 (unspecified alterations); # 13601, dated 17 February 1954 (garage), # 19836, dated 21 January 1957 (removal of carport). See also Building inspectors' reports, 28 February 1944 ('1 room addition') 8 April, 29 October 1954 (garage); 10 January 1956, 15 May 1957 (laundry and toilet), City of Camberwell Building File 2043: 26A.

<sup>15</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index: HC Order, no date; and #87077, dated 14 December 1988, and #87368, 6 February 1989.

<sup>16</sup> Bates, Smart and McCutcheon, working drawings of alterations,, TK del., dated September 1988. Drawings sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, #87077, dated 14 December 1988; #87368, dated 6 February 1989. Additional information provided by the owners, April 2007.

<sup>17</sup> G Butler, City of Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991, vol. 4, p. 10 (25 Alma Rd); p. 13 (36 Alma Rd); p. 15 (8 Balwyn Rd); p. 7 (136 Canterbury Rd); p. 253 (23 Royal Cresc).

<sup>18</sup> G Butler, City of Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, vol. 4, p. 299.

<sup>19</sup> Thomson, CR Cockerell and Charles Barry had a pronounced influence on crucial Australian architects, such as James Barnet in NSW and Joseph Reed in Victoria. See, in particular, George Tibbitts, 'The Classical Tradition in Victoria: represented structure and Style', in David Saunders, ed., *Architectural Papers 1977*, Art Association of Australia, Sydney, 1978, and Chris Johnson and Peter Kohane, *James Barnet*, Pesaro, Sydney, 2001. Germany was another source, reflected primarily in JAB Koch's Melbourne buildings of the time. See Peter Kohane, 'Classicism Transformed', *Transition*, 1983.

<b>Name</b>	<i>The Knoll</i>	<b>Reference No</b>	
<b>Address</b>	50 Wandsworth Road, Surrey Hills	<b>Survey Date</b>	20 September 2005
<b>Building Type</b>	Residence	<b>Grading</b>	B
<b>Date</b>	1888-9	<b>Previous Grading</b>	B



#### Extent of Overlay

To title boundaries.

<b>Intactness</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Poor
<b>Heritage Status</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> HV	<input type="checkbox"/> AHC	<input type="checkbox"/> NT
	<input type="checkbox"/> Rec.	BPS Heritage Overlay	

#### History

Constructed in 1888 for Augustus and Peter Barbeta, it was afterwards leased to Ms J.W. Galbraith.<sup>1</sup> Captain Joseph Bradshaw a pastoralist occupied and owned the house by 1909 until a solicitor, Thomas Henderson acquired it in 1915, remaining there until his death.<sup>2</sup>

Augustus Barbeta with the Parer family was the licensee of Hosies Hotel, Melbourne whilst Peter was the manager of the Havana, Manila and New York Cigar Co. Ltd., situated beside the hotel in Elizabeth Street. Another A. Barbeta ran Turkish baths in Bourke Street. There were a number of Spanish families living in this area of Surrey Hills, including the Parer family, who had *Guilford* (q.v. 26A Wandsworth Road, B-graded).

After 1891, the house was leased to D.C. Archer, a customs agent.<sup>3</sup> After 1896, Archer was gone and the bank had foreclosed.<sup>4</sup> Later residents included the Bradshaw and Henderson families, both associated with the Presbyterian church in Surrey Hills.

(G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, amended by Lovell Chen, 2005)

#### Description & Integrity

*The Knoll*, of 1888-9, had its original frontage to Union Road, though its main orientation was actually toward Mont Albert Road and the view of Surrey Hills and the Dandenong Ranges. *The Knoll*, as its name suggests, was sited on a low ridge that even now still allows views over the roofs of its neighbours around the Union Road- Mont Albert Road corner. Following the subdivision of the eastern section of its original allotment, the house is accessed from Wandsworth Road, with the current front elevation originally a side elevation.

The MMBW Detail Plan No. 72 of 1909 shows the extent of the original site, including three outbuildings of which one at the north-west still appears to be there.<sup>5</sup>

50 Wandsworth Road is a single-storey double-fronted rendered brick house with hipped roof clad in slate with galvanized iron ridge capping and rendered chimneys. The projecting north wing has a canted bay with three arch-headed sash windows. A return verandah with cast iron columns and lace frieze extends along the east and south sides below a concave spirelet and a second canted bay projects to the south. The original entry was from the south. The building was unpainted in 1991, but has subsequently been overpainted in an apricot-buff. The original mouldings, an impost on the north elevation, bracketing on the chimneys, remain.

A weatherboard outhouse by the car court is of uncertain age.<sup>6</sup> The garden appears mature on its south side, however the metal picket fence, hedge, massive bluestone gateposts, gates and garden on the near north side are all of recent origins, being completed between 1975 and 1988.<sup>7</sup>

### Historical Context

The 1909 MMBW Detail Plan no. 72 shows a series of houses facing Mont Albert Road (ie: facing away from Wandsworth Avenue, with a cluster of smaller timber residences in the block bounded by Chertsey and Weybridge Streets and Wandsworth Avenue. Further development occurred in the late Edwardian and interwar periods, with numerous bungalows constructed in the surrounding area.

### Comparative Analysis

*The Knoll* is a substantial single storey stuccoed Italianate house related to several in the area, such as *Hazeldene* at 8 Balwyn Road Canterbury (q.v., B-graded)<sup>8</sup>. In composition it leans toward the characteristic type of the Federation period, having a return verandah which wraps round a corner bay with a conical tower immediately above it. In other respects it is characteristic of the later nineteenth century suburban Italianate.

### Assessment Against Criteria

*Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria*

*CRITERION A: The historical importance, association with or relationship to Boroondara's history of the place or object.*

The association of 50 Wandsworth Road with the Barbeta family is of historical interest but is not considered to elevate the significance of the house.

*CRITERION D: The importance of a place or object in exhibiting the principal characteristics or the representative nature of a place or object as a part of a class or type of places or objects.*

*The Knoll* is a relatively intact example of later nineteenth century suburban Italianate style in a substantial-sized Camberwell house. Though it has lost its original frontages to Union Road and Mont Albert Road, the diagonal address of the house to its garden is still evident.

*CRITERION E: The importance of the place or object in exhibiting good design or aesthetic characteristics and/or in exhibiting a richness, diversity or unusual integration of features.*

*The Knoll* is a good example of later Italianate design on the eve of the Federation period, and shows some proto-Federation characteristics in the elaboration of its corner bay into a conical roof.

### Statement of Significance

*The Knoll*, at 50 Wandsworth Road, Surrey Hills, is of local historical and architectural significance as a relatively intact example of later nineteenth century suburban Italianate style in a substantial Camberwell house. Though it has lost its original frontage and is now sited on a truncated allotment, the diagonal address of the house to its garden is still evident. *The Knoll* is a good example of later Italianate design on the eve of the Federation period, and shows some proto-Federation characteristics in the elaboration of its corner bay into a conical roof.

### Grading Review

Unchanged.

## **Recommendations**

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme.

## **Identified By**

G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

## **References**

*General:* G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

*Specific:*

<sup>1</sup> Shire of Boroondara Rate Book, 1887-8, 1184; Shire of Boroondara and Camberwell, 1904-5, 1157; *Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria*, 1906.

<sup>2</sup> Town of Camberwell Rate Book, 1911-12, 1337.

<sup>3</sup> Shire of Boroondara Rate Books, 1891-2, 1605; 1894-5, 1350.

<sup>4</sup> Shire of Boroondara Rate Book, 1896-7, 1181.

<sup>5</sup> MMBW Plan No. 72, dated 1909.

<sup>6</sup> It does not appear on the 1909 MMBW Plan No. 72.

<sup>7</sup> Details sourced from City of Camberwell Building Index, # 58316, dated 22 December 1975 (house extensions); 58726, dated 19 March 1976, (swimming pool); and 23 November 1988 9 ('Alts.-owner'). This last appears to refer to the fence and gate alterations.

<sup>8</sup> G Butler, City of Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, vol.4, p. 15.



<b>Name</b>	House	<b>Reference No</b>	
<b>Address</b>	294 Warrigal Road, Burwood	<b>Survey Date</b>	19 September 2005
<b>Building Type</b>	Residence	<b>Grading</b>	B
<b>Date</b>	1927	<b>Previous Grading</b>	B



#### Extent of Overlay

To title boundaries.

**Intactness** ☒ Good ☐ Fair ☐ Poor

**Heritage Status** ☐ HV ☐ AHC ☐ NT ☐ Rec. ☐ BPS Heritage Overlay

#### History

George Brown commissioned builder, W.L. Payne, to construct a brick and timber dwelling on this site in 1927.<sup>1</sup> The residence consisted of nine rooms and was estimated to cost £1,800.<sup>2</sup> A billiard room was added to the residence in 1930 at an estimated cost of £450.<sup>3</sup> George Brown occupied the property until after 1930.<sup>4</sup> Dr Wilfred Edward Fleming had become the owner-occupier by 1940. During the 1960s and 1970s Dr Fleming had a dental surgery at 420 Toorak Road, Burwood.<sup>5</sup>

Since its construction, minor alterations and additions have been made to the house and the block has been subdivided (refer Description and Integrity).

(G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, additional research by Lovell Chen, 2005)

#### Description & Integrity

294 Warrigal Road is a two-story house in red brick with a terracotta tiled roof in a Marseilles pattern, and half-timber finished upper gables, all with prominent fascias. The front is dominated by a porch with an upstairs balcony above it, lined with stuccoed walling and a set of projecting piers. The windows are robustly scaled box-frames, set into the generally plain brick walling. The two bays facing Warrigal Road have four panes each. The house originally had a prominently inscribed name, traces of which can be seen in the balcony stucco. A detached billiard room was added in 1930 and was designed to match the house.<sup>6</sup> Additional windows have been added at the rear since. A courtyard with pergola and covered area was developed in 1994.<sup>7</sup>

The garden is mature and complements the house style. The fence is glazed brick, probably dating from the 1930s or 1940s. The block was originally more substantial, but has been subdivided, possibly in c. 1960, with an L-shape section being split off and developed for two linked double-storey



blocks of flats. The present cream brick garage sits in front of the 1930 billiard room and is a later design, and appears to date from 1952.<sup>8</sup>

### Historical Context

Warrigal Road's west side was Melbourne's pre-war suburban boundary, for about 20 years after this house was built. The road was originally called Boundary Road.

### Comparative Analysis

294 Warrigal Road is an attic version of the generally accepted bungalow mode of the time, with a second floor level accommodated in an attic within large gables. The house was designed relatively late in the bungalow period and this is reflected in the relative heaviness of the elevations. The centralized frontal composition, combined with a prominent balcony over the front porch, follows practice elsewhere in Boroondara and Whitehorse, where 'bungalow' fronts were occasionally symmetrical and dominated by a large central element, usually a dormer. Examples include 931 Toorak Road, Camberwell (q.v., B-graded), of 1925 and 16 Alma Road, Camberwell, of 1923-4 (C-graded).<sup>9</sup> The curved and offset corner bay recalls a well-known Melbourne composition of the time, seen in a 1919 house in Camberwell by Robert Haddon.<sup>10</sup> A nearby predecessor, 55 Bath Road of 1925, is arguably a more daring and interesting design, with an original fence and mature garden (albeit C-graded).<sup>11</sup> The lookout balcony is dramatized, possibly an oblique reference to the siting of the house overlooking Warrigal Road, at the time considered to mark the edge of inter-war suburban Melbourne.<sup>12</sup>

### Assessment Against Criteria

*Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria*

*CRITERION D: The importance of a place or object in exhibiting the principal characteristics or the representative nature of a place or object as a part of a class or type of places or objects.*

294 Warrigal Road is a fine, representative and intact example of an attic-style bungalow. Dating from relatively late in the bungalow period, its design reflects the solidity characteristic of suburban houses at this time. The massive front entry porch with terrace above adds interest and some distinction to the design. Despite the subdivision and development of the rear of the block and the addition of a later brick garage, the building retains a sympathetic garden setting to Warrigal Road.

### Statement of Significance

294 Warrigal Road is of local historical and architectural significance as a fine, representative and intact example of an attic-style bungalow. Dating from relatively late in the bungalow period, its design reflects the solidity characteristic of suburban houses at this time. The massive front entry porch with terrace above adds interest and some distinction to the design. Despite the subdivision and development of the rear of the block and the addition of a later brick garage, the building retains a sympathetic garden setting to Warrigal Road.

### Grading Review

Unchanged.

### Recommendations

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme.

### Identified By

G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

### References

*General:* G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

*Specific:*

<sup>1</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, # 1523, dated 21 May 1927.

<sup>2</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, # 1523, dated 21 May 1927.

<sup>3</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, # 1523, dated 21 May 1927.

<sup>4</sup> Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria, 1930.

<sup>5</sup> Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria 1962; 1974.

<sup>6</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, #1664, dated 6 May 1930 and referred to as 'billiard room'.

<sup>7</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, #99698, dated 5 May 1994, and working drawings of that date held in Boroondara archives.

<sup>8</sup> Detail sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, #9462, dated 11 March 1952. The current owner believes the flats were constructed in c.1960. Discussion with the owner, 19 September 2005.

<sup>9</sup> See G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, vol. 4, pp. 9 (16 Alma Road) and 276 (931 Toorak Road).

<sup>10</sup> This was illustrated in the *Australasian Real Property Annual*, later *Australian Home Beautiful*, in their 1919 issue.

<sup>11</sup> G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, vol. 4, pp. 26-7.

<sup>12</sup> Warrigal Road was in fact called Boundary Road when the house was first built. See City of Camberwell Building Index, #1523, dated 21 May 1927 (initial construction).

<b>Name</b>	House	<b>Reference No</b>	
<b>Address</b>	452 Warrigal Road, Ashburton	<b>Survey Date</b>	20 September 2005
<b>Building Type</b>	Residence	<b>Grading</b>	B
<b>Date</b>	1932	<b>Previous Grading</b>	B



#### Extent of Overlay

To title boundaries.

Note that this would include the rear section of the block, now developed for a detached dwelling.

In the event a subdivision has been effected, only the front section of the block need be included.

**Intactness** ☒ Good ☐ Fair ☐ Poor

**Heritage Status** ☐ HV ☐ AHC ☐ NT ☐ Rec. ☐ BPS Heritage Overlay

#### History

The architect, P.J. O'Connor, was the designer and first owner of this seven room stuccoed brick house when it was constructed in 1930-2.<sup>1</sup> A later long-term owner-occupier was Harold J. Coy.<sup>2</sup>

O'Connor was a devotee of the Spanish Mission style, particularly as applied to Catholic churches. His best known works are the Catholic churches at 305 Wendouree Pde, Ballarat (1938) and Our Lady of Lourdes, Werrimull (near Mildura, 1933). His practice continued as O'Connor & Brophy with works such as Our Lady Star of the Sea at HMAS Cerberus, Hastings (1948).<sup>3</sup>

Few major alterations appear to have been made to the building. Approval was sought for a new fence and pergola in 1994.<sup>4</sup>

(G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, amended by Lovell Chen, 2005)

#### Description & Integrity

452 Warrigal Road Ashburton has a hipped roofed double-front facing Warrigal Road, augmented by a pyramidal-roofed tower over the front entrance. The rear elevation breaks up into a more casual array of parallel wings including a large laundry and toolshed wing, and at the rear of the site a galvanized iron shed appears of fairly long standing. Apart from the tower, the front-facing roofs are hipped with cement tiles in a Marseilles pattern. The north-eastern front has a stuccoed wall-screen with three arches, possibly an open loggia originally. The tower has an arched entry and two flanking spiral colonnettes, giving a note of ornamental flourish, albeit a frugal one. A small grilled window punctuates the tower higher up. The rear wings have straight pitches running to shallow gables.

A high front fence of cement-rendered piers and red brick panelling has been built to screen the Warrigal Road frontage in recent years (replacing the original fence noted in the 1991 Camberwell Conservation Study).

A free standing two-storey red brick house of unusual design is under construction on the south side of the property, with access to this building from Lancaster Street through a double garage.

### Historical Context

No. 452 would have been a major element in the pre-WWII Warrigal Road streetscape, with no houses immediately opposite or to either side, and the contemporary Gardiner Creek Bridge as the nearest major design undertaking. Lancaster Street to the immediate south came later, part of a Housing Commission subdivision where the streets were all named after major campaigns or aircraft of World War II.

### Comparative Analysis

Considered in the context of architect P J O'Connell's work, 452 Warrigal Road appears a substantial, albeit relatively staid effort, particularly by comparison with his delightful Werrimull Church, executed in a verandahed Lombardic mode, which commenced the following year.<sup>5</sup> Its triple arch was common in Spanish Mission housing of these years, as with 22 Cookson Street Camberwell (ungraded), for example. The entry tower was impressive for what it achieved with limited means.

### Assessment Against Criteria

*Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria*

*CRITERION D: The importance of a place or object in exhibiting the principal characteristics or the representative nature of a place or object as a part of a class or type of places or objects.*

454 Warrigal Road is a competent and relatively externally intact application of the Spanish Mission styling to a mid-sized suburban house of the early 1930s, successfully achieving an assertive open character. The house suffers to a degree from the alteration of its setting, including the replacement of the original fence and the development of the rear of the block.

*CRITERION G: The importance of the place or object in demonstrating social or cultural associations*

The association of this house with original owner and architect, P J O'Connor, is of interest, with its adoption of the Spanish Mission style reflecting the architect's own interest in the idiom.

### Statement of Significance

452 Warrigal Road, Ashburton is of local historical and architectural significance as a competent and relatively externally intact of the application of Spanish Mission styling to a mid-sized suburban house of the early 1930s, successfully achieving an assertive open character. The house suffers to a degree from the alteration of its setting, including the replacement of the original fence and the development of the rear of the block. The association of this house with original owner and architect, P J O'Connor, is of interest, with its adoption of the Spanish Mission style reflecting the architect's own interest in the idiom.

### Grading Review

Unchanged.

### Recommendations

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme.

### Identified By

G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

### References

*General:* G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

<sup>1</sup> MMBW Drainage Plan Application # 168359 examined 1930, carried out 7.1932, P J O'Connor of 371 Collins St, Melb. Miles Lewis lists O'Connor in *Victorian Churches*, National Trust, Melbourne, 1991, as J O'Connell (pp. 42, 136, 169).

<sup>2</sup> *Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria*, 1952, 1962.

<sup>3</sup> Refer Royal Australian Institute of Architects, 20<sup>th</sup> Century Register.

<sup>4</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, #20427, dated July 1994.

<sup>5</sup> See Miles Lewis, *Victorian Churches*, National Trust of Victoria, Melbourne, 1991, p. 136. Lewis dates it at 1933-4 and names the architect as J O'Connell.

---

<b>Name</b>	<i>Warranbine</i>	<b>Reference No</b>	
<b>Address</b>	125 Wattle Valley Road, Camberwell	<b>Survey Date</b>	27 September 2005
<b>Building Type</b>	Residence	<b>Grading</b>	B
<b>Date</b>	1892	<b>Previous Grading</b>	B



**Extent of Overlay**

To title boundaries.

---

**Intactness**    ☒ Good    ☐ Fair    ☐ Poor

**Heritage Status**    ☐ HV    ☐ AHC    ☐ NT    ☐ Rec.    BPS Heritage Overlay

**History**

James Lambert Baillieu, a warehouseman and Michael Trohy (?), an accountant, owned Lot 24 on which a brick house was built in 1892.<sup>1</sup> James Baillieu moved from Lisson Grove, Hawthorn to this property and, according to rate books, owned and occupied the eight roomed dwelling until his death in 1900.<sup>2</sup> Michael Trohy(?) was also listed as an owner in 1895-96 and an occupier 1894-96.<sup>3</sup>

After James Baillieu's death Elizabeth Mary Baillieu, probably his widow, owned and occupied the property now named *Warranbine*, until after 1905-6.<sup>4</sup> A Mrs L. Baillieu occupied the residence in 1910 when it was purchased by John Johnson Smart, an architect.<sup>5</sup> Smart was the owner-occupier of *Warranbine* until his death after 1916 when the Executors for John J. Smart were listed as owners in the rate books and Amy Smart as the occupier.<sup>6</sup> The property was leased to William J.P. Howe, a civil servant, in the late 1920s and Miss G.M. Roberts in the 1930s.<sup>7</sup> During this time the land associated with the property almost doubled in size, from 170 feet x 300 feet in 1915 to 341 feet x 454 feet in 1920, and in rates from £70 in 1915 to £150 in 1920 and £200 in 1925.<sup>8</sup> Mrs Cora Halkyard purchased the property in the early 1930s but continued to lease it until in the late 1930s, she resided there with A.J.S. Halkyard.<sup>9</sup> Ivo K. Robb had become the owner-occupier of the residence by 1950.<sup>10</sup>

James Lambert Baillieu was born in 1855 and began his mercantile career as a junior with a firm known in 1900 as Paterson, Laing & Bruce. In the twenty-five years he worked for the firm he rose from correspondent clerk to manager of departments and a traveller in Tasmania. Having reached the highest post attainable in the firm, he commenced his own business in 1894 as a soft goods manufacturing agent, in partnership with a Mr. Austin. They represented a well known London firm Messrs. Bradbury, Greatorex & Company Ltd. Married but without children, he died at the age of forty-five years.<sup>11</sup>

(G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991)

### Description & Integrity

*Warranbine* is a symmetrical-fronted single-storey brick house set in a large garden though one section, the present No. 127, was subdivided from it in recent years. The east elevation, facing Wattle Valley Road, is dominated by two equal gables, expressing two bedrooms, half timbered and jutting out over a timber-framed verandah marked by a gablet at the centre, over the entry to the front door. The two major gables are tied together visually by a simple transverse ridge line running behind them. The verandah returns at each corner. To the north the elevations break up into asymmetry, in front of a family room and bedroom grouping on the north (Hampton Grove) side, and on the south a long elevation, punctuated by a canted bay out of the living room, pushes through toward the rear of the site. The front walls are stuccoed externally

The house was extended to the south and north in 1978, to designs by Richard Fakhry.<sup>12</sup> Other than for these works, the main alteration that has occurred is the overpainting of the exterior.

*Warranbine* was owned by the architect John James Smart between 1910 and 1916 and Graeme Butler has suggested that Smart may have undertaken earlier alterations. This has not been confirmed. The only previous recorded alterations to the house were unspecified, in 1936, and renovations with a small extension in 1951.<sup>13</sup> A swimming pool was being installed when the site was visited for this survey.<sup>14</sup>

The fence was replaced with another picket design in 1972, after a council deliberation on its height.

### Historical Context

This area was developed from the 1890s, with *Warranbine* one of the earlier residences to be constructed. The 1929 MMBW Detail Plan no 75 shows a series of substantial Victorian and Edwardian villas along the street; subsequent development occurred in the interwar period.<sup>15</sup>

### Comparative Analysis

*Warranbine* is an early and assured example of a strongly Old English house of the 1890s. Its direct counterparts are GHM Addison's Brisbane essay in the Old English manner, published in the *Builder and Contractor's News* in 1890, and more locally Guyon Purchas' *Tay Creggan* in Yarra Street Hawthorn, being built the previous year. There had been a smattering of conspicuously Old English adaptations earlier, but as with *Tay Creggan*, *Warranbine* is in the process of adaptation to what would become Federation forms. In that, it has parallels with the similarly sized 622 Riversdale Road, built in the same year (q.v., B-graded). *Warranbine's* verandah has prominence and is a distinct episode readable in its own right (a Federation characteristic); it is played off in a direct juxtaposition against the projecting half-timbered gables, as in developed Federation houses. As in Federation houses, the composition is tied together with a simple roof profile dominating and controlling the two large gables facing Wattle Valley Road. The timber-framed verandah is a reaction to characteristic 1880s cast iron versions, and typifies the early Federation outlook in architecture. The composition is simple but forceful and the relative plainness of the massing works well in conjunction with the garden. The windows are plain sashes, as distinct from the elaboration and casements that dominate in the Federation period. As a type, *Warranbine* relates to an established Camberwell mode: the large, single-storey house, but is distinguished from other examples which were more typically in the Italianate mode.

### Assessment Against Criteria

*Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria*

*CRITERION A: The historical importance, association with or relationship to Boroondara's history of the place or object.*

The historical associations with early owners, James Baillieu and John J Smart are of interest but are not considered to elevate the significance of the place.

*CRITERION E: The importance of the place or object in exhibiting good design or aesthetic characteristics and/or in exhibiting a richness, diversity or unusual integration of features.*

*Warranbine* is an early example in Camberwell of a large single-storey villa to adopt a style other than the Italianate, in this case a distinctively Old English mode. The design is distinguished by a strong, simple composition on its Wattle Valley Road frontage, which meshes well with its imposing and lush garden. Much of its interest derives from its early date of construction; appearing in the early 1890s and combining aspects of the developing Federation mode with elements of earlier approaches to design, as in its symmetry. The additions have been unobtrusive and are visibly sympathetic, although the overpainting of the exterior detracts from the presentation of the building.

### Statement of Significance

*Warranbine* is of local architectural and historical significance as an early example in Camberwell of a large single-storey villa to adopt a style other than the Italianate, in this case a distinctively Old English mode. The design is distinguished by a strong, simple composition on its Wattle Valley Road frontage, which meshes well with its imposing and lush garden. Much of its interest derives from its early date of construction; appearing in the early 1890s and combining aspects of the developing Federation mode with elements of earlier approaches to design, as in its symmetry. The additions have been unobtrusive and are visibly sympathetic, although the overpainting of the exterior detracts from the presentation of the building.

### Grading Review

Unchanged.

### Recommendations

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme.

### Identified By

G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

### References

*General:* G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

*Specific:*

<sup>1</sup> Shire of Boroondara Rate Books, 1891-92, 232; 1892-93, 966.

<sup>2</sup> Shire of Boroondara Rate Books, 1893-94, 938 1900-1, 332.

<sup>3</sup> Shire of Boroondara Rate Books, 1894-95, 339; 1895-96, 332.

<sup>4</sup> Borough of Boroondara and Camberwell Rate Books, 1905-6, 290.

<sup>5</sup> *Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria* 1910; Town of Camberwell Rate Books, 1910-11.

<sup>6</sup> City of Camberwell Rate Books, 1915-16, 591; 1920-21, 864.

<sup>7</sup> *Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria*, 1925; 1930; 1935; City of Camberwell Rate Books, 1930-31, 16711; 1934-35, 15341.

<sup>8</sup> City of Camberwell Rate Books, 1915-16, 591; 1920-21, 864; 1925-26, 15110.

<sup>9</sup> City of Camberwell Rate Books, 1915-16, 591; 1920-21, 864; 1925-26, 15110; *Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria*, 1940; 1945-46.

<sup>10</sup> *Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria*, 1950.

<sup>11</sup> *Australian Storekeepers Journal*, VII-VIII, 1901-2, 31.1.1901.

<sup>12</sup> Drawings dated 7 March 1978 sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, #62836, dated 5 April 1978.

<sup>13</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, #6585, dated 18 May 1936 (unspecified); and #6908, dated 22 March 1951 ('repairs and renovations'). Outside the house, Cockrams replaced the earlier picket fence, #51950, dated 26 October 1972, and put in a carport: #67293, dated 3 July 1975.

<sup>14</sup> City of Boroondara Building Index, BS-1245/20060022, dated 26 July 2005.

<sup>15</sup> G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, vol. 3, citation for Precinct 7.



<b>Name</b>	House	<b>Reference No</b>	
<b>Address</b>	136 Whitehorse Road, Balwyn	<b>Survey Date</b>	13 December 2005
<b>Building Type</b>	Residence	<b>Grading</b>	B
<b>Date</b>	1938	<b>Previous Grading</b>	B



#### Extent of Overlay

To title boundaries.

**Intactness** ☒ Good ☐ Fair ☐ Poor

**Heritage Status** ☐ HV ☐ AHC ☐ NT ☐ Rec. BPS Heritage Overlay

#### History

Architects, A.K. Lines, with Jessica MacFarlane as the probable design architect (see Comparative Analysis, below) drew up this six room two-storey house in 1938 for Frank C. Oates, a manager.<sup>1</sup> His builder was A.E. Smart, the estimated cost was £1,823 and the area over 21 squares.<sup>2</sup> On completion, the Oates family moved here from 35 Walsh Street, Balwyn.<sup>3</sup>

(G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991)

#### Description & Integrity

136 Whitehorse Road is a three-fronted composition in brick with cement rendering; the lower walls are left as plain brick. It has metal frame windows, 'cantilevered' at the north-west corner of the front wing in that they have brick walling above. The roof is hipped with boxed eaves and terracotta tiles in a Marseilles pattern, punctuated by two long rectangular chimney stacks, one at the west side and the other at the centre, near the junction of the wing facing Whitehorse Road. The roof is parapetted on the north-east side. The eaves are deep on the north side, and the lower north-west window is shielded from sun by a further tiled projection, a cantilevered half hip. The entry porch has a thick lintel supported by an offset column, plain and untapered. The east side has relatively little fenestration, albeit including a circular porthole, and the driveway runs up past the house on that side, in a conventional manner.

The house is intact as viewed from the street; in 1952. a bedroom and dining room were added to the rear in a single storey extension with a flat roof in reinforced concrete, perhaps in anticipation of another addition above it.<sup>4</sup> Unspecified additions were recorded in 1996.<sup>5</sup>

The original garage was demolished and replaced in 1952. The primarily floral garden is sympathetic to the period of the house and is screened from Whitehorse Road by a shrub hedge. The driveway is a kerbed concrete slab, possibly original.

### Historical Context

This area of Whitehorse Road was developed for a series of substantial villas, in the interwar period and later.

### Comparative Analysis

136 Whitehorse Road is a distinctly modern house in its exterior, perhaps prompted by the now demolished Thomas house at 12 Reid Street, nearby, by Roy Grounds, of 1937.<sup>6</sup> There was, similarly, no Moderne or Art Deco ornamentation as with related houses in the areas such as 1205 Burke Road Kew. At the same time 136 is more pragmatic than Grounds' design, having a hipped tiled roof instead of Grounds' flat Malthoid roofing. Its plan, moreover, is closer to other architect-designed houses in the Balwyn-North Balwyn area, particularly LW Ritter's 1 Mountain View Road of 1939 (C-graded)<sup>7</sup>, and Clive Miller's 56 Riverside Avenue (q.v., B-graded) of 1940.<sup>8</sup> There is also a similarity to Norman Seabrook's own house in Hawthorn, publicized in *Home Beautiful* in 1935, and a Seabrook and Fildes house in Burke Road, Camberwell, also of c. 1938-40.<sup>9</sup> In other aspects the house hints at the accommodations to standard hipped tiled roofing and a new set of standard window fittings, both of which became hallmarks of the emerging suburban vernacular. Within A and K Lines' office, the design may well have been shaped by Jessica McFarlane, who is credited as design architect for two other very similar Lines houses in Balwyn North, the Myhill house at Oakdale Road, of 1936, and the Wilson house, City View Road, of 1939 and for the closely related Lines house at Grange Road Toorak, of 1938. These were all published in *Australian Home Beautiful*.<sup>10</sup>

### Assessment Against Criteria

*Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria*

*CRITERION D: The importance of a place or object in exhibiting the principal characteristics or the representative nature of a place or object as a part of a class or type of places or objects.*

136 Whitehorse Road is a broadly intact example of Modern Movement house design as it appeared in Camberwell in the late inter-war period. Historically, it appears a direct result of the Modern Movement's early 1930s 'popular revolution' as Robin Boyd described it.<sup>11</sup>

### Statement of Significance

136 Whitehorse Road, Balwyn is of local historical and architectural significance as a relatively intact example of Modern Movement house design as it appeared in Camberwell in the late inter-war period. Historically, it relates to the Modern Movement's early 1930s 'popular revolution' as Robin Boyd described it.<sup>12</sup> Though it has a hipped, rather than flat, roof, the building features geometric massing and modern devices such as corner windows with the new standard metal window fittings. Alterations and additions are relatively minor and sympathetic in their design.

### Grading Review

Unchanged.

### Recommendations

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme.

### Identified By

G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

### References

*General:* G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

*Specific:*

<sup>1</sup> Melbourne and Metropolitan Board of Works, Drainage Plan Application # 210511.

<sup>2</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index #10417, dated 6 October 1938.

<sup>3</sup> *Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria 1938; 1939.*

<sup>4</sup> Drawings sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, #9510, dated 17 March 1952. The drawings are listed as having been prepared in November 1951.

<sup>5</sup> Details sourced from the City of Boroondara Building Index, #740/408/16144, Banyule BPI.

<sup>6</sup> See G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, vol. 4, p. 229-230. Butler discusses 136 Whitehorse Road on pp. 312-313.

<sup>7</sup> G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, vol. 4, p. 207.

<sup>8</sup> Discussed by Butler also: graded B: Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, p. 247-8.

<sup>9</sup> See Christine Philips, Norman Seabrook, M Arch thesis, University of Melbourne, 2006, nearing completion at time of writing.

<sup>10</sup> See Julie Willis and Bronwyn Hanna, Women Architects in Australia, 1900-1950, RAlA, Canberra, 2001, p. 55, 58.

<sup>11</sup> See Robin Boyd, *Victorian Modern: 111 years of Modern Architecture in the State of Victoria, Australia*, RVIA Students' Society, Melbourne, 1947; *Australia's home: its origins, builders and occupiers*, Melbourne university Press, 1952.

<sup>12</sup> See Robin Boyd, *Victorian Modern: 111 years of Modern Architecture in the State of Victoria, Australia*, RVIA Students' Society, Melbourne, 1947; *Australia's home: its origins, builders and occupiers*, Melbourne University Press, 1952.

<b>Name</b>	<i>Pontefract House</i>	<b>Reference No</b>	
<b>Address</b>	199 Whitehorse Road, Balwyn	<b>Survey Date</b>	27 November 2005
<b>Building Type</b>	Residence	<b>Grading</b>	B
<b>Date</b>	1892	<b>Previous Grading</b>	B



#### Extent of Overlay

To title boundaries.

**Intactness** ☐ Good ☐ Fair ☒ Poor

**Heritage Status** ☐ HV ☐ AHC ☐ NT ☐ Rec. BPS Heritage Overlay

#### History

Lebbens Hordern, an auctioneer, had this originally 11-room brick house built in 1892 among nine suburban lots which totalled 82 acres.<sup>1</sup> The architect is thought to have been Henry James Proctor.<sup>2</sup> By 1895 it was described a brick house on part of the 'Cotham Estate', occupying the same lots.<sup>3</sup> Hordern was listed as resident in Whitehorse Road, Balwyn in the Victorian directory of 1892-3, the house name being *Pontefract*.<sup>4</sup>

The Hordern family (Louisa D. Hordern) continued as the owner-occupier at least until the 1930s,<sup>5</sup> the first room count for the house being in 1899 when it stood at 11 rooms<sup>6</sup> and the house population being cited as seven, fifteen years later.<sup>7</sup>

Improvements may have been carried out in 1934 by local builders, F.W. Le Leu,<sup>8</sup> possibly in preparation for its conversion to Chaddesley flats.<sup>9</sup> The MMBW plan for that year shows extensive new plumbing, replacing the old closets, basins and baths but also adding new ones to what appears to have been a new north wing (stuccoed), built in a similar style. This wing survives, though it has itself undergone extensive modification in works undertaken in the 1980s and 1990s.

The property is now accessed via Hardwicke Street.

(G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, additional research by Lovell Chen, 2005)

#### Description & Integrity

*Pontefract* is a double-fronted brick house with a return verandah and west-facing gabled wing, dating from 1892, at the outset of the Federation period. Its number for Council records is 199 Whitehorse Road, but its address for its sale was more recently given as 2 Hardwicke Street, reflecting the fact that entry is now from the side street to the west.<sup>10</sup> The roof is terracotta tile in a Marseilles pattern:

the main roof runs north-south, ending in a gable at the south end facing Whitehorse Road, and transforming into a short transverse hip north of the west-facing wing. This wing is, in turn, balanced by an east-facing wing, so the pair form a kind of transept. The east wing is terminated with a broken gable and has the main views of the Dandenong Ranges. The walls are in face brick toward Whitehorse Road and Hardwicke Street, sienna-coloured with red-orange brick striping. The verandah is a double-storeyed and timber posted structure, with a flattened segmental frieze in timber planking. The verandah balustrades are in timber panels with a half-timbered Old English patterning on them, and similar half-timbering and textured stucco line the gables. Most of the original windows are grouped casements in the Norman Shaw manner, some with a grid of amber panes in their upper lights. The ground window on the west wing is arched in a broad arc. The gable corbel and the first floor roof corbel on this wing are clad in textured stucco.

Like many houses of its size *Pontefract* was converted to the *Chaddesley* Flats in 1934, and it is thought that at this time a large addition was constructed to the north of the original house and almost equal to it in size. Graeme Butler has noted that this wing (which now incorporates three garages) may have replaced an earlier service wing, probably single-storied.<sup>11</sup> More recently, in 1984, the property was converted back into a single residence. At this time and subsequently (in 1990), extensive alterations were undertaken; however these focussed on the rear (non-original) wing rather than on the original house.<sup>12</sup> In its current form, this rear wing appears as a stripped down version of the original house, in painted, rendered brick with pitched tiled roof and timber joinery and balconies.

Despite its large additions, *Pontefract's* original design still reads clearly. The proportions and form of the original house are still readily discernible, with the later wing separated visually from the original house by a recessed bay with balustrade, which accentuates the separation of the two.

There are several large trees in the garden that are probably original or early, though the formal path and fountain from Hardwicke Street looks more recent. The long and relatively high brick fence is not original but has been completed in a carefully chosen brick that emulates the stripes and colouration of the original house walls. A swimming pool was added in 1989.

### Historical Context

*Pontefract* is a relatively early survivor by comparison with the largely interwar character of the building stock in the surrounding area.

### Comparative Analysis

*Pontefract* is a relatively early example in the emergence of Federation architecture. All the elements of a mature Federation two-storey design are there, but in a house dating from 1892, two years after Alfred Dunn's seminal design for a two storeyed house with a hipped roof, free style elevations and a central plan running off a developed and dominating stair hall. *Pontefract* precedes many other two-storey designs in a developed Federation manner (as distinct from the large Queen Anne Romanesque and Free Style fusions seen in James Birtwhistle's *Illawarra* in Toorak of 1888-9,<sup>13</sup> or Reed, Henderson and Smart's houses in the Kew and Camberwell area of 1883-90<sup>14</sup>). It is broadly comparable to *Lineda*, designed by Hyndman and Bates and completed for AJ Fuller in 1891-2 (demolished?), with similar usage of rough textured stucco.<sup>15</sup> The other known early Federation examples in the Camberwell area tend to be single-storied, as with *Elderslie* at 15 Alma Road Camberwell, of 1890-1 (q.v., B-graded, recommended to be upgraded to A in this review) and 622 Riversdale Road, also of 1892 (q.v., B-graded, also recommended for A in this review). Another relatively early two storey house that moves to a Federation free style form, 30 Howard Street, Glen Iris, (q.v., B-graded) comes three years after *Pontefract*.

### Assessment Against Criteria

*Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria*

*CRITERION D: The importance of a place or object in exhibiting the principal characteristics or the representative nature of a place or object as a part of a class or type of places or objects.*

*Pontefract* sets out most of the distinguishing elements of Federation architecture: the return verandah with punctuating wing, the balance of wing gables against a main roof form (though this would be articulated more by Beverly Ussher in subsequent designs), the abandonment of cast iron in the verandah construction, the wholesale adoption of Shaw-pattern window casements, the control

and stucco and its new use in textured form, the verandah frieze, extraordinarily plain for its time, the shortening of internal corridors and the new dominance of a stair hall in the plan.

*CRITERION E: The importance of the place or object in exhibiting good design or aesthetic characteristics and/or in exhibiting a richness, diversity or unusual integration of features.*

*Pontefract* is of significance as a developed prototype for two-storey housing in the Federation period. It is in the first Federation 'wave' in Melbourne housing and predates most related moves in Australia's other states. It is contemporary with Hyndman and Bates' similarly important *Lineda*, which appears to have been demolished. Its additions are large but visibly distinct and held apart from the original house by a recessed bay on its Hardwicke Street side.

### Statement of Significance

*Pontefract*, at 199 Whitehorse Road is of local historical and architectural significance. Reputedly designed by little-known architect, Henry James Proctor, the residence has all the hallmarks of a developed prototype for two-storey housing in the Federation period. It is in the first phase of Federation-style houses and is contemporary with other early known examples. The house sets out most of the distinguishing elements of Federation architecture: the return verandah with punctuating wing, the balance of wing gables against a main roof form (though this would be articulated more by Beverly Ussher in subsequent designs), the abandonment of cast iron in the verandah construction, the wholesale adoption of Shaw-pattern window casements, the control and stucco and its new use in textured form, the verandah frieze, extraordinarily plain for its time, the shortening of internal corridors and the new dominance of a stair hall in the plan. While the major additions on Hardwicke Street are imposing and detract somewhat from the street presentation of the building, they are visually distinct, allowing the original building to read as such.

### Grading Review

Unchanged.

### Recommendations

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme.

### Identified By

G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

### References

*General:* G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

*Specific:*

<sup>1</sup> Shire of Boroondara Rate Books, 1891-2, 2462, 2592 lots 101-6, 145-6.

<sup>2</sup> The attribution is from Miles Lewis, Melbourne Mansions Database, referring to the Australasian Builder and Contractors' News, 28 May 1892, p. 382.

<sup>3</sup> Shire of Boroondara Rate Books, 1894-5, 2025.

<sup>4</sup> Wise (publisher), Victoria Post Office Directory, 1892-3.

<sup>5</sup> City of Camberwell Rate Books, 1930-1, 3959 occ. L.D. Hordern.

<sup>6</sup> Shire of Boroondara Rate Books, 1899-1900, 1551.

<sup>7</sup> City of Camberwell Rate Books, 1915-16, 2421.

<sup>8</sup> MMBW Drainage Plan Application 161602, 28.9.34 plan.

<sup>9</sup> Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria, 1940-50.

<sup>10</sup> Fletcher and Parker: Prestige Property Division, advertisement. 'Pontefract: a fine example of period restoration' where 'precise attention to meticulous detail' has achieved 'a splendid revival of the original grandeur'.

<sup>11</sup> Council records for this period do not survive, however, Graeme Butler has noted that they are shown on the MMBW Drainage Plans for the property. Butler notes that the work was probably carried out by FW Le Leu, a local builder. Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, vol. 4, 315.

<sup>12</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, #75297, dated 6 April 1984 (conversion from flats); #75850, dated 2 July 1984 (heightening fence); #89679, dated 18 December 1989 (swimming pool).

<sup>13</sup> See Philip Goad, ed., contrib., *Melbourne Architecture: a Guide*, Watermark, Sydney, 1999, p. 73 fig. 117 (for *Illawarra*). and Goad, (ed., contrib.), *Bates Smart*, Thames and Hudson, Melbourne,

2004, esp. Miles Lewis' section 2 where he discusses houses such as the 1883-4 *Urangeline* in Barkers Road Kew (q.v.), pp. 77-8, or the 1890 *Holyrood*, at 816 Riverdale Road Camberwell, pp. 82-3, graded A by Butler. The same could also be said of EG Kilburn's *Cestria* at Glenferrie Road Hawthorn: Goad, *Melbourne Architecture*, p.84 fig. 128, which is dominated by a direct synthesis of Richardson Romanesque and Norman Shaw.

<sup>15</sup> *Bates Smart*, pp. 80-82. Lewis believes the actual designer may have been Alfred Carleton, who went on to prominence in the Camberwell – Canterbury region as a Federation architect.



<b>Name</b>	House	<b>Reference No</b>	
<b>Address</b>	127 Winmalee Road, Balwyn	<b>Survey Date</b>	25 November 2005
<b>Building Type</b>	Residence	<b>Grading</b>	B
<b>Date</b>	1919-20	<b>Previous Grading</b>	B



#### Extent of Overlay

To title boundaries.

**Intactness** ☒ Good ☐ Fair ☐ Poor

**Heritage Status** ☐ HV ☐ AHC ☐ NT ☐ Rec. BPS Heritage Overlay

#### History

In 1920 Dr Cedric Roche, variously described as a physician, surgeon, and medical practitioner, become the owner-occupier of the only property listed in directories for Winmalee Road between Narrak and Crom Streets.<sup>1</sup> The property's brick dwelling was of seven rooms and was built after builder, F.W. Fairhall lodged an application to build a brick dwelling of ten rooms with a tiled roof, late in 1919.<sup>2</sup>

MMBW plans in 1931 show a proposed subdivision of this property into six lots.<sup>3</sup> The plans show a cow bail on Lot 2 fronting Narrak Street which seems to indicate this property was a farmlet.<sup>4</sup> MMBW plans of 1959 show the subdivision in place and the cow bail to be abolished.<sup>5</sup> Lots 2, 3 & 4 became 2, 3, & 4 Narrak Road and Lots 5 & 6 became 125A and 125B Winmalee Road respectively.<sup>6</sup> Cedric Roche lived at the subject property until after 1952.<sup>7</sup> By 1962 J.R. Fisher occupied the property and lived here until 1974.<sup>8</sup>

(G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, additional research by Lovell Chen, 2005)

#### Description & Integrity

127 Winmalee Road is a simply massed house with a single transverse gable punctuated with two chimneys of different heights and an expanded dormer, cast as a floating gable in the front slope of roof tiling, over the front entry area. The roof is of terracotta tiles in a Marseilles pattern, the gables are all shingled and the walls are in a characteristic Melbourne combination of red brick and textured stucco. The arch motif is repeated in the south east wall with an upper lunette, passed on approaching the house by its main drive. Below that, the windows assume asymmetrical placement, expressing the interior and its specifics.

The drive curves in what appears to be its original pattern.



A garage was added, probably in 1929.<sup>9</sup> The site was subdivided and a brick veneer house and garage were added on the second allotment, to the rear of the original house. The fence and gates were replaced in 1986, and a swimming pool was installed the following year.<sup>10</sup> In 1993 the owners added a garden room, altered the kitchen and laundry, and bathroom, and changed the wardrobe arrangements. They also made various modifications to the 1974 outbuildings.<sup>11</sup>

### Historical Context

The MMBW Detail Plan no. 150 of 1932 shows Winmalee Street had only been partly developed by the interwar period.

### Comparative Analysis

The emphatic horizontality of the design, and the imposing arched entrance placed off centre, place 127 Winmalee Road in a group of Camberwell houses which drew on the roof and arched entry forms suggested by influential late Federation designs such as Jeaffreson Jackson's house for Henry Gullett at Woohroonga, NSW, of 1903 (demolished), which was widely publicised in *Art and Architecture* and elsewhere.<sup>12</sup>

Graeme Butler has commented that the design was one which drew on the work of British designers such as Voysey and the British Arts and Crafts Free Style, rather than the Californian bungalow forms.<sup>13</sup> But the house has American elements as well, particularly of the East Coast style where Bungalows had a simple transverse roof, invariably punctuated by a long central dormer. The East Coast or *Craftsman* bungalow was already being taken up widely in Melbourne, possibly because of its overtones as a bungalow for cool climates.<sup>14</sup> Like most Australian bungalows from the 1920s, 127 Winmalee Road was to some extent also a simplification and stylization of forms and elements that had pervaded the Federation period. This shows in the terracotta tiled roof, the prominence of the entrance arch, the layering of parts in the front elevation, and use of the floating gable.

### Assessment Against Criteria

*Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria*

*CRITERION D: The importance of a place or object in exhibiting the principal characteristics or the representative nature of a place or object as a part of a class or type of places or objects.*

127 Winmalee Road is a fine, externally relatively intact and early example of a simply composed attic plan house with round arched entry that became popular in Melbourne suburbs in the 1920s.

*CRITERION E: The importance of the place or object in exhibiting good design or aesthetic characteristics and/or in exhibiting a richness, diversity or unusual integration of features.*

The house is direct in its treatment and beautifully sited. It reads as a skilled synthesis of British and American Arts and Crafts influences, yet, as with the more successful Australian designs in this period, reveals itself in part as a simplification of Federation houses.

### Statement of Significance

127 Winmalee Road, Balwyn, is of local historical and architectural significance. It is a fine, externally relatively intact and early example of a simply composed attic plan house with round arched entry that became popular in Melbourne suburbs in the 1920s. The house is direct in its treatment and beautifully sited. It reads as a skilled synthesis of British and American Arts and Crafts influences, yet, as with the more successful Australian designs in this period, reveals itself in part as a simplification of Federation houses.

### Grading Review

Unchanged.

### Recommendations

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme.

## Identified By

G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

## References

*General:* G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991

*Specific:*

<sup>1</sup> *Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria* 1921; Electoral Roll, 1938; City of Camberwell Rate Books, 1925-26, # 6933.

<sup>2</sup> *Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria* 1921; Electoral Roll, 1938; City of Camberwell Rate Books, 1925-26, # 6933, [BR], Building Record?, 303.

<sup>3</sup> MMBW Drainage Plan Application, # 117687.

<sup>4</sup> MMBW Drainage Plan Application, # 117687.

<sup>5</sup> MMBW Drainage Plan Application, # 117687.

<sup>6</sup> City of Camberwell Consolidated Plans No. 36.

<sup>7</sup> *Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria*, 1952.

<sup>8</sup> *Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria*, 1962; 1974.

<sup>9</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, #1067, dated 30 September 1929.

<sup>10</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index: # 54997, dated 9 April 1974 (brick veneer house and garage); #80638, dated 30 June 1986 (fence); #82737, dated 12 May 1987 (swimming pool).

<sup>11</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, #97492, dated 23 June 1993.

<sup>12</sup> The Gullett house is cited in Donald Johnson's *Australian Architecture 1901-51: Sources of Modernism*, University of Sydney press, 1980, pp. 55-6.

<sup>13</sup> G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, vol. 4, p.p. 317-318.

<sup>14</sup> Oakden and Ballantyne's Harry Martin house in Malvern, of 1908, widely regarded as the seminal Melbourne bungalow, was of this type rather than following a clearly Californian design. Illustrated in Johnson, *Australian Architecture*, p. 57.

<b>Name</b>	<i>Banff</i>	<b>Reference No</b>	
<b>Address</b>	150 Winmalee Road, Balwyn	<b>Survey Date</b>	25 November 2005
<b>Building Type</b>	Residence	<b>Grading</b>	B
<b>Date</b>	1915	<b>Previous Grading</b>	B



**Extent of Overlay**

To title boundaries.

**Intactness** ☒ Good ☐ Fair ☐ Poor

**Heritage Status** ☐ HV ☐ AHC ☐ NT ☐ Rec. BPS Heritage Overlay

**History**

Allotment 3 owned by Thomas Watt in 1910 was purchased by Allen D. Gilfillan of Castlemaine by 1914.<sup>1</sup> Gilfillan as owner applied to build a concrete and 'fibro' 25 square house at 230 Winmalee Road in late 1914; his architect was H. Crawford who is thought to have been Hugh R. Crawford, a noted concrete technologist from early this century. Crawford's patented (1907) hollow-wall reinforced concrete construction method was used to build Queen Anne style houses in Mont Albert Road, Canterbury and Camberwell East.<sup>2</sup> His own house is thought to survive at 1121 Dandenong Road, East Malvern.<sup>3</sup>

By 1915 Gilfillan had a nine roomed, concrete dwelling.<sup>4</sup> Allen Gilfillan, a solicitor, lived here with Eliza, Charlotte, Eliza Mary, and Sheila Gilfillan until after 1952.<sup>5</sup>

Based on the MMBW Detail Plan No. 150, (of 1932 but possibly based on an earlier survey), Banff was originally located on a very large allotment which has been reduced substantially in size, through the subdivision and development of land to the east, west and south of the house.

By 1962 Arthur Morrison occupied this property and remained here until after 1974.<sup>6</sup> In 1977 additions were made to the south-east corner of the house at an estimated cost of £8,100 by Vindin Suares Home Improvements to the residence for the owners, Mr. and Mrs. J. Van Schoonhoven.<sup>7</sup>

(G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, additional research by Lovell Chen, 2005)

**Description & Integrity**

*Banff*, at 150 Winmalee Road, is an imposing house, set back from the street on a corner site and separated by a tennis court from its street corner. It is angled to take in views of the Dandenong Ranges and Great Divide. The house has a low pitched roof with a broad eave and exposed rafters,

supported on a series of diagonal struts in a manner evoking both the Swiss chalet and its derivations in the California bungalow. The gables under each roof are shingled. The walls are in reinforced concrete, overpainted white. This drains the house of visible weight, so that it could be as materially light as if it were in weatherboard or shingle. This sense of lightness is aided by the juxtaposed gabling, the textured stucco rendering, the fairly light treatment of the window framing and the well-scaled use of shutters. The house is generally intact externally, though it is not known whether it was originally overpainted.

*Banff's* tennis court appears to be of relatively long standing, as at the related 286 Union Road. A tennis pavilion, brick fence, drainage and lighting were added in 1984. There had been some internal alterations in the later 1970s, the addition of a swimming pool and then an 'open' garage and several added pool facilities, including a timber-framed timber pool house.<sup>8</sup> A basic fence was added in 1990: in palings and cyclone wire, predominantly<sup>9</sup>.

### Historical Context

As noted above, *Banff* was originally sited in much larger grounds, as were other early houses in Winmalee Road. The MMBW Detail Plan no. 150 of 1932 shows the street had only been partly developed by the interwar period.

### Comparative Analysis

*Banff* compares well with No. 127 Winmalee Road; the houses were only four to five years apart and both attempted to reconcile the bungalow form with the space and programmatic complexity of large suburban houses. The strategy here was to take the bracketed and low-pitched roof seen in Californian designs and return it, to some extent, to its original Swiss Chalet roots. This also had the effect of then allowing two or more levels in relative compositional comfort. At the same time this bulk allowed the design to stay relatively close to important California bungalow prototypes, particularly Greene and Greene's Gamble and Blacker houses in the United States and others from the period 1904-8.<sup>10</sup> Most so-called California bungalows- at least in the Pasadena area where they are seen as originating - actually accommodated two levels, notwithstanding the bungalow's traditional association with one storey. The majority of larger Melbourne houses in the 1920s opted for the attic bungalow as a solution to size, rather than the more cuboid chalet mode as in the case of 150 Winmalee Road. John Monash's revolutionary 'moulded' George Higgins house at 4 Ray Street Beaumaris of 1912 (now demolished, but interestingly, also in reinforced concrete) showed the same approach.<sup>11</sup>

*Banff* is relatively early in the development of the modern bungalow form in Australia, indeed within about six years of the bungalow being identified as an architectural possibility for Australia and the appearance of Bungalows in Malvern and nearby at 17 Threadneedle Street (q.v., B-graded). *Banff* falls within what is generally considered the bungalow's 'first wave', marked by Edwin Orchard's early bungalow designs in Charles Slatyer's Sydney office, the prefabricated Redwood bungalow's arrival and Roscoe Collins' winning bungalow design for the Sydney Red Cross competition.<sup>12</sup> In the 1991 Camberwell Conservation Study, Graeme Butler observed a resemblance to Harold Desbrowe-Anneer's houses of the same period, perhaps reflecting Desbrowe-Anneer's own gravitation to Bungalow forms from around 1905-6.<sup>13</sup>

The reinforced concrete construction was unusual at the time, and compares with HR Crawford's better-known reinforced concrete houses, of which one at least was in the Camberwell area. It is not known whether any the Crawford houses survive, and one at least was demolished after being sold in 1972.<sup>14</sup>

### Assessment Against Criteria

*Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria*

*CRITERION E: The importance of the place or object in exhibiting good design or aesthetic characteristics and/or in exhibiting a richness, diversity or unusual integration of features.*

Coming relatively early in the development of the modern Bungalow form in Australia, *Banff* provides several signatures of the form generally: a fairly low-pitched roof, lightness in its external walling, lightness in its fenestration, and a good siting for views and sun, it is relatively uncommon in the Melbourne context as an example of a clear two-storey Bungalow form (as opposed to the attic form).

While largely confined to the eave treatment of the house, its Swiss Chalet references are also relatively uncommon in the Melbourne context; as noted by Bryce Raworth, 'Swiss-influenced bungalows are without doubt the most poorly represented style of bungalow in Melbourne'.<sup>15</sup>

*CRITERION F: The importance of the place or object in demonstrating or being associated with scientific or technical innovations or achievements.*

The house is of technological interest for its construction, using the patented system of reinforced concrete construction developed by Hugh R Crawford.

### Statement of Significance

*Banff*, 150 Winmalee Road, Balwyn is of local historical and architectural significance as an intact and relatively early example of a two-storey Bungalow residence. While *Banff* provides several signatures of the Bungalow form generally: a fairly low-pitched roof, lightness in its external walling, lightness in its fenestration, and a good siting for views and sun, it is relatively uncommon in the Melbourne context as an example of a clear two-storey Bungalow form (as opposed to the attic form). The Swiss Chalet references are also relatively uncommon in the Melbourne context. With a construction date of 1915, *Banff* is also relatively early in the development of the modern bungalow form in Australia.

### Grading Review

Unchanged.

### Recommendations

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme.

### Identified By

G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

### References

*General:* G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

*Specific:*

<sup>1</sup> Town of Camberwell Rate Books, 1910-11, 2392; 1914-15, 3042.

<sup>2</sup> M Lewis, *200 Years of Concrete Construction in Australia*, Concrete Institute of Australia, Sydney, 1988, p.26

<sup>3</sup> M Lewis, *200 Years of Concrete Construction in Australia*, see also M Lewis, *Australian Building: A Cultural Investigation*, p. 7.0515.

<sup>4</sup> City of Camberwell Rate Books, 1915-16, 3092.

<sup>5</sup> *Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria*, 1930; *Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria* 1952; Electoral Roll, 1938.

<sup>6</sup> *Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria*, 1962; 1974.

<sup>7</sup> Details sourced from City of Camberwell Building Index, # 60553, dated 2 February 1977.

<sup>8</sup> Details sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, #60553, dated 2 February 1977 (internal alterations); #60577, dated 7 February 1977 (swimming pool); 63193, dated 1 June 1978, #76025, dated 31 July 1984 (a second, 'open' garage, the tennis pavilion brick fencing, drainage and lighting).

<sup>9</sup> Detail sourced from the City of Camberwell Building Index, #91430, dated 24 September 1990.

<sup>10</sup> These are discussed at length in Randell Mackinson, *Greene and Greene: Architecture as a Fine Art*, Peregrine Smith, Los Angeles, 1977, pp. 92-3, 100-101 (Mrs James Garfield's house, Josephine van Rossem house, both 1904); 112, 116 (the LG and Marion Porter house, and Arthur Libby house, both 1905); 126-132 (the de Forest, Philips, and Pitcairn houses of 1906, and the Blacker and Gamble houses of 1907-8: pp. 150-5, 160-167.

<sup>11</sup> See the Heritage Victoria citation, [www.heritage.vic.gov.au/page/239](http://www.heritage.vic.gov.au/page/239).

<sup>12</sup> These are discussed in both *Architecture and Arts* and *The Salon*, its new incarnation in 1912. The earlier Martin house was discussed in *Building* in April 1912. See Peter Cuffley, *Australian Houses of the '20s and '30s*, Five Mile, Melbourne, 1989, p. 57.

<sup>13</sup> G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, vol. 4, pp. 319-320.

<sup>14</sup> (C Hamann) Personal recollections of the demolition. Lewis discusses Crawford's houses in *200 years of Concrete in Australia*, pp. 24-27.

<sup>15</sup> B Raworth. A Question of Style, M Arch thesis, University of Melbourne, 1993, pp. 51-52.

Name	<i>Idlewylde; Mary's Mount</i>	Reference No	
Address	41-45 Yarrbat Avenue, Balwyn	Survey Date	25 November 2005
Building Type	Residence	Grading	A
Date	1933	Previous Grading	B



#### Extent of Overlay

To title boundaries.

Intactness ☒ Good ☐ Fair ☐ Poor

Heritage Status ☐ HV ☐ AHC ☐ NT ☒ Rec. BPS Heritage Overlay

#### History

Oliver Gilpin applied for a building permit for a twenty-four roomed brick and timber dwelling in 1928, to be built by D.O. Gilpin at a massive estimated cost of £20,000,<sup>1</sup> however this project appears not to have gone ahead.<sup>2</sup>

In 1933 Gilpin again applied for a building permit, this time for a forty-one roomed brick and timber dwelling at an estimated cost of £40,000, a lodge, garages and sheds.<sup>3</sup> The builder nominated on the application was M. Stanby.<sup>4</sup> Directories first list Oliver Gilpin at this address in 1934 previously giving his place of residence as 50 Finch Street, Malvern.<sup>5</sup>

The Trustees of the Gilpin estate auctioned the property on 17<sup>th</sup> February, 1945.<sup>6</sup> Then the residence was described as having five suites of bedrooms and bathrooms, glassed sunroom, a 28 feet wide kitchen, butler's pantry, strong room, indoor swimming pool and many extras including substantial servants' quarters.<sup>7</sup> The building also contained music, billiard and card rooms and a ballroom.<sup>8</sup> The 20 acres of grounds featured a concrete and glass conservatory, fish ponds, large artificial lake and fish hatcheries, 34 special Kraal aviaries and approximately two acres of covered orchards.<sup>9</sup> A four roomed lodge, probably built in c1930, stood beside the imposing wrought-iron entrance gates.<sup>10</sup> *Idlewylde* was passed in at auction on a bid of £38,500 from the Missionary Sisters of the Sacred Heart.<sup>11</sup> The purchase of the property was finalised on 27<sup>th</sup> February, 1945 with an offer of £45,000 on behalf of the Sisters and they officially became owners on 21<sup>st</sup> April<sup>12</sup>. The property, renamed Mary's Mount, was used to house the Provincialate and the Novitiate of the order and as a convalescent home for missionaries released from internment camps in the islands after the war.<sup>13</sup> Late in 1945 the indoor swimming pool was covered over and the area turned into a chapel. The property was later sold to the Uniting Church.<sup>14</sup>

Oliver Gilpin, son of Diana and William John Gilpin, was born at Euroa in 1874 and educated at the local State School.<sup>15</sup> At the age of seventeen he started his career with the drapery firm of Messrs. A. Miller & Company of Euroa. After two years with this firm he joined Messrs. A.P. Gardiner and

remained there for another two years before moving to Melbourne to work for Messrs. Ball & Welch of Carlton. In 1895, when only twenty-one years of age, he began his own softgoods business in Korumburra. By 1921 his mail order service boasted forty-eight country branches scattered throughout Victoria, New South Wales and South Australia. The business grew to incorporate ninety-five stores throughout the above mentioned states as well as Tasmania. Goods were transported between the branches by the firm's own motor vehicles.<sup>16</sup> On 17 February 1928, aged 54, Gilpin married Muriel Doris Longford-Round.<sup>17</sup> A son was born to the couple in the early 1930s.<sup>18</sup>

(G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, additional research by Lovell Chen, 2005)

### Description & Integrity

*Idlewylde*, now the *Connaght* nursing home, was a huge house and landscape undertaking, rivaling that of the Douglas Fairbanks Senior house in Los Angeles designed ten years earlier and with a similar aura of the exotic utopia on the hill.

The house was, in fact, a group of connected buildings: the family was to live in the central part, a basically rectangular, roughly symmetrical block with a terracotta tiled roof in three hips, with a fourth hip over the north-facing apsidal balcony and a fifth hip over the square porte-cochere to the east side. The roofs were sealed with boxed eaves, each almost a metre deep. The walls and original outside balustrading were stuccoed and keyed to ceremonial steps down into the garden. The north porch entrance is approached by a flight of wide splayed stairs and has a mosaic floor inscribed in italics with the initials of the first owner, Oliver Gilpin. The porch walls are paneled to dado height in a combination of polished and unpolished grantite. The granite also frames the three arched entrance doorways – a pair of timber-framed glazed doors flanked by single leaf timber framed glazed doors which retain their beveled glazing. Above the porch is a thick-walled balcony, supported on a set of oddly primitive-looking untapered Tuscan columns. There was a balcony immediately overhead, and that was protected by a shallow-pitched, half conical roof, forming an apse. A porte-cochere juts off the main block to the east, carrying an extended bedroom of the main house out on its upper storey: this has leadlit glass in an Adam brothers' pattern on one side as a screen from the morning sun.

The porte-cochere leads into a service courtyard, framed on the south by a dormitory wing that contained what was probably servant's quarters and is now a ward, and on the east by a low conservatory wing, which reads to the service yard as a decorative and interesting elevation, and conceals another surprise: a triangular plan.

The dormitory block balances one side of the house against the south entrance; and on the other side (to the south-west), to balance, is an indoor pool with a square floor plan. The pool has been treated in a more decorative manner when compared with the restrained detailing of the former mansion. Notable is the wide stepped parapet, central steel framed circular lantern and main walls with regular fenestration pattern of multiple elongated metal arched windows with settings consisting of Art Deco Style capitals and a pair of dolphins to the arch. The northern most opening on the west elevation is a doorway with a later porch with steel poles and a gable roof. Internally, the elaborate tiling appears to be original.<sup>19</sup>

A group of garages stands to the south-east of the site at one side of a large concrete yard, rather as the asphalt and concrete service yard works on *Idlewylde's* east side. This concrete paving is weathered and of long standing, though whether it is original or was added a few years later is hard to tell. The former concrete drive and parking area at the north side in front of the semicircular porch has been asphalted, and paling fences now close in the north garden just beyond the car park. The garden has been subdivided close in at the northeast side as well, and down the entire west side. Here, a lake is placed in a hollow at the centre of this tract of garden, now owned by others. Butler notes that the grounds once also held a concrete and glass conservatory (on the eastern side), fish ponds, fish hatcheries, 34 kraal aviaries, and two acres of covered orchards.<sup>20</sup> While documentation is not complete, it is thought that a four-room lodge may have been located on the property, next to an imposing wrought iron set of entrance gates.<sup>21</sup> The aviaries were along the east side of the site, where Yarrbat Avenue curled round before climbing the Hill toward the Maranoa Gardens.

In plan the house had its share of oddities and surprises. The entry to the main living room was unexpectedly abrupt, through a shallow entrance vestibule. The living area was paneled in a rich Art Deco, not unlike the interior of contemporary ocean liners. This sense was heightened as the living



room had no external windows, being instead, a semi-circulation space, leading variously to a music room and library on either side of the north entry, a billiard room, card room, dining room, powder and bathrooms, through which the principal stair went. The main bedroom, interestingly, was on this floor as well. The porte-cochere entry, as broad as that for a suburban cinema, led simply into the dining room, and the large balcony above it was an extension of the one major upstairs bedroom not to have an ensuite bathroom. The back or service stair was, again surprisingly, on the main general axis from the north porch, and led up to another curious combination of spaces. Clockwise these were, via a centrally placed ballroom over the living room below, four bedrooms, interspersed with the service stair, a vestibule, two more bedrooms, a small lounge opening onto the north balcony, and two more bedrooms on the east side. All but one of the major bedrooms had its own bathroom, virtually unheard of in the 1930s. The servants' rooms, their bathrooms, the kitchen and scullery areas were distributed through a rectangular wing stretching south toward Yarrbat Avenue. The basement held three cellars, a group of workrooms and plant rooms serving both the house and the pool.

When the house was taken over by the Missionary Sisters of the Sacred Heart, and adapted for use as a residential care facility, extensive internal alterations were made. A 1997 study of existing conditions at *Idlewylde* showed that all first floor rooms surrounding the ballroom had been turned into wards, as had the servants' wing to the immediate south. The ground floor of the main house had been re-used for administrative rooms, and the former dining room was turned into an extra lounge. The eastern conservatory was turned into a day room. External alterations appear to be relatively minor, and to be generally limited to changes to door and window openings, with the main building forms reasonably intact. Later stairs have been added to the south and west sides of the main block.

### Historical Context

This area of Balwyn had been partly developed by the interwar period, the c. 1932 MMBW Detail Plan showing a mix of standard, regular building blocks, interspersed with more generous allotments. The plan appears to show an earlier Victorian house with return verandah on the subject site, but no trace of this remains. The surrounding houses were in the main bungalows of standard size, though quite a number of these have been demolished. Robin Boyd's D&J Gillison house of 1951-2 graded A, is 200 metres east up Yarrbat Avenue at the Kireep Road corner.<sup>22</sup>

### Comparative Analysis

There are few, if any, direct Melbourne comparisons for this building. In scale and bulk it compares with Hollywood or Long Island Mansions and with some of the 'Cretan Palaces' that appeared to designs by Neville Gruzman, Peter Muller and Douglas Snelling on the Sydney Harborside and Pittwater regions in the 1950s.<sup>23</sup> In its amalgam of Colonial and Mediterranean style, as applied here, *Idlewylde* has something of Neville Hampson's 1933 *Boomerang*, by Sydney Harbour, another utopia in the hollow, or other interwar precincts such as Bilgola on Sydney's Northern Beaches. In its lavishness, scale, and ornamented grounds, it can be compared in the Melbourne region with other large interwar mansions such as *Ilyuka* at Portsea or *Burnham Beeches* at Sassafras, both by Harry Norris. The apsidal north porch and balcony recall the porch at Henry Robertson's *Fernhill* of 1840-1, a well-known and published house at Mulgoa, NSW, and the east side recalls Bates, Peebles and Smart's *Netherby* in Studley Avenue Kew, of 1915, rated A in the Kew survey of 1988.<sup>24</sup> However, it lacks the general assurance of these earlier and contemporary examples. *Idlewylde* also lacks Norris' constant formal experimentation and interweaving of structure and surface expression. It is, by comparison, an assemblage of 'completed' forms, a generally austere and rather ungainly composition without real assurance in its application of style.

### Assessment Against Criteria

#### *Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria*

#### *CRITERION G: The importance of the place or object in demonstrating social or cultural associations*

*Idlewylde*, at 41-45 Yarrbat Avenue, Balwyn is one of the largest and most lavish interwar mansions in Victoria. In its original form, the house and grounds, including elaborate and extravagant outbuildings and garden, combined to demonstrate one version of the lifestyle of the very wealthy in the early 1930s, with extremely lavish entertaining and recreational facilities. As is the case for the Nicholas residence, *Burnham Beeches*, the complex was all the more extraordinary for having been constructed



at a time when Australia was still in the grip of economic depression. The ability of the place to demonstrate the interests and aspirations of its original owner, Oliver Gilpin, has been diminished by the truncation of the grounds and the removal of many of the original features.

### Statement of Significance

*Idlewylde*, at 41-45 Yarrbat Avenue, Balwyn is of municipal historical and architectural significance. Though architecturally relatively undistinguished, as constructed, it was one of the largest and most lavish interwar private residential complexes in the state, with elaborate and extravagant outbuildings and garden, including a lake. In its original form, *Idlewylde* demonstrated one version of the lifestyle of the very wealthy in the early 1930s, with extremely lavish entertaining and recreational facilities.

As is the case for the Nicholas residence, Burnham Beeches, the complex was all the more extraordinary for having been constructed at a time when Australia was still in the grip of economic depression. The ability of the place to demonstrate the interests and aspirations of its original owner, Oliver Gilpin, have been diminished by the truncation of the grounds and the removal of many of the original features, though the lake remains. The indoor swimming pool is of note for its intactness and elaborate decoration and tiling.<sup>25</sup>

### Grading Review

Unchanged

### Recommendations

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme.

### Identified By

G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

### References

*General:* G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study, 1991.

*Specific:*

<sup>1</sup> Building Application (cited by Butler) 1928, # 2436.

<sup>2</sup> Building Application (cited by Butler) 1928, # 2436.

<sup>3</sup> Building Application (cited by Butler) 1933, # 3681.

<sup>4</sup> Building Application (cited by Butler) 1933, # 3681.

<sup>5</sup> *Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria*, 1935; 1932.

<sup>6</sup> Kane, K.D. *The M.S.C. Sisters in Australia*, 1928-1978, p.62f.

<sup>7</sup> Kane, K.D. *The M.S.C. Sisters in Australia*, 1928-1978, p.62f.

<sup>8</sup> [National Trust of Australia (Vic.) File no. 4760.

<sup>9</sup> National Trust of Australia (Vic.) File no. 4760.

<sup>10</sup> National Trust of Australia (Vic.) File no. 4760; City of Camberwell Rate Books, 1930-31, 5271.

<sup>11</sup> National Trust of Australia (Vic.) File no. 4760; City of Camberwell Rate Books, 1930-31, 5271.

<sup>12</sup> National Trust of Australia (Vic.) File no. 4760; City of Camberwell Rate Books, 1930-31, 5271.

<sup>13</sup> [Kane, K D. *M.S.C. Sisters in Australia*, 1928-1978], p.63f.

<sup>14</sup> [Kane, K D. *M.S.C. Sisters in Australia*, 1928-1978], p.63f. Building Application (cited by Butler) 1945, # 17118.

<sup>15</sup> *Who's Who in Australia*, 1935, p. 201.

<sup>16</sup> *Victorian Centenary Book, Section 1*, p.158.

<sup>17</sup> National Trust of Australia (Vic.) File no. 4760

<sup>18</sup> National Trust of Australia (Vic.) File no. 4760.

<sup>19</sup> Further detail relating to the poolhouse is taken from the peer review by RBA Architects and Conservation Consultants, October 2008.

<sup>20</sup> G Butler, *Camberwell Conservation Study* 1991, vol. 4, pp. 321-2.

<sup>21</sup> G Butler, *Camberwell Conservation Study* 1991, vol. 4, pp. 321-2, G Butler, Camberwell Conservation Study 1991, p. 321.

<sup>22</sup> Butler, *Camberwell Conservation Study* 1991, vol. 4, p. 152. Its actual address is 43 Kireep Road.

<sup>23</sup> Discussed in material being prepared by P Goad, C Hamann, and G London for *An Unfinished Experiment in Living: the Architect-Designed Detached House in Australia, 1950-1965*, Miegunyah, Melbourne, scheduled for publication 2007.

<sup>24</sup> *Fernhill* had been published in Ure Smith's *Domestic Architecture in Australia*, Sydney, 1919, and in Hardy Wilson's *Old Colonial Architecture in New South Wales and Tasmania*, Privately published, London, 1928. Norris' work was well known in the Melbourne area and had been published in *Home Beautiful* and elsewhere. For *Netherby*, also well-known, see Philip Goad et al., *Bates Smart*, Thames and Hudson, Melbourne, 2004, esp Julie Willis' Part 3, pp. 116-7, 119, and Pru Sanderson, City of Kew Urban Conservation Study, 1988, Citation 51.

<sup>25</sup> Specific reference to the pool has been included on the recommendation of the Panel for Amendment C64. Additional descriptive material on the pool (based on the RBA Architects peer review of October 2008) was also added under Description and Integrity.

---

<b>Name</b>	<i>Streamshall (or Stramshall)</i>	<b>Reference No</b>	
<b>Address</b>	173 Auburn Road, Hawthorn	<b>Survey Date</b>	6 January 2006
<b>Building Type</b>	Residence	<b>Grading</b>	B
<b>Date</b>	1881-82	<b>Previous Grading</b>	B



**Extent of Overlay**

To title boundaries.

---

<b>Intactness</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Poor	
<b>Heritage Status</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> HV	<input type="checkbox"/> AHC	<input type="checkbox"/> NT	<input type="checkbox"/> Rec. BPS Heritage Overlay

**History**

William Hordern, merchant, constructed a large two-storeyed brick residence erected in Auburn Road on the corner of Auburn Grove with a summer house, asphalt tennis court, coachhouse, orchard and paddock, in 1881.<sup>1</sup> The coachhouse and stables were accessed from Auburn Grove and the extensive allotment appeared to extend along Auburn Road and Auburn Grove to the flanking laneways.<sup>2</sup> The house was designed by the architectural practice of [Nathaniel] Billing & Son. Hordern appears to have died during 1881, with the *Argus* of 26 November 1881 noting the auction of the late William Hordern's recently erected two-storey mansion on hill at Auburn Road, Hawthorn.<sup>3</sup> Despite this, the house remained in the Hordern family, and by 1882-83 it was listed in rate books as being owned and occupied by Cecilia Hordern.<sup>4</sup> Mrs. Hordern was owner/occupier still in 1888 when the house was described as an eleven-roomed brick house, NAV 230 pounds and remained in residence until at least 1900.<sup>5</sup>

(Meredith Gould, Conservation Architects, Hawthorn Heritage Study, 1992, additional research by Lovell Chen, 2005)

**Description & Integrity**

*Streamshall*, at 173 Auburn Road, Hawthorn, is a substantial two-storey Victorian villa of brick construction in the Italianate style. The hipped roof is finished with slate and rendered brick chimneys with consoled moulded caps. The walls display an overpainted rendered finish with moulded string courses and projecting bays on the west and south flank a double-height cast iron return verandah. The verandah has an ogee-profile corrugated galvanised steel roof supported by fluted Corinthian columns with cast iron balustrade, frieze and brackets and non-original tiled floor. The main entrance is via an arched opening containing a panelled timber door with leadlight surrounds and non-original timber-frame screen door; a second door accesses the verandah at first floor level. A double-height canted bay window, located in the projecting bay of the façade, features windows with segmented

arch heads and metal valances at ground floor level and semi-circular arched windows with moulded archivolt at first floor level. Windows elsewhere in the principal elevations contain conventional timber-framed double-hung sashes.

Rear additions and alterations appear to be minor and are concealed from view from Auburn Road. The landscape has been completely renewed, a pool and shed may have been constructed and the property is fenced by a non-original brick wall and timber gates which probably date from the 1960s.<sup>6</sup>

### Historical Context

From the 1870s many mansion houses were constructed at Hawthorn, where the relatively close proximity to the city, the elevated nature of the area and the large quantity of land available encouraged the construction of large residences set within gracious grounds.

(Meredith Gould, Conservation Architects, Hawthorn Heritage Study, 1992)

### Comparative Analysis

In its overall scale, composition and Italianate styling and detail, *Streamshall* can be compared directly with a number of similar examples nearby in Hawthorn and elsewhere in Boroondara. Though overpainted and lacking a prominent siting when seen from the street, it is remarkably similar to *Church Hill* at 6 Hepburn Street, Hawthorn (Graded B2), which is enhanced by unpainted render and a commanding corner position. Similarly, it can be compared with the nearby Italianate villas at numbers 1, 12 and 14 Goodall Street, Hawthorn (graded B1 and B2), which adopt the same form, scale and styling with two-storey return verandahs with decorative cast iron, projecting canted bays and slate hipped roofs, although number 1 displays bichrome face brickwork. It is also similar to 149 Victoria Road, Hawthorn (q.v. graded B2) and 12 Sackville Street, Kew (albeit polychrome brick and graded A). Elsewhere in Hawthorn and Kew, *Streamshall* is a variant of the houses located at 58 and 83 Lisson Grove, Hawthorn (graded B2 and C\*3 respectively) and 892 Glenferrie Road, Kew (graded B).

### Assessment Against Criteria

*Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria*

*CRITERION D: The importance of a place or object in exhibiting the principal characteristics or the representative nature of a place or object as a part of a class or type of places or objects.*

*Streamshall* is a good and relatively externally intact example of a substantial two-storey Italianate villa, large numbers of which were constructed throughout Hawthorn and the broader Boroondara area in the 1870s and 1880s. While the full extent of its original setting has been reduced and the house is obscured from the street by a fence, it maintains its garden setting on an elevated site.

### Statement of Significance

*Streamshall* is of local significance as a good and relatively externally intact example of a substantial two-storey Italianate villa with hipped roof, projecting canted bay and two-storey verandah, large numbers of which were constructed throughout Hawthorn and the broader Boroondara area in the 1870s and 1880s. While the full extent of its original setting has been reduced and the house is obscured from the street by a fence, it maintains its garden setting on an elevated site.

### Grading Review

Unchanged.

### Recommendations

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme.

### Identified By

Meredith Gould, Conservation Architects, Hawthorn Heritage Study, 1992.

### References

*General:* Meredith Gould, Conservation Architects, Hawthorn Heritage Study, 1992; Meredith Gould, Conservation Architects, Hawthorn Heritage Study Review, 1994.

<sup>1</sup> Borough of Hawthorn Rate Books, 1881-82 # 785; Gwen McWilliam, *Auburn Village*, Walk VII, Hawthorn Historical Society, 1988. It was described in the Hawthorn rate book as "unfinished" at that date but already with an NAV of 160 pounds. The previous year, 1880-81, Hordern's vacant allotment in Auburn Road was valued at only twenty pounds.

<sup>2</sup> As indicated on MMBW Detail Plan No. 1544, City of Hawthorn, dated 1903.

<sup>3</sup> As noted in the Melbourne Mansions on-line database, record no. 1435.

<sup>4</sup> The house had a NAV of 175 pounds. Borough of Hawthorn Rate Books 1882-83, # 925.

<sup>5</sup> 1888 Rate Book Index No. 4399 (held in local history collection, Hawthorn Library).

<sup>6</sup> Details sourced from the City of Hawthorn Building Index, permit #461, dated 1944 (shed), permit #11817, dated 27 November 1974 (pool), and permit #6193, dated 10 December 1963, for construction of front fence.

---

<b>Name</b>	House	<b>Reference No</b>	
<b>Address</b>	7 Elphin Grove, Hawthorn	<b>Survey Date</b>	6 January 2006
<b>Building Type</b>	Residence	<b>Grading</b>	B
<b>Date</b>	1887-88	<b>Previous Grading</b>	B



**Extent of Overlay**

To title boundaries.

---

**Intactness**    ☒ Good    ☐ Fair    ☐ Poor

**Heritage Status**    ☐ HV    ☐ AHC    ☐ NT    ☐ Rec.    BPS Heritage Overlay

**History**

In 1887-88 William A.P. Church, salesman, was rated for a house on the east side of Elphin Grove,<sup>1</sup> later known as No. 7. The following year Church's home was described as a brick house of eight rooms, NAV 80 pounds.<sup>2</sup> By the early 1890s, Church owned a number of other houses in Elphin Grove. By this date his home had increased to eleven rooms. Church also owned No. 1, a seven-roomed brick house,<sup>3</sup> and No. 3, another seven-roomed brick house.<sup>4</sup> Church still lived at No. 7 in 1900.<sup>5</sup>

A number of additions and alterations have been made to the house in recent years (refer Description and Integrity below).

(Meredith Gould, Conservation Architects, Hawthorn Heritage Study, 1992, additional research by Lovell Chen, 2005)

**Description & Integrity**

As constructed, the house at 7 Elphin Grove, Hawthorn, was a single-storey double-fronted Victorian villa of brick construction on an asymmetrical plan with extensive rear wings. It now includes two-storey rear additions which date from 1978 and 2004 and a detached garage building at the rear boundary.<sup>6</sup> The bracketed hipped roof of the original house is finished with slate and rendered chimneys with bracketed moulded caps and antefixa. The original walls display an overpainted ruled ashlar rendered finish with string moulding, while the walls of the later additions are face brickwork. The principal west and south elevations are screened by a return cast iron verandah which features a concave corrugated galvanised steel roof, paired Corinthian columns, cast iron frieze and trellis panels and a reconstructed timber floor. Two sets of bluestone steps provide access to the verandah, those on the southern side lead directly to the entrance and appear to be original, while those to the west date from the recent works.<sup>7</sup> The façade is divided into bays by two pairs of tall window openings with

round-arched heads and moulded architraves which contain timber-framed double-hung sashes. There is a single non-original window opening in the north elevation to the east of the chimney breast. The main entrance is located in a projecting bay which terminates the verandah return and contains a half-glazed panelled timber door with matching glazed surround.

With the exception of the rear and detached additions and the non-original corrugated galvanised steel and timber fence, the house appears to be otherwise externally intact as viewed from the street.

### Historical Context

The subject property is located in a streetscape at the northern end of Elphin Grove which contains a substantial number of Victorian villas of various scale, construction and integrity.

### Comparative Analysis

With its straight-fronted form, the subject building differs from many of the double-fronted Victorian villas in the vicinity which typically are asymmetrical in their planning with a projecting front bay. The house also occupies an allotment which is twice the width of the neighbouring properties. 7 Elphin Grove compares favourably with the nearby number 15 Elphin Grove (graded C2), which is also straight-fronted but lacks a return verandah. Further afield, it compares with the B-graded double-fronted Victorian villas, *Waverley*, at 98 Pakington Street, Kew and 7 Coleridge Street, Kew and favourably with the nearby 89 Fitzwilliam Street, Kew (C-graded).

### Assessment Against Criteria

*Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria*

*CRITERION D: The importance of a place or object in exhibiting the principal characteristics or the representative nature of a place or object as a part of a class or type of places or objects.*

7 Elphin Grove, Hawthorn, is a fine, representative and relatively externally intact example of a single-storey double-fronted Victorian Italianate villa set on a substantial suburban allotment.

### Statement of Significance

7 Elphin Grove, Hawthorn, is of local historical and architectural significance as a fine, representative and relatively externally intact example of a single-storey double-fronted Victorian Italianate villa set on a substantial suburban allotment. Though a series of substantial rear additions have been made, these do not detract from the presentation of the house.

### Grading Review

Unchanged.

### Recommendations

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme.

### Identified By

Meredith Gould, Conservation Architects, Hawthorn Heritage Study, 1992.

### References

*General:* Meredith Gould, Conservation Architects, Hawthorn Heritage Study, 1992.

*Specific:*

<sup>1</sup> Town of Hawthorn Rate Books, 1887-88 # 2593 (NAV 70 pounds).

<sup>2</sup> City of Hawthorn Rate Books, 1888 # 3054 (NAV 80 pounds).


<sup>3</sup> City of Hawthorn Rate Books, 1893-94 # 4358 (NAV 72 pounds).

<sup>4</sup> City of Hawthorn Rate Books, # 4360, # 4361 (NAVs 38 pounds each).

<sup>5</sup> *Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria*, various years.

<sup>6</sup> Details and drawings sourced from the City of Hawthorn Building Index File, City of Boroondara Planning File 108814, Part 1, and City of Boroondara Building File, 40/408/08657 Part 1.

<sup>7</sup> Building Permit #BS1092/980917/0, dated 24 June 2004, City of Boroondara Building File, 40/408/08657 Part 1.

<b>Name</b>	<i>Struan</i>	<b>Reference No</b>	
<b>Address</b>	26 Lisson Grove, Hawthorn	<b>Survey Date</b>	
<b>Building Type</b>	Residence	<b>Grading</b>	B (Provisional)
<b>Date</b>	c.1886-87 (or 1888? unclear)	<b>Previous Grading</b>	B
		<b>Extent of Overlay</b>	
			To title boundaries

**Intactness** ☐ Good ☐ Fair ☐ Poor

**Heritage Status** ☐ HV ☐ AHC ☐ NT ☒ Rec BPS Heritage Overlay

### History

Edward Fatt, clothier, was the first owner/occupier of a house on the south side of Lisson Grove listed in the 1886-87 Hawthorn rate book with an NAV of 85 pounds.<sup>1</sup> In 1888, Fatt was also rated for another property, a nine-roomed brick house in Glenferrie Road, NAV 75 pounds.<sup>2</sup> Fatt was listed in Lisson Grove for the first time in the 1888 *Sands & McDougall Melbourne Directory*.

(Meredith Gould, Conservation Architects, Hawthorn Heritage Study, 1992)

### Description & Integrity

*The following description is provisional only, based on limited views from the street, existing documentation, including photographs and drawings and would need to be confirmed by a site visit.*

As constructed, *Struan*, at 26 Lisson Grove, Hawthorn, was a double-storey brick villa which probably displayed Victorian Italianate styling including a double-storey cast iron verandah. Substantial works carried out in 1937 by architect Edward Billson, however, involved the substantial remodelling of the façade including the removal of the earlier verandah and construction of a new two-storey verandah comprising a flat roof supported by rendered masonry columns with stylized capitals. Wrought iron balustrades and a Juliet balcony above the side entrance porch are also likely to date from this period. Subsequent major additions at the rear of the house carried out in the 1980s to a design by Gregory Burgess doubled the building footprint and are visible from Through Street to the east.

The main wing of the house has a slate-clad hipped form. Walls display unpainted ruled ashlar render and the asymmetrical façade is divided into three bays by a double-height faceted bay window and a projecting double-height square bay set on the diagonal at the north-east corner of the house. Set back from the façade on the west side is an entrance porch which is accessed via steps and an arched opening flanked by a pair of stylized pilasters. In addition, access is provided to both levels of the



verandah via pairs of timber-framed French doors. Fenestration is generally regular between floors and comprises a small number of original, unaltered openings and others which have variously been altered or constructed at later stages.

Building applications suggest that other alterations to the property include a swimming pool and brick fences.<sup>3</sup>

The building is set in a complimentary garden which appears to incorporate the general planning evident in 1903 and may include a fountain and an early *Magnolia grandiflora* planting.<sup>4</sup>

### **Historical Context**

One of Hawthorn's most desirable addresses, subdivision and the gazetting of Lisson Grove first occurred after 1873, at the eastern end of the street with the western end subdivided a decade later. Today the street is characterised by large Victorian-era two-storeyed residences set on medium-sized allotments, with some later Federation-era houses.

### **Comparative Analysis**

Not completed, access required.

### **Assessment Against Criteria**

Not completed, access required.

### **Statement of Significance**

Not completed, access required.

This house is massively altered from its original Victorian form, but has been assessed by Conservation Architect, Meredith Gould (refer attached citation) as being of significance as an example of an interwar remodelling of a Victorian residence.

Because of the particular nature of this assessment and the limited nature of available documentation (photographs and drawings), it is more difficult in this case to review significance (without inspecting the building) than is the case of other obscured properties in this Review. Accordingly, it is proposed to adopt the Gould recommendation in its current form.

Following is the Meredith Gould recommendation (refer to attached citation):

*Whilst the original Victorian period mansion is clearly altered, the simple but elegant overlay of the then current fashion by Billson is substantially intact.*

*Many Hawthorn mansions were altered for flats during the 1920s and 1930s. A large proportion were later demolished or have been returned to their original form. Few show so clearly, the public's change in taste, away from the Victorian decorative approach which is so popular again today, to a simpler, more austere form.*

*The building is of metropolitan significance for its illustration of changes in fashion in the 1930s in Melbourne, and the restrained, elegant work of Billson.*

(Meredith Gould, Conservation Architects, Hawthorn Heritage Study Review, 1995.)

### **Grading Review**

Not reviewed in this study. Reviewed to B2 by Meredith Gould in 1995 (refer attached citation).

### **Recommendations (provisional)**

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme, on the basis of the attached assessment and citation prepared by Meredith Gould in 1995.

It is recommended that a further site inspection be carried out to confirm the Gould grading.

## **Identified By**

Meredith Gould, Conservation Architects, Hawthorn Heritage Study, 1992.

## **References**

*General:* Meredith Gould, Conservation Architects, Hawthorn Heritage Study, 1992; Meredith Gould, Conservation Architects, Hawthorn Heritage Study Review, 1995.

*Specific:*

<sup>1</sup> Hawthorn Ratebooks 1886-87 # 1161 (rates paid May 1887).

<sup>2</sup> 1888 Ratebook Index # 5072 (held in Local History Collection, Hawthorn Library).

<sup>3</sup> Details sourced from the City of Hawthorn Building Index, #3650 (2095), dated 20 January 1986; #4070 (2619), dated 8 August 1986; #4224, dated 16 October 1986; and #4662 (3316), dated 6 May 1987.

<sup>4</sup> As depicted on MMBW Detail Plan No. 1481, dated 1903.

<b>Name</b>	<i>Warrowiturl</i>	<b>Reference No</b>	
<b>Address</b>	1 Neave Street, Hawthorn East	<b>Survey Date</b>	6 March 2006, 11 April 2006
<b>Building Type</b>	Residence	<b>Grading</b>	B
<b>Date</b>	1890	<b>Previous Grading</b>	B



#### Extent of Overlay

To title boundaries.

**Intactness** ☒ Good ☐ Fair ☐ Poor

**Heritage Status** ☐ HV ☐ AHC ☐ NT ☐ Rec. ☐ BPS Heritage Overlay

#### History

The accountant, Charles Brown, was listed as the owner/occupier for the first time in the 1890-91 Hawthorn rate records of a ten-roomed brick house in Neave Street, NAV £80.<sup>1</sup> The description remained the same in 1892.<sup>2</sup> This substantial brick residence was identified later as 1 Neave Street. Its site was in part of the Tower Hill Estate subdivided in 1883.<sup>3</sup>

(Meredith Gould, Conservation Architects, Hawthorn Heritage Study, 1992)

#### Description & Integrity

As constructed, *Warrowiturl*, 1 Neave Street, (then) Upper Hawthorn, was a large two-storey Victorian villa in the Italianate style with a single-storey rear wing. It is flanked by a pair of slightly later parapeted single-storey wings which extend towards the side boundaries; these may date from as early as 1895.<sup>4</sup> The hipped main roof has a slate finish (refixed), bracketed eaves and red face brick chimneys with moulded bands, caps and antefixa. The parapeted side roofs are hipped and finished with non-original corrugated galvanised steel to match the original. The walls bear on a bluestone plinth and display tuckpointed bichrome Hawthorn brickwork. The break-fronted façade comprises three bays, with the centre projecting substantially beyond the sides, the full depth of the large rooms at both levels. A double-height cast iron return verandah screens the principal north, south and west elevations of the projecting bay; it extends on the south side to the main entrance and on the north to a second, altered, entrance. The verandah has been partially reconstructed at the south-west corner, generally reusing the original materials and the re-clad corrugated galvanised steel roof is supported by cast iron columns with dentilled cornices, cast iron friezes, brackets and balustrades. A section of the first floor south verandah contains a timber-framed and clad enclosure. Access to the verandah is via bluestone steps to the south and the floors are finished with predominantly original tessellated tiles to the ground floor and timber to the first floor level. The main entrance contains a panelled

timber door with stained glass panels and surrounds, bearing the property name and a non-original screen door. The second entrance from the north verandah contains a pair of non-original timber-framed double-doors. Fenestration to the double-storey section is regular between floor levels and comprises tall window openings with timber-framed double-hung sashes and conventional timber-framed double-hung sashes throughout. Some windows are fitted with panels of non-original shade cloth.

Recorded alterations to the property include a brick laundry, added in the 1950s and removed in the 1980s, carport, since demolished, repairs to the verandah, rear additions, fences and an outbuilding.<sup>5</sup> The property has been subdivided, and a new residence constructed to the rear (4A Myrniong Grove) with a new carport added to the northeast corner of the original house. The fences comprise a non-original timber picket fence to the Neave Street frontage, a reconstructed side fence comprising old and new pickets to Myrniong Grove, and a reconstructed dividing fence to 3 Neave Street containing original wire fencing. The fountain and pond in the front garden are original, however the surround is not. The rear garden contains a small pond which was the central feature of an earlier conservatory, since demolished.

### Historical Context

Neave Street formed part of the Tower Hill estate subdivision of 1883. Development of the estate was gradual with the subject property one of only a few substantial homes erected during the last years of the nineteenth century. Its distance from transport links at time of its subdivision may have accounted for the slow development of this part of Hawthorn.

### Comparative Analysis

In its general Victorian styling, detail and scale, *Warrowit*, at 1 Neave Street, Hawthorn East can be compared to many examples of two-storey Victorian villas throughout the municipality, particularly Hawthorn, Kew and Canterbury. Where it differs, however, is in the atypical planning and massing which comprises a dramatically projecting double-storey bay flanked by a pair of parapeted single-storey wings. In this regard it is quite uncommon, with no known comparisons.

### Assessment Against Criteria

*Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria*

*CRITERION D: The importance of a place or object in exhibiting the principal characteristics or the representative nature of a place or object as a part of a class or type of places or objects.*

*Warrowit* is a fine and relatively externally intact example of a substantial two-storey triple-fronted bichrome brick Victorian Italianate villa set on a generous garden allotment.

*CRITERION E: The importance of the place or object in exhibiting good design or aesthetic characteristics and/or in exhibiting a richness, diversity or unusual integration of features.*

*Warrowit* is an unusual example of a late Victorian Italianate design; it incorporates parapeted single-storey wings flanking a prominent projecting bay, screened by an ornate return cast iron verandah. The richness of the composition is enhanced by the use of bichrome brickwork and rendered details.

### Statement of Significance

*Warrowit*, 1 Neave Street, Hawthorn East, is of local historical and architectural significance as a fine and relatively externally intact example of a substantial Victorian Italianate villa set on a generous garden allotment. *Warrowit* is an unusual example of a late Victorian Italianate design; it incorporates parapeted single-storey wings flanking a prominent projecting bay, screened by an ornate return cast iron verandah. The richness of the composition is enhanced by the use of bichrome brickwork and rendered details. Though the site has been subdivided and a series of rear additions have been made, these changes do not detract from the presentation of the house.

### Grading Review

Unchanged.

## Recommendations

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme.

## Identified By

Meredith Gould, Conservation Architects, Hawthorn Heritage Study, 1992.

## References

*General:* Meredith Gould, Conservation Architects, Hawthorn Heritage Study, 1992; Meredith Gould, Conservation Architects, Hawthorn Heritage Study Review, 1996.

*Specific:*

<sup>1</sup> Hawthorn Rate Book 1890-91 Eastern Division # 3964.

<sup>2</sup> Hawthorn Rate Book, 1892, # 5068.

<sup>3</sup> Gwen McWilliam, *Hawthorn Peppercorns*, p.135.

<sup>4</sup> As depicted on MMBW Detail Plan No. 1530, City of Hawthorn, published 1916 but possibly dated as early as 1895. This is supported by information supplied by the present owner, M Rawlinson, who believes the side wings were constructed within the first five years.

<sup>5</sup> Details sourced from the City of Hawthorn Building Index, permits #292, dated 13 November 1947 (alterations); #704, dated 15 July 1949 (alterations); #126, 22 December 1952 (additions); #1520, dated 1957 (brick laundry); #6204, dated 17 December 1965 (carport); #13048, dated 7 October 1976 (alterations to dwelling); #14086, dated 1 March 1978 (repairs to verandah); #15900, dated 9 June 1980 (additions); #0274/91 (9109), dated 19 November 1991 (fence) and #134/92 (9588), dated 6 May 1992 (outbuilding).

<b>Name</b>	<i>Rathgar</i>	<b>Reference No</b>	
<b>Address</b>	149 Victoria Road, Hawthorn	<b>Survey Date</b>	6 January 2006
<b>Building Type</b>	Residence	<b>Grading</b>	B
<b>Date</b>	1886-87	<b>Previous Grading</b>	B



**Extent of Overlay**

To title boundaries.

**Intactness** ☒ Good ☐ Fair ☐ Poor

**Heritage Status** ☐ HV ☐ AHC ☐ NT ☐ Rec. BPS Heritage Overlay

**History**

John Burke, warehouseman, was the first owner in 1886-87 of a brick house of nine rooms (NAV 85 pounds) in Victoria Road,<sup>1</sup> known now as No. 149. Meredith Gould has speculated that Burke may have been the father of the distinguished architect, J. Edmund Burke, and that he may have designed the house, though no such link has been confirmed.<sup>2</sup>

John Burke remained as owner until 1892,<sup>3</sup> when the property was owned by the Australian Wesleyan Methodist Ministers and Widows Fund.<sup>4</sup>

*Rathgar* subsequently had a number of interesting occupants. Dr. William H. Cutts was there between 1892 and 1896 and then, from 1897 to 1900, Edward Pollett, Consul for Belgium for the Australian Colonies occupied the premises. Mrs. Sarah J. Hall ran her "Woodhouse Grove" Girls School there in 1901-02. Later, from 1903-1906, it was occupied by a well-known businessman, Aaron T. Danks, of a firm of engineers, coppersmiths and brassfounders.<sup>5</sup> Between 1963 and 1982, the Presbyterian Children's Aid Society was located in *Rathgar*.<sup>6</sup>

In recent years, a series of alterations and additions have been made at the rear of the property (refer below, under Description & Integrity).

(Meredith Gould, Conservation Architects, Hawthorn Heritage Study, 1992, additional research by Lovell Chen, 2005)

**Description & Integrity**

*Rathgar*, 149 Victoria Road, Hawthorn, is a substantial two-storey double-fronted Victorian villa of brick construction in the Italianate style. The hipped roof is clad with corrugated galvanised steel and is finished with bracketed eaves which are incorporated into a frieze moulding. The roofscape is

penetrated by rendered (overpainted) chimneys with moulded caps. The façade comprises two bays, including a double-height projecting faceted bay, and the principal south and west elevations display an overpainted rendered finish, with overpainted brick walls elsewhere. These principal elevations feature moulded string courses and architraves, fielded and tooled panels, roundels and cornice mouldings – the authenticity/origin of which has been previously questioned.<sup>7</sup> The south and west elevations are screened by a double-height return cast iron verandah, which has been at least partially reconstructed at first floor level.<sup>8</sup> The verandah has an ogee profile corrugated galvanised steel roof supported by cast iron Corinthian columns with cast iron frieze, brackets and balustrade and the floor is finished with non-original ceramic tiles. The fenestration is regular between floor levels and windows contain timber-framed double-hung sashes with some segmented and round arched heads with moulded archivolt and keystones. The main entrance is arched and contains a panelled timber door with stained glass surround and barley sugar motif stiles and non-original timber-framed screen door.

Single-storey rear additions and a detached garage with access from the side street date from the 1980s. The grounds of the property also contain a recent tennis court to the west and pool to the north-west of the main house and extensive associated landscaping.

The property is bounded by non-original fences with timber posts and corrugated steel mini-orb and timber lattice panels.

### Historical Context

*Rathgar* is situated at the corner of the aptly named Grandview Grove, where a number of two-storeyed brick villas were constructed in the boom years of the 1880s, taking advantage of the elevated location. The convenience of the recently opened railway between Lilydale and Melbourne added to the area's desirability.

### Comparative Analysis

In its scale, form and overall Italianate detail, *Rathgar*, can be compared to a number of similar examples located in Kew and elsewhere throughout the municipality, most of which are similarly graded. Direct comparisons can be made with *Church Hill* at 6 Hepburn Street, Hawthorn (graded B2) and 1, 12 and 14 Goodall Street, Hawthorn (graded B1 and B2) which take the same form, scale and styling with double-storey return cast iron verandahs, projecting canted bays and slate hipped roofs, although number 1 displays bichrome face brickwork. Likewise, it is similar to 173 Auburn Road, Hawthorn (q.v. graded B3) and 12 Sackville Street, Kew (albeit polychrome brick and graded A). Elsewhere in Hawthorn and Kew, *Rathgar* is a variant of the houses located at 58 and 83 Lisson Grove, Hawthorn (graded B2 and C\*3 respectively) and 892 Glenferrie Road, Kew (graded B).

### Assessment Against Criteria

*Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria*

*CRITERION D: The importance of a place or object in exhibiting the principal characteristics or the representative nature of a place or object as a part of a class or type of places or objects.*

*Rathgar*, at 149 Victoria Street, Hawthorn, is a fine and relatively externally intact example of a substantial two-storey Italianate villa of the late 1880s. Constructed at the height of the boom, the house is an imposing, albeit conventional, example of a relatively common Boroondara typology. Later additions are generally to the rear of the house and do not detract from its presentation.

### Statement of Significance

*Rathgar*, at 149 Victoria Street, Hawthorn, is of local historical and architectural significance as a fine and relatively externally intact example of a substantial two-storey Italianate villa of the late 1880s. Constructed at the height of the boom, the house is an imposing, albeit relatively conventional, example of a popular Boroondara typology. Later additions are generally to the rear of the house and do not detract from its presentation.

### Grading Review

Unchanged.

## Recommendations

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme.

## Identified By

Meredith Gould, Conservation Architects, Hawthorn Heritage Study, 1992.

## References

*General:* Meredith Gould, Conservation Architects, Hawthorn Heritage Study, 1992; Meredith Gould, Conservation Architects, Hawthorn Heritage Study Review, 1994.

*Specific:*

<sup>1</sup> Town of Hawthorn Rate Books, 1886-87 # 1718.

<sup>2</sup> National Trust File # B3156.

<sup>3</sup> National Trust File # B3156.

<sup>4</sup> National Trust File # B3156. It is not known whether this organisation was associated with the Australian Widows Fund, which was founded in 1871, and was involved in land dealings during the 1880s. It financed a number of boom period mansions and in 1910 amalgamated with the Mutual Life Association of Australasia to form the giant M.L.C. organisation of today. Michael Cannon, *The Land Boomers*, pp. 169-171.

<sup>5</sup> National Trust File # B3156.

<sup>6</sup> National Trust File # B3156.

<sup>7</sup> Meredith Gould, *Hawthorn Heritage Study*, 1992, citation for 149 Victoria Road.

<sup>8</sup> A photograph taken in 1982 indicates that by then the eastern end of the first floor verandah had been infilled. See John T Collins Collection, Picture Collection, State Library of Victoria, accession number H97.250/658, image number jc005980.



Name	<i>Knottywood, Morley</i>	Reference No	
Address	61 Wattle Road, Hawthorn	Survey Date	9 May 2006
Building Type	Residence	Grading	B
Date	1863, 1868	Previous Grading	B



#### Extent of Overlay

To title boundaries, but excluding adjoining subdivision development. Line of extent of overlay at rear of house to be determined on site and following consultation with owner.

Intactness ☒ Good ☐ Fair ☐ Poor

Heritage Status ☐ HV ☐ AHC ☐ NT ☒ Rec BPS Heritage Overlay

#### History

*Knottywood* was constructed in 1868 for Thomas Williams, most probably a Burwood Road butcher.<sup>1</sup> It is reputed to have incorporated a circa 1863 three-roomed wooden cottage owned by Gottlieb Gottke, a gardener, who occupied the site from 1860.<sup>2</sup> This is no longer extant, but a possibly earlier brick kitchen does survive. A substantial six-roomed brick section with verandah was added in the early 1860s, builder unknown.<sup>3</sup> In 1873, the property became known as *Morley* and was owned by Joseph Dixon (related to the celebrated lawyer, Sir Owen Dixon, who came from Morley in England). The eastern brick wing may have been added about this time. Joseph, who was at first a warehouseman and by 1883 an accountant,<sup>4</sup> held *Morley* until 1909.<sup>5</sup>

In the twentieth century, this property had a long association with the McCowan and Simpson families. In the late nineteenth century, Henry McCowan, a builder from Hampstead and his wife Elizabeth came to Australia, settling first in Brunswick. They arrived to an unexpectedly slack economy, with few opportunities for building development by Henry, following the banking crisis of the late 1880s and the depression which followed. In 1905 the family moved to this property in Wattle Road, then a few acres in size, including the early timber building<sup>6</sup> and still supporting an orchard.<sup>7</sup> Mrs. Elizabeth McCowan<sup>8</sup> is recorded as owner in 1910. The property passed to their child Florence who married R.H. Simpson and subsequently to R.G. Simpson and his wife.

The notable architect Roy McCowan Simpson AO (1914-1997) grew up here. In 1958 the property was subdivided and Roy Simpson designed a residential development to the rear of the property, first a separate accommodation for his aunt, and later a more extensive separate development of sixteen units. The contractor for the first stage was A.V. Jennings.<sup>9</sup>

Roy Simpson undertook some of the alterations to the house including removal of some of the decoration to the verandah, removal of the eaves brackets, and replacement of the decorative coloured glass to the front door. The rear rooms were joined together to make one space and much

later, the freestanding kitchen, possibly belonging to the earliest German settlement, was upgraded into a modern kitchen and connected to the main house.

The architect Roy Simpson, of Yuncken Freeman, was awarded the Royal Australian Institute of Architects 1997 gold medal for his contribution to architecture. Its citation reads:

*His sensitivity to the context of his projects displays an affinity with the true art of architecture.*

He was an important member of the post war architects who consolidated the introduction of the modern movement, first introduced in the small pre war works of Grounds, Boyd and others, and who developed strong movement towards contextual development. Amongst his most important work is the master plan for La Trobe University. He died in March 1997.

(Meredith Gould, Conservation Architects, Hawthorn Heritage Study Review, 1995, Provisional B Grade Review, 1997)

### Description & Integrity

*Knottywood* is a single-storey Victorian villa of Hawthorn brick construction. The main section of the house is double-fronted with symmetrical façade, rendered quoins and plinth and a hipped slate roof with rendered chimneys with moulded caps; eaves brackets have been removed.<sup>10</sup> It is screened by a skillion-roofed timber verandah with paired posts, altered by the removal of some decoration.<sup>11</sup> The central entrance comprises a single door with glazed surrounds and timber-framed screen door which is flanked by timber-framed double-hung sash windows. While the principal elevations retain a face brick finish, the rear elevation appears to have been overpainted.<sup>12</sup>

To the east of the main house is a brick wing of nineteenth century origins, set back from the main frontage. Also constructed of brown brick, it differs from the main house with lower floor and ceiling levels but repeats the quoining and hipped slate roof form. Evidence of an ochre wash remains on the quoins.

A single-storey, skillion-roofed kitchen wing of brick construction is located at the north-west (rear) corner of the main house. Originally detached, it is now linked to the main house. This was not inspected during this review but was photographed and described by Meredith Gould in 1997. The age of this wing is unclear, though Gould has suggested that it may predate the existing house and have been the kitchen wing for an earlier timber cottage on the site.<sup>13</sup>

An attached flat-roofed carport has been constructed at the south-east corner of the eastern wing and a detached carport has been constructed between the house and the street. An application for alterations to the rear verandah and some rear window and door openings was made in 1998.<sup>14</sup> Additional conservation works, and works at the rear are apparently being carried out at the time of writing.<sup>15</sup>

The 1960s flats constructed at the rear of the property were not inspected.

### Historical Context

Wattle Road, first known as Weinberg Road, is an early street in Hawthorn and marks the location of a farming settlement established by a group of German immigrants in the 1950s. These farming allotments were gradually subdivided, a process which commenced as early as the late 1850s, with the result being an area which is mixed in character but which still retains some evidence of the early farming settlement.

### Comparative Analysis

While the overall double-fronted Victorian villa form of the main house is not uncommon, particularly in Hawthorn, the house is one of the smaller group of surviving examples in the suburb on larger allotments and dating from the 1860s. Despite minor alterations and rear subdivision, its unpainted masonry, generous garden setting and relatively high level of integrity demonstrate the early development of the area for small scale farming, prior to the suburban development of the 1870s. Not quite suburban and not a farmhouse, it has been suggested that the house combines a street address with the three dimensionality and functionality of a farmhouse.<sup>16</sup> The house compares favourably with other examples from a similar period of development in Wattle Road such as numbers 58, 60, 78 and 86 which exhibit a range of levels of integrity and significance (variously graded B, C\* and C).

## Assessment Against Criteria

### Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria

**CRITERION A:** *The historical importance, association with or relationship to Boroondara's history of the place or object.*

*Knottywood* is associated with an early phase in Hawthorn's history, specifically with the establishment of a German settlement around Weinberg Road (prior to the transition to garden suburb during the 1870s) and the subsequent development of this settlement. Developed in a series of phases and possibly incorporating an early kitchen wing to the rear, *Knottywood* is one of a small surviving group of Hawthorn properties whose form and generous setting demonstrate the early development of the area for small-scale farming pursuits.

**CRITERION D:** *The importance of a place or object in exhibiting the principal characteristics or the representative nature of a place or object as a part of a class or type of places or objects.*

*Knottywood* is a fine, representative and relatively externally intact example of a single-storey double-fronted Victorian villa set on a substantial allotment. The house has undergone some modification and new structures constructed. The broader site has also been subdivided and partly redeveloped, however, these changes have not fundamentally detracted from its presentation.

### Statement of Significance

*Knottywood*, 61 Wattle Road, Hawthorn, is of local historical and architectural significance. It is associated with an early phase in Hawthorn's history, specifically with the establishment of a German settlement around Weinberg Road (prior to the transition to garden suburb during the 1870s) and the subsequent development of this settlement. Developed in a series of phases and possibly incorporating an early kitchen wing to the rear, *Knottywood*, at 61 Wattle Road is one of a small surviving group of Hawthorn properties whose form and generous setting demonstrate the early development of the area for small-scale farming pursuits. The house is also significant in the local context as a fine, representative and relatively externally intact example of a single-storey double-fronted Victorian villa of the 1860s set on a substantial allotment. The house has undergone some modification and new structures have been constructed on the site, however, these changes do not fundamentally detract from its presentation.

### Grading Review

Unchanged, B.

### Recommendations

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme.

Note that the extent of the heritage overlay should extend to the title boundaries, but exclude the adjoining subdivision development at the rear and to the east.<sup>17</sup> The line of the extent of overlay at the rear of house should be determined on site with the owner.

### Identified By

Meredith Gould, Conservation Architects, Hawthorn Heritage Study, 1992.

### References

*General:* Meredith Gould, Conservation Architects, Hawthorn Heritage Study, 1992; Meredith Gould, Conservation Architects, Hawthorn Heritage Study Review, 1994.

*Specific:*

<sup>1</sup> City of Hawthorn Ratebook, 1868, #. 232.

<sup>2</sup> City of Hawthorn Ratebook, 1863 #. 201; 1864, # 206; Local History. Correspondence 877, Oct. 1860. (Research by Ruth Dwyer Nov 1991).

<sup>3</sup> Local History. Correspondence 877, Oct. 1860. (Research by Ruth Dwyer Nov. 1991).

<sup>4</sup> City of Hawthorn Ratebook, 1873, # 448; 1883, # 766.

<sup>5</sup> City of Hawthorn Ratebook, 1909 # 2194.

<sup>6</sup> Cited by Meredith Gould, personal communication, Mr. Simpson.

<sup>7</sup> Cited by Meredith Gould, personal communication, Mr. Simpson.

<sup>8</sup> City of Hawthorn Ratebook, 1910 # 2193.

<sup>9</sup> Research by Ruth Dwyer Nov 1991.

<sup>10</sup> Meredith Gould Architects, Hawthorn Heritage Study, Provisional B Grade Review, 1997.

<sup>11</sup> The extent of alteration is unclear. Meredith Gould Architects, Hawthorn Heritage Study, Provisional B Grade Review, 1997.

<sup>12</sup> Based on photographs produced in the previous study, Meredith Gould Architects, Hawthorn Heritage Study, Provisional B Grade Review, 1997.

<sup>13</sup> Meredith Gould Architects Pty Ltd, Provisional B Grade Review, citation for 61 Wattle Road, 'Knottywood'.

<sup>14</sup> Planning Permit #BOR 98/844, dated 3 September 1998, City of Boroondara Planning File 40/409/02994.

<sup>15</sup> *Pers comm.*, Michelle Hirst, owner.

<sup>16</sup> Meredith Gould Architects, Hawthorn Heritage Study, Provisional B Grade Review, 1997.

<sup>17</sup> Note that the c. 1960 residential development was graded C by Meredith Gould.